



Concha Maria Höfler

# Boundaries and Belonging in the Greek Community of Georgia



Nomos

Border Studies.  
Cultures, Spaces, Orders

Edited by

Prof. Dr. Astrid Fellner, Saarland University

Prof. Dr. Konstanze Jungbluth, European University  
Viadrina Frankfurt (Oder)

Prof. Dr. Hannes Krämer, University of Duisburg-Essen

Dr. Christian Wille, University of Luxembourg

Volume 2

Concha Maria Höfler

# Boundaries and Belonging in the Greek Community of Georgia



**Nomos**

© Coverpicture: Concha Maria Höfler

Research for this book was made possible by a PhD scholarship from the Heinrich-Böll-Stiftung and the research project „The impact of current transformational processes on language and ethnic identity: Urum and Pontic Greeks in Georgia“ funded by the VolkswagenStiftung.

The Viadrina Center B/ORDERS IN MOTION has generously supported the publication of this book.

**Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

Zugl.: Frankfurt (Oder), Europa-Universität Viadrina, Diss., 2017

**The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

ISBN 978-3-8487-4832-7 (Print)  
978-3-8452-9050-8 (ePDF)

#### **British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-4832-7 (Print)  
978-3-8452-9050-8 (ePDF)

#### **Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Höfler, Concha Maria

Boundaries and Belonging in the Greek Community of Georgia

Concha Maria Höfler

313 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-4832-7 (Print)  
978-3-8452-9050-8 (ePDF)



Onlineversion  
Nomos eLibrary

1. Auflage 2020

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden 2020. Gesamtverantwortung für Druck und Herstellung bei der Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG. Alle Rechte, auch die des Nachdrucks von Auszügen, der fotomechanischen Wiedergabe und der Übersetzung, vorbehalten. Gedruckt auf alterungsbeständigem Papier.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to “Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort”, Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

To my parents, Johanna and Felix Höfler



## Acknowledgments

I want to thank Konstanze Jungbluth and Stavros Skopeteas for their curiosity, generosity of spirit, and trust that gave meaning to the terms *Doktormutter* and *Doktorvater* in ways I know to be far beyond how these positions are usually filled at German universities. I am also thankful for the beneficial research conditions they have provided through the project “The impact of current transformational processes on language and ethnic identity: Urum and Pontic Greeks in Georgia” funded by the VolkswagenStiftung.

I am grateful for the PhD-grant I received from the Heinrich Böll Stiftung. The ideational part of the scholarship has enriched my personal and professional life in ways I did not believe to be possible. I am particularly thankful to Louka Goetzke, Till Gierlich, Tobias Heinze, Ole Meinefeld, Solveig Selzer, and Hendrik Steppke for having stepped into my world.

The VW-project brought me in contact with many wonderful researchers. I want to thank especially Lia Melikishvili and Natia Jalabadze for our conversations over beautiful food, their gentle guidance, and insightful comments. Ekaterine Kartvelishvili generously invited me to the Greek department at Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University.

Violeta Moisiidi was the key figure in setting up interviews in Tbilisi and, together with her family, also my host during my research stays in 2010 and 2013. In welcoming me as part of their family, they were my first consultants on Georgia’s Greek community as well as my first guides to Georgia, and I am immensely grateful for both. Without Nika Loladze the field work in the regions would not have been conceivable. Thank you for being an incomparable travel companion, colleague and friend, for being always ready for discussions about our work and the world, for making me watch *Fight Club* in Georgian, and for introducing me to the Georgia I love.

I cannot thank our consultants by name. I am deeply grateful they opened their doors to us, allowed us a glimpse into their lifeworlds, and patiently answered our myriad questions, not all of which made immediate (or any) sense to them. Their recorded and transcribed voices have become intimate companions over many years. In transcribing the recordings, I was greatly assisted by Anno Chkhaidze, Ani Chutkerashvili, Sophio Gachechiladze, who transcribed the bulk of the interviews, Gvantsa Jishkariani, Nino Ushikishvili and Mariam Varazashvili.

A number of people in Georgia conspired to take my mind off my research. I would like to thank Vato Urushadze, Mako Machavariani, Iva Tskitishvili, Iva Pezuashvili, Mariam Ghambashidze, Irakli Bochorishvili, Shoko Darakhvelidze, Zura Chantladze, Rezo Pheradze, Galaqtion Eristavi, Grigol Abashidze, Sandro Gongliashvili, Beka Tsiqarishvili, Nino and Tamar Tsikhishvili for the music, the conversations, and the incomparable times. In Greece, my thanks for a warm welcome go to Christos, Sotiris and Ibo in Thessaloniki, and in Athens to Isidoros Kokos and Orestis Tsihlakis for your friendship and music. In Berlin, wonderful human beings have enticed me away from my desk, to return to it with a fresher brain. For their friendship and emotional support in various guises I want to thank Pola Brändle, Florian Fischer, Mathias Hammer, Taib Hayat, Jürgen Joseph, Sebastian Kroschinsky, Emil Lamprecht, Hugo Lancheros, Jakob Reckhenrich, Wolfgang Striewe, Sylwia Szmajdych, Kate Vredenburgh, Vicky Uhlich and Noah Wintzer. My sister and nephews are to be thanked for diverting research attention to questions of dinosaurs, aquatic life, and the writing of screenplays.

At Viadrina, Peter Rosenberg and Klaas-Hinrich Ehlers were wonderful mentors from the very beginning on matters of research and university life. I am also immensely grateful to Iris Franke and Peggy Zimmer for infallibly having my back in all spheres of university admin. I wish to thank the research group “Border and Boundary Studies” at the Viadrina Center B/Orders in Motion for providing me with intellectual shelter immediately after the PhD, and Hannes Krämer for his support and the offer to publish in this series. I thank Nomos’ Beate Bernstein, Eva Lang, and Achim Jander for their patient guidance in transforming manuscript into book. For countless stimulating discussions on and off trains, with and without beer, on research and (academic) life I thank Franziska Boll, Janett Haid, Georg Höhn (for your untiring enthusiasm as much as for the historical literature), Dorothea Horst, Lena Hotze, Maria Klessmann, Silva Ladewig, Christina Rogers, Peter Ulrich, Sascha Wölck and Dagna Zinkhahn Rhobodes.

I am deeply grateful to Dominik Gerst and Rita Vallentin for accompanying me and this book in its various stages over the years. Thank you for your scrutiny, the challenging and productive discussions, and the emotional reassurance. Many thanks to Ryan Wyeth for your patience and meticulous attention to the intricacies of English, Russian, and Georgian linguistics, and to Uri Gordon for the final eloquent polish.

I finally want to thank Jochen Hänsel for his steady companionship during the years I worked on this project, and my parents for their unfaltering support and never doubting my choices in life and research.

# Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction	19
A. Introducing the Greek community of Georgia: A note on naming	20
B. Research on Georgia's Greek community	22
C. Research questions	24
D. Outline of the book	25
Chapter 2: Historical background	27
A. Migrating from the Ottoman to the Russian Empire	28
B. The Soviet Union: Processes of homogenization and particularization	33
C. Encounters with the nation state	37
I. Georgian transformations	37
II. Emigration to Greece	42
Chapter 3: Researching identification, belonging, and the (un)making of boundaries	47
A. Processes of groupness and belonging	49
I. Imagination: Categories and groupness	50
II. Community and belonging	51
III. Actors, processes, and context	52
B. The limits of belonging: Boundaries	54
I. Qualities of boundaries	60
II. (Un)making boundaries	62
C. Methodological considerations	65
I. Categorization	66
II. Doing things with categories: Positioning the self and others	68
III. Context	75
Chapter 4: Data collection and analysis	79
A. The semi-structured interview	79
B. Who to speak to?	82
C. Constructing and entering the field	83
D. From interview data to written analysis	88

Chapter 5: “Language” as a resource for positioning	93
A. Heritage varieties	95
I. Competence and everyday language use	96
II. Speaking about and evaluating the heritage varieties	99
1. The “Choice” between language and religion	102
2. Speaking about the respective other heritage variety	110
3. Speaking about Pontic Greek	115
4. Urum as a “Problematic” heritage variety	121
III. Preliminary summary	126
B. Standard Modern Greek	128
I. Competence in SMG and evaluating its importance	128
II. Tracing belonging through competence	133
III. “We are born Greeks”: Tracing belonging through ancestry and religion	136
IV. Competence “Desirable” – uncertain evaluations	142
V. Preliminary summary	150
C. Shifting languages of (official) communication: Russian and Georgian	152
I. Competence and everyday language use	152
II. Speaking about Russian	155
III. Comparing Russian and Georgian	159
IV. Speaking about Georgian	163
D. Discussion	166
Chapter 6: Transformations: The end of the Soviet Union as a turning point	173
A. How to avoid talking about the end of the Soviet Union	179
B. The end of the Soviet Union as “Family Breakdown”	190
I. “Georgia for Georgians”: The dissolution of the “Family of Nations”	196
II. “Staying behind”: Coming to terms with emigrating family members	202
C. Discussion	206
Chapter 7: (Un)Making boundaries	209
A. Greece: Dealing with boundaries drawn by Others	210
I. Being categorized as “Different” in Greece	214
II. Relating “Nation” and “Citizenship”	222
III. Contesting the category “Greek”	234

IV. Preliminary summary	246
B. Ts'alk'a: Struggling to belong	248
C. Belonging to Georgia and blurring boundaries	261
D. Irreducible differences? "Religion" and "Ancestry"	271
Chapter 8: Discussion	277
Chapter 9: Conclusion	289
Appendix A: Sociolinguistic metadata	291
Bibliography	295



## List of Figures

2.1	Areas of Origin	28
4.1	Research Sites	84
5.1	Urum Greeks: Competence in and evaluation of the necessity of competence in SMG	132
5.2	Pontic Greeks: Competence in and evaluation of the necessity of competence in SMG.	132



## List of Tables

5.1	Self-assessed competence in the respective heritage variety	97
5.2	Transfer of respective heritage variety to children (competent speakers)	98
5.3	Personal importance of heritage variety	100
5.4	Self-assessed language competence in SMG	129
5.5	Age and self-assessed language competence in SMG	130
5.6	Is competence in SMG necessary in order to consider oneself Greek?	131
5.7	Self-assessed competence in Georgian	153
6.1	Evaluation of life in the Soviet Union	175
7.1	Being accepted as “genuine Greeks” in Greece	212
7.2	Feeling as “Greek”, “Georgian”, or both	268
7.3	Is it acceptable to marry a person who is not “Greek”?	272



## Transcription conventions

The transcription is based on the *Gesprächsanalytische Transkriptionssystem GAT 2* nach Selting et al. (2009).

°h / h°	in-/exhalation
(-)	short estimated break of about 0.2-0.5 second
(-)	medium estimated break of about 0.5-0.8 second
(—)	longer estimated break of about 0.8-1 second
(1.3)	longer measured break
[ ]	simultaneous articulation of two or more speakers
because_ah	slurring
bec_	abrupt cut-off
((laughs))	para- and non-verbal activities
<<smiling> >	smiling utterance with range
(x), (xx)	one/two unintelligible syllables
((unintelligible 1.2))	unintelligible sequence with duration
(and)	unclear or probable item
(they/they're)	probable alternatives
: :: :::	lengthening, duration analogue to breaks
akZENT	focus accent

