

## Acknowledgements

I was born in a society where the fact of having a physical, mental or sensory impairment was synonym to uselessness and considered god's punishment. How bitter it was for me as a child to realize that I belong to this minority. The long chain of 'repair' efforts, societal rejection and structural discrimination were unable to diminish my profound believe in equal rights of Disabled persons (hereinafter referred as DPs). Rather they strengthened my resolution to dissolve historic discrimination through the examination of legal norms, actors and processes of the states that prevent or ensure the implementation, promotion and protection of equal rights of DPs.

The wish of conducting multi-level cross-country study could be realized through the PROMI- Project funded by the Federal Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, as well as the financial support of the University of Kassel.

For the successful completion of my doctoral dissertation, I am deeply indebted to my supervisor Prof. Dr. iur. Felix Welti, whose unparalleled academic advice, invaluable professional guidance, unwavering support and commitment created an ideal and equal academic environment.

Deep appreciation should be extended also to Prof. Dr. Sabine Ruß-Sattar for her constructive guidance and valuable advice in the field of political science.

Next, I express my sincere gratitude to the head of the institute of Civil Law at the University of Innsbruck, Prof. Dr. Jur Michael Ganner for the opportunity and support in carrying out two-week field study at his institute.

Further thanks go to my interview partners for their time and the insights that were key to the present research work.

I am also extremely grateful to my assistants, whose devoted support during numerous national and international conferences and interviews, as well as their valuable help in making the countless books and articles accessible were instrumental for the successful completion of my doctoral project.

Many thanks also to my colleagues for their helpful questions and advice during the annual colloquia of the Department of Social and Health Care Law, Rehabilitation and Disability Law at the University of Kassel and for the nice atmosphere at the department.

## *Acknowledgements*

And last but not least, I wish to extend my deepest gratitude to my family for their support and learned ability to be proud of me as I am; to my cousin, Narine, who took care of my son during my business trips; to my son, Menua for his understanding when I could not be with him as much as I would dream of, for his profound belief in my abilities and unconditional love that served as a lighthouse on days when I was in disparity. I dedicate this work to him.

# Table of Contents

|                                                                |    |
|----------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| List of Table                                                  | 17 |
| List of Abbreviations                                          | 19 |
| I. Introduction                                                | 25 |
| 1. Introduction to the subject of investigation                | 25 |
| 2. Research questions                                          | 27 |
| 3. Research Design                                             | 28 |
| 3.1 Research Gaps                                              | 28 |
| 3.2 Conceptual Framework                                       | 30 |
| 3.3 Analytical Framework                                       | 31 |
| 4. Structure of the Researchwork                               | 32 |
| II. Development of Analytical Framework                        | 35 |
| 1. Conceptualisation of Governance                             | 35 |
| 1.1 Multi-level Governance                                     | 36 |
| 1.1.1 TYPE I MLG                                               | 37 |
| 1.1.2 TYPE II MLG                                              | 37 |
| 1.2 Federal and Unitary Systems                                | 38 |
| 1.2.1 Federal systems                                          | 38 |
| 1.2.2 Unitary Systems                                          | 40 |
| 2. Conceptualisation of Legal Systems                          | 41 |
| 2.1 Legal Systems                                              | 41 |
| 2.1.1 Civil Law Legal Systems                                  | 43 |
| 2.2 The Reception and Execution of International Law           | 44 |
| 2.2.1 The Reception of International Law                       | 44 |
| 2.2.2 The Execution of International Law at the Domestic Level | 45 |
| 3. MLG and CPRD Implementation                                 | 48 |
| 3.1 CPRD Monitoring at the International Level                 | 49 |

## Table of Contents

|         |                                                         |     |
|---------|---------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3.2     | EU Disability Framework                                 | 53  |
| 3.2.1   | EU Primary Law                                          | 53  |
| 3.2.2   | EU Secondary Law                                        | 56  |
| 3.2.3   | European Disability Strategies                          | 57  |
| 3.2.4   | The CPRD Conclusion by the EU                           | 58  |
| 3.3     | CPRD Implementation at the National Level               | 62  |
| 3.3.1   | CPRD Implementation at the Sub-National Level           | 63  |
| 3.3.2   | Focal Points                                            | 66  |
| 3.3.3   | Coordination Mechanisms                                 | 68  |
| 3.3.4   | National Human Rights Institutions                      | 68  |
| 3.3.4.1 | Independence and Legal Status                           | 71  |
| 3.3.4.2 | Composition                                             | 72  |
| A.      | Pluralist representation                                | 73  |
| B.      | Adequate infrastructure                                 | 75  |
| C.      | Method of appointment/dismissal                         | 77  |
| 3.3.4.3 | Mandate, Competence and Responsibilities                | 78  |
| A.      | Promotion Competence                                    | 78  |
| B.      | Protection Competence                                   | 81  |
| C.      | Monitoring Competence                                   | 83  |
| 3.3.4.4 | Methods of Operation                                    | 84  |
| A.      | System of multi-level NHRIs/MFs                         | 84  |
| B.      | Multi-level cooperation with state and non-state bodies | 85  |
| 3.3.5   | Organized Interests                                     | 87  |
| 3.3.5.1 | Types of Organized Interests                            | 88  |
| 3.3.5.2 | DPO Types in the LMG Framework                          | 89  |
| III.    | Research Methodology                                    | 95  |
| 1.      | The comparative method in political analysis            | 95  |
| 1.1     | Method of congruence                                    | 97  |
| 1.2     | Method of Systematic Process Analysis                   | 98  |
| 2.      | Case Study approach                                     | 99  |
| 2.1     | Case Selection                                          | 101 |
| 2.2     | Choice of Representative Case                           | 103 |
| 3.      | MSSD and MDSD                                           | 103 |
| 3.1     | Most Similar Systems Design                             | 103 |
| 3.2     | Most Different Systems Design                           | 104 |

|                                                                                               |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3.3 Application within this Research Work                                                     | 104 |
| 4. Methods of data Collection and Analysis                                                    | 110 |
| 4.1 Documentation Analysis                                                                    | 110 |
| 4.2 Expert Interviews                                                                         | 113 |
| 4.2.1 Application of systematizing expert interviews                                          | 116 |
| 4.2.2 Technical Details                                                                       | 121 |
| IV. State Actors and National Implementation                                                  | 125 |
| 1. Structure of states and their constitutional organs                                        | 125 |
| 1.1 Federal Republic of Germany                                                               | 125 |
| 1.1.1 Federal Level Constitutional Organs                                                     | 126 |
| 1.1.1.1 Structure and resources of federal Focal Point                                        | 128 |
| 1.1.1.2 Structure and resources of federal-level<br>Coordination Mechanism                    | 129 |
| 1.1.2 Länder-level constitutional organs                                                      | 131 |
| 1.1.2.1 Structure and resources of Länder-level Focal<br>Points                               | 132 |
| 1.1.2.2 Structure and resources of Länder-level<br>Coordination Mechanisms                    | 134 |
| 1.2 Federal Republic of Austria                                                               | 136 |
| 1.2.1 Federal Level Constitutional Organs                                                     | 137 |
| 1.2.1.1 Structure and resources of Austrian federal Focal<br>Point and Coordination Mechanism | 139 |
| 1.2.2 Länder-level constitutional organs                                                      | 141 |
| 1.2.2.1 Länder-level Focal Points and Coordination<br>Mechanisms                              | 142 |
| 1.3 Kingdom of Denmark                                                                        | 144 |
| 1.3.1 Structure and resources of Danish Focal Point and<br>Coordination Mechanism             | 144 |
| 2. Division of Legislative and Executive Competencies                                         | 147 |
| 2.1 Federal Republic of Germany                                                               | 147 |
| 2.1.1 Exclusive legislative competencies                                                      | 147 |
| 2.1.2 Concurrent legislative competencies                                                     | 149 |
| 2.2 Federal Republic of Austria                                                               | 152 |
| 2.3 Kingdom of Denmark                                                                        | 154 |

|                                                                                                              |     |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3. Incorporation and application of International Law in the domestic legal system                           | 156 |
| 3.1 Federal Republic of Germany                                                                              | 156 |
| 3.2 Federal Republic of Austria                                                                              | 158 |
| 3.3 Kingdom of Denmark                                                                                       | 160 |
| 4. CPRD Ratification, Incorporation and Application                                                          | 162 |
| 4.1 Federal Republic of Germany                                                                              | 162 |
| 4.1.1 Ratification and legal status                                                                          | 162 |
| 4.1.2 CPRD incorporation and application in the policy fields under the legislative powers of federation     | 164 |
| 4.1.2.1 Responsibilities of the federal Focal Point and Coordination Mechanism                               | 164 |
| 4.1.2.2 Legislative Action                                                                                   | 166 |
| 4.1.2.3 Consideration by the Courts                                                                          | 168 |
| 4.1.3 CPRD incorporation and application in the policy fields under the legislative powers of federal states | 170 |
| 4.1.3.1 Responsibilities of Focal Points and Coordination Mechanisms                                         | 170 |
| 4.1.3.2 Legislative action and consideration by the courts in the field of cultural rights                   | 173 |
| 4.1.3.2.1 Reasonable educational accommodations                                                              | 176 |
| 4.1.3.2.2 Accessible schools                                                                                 | 178 |
| 4.2 Federal Republic of Austria                                                                              | 180 |
| 4.2.1 Ratification, legal status and consideration by the courts                                             | 180 |
| 4.2.2 Responsibilities of Focal Point/Coordination Mechanisms and legislative actions                        | 184 |
| 4.3 Kingdom of Denmark                                                                                       | 189 |
| 4.3.1 Ratification, legal status and consideration by the courts                                             | 189 |
| 4.3.2 Responsibilities of Danish Focal Point/Coordination Mechanism and legislative actions                  | 194 |
| 5. Comparative evaluation                                                                                    | 197 |
| 5.1 Effective restructuring                                                                                  | 197 |
| 5.2 Adequate resources                                                                                       | 198 |
| 5.3 Horizontal and vertical coordination                                                                     | 199 |

|         |                                                                  |     |
|---------|------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 5.4     | Democratic control and accountability                            | 201 |
| 5.5     | Multi-level equity of implementation                             | 204 |
| V.      | National Monitoring Mechanisms                                   | 211 |
| 1.      | Structure of National Monitoring Mechanisms                      | 211 |
| 1.1     | German National Monitoring Body                                  | 211 |
| 1.1.1   | Legal status and system                                          | 211 |
| 1.1.2   | Pluralist representation and the method of appointment/dismissal | 213 |
| 1.2     | Austrian Monitoring Framework                                    | 216 |
| 1.1.1   | Legal status and system                                          | 216 |
| 1.2.2   | Pluralist representation and the method of appointment/dismissal | 218 |
| 1.2.2.1 | Federal Monitoring Committee                                     | 218 |
| 1.2.2.2 | Provincial Monitoring Committees                                 | 219 |
| 1.3     | Danish Monitoring Framework                                      | 220 |
| 1.3.1   | Legal status and System                                          | 220 |
| 1.3.2   | Pluralist representation and method of appointment/dismissal     | 223 |
| 1.3.2.1 | Danish Institute of Human Rights                                 | 223 |
| 1.3.2.2 | Danish Parliamentary Ombudsman                                   | 225 |
| 1.3.2.3 | Danish Disability Council                                        | 225 |
| 2.      | Resources of National Monitoring Mechanisms                      | 226 |
| 2.1     | German National Monitoring Body                                  | 226 |
| 2.2     | Austrian Monitoring Framework                                    | 230 |
| 2.3     | Danish Monitoring Framework                                      | 231 |
| 3.      | Mandate of National Monitoring Mechanisms                        | 233 |
| 3.1     | German National Monitoring Body                                  | 233 |
| 3.1.1   | Promotion                                                        | 233 |
| 3.1.2   | Monitoring                                                       | 236 |
| 3.1.3   | Protection                                                       | 237 |
| 3.1.4   | Multi-level Cooperation with state and non-state bodies          | 239 |
| 3.2     | Austrian Monitoring Framework                                    | 242 |
| 3.2.1   | Promotion                                                        | 243 |
| 3.2.2   | Monitoring                                                       | 244 |
| 3.2.3   | Protection                                                       | 245 |

## Table of Contents

|                                                                    |     |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3.2.4 Multi-Level Cooperation                                      | 245 |
| 3.3 Danish Monitoring Framework                                    | 248 |
| 3.3.1 Promotion                                                    | 248 |
| 3.3.2 Monitoring                                                   | 250 |
| 3.3.3 Protection                                                   | 252 |
| 3.3.4 Multi-level cooperation with state and non-state bodies      | 254 |
| 4. Comparative Evaluation                                          | 257 |
| 4.1 Legal Status                                                   | 258 |
| 4.2 Multi-level competence                                         | 258 |
| 4.3 Broad Mandate                                                  | 259 |
| 4.3.1 Promotion mandate                                            | 260 |
| 4.3.2 Monitoring mandate                                           | 260 |
| 4.3.3 Protection mandate                                           | 261 |
| 4.4 Inclusive composition and independence                         | 262 |
| 4.4.1 Non-state actors                                             | 263 |
| 4.4.2 State actors                                                 | 264 |
| 4.5 Appointment and dismissal                                      | 266 |
| 4.6 Adequate infrastructure                                        | 267 |
| 4.7 Accessibility                                                  | 268 |
| 4.8 Cooperation at the vertical and horizontal governmental levels | 269 |
| VI. Organizations of DPs                                           | 271 |
| 1. Structures of DPOS                                              | 271 |
| 1.1 Structure of German DPOs                                       | 271 |
| 1.1.1 Legal Framework and Governing Configuration                  | 271 |
| 1.1.2 Types of Disability Organizations                            | 275 |
| A. Individual organizations                                        | 275 |
| B. Collective representation                                       | 276 |
| 1.1.3 Multi-level representation                                   | 279 |
| 1.2 Structure of Austrian DPOs                                     | 283 |
| 1.2.1 Legal Framework and Governing Configuration                  | 283 |
| 1.2.2 Types of Disability Organizations                            | 285 |
| A. Individual Organizations                                        | 285 |
| B. Collective Representation                                       | 285 |
| 1.2.3 Multi-Level Representation                                   | 287 |



|         |                                                                |     |
|---------|----------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 1.3     | Structure of Danish DPOS                                       | 288 |
| 1.3.1   | Legal framework and governing configuration                    | 288 |
| 1.3.2   | Types of Disability organizations                              | 290 |
|         | A. Individual Organizations                                    | 290 |
|         | B. Collective Representation                                   | 292 |
| 1.3.3   | Multi-Level Representation                                     | 292 |
| 2.      | Resources of DPOS                                              | 294 |
| 2.1     | Resources of German DPOs                                       | 294 |
| 2.2     | Resources of Austrian DPOs                                     | 302 |
| 2.3     | Resources of Danish DPOS                                       | 304 |
| 3.      | Aims and Actions of DPOS                                       | 305 |
| 3.1     | Aims and Actions of German DPOs                                | 305 |
| 3.1.1   | Promoting the rights of DPs in decision-making processes       | 306 |
| 3.1.1.1 | Participation in Advisory Bodies                               | 307 |
| 3.1.1.2 | Participation at decision-making processes of executive organs | 310 |
| 3.1.1.3 | Participation at legislative processes of parliaments          | 316 |
| 3.1.2   | Monitoring the implementation of the rights of DPs             | 322 |
| 3.1.3   | Protecting the rights of DPs                                   | 325 |
| 3.2     | Aims and Actions of Austrian DPOs                              | 330 |
| 3.2.1   | Promoting the rights of DPs in legislative processes           | 331 |
| 3.2.1.1 | Participation in Advisory Bodies                               | 331 |
| 3.2.1.2 | Participation at decision-making processes of executive organs | 333 |
| 3.2.1.3 | Participation at legislative processes of parliaments          | 337 |
| 3.2.2   | Monitoring the implementation of the rights of DPs             | 338 |
| 3.2.3   | Protecting the rights of DPs                                   | 340 |
| 3.3     | Aims and Actions of Danish DPOS                                | 342 |
| 3.3.1   | Promoting the rights of DPs in legislative processes           | 342 |
| 3.3.1.1 | Participation in advisory bodies                               | 343 |
| 3.3.1.2 | Participation at decision-making processes of executive organs | 345 |
| 3.3.1.3 | Participation at legislative processes of parliament           | 350 |

## *Table of Contents*

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3.3.2 Monitoring the implementation of the rights of DPs                                                                                                                                                                          | 351 |
| 3.3.3 Protecting the rights of DPs                                                                                                                                                                                                | 353 |
| 4. Comparative Evaluation                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 356 |
| 4.1 Multi-level structural configuration of DPOs                                                                                                                                                                                  | 357 |
| 4.2 Resources of DPOs in multi-level prospective                                                                                                                                                                                  | 361 |
| 4.3 Vertical and horizontal level political participation of DPOs                                                                                                                                                                 | 363 |
| 4.4 DPO Involvement in monitoring activities                                                                                                                                                                                      | 368 |
| 4.5 Alternative instruments of influence                                                                                                                                                                                          | 370 |
| 4.5.1 Awareness Raising Activities                                                                                                                                                                                                | 370 |
| 4.5.2 Collective Legal Action                                                                                                                                                                                                     | 371 |
| VII. Conclusion                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 381 |
| 1. How is the CPRD incorporated in the domestic law and how can this type of incorporation affect the implementation of the Convention?                                                                                           | 381 |
| 2. How are the actors under the Art. 33 CPRD financed?                                                                                                                                                                            | 382 |
| 2.1 FPs and CMs                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 382 |
| 2.2 National Monitoring Frameworks                                                                                                                                                                                                | 383 |
| 2.3 Organizations of DPs                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 384 |
| 3. How is the interplay within and between the actors under the Art. 33 CPRD organized and what are the roles of these actors in the implementation process of the Convention at the vertical and horizontal governmental levels? | 385 |
| Bibliography                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | 387 |

List of Table

|          |                                          |     |
|----------|------------------------------------------|-----|
| Table 1: | Status and Inclusive Mandate Safeguards  | 107 |
| Table 2: | Inclusive Composition Safeguards         | 107 |
| Table 3: | Promotion Safeguards                     | 108 |
| Table 4: | Protection Safeguards                    | 108 |
| Table 5: | Monitoring Safeguards                    | 109 |
| Table 6: | Accessibility and Cooperation Safeguards | 109 |

