

# Knowledge Organization

## International Journal

Devoted to Concept Theory, Classification, Indexing, and Knowledge Representation

### Special Issue:

**The Great Debate: “This House Believes that the Traditional Thesaurus has no Place in Modern Information Retrieval.”**

#### Background to the Debate

- *Stella G. Dextre Clarke and Judi Vernau.* Guest Editorial: The Thesaurus Debate Continues
- *Stella G. Dextre Clarke.* Origins and Trajectory of the Long Thesaurus Debate

#### Article for the Proposition

- *Birger Hjørland.* Does the Traditional Thesaurus Have a Place in Modern Information Retrieval?

#### Articles against the Proposition

- *Andreas Oskar Kempf and Joachim Neubert.* The Role of Thesauri in an Open Web: A Case Study of the STW Thesaurus for Economics
- *Douglas Tudhope and Ceri Binding.* Still Quite Popular After all Those Years – The Continued Relevance of the Information Retrieval Thesaurus
- *Andrew MacFarlane.* Knowledge Organisation and its Role in Multimedia Information Retrieval
- *Martin White.* The Value of Taxonomies, Thesauri and Metadata in Enterprise Search
- *Francisco-Javier García-Marco.* Enhancing the Visibility and Relevance of Thesauri in the Web: Searching for a Hub in the Linked Data Environment

#### Points of view

- *Stella G. Dextre Clarke and Judi Vernau.* Questions and Answers on Current Developments Inspired by the Thesaurus Tradition

#### Letters to the Guest Editors

ERGON-VERLAG

ISSN 0943-7444 Knowl.Org.

## Contents

### Special Issue:

#### The Great Debate:

“This House Believes that the Traditional Thesaurus has no Place in Modern Information Retrieval.”

#### Background to the Debate

Stella G. Dextre Clarke and Judi Vernau.

Guest Editorial:

The Thesaurus Debate Continues ..... 135

Stella G. Dextre Clarke.

Origins and Trajectory of the Long Thesaurus

Debate ..... 138

#### Article *for* the Proposition

Birger Hjørland.

Does the Traditional Thesaurus Have a Place in Modern Information Retrieval? ..... 145

#### Articles *against* the Proposition

Andreas Oskar Kempf and Joachim Neubert.

The Role of Thesauri in an Open Web:

A Case Study of the STW Thesaurus for

Economics ..... 160

Douglas Tudhope and Ceri Binding.

Still Quite Popular After all Those Years—

The Continued Relevance of the Information

Retrieval Thesaurus ..... 174

Andrew MacFarlane.

Knowledge Organisation and its Role

in Multimedia Information Retrieval ..... 180

Martin White.

The Value of Taxonomies, Thesauri

and Metadata in Enterprise Search ..... 184

Francisco-Javier García-Marco.

Enhancing the Visibility and Relevance

of Thesauri in the Web: Searching for a Hub

in the Linked Data Environment ..... 193

#### Points of view

Stella G. Dextre Clarke and Judi Vernau.

Questions and Answers on Current Developments

Inspired by the Thesaurus Tradition ..... 203

Letters to the Guest Editors ..... 210

# KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION

# KO

Official Journal of the International Society for Knowledge Organization

ISSN 0943 – 7444

International Journal devoted to Concept Theory, Classification, Indexing and Knowledge Representation

## KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION

This journal is the organ of the INTERNATIONAL SOCIETY FOR KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION (General Secretariat: Amos DAVID, Université de Lorraine, 3 place Godefroy de Bouillon, BP 3397, 54015 Nancy Cedex, France. E-mail: [secre@isko.org](mailto:secre@isko.org)).

### Editors

Richard P. SMIRAGLIA (Editor-in-Chief), School of Information Studies, University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee, Northwest Quad Building B, 2025 E Newport St., Milwaukee, WI 53211 USA.  
E-mail: [smiragli@uwm.edu](mailto:smiragli@uwm.edu)

Melodie J. FOX (Reviews Editor), Bryant & Stratton College, 310 W. Wisconsin Ave., Ste 500E, Milwaukee, WI 53203 USA.  
E-mail: [melodie.j.fox@gmail.com](mailto:melodie.j.fox@gmail.com)

Jihe BEAK (Assistant to the Editor-in-Chief), School of Information Studies, University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee, Northwest Quad Building B, 2025 E Newport St., Milwaukee, WI 53211 USA.  
E-mail: [jbeak@uwm.edu](mailto:jbeak@uwm.edu)

Joshua HENRY (Editorial Assistant), School of Information Studies, University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee, Northwest Quad Building B, 2025 E Newport St., Milwaukee, WI 53211 USA.

### Editors Emerita

Hope A. OLSON, School of Information Studies, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, Milwaukee, Northwest Quad Building B, 2025 E Newport St., Milwaukee, WI 53211 USA. E-mail: [holson@uwm.edu](mailto:holson@uwm.edu)

Clare BEGHTOL, Faculty of Information Studies, University of Toronto, 140 St. George Street, Toronto, Ontario M5S 3G6, Canada.  
E-mail: [clare.beghtol@utoronto.ca](mailto:clare.beghtol@utoronto.ca)

Ingetraut DAHLBERG, Am Hirtenberg 13, 64732 Bad König, Germany. E-mail: [IDahlberg@t-online.de](mailto:IDahlberg@t-online.de)

### Editorial Board

Thomas DOUSA, The University of Chicago Libraries, 1100 E 57th St, Chicago, IL 60637 USA. E-mail: [tmdousa@uchicago.edu](mailto:tmdousa@uchicago.edu)

Jonathan FURNER, Graduate School of Education & Information Studies, University of California, Los Angeles, 300 Young Dr. N, Mailbox 951520, Los Angeles, CA 90095-1520, USA.  
E-mail: [furner@gseis.ucla.edu](mailto:furner@gseis.ucla.edu)

Jesús GASCÓN GARCÍA, Facultat de Biblioteconomia i Documentació, Universitat de Barcelona, C. Melcior de Palau, 140, 08014 Barcelona, Spain. E-mail: [gascon@ub.edu](mailto:gascon@ub.edu)

Claudio GNOLI, University of Pavia, Science and Technology Library, via Ferrata 1, I-27100 Pavia, Italy. E-mail: [claudio.gnoli@unipv.it](mailto:claudio.gnoli@unipv.it)

Rebecca GREEN, Assistant Editor, Dewey Decimal Classification, Dewey Editorial Office, Library of Congress, Decimal Classification Division, 101 Independence Ave., S.E., Washington, DC 20540-4330, USA. E-mail: [greenre@oclc.org](mailto:greenre@oclc.org)

José Augusto Chaves GUIMARÃES, Departamento de Ciência da Informação, Universidade Estadual Paulista–UNESP, Av. Hygino Muzzi Filho 737, 17525-900 Marília SP Brazil. E-mail: [guima@marilia.unesp.br](mailto:guima@marilia.unesp.br)

Birger HJØRLAND, Royal School of Library and Information Science, Copenhagen Denmark. E-mail: [pnl617@iva.ku.dk](mailto:pnl617@iva.ku.dk)

Michael KLEINEBERG, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin, Unter den Linden 6, D-10099 Berlin. E-mail: [michael.kleineberg@ub.hu-berlin.de](mailto:michael.kleineberg@ub.hu-berlin.de)

María J. LÓPEZ-HUERTAS, Universidad de Granada, Facultad de Biblioteconomía y Documentación, Campus Universitario de Cartuja, Biblioteca del Colegio Máximo de Cartuja, 18071 Granada, Spain. E-mail: [mjlopez@ugr.es](mailto:mjlopez@ugr.es)

Kathryn LA BARRE, The Graduate School of Library and Information Science, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 501 E. Daniel Street, MC-493, Champaign, IL 61820-6211 USA. E-mail: [klabarre@illinois.edu](mailto:klabarre@illinois.edu)

Devika P. MADALLI, Documentation Research and Training Centre (DRTC) Indian Statistical Institute (ISI), Bangalore 560 059, India. E-mail: [devika@drtc.isibang.ac.in](mailto:devika@drtc.isibang.ac.in)

Ia MCILWAINE (Literature Editor), Research Fellow, School of Library, Archive & Information Studies, University College London, Gower Street, London WC1E 6BT U.K. E-mail: [i.mcilwaine@ucl.ac.uk](mailto:i.mcilwaine@ucl.ac.uk)

Jens-Erik MAI, Royal School of Library and Information Science, Copenhagen Denmark. E-mail: [bsh146@iva.ku.dk](mailto:bsh146@iva.ku.dk)

Daniel MARTÍNEZ-ÁVILA, Departamento de Ciência da Informação, Universidade Estadual Paulista–UNESP, Av. Hygino Muzzi Filho 737, 17525-900 Marília SP Brazil. E-mail: [dmartinezavila@marilia.unesp.br](mailto:dmartinezavila@marilia.unesp.br)

Elaine MÉNARD, School of Information Studies, McGill University, 3661 Peel Street Suite 303A, Montréal, Quebec, H3A 1X1, Canada. E-mail: [elaine.menard@mcgill.ca](mailto:elaine.menard@mcgill.ca)

Widad MUSTAFA el HADI, Université Charles de Gaulle Lille 3, URF IDIST, Domaine du Pont de Bois, Villeneuve d'Ascq 59653, France. E-mail: [widad.mustafa@free.fr](mailto:widad.mustafa@free.fr)

H. Peter OHLY, Prinzenstr. 179, D-53175 Bonn, Germany. E-mail: [president@isko.org](mailto:president@isko.org)

K. S. RAGHAVAN, KAnOE (Centre for Knowledge Analytics & Ontological Engineering), PES Institute of Technology, 100 Feet Ring Road, BSK 3rd Stage, Bangalore 560085, India.  
E-mail: [ksragav@hotmail.com](mailto:ksragav@hotmail.com)

M. P. SATIJA, Guru Nanak Dev University, School of Library and Information Science, Amritsar-143 005, India.  
E-mail: [satija\\_mp@yahoo.com](mailto:satija_mp@yahoo.com)

Aida SLAVIC, UDC Consortium, PO Box 90407, 2509 LK The Hague, The Netherlands. E-mail: [aida.slavic@udcc.org](mailto:aida.slavic@udcc.org)

Renato R. SOUZA, Applied Mathematics School, Getulio Vargas Foundation, Praia de Botafogo, 190, 3o andar, Rio de Janeiro, RJ, 22250-900, Brazil. E-mail: [renato.souza@fgv.br](mailto:renato.souza@fgv.br)

Rick SZOSTAK, University of Alberta, Department of Economics, 4 Edmonton, Alberta, Canada, T6G 2H4. E-mail: [rszostak@ualberta.ca](mailto:rszostak@ualberta.ca)

Joseph T. TENNIS, The Information School of the University of Washington, Box 352840, Mary Gates Hall Ste 370, Seattle WA 98195-2840 USA. E-mail: [jtennis@u.washington.edu](mailto:jtennis@u.washington.edu)

Maja ŽUMER, Faculty of Arts, University of Ljubljana, Askerceva 2, Ljubljana 1000 Slovenia. E-mail: [maja.zumer@ff.uni-lj.si](mailto:maja.zumer@ff.uni-lj.si)