

Myroslava Rap

The Public Role of the Church in Contemporary Ukrainian Society

The Contribution of the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church
to Peace and Reconciliation



Nomos

 Aschendorff
Verlag

Das *Institut für Theologie und Frieden* hat die Aufgabe, die ethischen Grundlagen menschlicher Friedensordnung zu erforschen und in den aktuellen friedenspolitischen Diskurs hineinzutragen. Mit den „Studien zur Friedensethik“ wird eine friedensethische Vertiefung der außen- und sicherheitspolitischen Debatte angestrebt. Dabei geht es letztlich um die Frage: Durch welche Politik wird den heute von Gewalt, Armut und Unfreiheit bedrohten Menschen am besten geholfen und zugleich der Errichtung einer zukünftigen friedlichen internationalen Ordnung gedient, in der Sicherheit, Wahrung der Gerechtigkeit und Achtung der Menschenrechte für alle gewährleistet werden?

Studien zur Friedensethik

Studies on Peace Ethics

edited by
Prof. Dr. Heinz-Gerhard Justenhoven
Dr. Bernhard Koch

Volume 53

Myroslava Rap

The Public Role of the Church in Contemporary Ukrainian Society

The Contribution of the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church
to Peace and Reconciliation



Nomos

 **Aschendorff**
Verlag

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

ISBN HB (Nomos) 978-3-8487-2210-5
ePDF (Nomos) 978-3-8452-6305-2

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN HB (Nomos) 978-3-8487-2210-5
ePDF (Nomos) 978-3-8452-6305-2

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Rap, Myroslava

The Public Role of the Church in Contemporary Ukrainian Society

The Contribution of the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church to Peace and Reconciliation
Myroslava Rap

500 p.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN HB (Nomos) 978-3-8487-2210-5
ePDF (Nomos) 978-3-8452-6305-2

ISBN 978-3402-11697-5 (Aschendorff Verlag, Münster)

Die Schriftenreihen ‚Beiträge zur Friedensethik‘ und ‚Theologie und Frieden‘ sind jeweils bis Band 44 beim Verlag W. Kohlhammer, Stuttgart, erschienen.

1. Edition 2015

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2015. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to “Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort”, Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

Foreword

This book addresses the issue of reconciliation in the Ukrainian context from the point of view of one of the most socially active religious communities in the country, the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church. The research is very topical at least in the view of the current Ukrainian-Russian crisis. Analysing the relevant official documents of the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church on reconciliation, the author traces how this Church comes to terms with the burdened pages of Ukrainian history and their repercussions for the current struggling of Ukraine on the way to its constitutionalisation as a true modern state.

This monograph is a very new one and at the same time not completely up-to-date. The book captures the stance of Ukrainian society and the developments within the Ukrainian Churches till the end of the Revolution of Dignity. A number of important changes, defining the societal and ecclesial situation in Ukraine after March 2014, are not covered. Among them are, for instance, the escalation of the Russian-Ukrainian relations that took place after the annexation of the Crimea Peninsula, the fluctuations within the Ukrainian Orthodox Church of the Moscow Patriarchate after in August 2014 she got a new Head, a pro-Moscow Metropolitan Onufrii, or the growing alienation between Ukrainians and Russians. However, the powerful waves of changes, which rolled over Ukraine in the last year, do not make the conclusions driven in the monograph untenable. This book has to be regarded as a background to better understand the current troubles of Ukraine and the new challenges of reconciliation. For instance, having read the paragraphs on the problems of reconciliation between the Ukrainian Churches and the Moscow Patriarchate, the reader will develop a clearer picture of the current conflict between Russia and Ukraine and how it could escalate to that extent. It is also evident that not only drawing lessons from World War II, but also coming to terms with the legacy of the current Russian-Ukrainian confrontation will be a big task for the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church in the future. After the developments of 2014 the Ukrainian Churches have to reassess their role in society and their reconciliation strategies.

Obviously, this research has its limitations. I wrote this book as a Greek-Catholic. I may seem not to be critical enough with regard to my Church; however, I consider this monograph to be an important testimony

to the stance of the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church, a testimony which sometimes fails. In a context where this Church is not always granted the right to express her position or when this position is ignored or silenced (as is evident in the dialogue between the Moscow Patriarchate and the Vatican), it is important that those embedded in the Greek-Catholic tradition explain the concerns of their Church. This is what I have done in my research.

This book came into life as a PhD thesis defended in September 2014 at the faculty of Theology and Religious Studies of the Leuven Catholic University in Belgium. Many people came along and were helpful in various ways in the course of working on this research project; this is a proper place to name some of them. The first words of gratitude I owe to both my supervisors. I am grateful to Prof. Dr Johan Verstraeten for his suggestions concerning the scientific part of my project, for challenging intellectual discussions, and for giving me the chance to scoop from his boundless knowledge. My fascination with the topic of reconciliation I developed during the lectures of Prof. Verstraeten, when I was a Master student in Theology at the Leuven Catholic University in 2004-2006.

My heartfelt gratitude goes to my co-supervisor, Dr Lesia Kovalenko, for helping me learn theoretically and come in touch practically with the social dimension of the teaching and activities of the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church. It is greatly her merit that I decided to engage in the adventure of that research project. I was fortunate that Dr Kovalenko was my employer at the Institute of Religion and Society in Lviv and taught me valuable organisational and analytical skills, which were of tremendous help during the work on my research project.

The long journey of the unfolding of this research project began in the Ukrainian Catholic University in Lviv that assisted me in looking for a scholarship and trusted in my ability to successfully complete my doctoral studies in Leuven. I am grateful to the Porticus Foundation for providing the greater amount of financial assistance necessary to make possible my residence and studies in Belgium. I immensely appreciate Dr Jos Vanachter for his patient, punctual, committed, and precise way of correcting my English. My special gratefulness goes to Prof. Dr Justenhofen, one of the scientific correctors of my dissertation, for making possible the publication of this monograph. And finally, I owe thanks to my family both in Switzerland and Ukraine for their caring support and active interest in the progress of my research.

Laufenburg, AG, January 1, 2015

Myroslava Rap

Table of contents

| | |
|--|----------------|
| List of abbreviations and acronyms | 13 |
| List of diagrams | 15 |
| General Introduction | 17 |
| Chapter I. Religious context of Ukrainian society today – the background to research | 37 |
| Introduction | 37 |
| 1.1 Religious pluralism in Ukraine | 38 |
| 1.2 Religiosity of Ukrainians | 45 |
| 1.3 Religious revival and the traditional Ukrainian Churches | 50 |
| 1.3.1 Traditional Orthodox denominations | 52 |
| 1.3.1.1 The Ukrainian Orthodox Church In the shadow of the Moscow Patriarchate Vectors of confrontations | 52 52 54 |
| 1.3.1.2 The Ukrainian Autocephalous Orthodox Church At the rampart of Orthodox autocephaly in Ukraine Vectors of confrontations | 59 59 60 |
| 1.3.1.3 The Ukrainian Orthodox Church of the Kyiv Patriarchate On the way to a national Church Vectors of confrontations | 63 63 65 |
| 1.3.2 Traditional Catholic denominations | 69 |
| 1.3.2.1 The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church Survival in the Soviet underground Vectors of confrontations | 69 69 71 |
| 1.3.2.2 The Roman-Catholic Church | 77 |
| 1.4 The interconfessional conflict in Ukraine as a conflict of identities | 78 |
| 1.4.1 The issues of the self-identity of the Churches | 80 |
| 1.4.1.1 Identity and Orthodox denominations | 80 |
| 1.4.1.2 The doctrine of the <i>Russkiy Mir</i> | 85 |

Table of contents

| | | |
|-------------|--|-----|
| 1.4.1.3 | Identity and the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church | 90 |
| 1.4.2 | Identity, nationalism, Churches | 91 |
| 1.5 | Ukrainian post-atheism | 95 |
| 1.5.1 | Typical features of Ukrainian post-atheism | 95 |
| 1.5.2 | Church and state in Ukraine | 96 |
| 1.5.2.1 | Legal basis | 96 |
| 1.5.2.2 | Intrusion of the state | 97 |
| 1.5.2.3 | Cooperative attitude of the Churches | 100 |
| 1.5.2.4 | The idea of a national (state) Church in Ukraine | 105 |
| 1.6 | The role of the media in the interconfessional conflicts | 109 |
| | Conclusion | 114 |
| Part I. | The essence and challenges of reconciliation | 119 |
| | Introduction to Part I | 119 |
| Chapter II. | Who are victims? Who is guilty? Moral diagnosis of the Ukrainian past | 120 |
| 2.1 | Poland and Ukraine – neighbours in peace? | 120 |
| 2.1.1 | Together but still separated | 120 |
| 2.1.2 | Historically embedded conflicts and the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church | 125 |
| | Conflicts on the Cemetery of the Lviv Eaglets | 126 |
| | The Volyn tragedy | 129 |
| | The Operation Vistula | 135 |
| 2.2 | War has finished – war continues | 138 |
| 2.2.1 | Plurality of war memories | 138 |
| 2.2.2 | The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church: reinterpreting the established image of war | 142 |
| 2.3 | Divided Church – divided nation | 145 |
| | The wound of division | 146 |
| | The sin of pride | 146 |
| | Intrusion of the state | 147 |
| | The Union of Brest and the Church division | 149 |
| | “No” to the Soviet methods of struggle | 150 |
| 2.4 | Difficult northern neighbour | 151 |
| 2.4.1 | Heavy load of historical burden | 151 |
| | Contesting issues | 151 |
| | Reconciliation between Ukraine and Russia | 154 |
| | Legalisation and property conflicts | 155 |
| | Moscow and the Lviv Pseudo-Synod | 157 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| The Russian Orthodox Church as a victim | 159 |
| Current coexistence | 162 |
| 2.4.2 Reconciliation between nations through reconciliation between Churches? | 163 |
| 2.5 Struggle between two Ukraines | 170 |
| 2.5.1 History, identity, language | 170 |
| History and identity | 170 |
| The answer of the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church | 174 |
| Language | 177 |
| 2.5.2 The trauma of the Holodomor | 179 |
| Chapter III. Understanding of reconciliation | 184 |
| 3.1 The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church: reconciliation as the spiritual regeneration of the person | 184 |
| 3.1.1 John Paul II as the advocate of reconciliation in Ukraine | 184 |
| 3.1.2 The Greek-Catholic tradition of reconciliation | 188 |
| 3.1.3 The human heart – the locus of reconciliation | 192 |
| The heart as the core of the human person | 192 |
| Where the changes are born | 194 |
| 3.1.4 Reconciliation with the help of God | 197 |
| 3.1.5 Reconciliation as a Christian obligation | 200 |
| 3.1.6 Reconciliation as a spiritual testament and legacy of martyrs | 202 |
| 3.2 Robert Schreier: reconciliation as a healing | 206 |
| 3.2.1 Horizontal and vertical dimensions of reconciliation | 207 |
| 3.2.2 Practical theology of reconciliation | 210 |
| Principle 1. “God is the author of reconciliation” | 210 |
| Principle 2. “God begins with victims” | 211 |
| Principle 3. “God makes of the victim and the wrongdoer a ‘new creation’” | 211 |
| Principle 4. Place the suffering of the victim in the story of the suffering of Christ | 212 |
| Principle 5. Eschatological completion of reconciliation | 214 |
| 3.2.3 “Reconciliation is more a spirituality than a strategy” | 215 |
| 3.2.4 Reconciliation as a metanoia | 217 |
| 3.3 Miroslav Volf: Reconciliation as embrace | 218 |
| 3.4 John Paul Lederach: reconciliation as the restoration of the fabric of community | 222 |
| Chapter IV. Elements of reconciliation | 228 |
| 4.1 On the demands for repentance | 228 |

Table of contents

| | | |
|----------|--|-----|
| 4.1.1 | The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church: repentance as the individual conversion of the heart | 228 |
| 4.1.2 | Miroslav Volf: “To repent of what perpetrators do to our soul” | 231 |
| 4.2 | On the path to forgiveness | 234 |
| 4.2.1 | The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church: “We forgive and ask for forgiveness” | 234 |
| 4.2.2 | Miroslav Volf: the centrality of forgiveness | 243 |
| 4.2.2.1 | Forgiveness as a gift and an obligation | 243 |
| 4.2.2.2 | The dynamics of forgiveness | 245 |
| 4.2.2.3 | Making space for the other | 248 |
| 4.2.3 | Robert Schreiter: forgiveness as a grace to attend to the moral failures of the past | 250 |
| 4.3 | On the challenges of justice | 252 |
| 4.3.1 | The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church: on the deficit of justice | 252 |
| | Which justice? | 252 |
| | Bringing about changes in Ukrainian society | 257 |
| | Some incitements for discussion | 263 |
| 4.3.2 | John Paul Lederach: conflicts originate from the lack of social justice | 269 |
| 4.3.3 | Robert Schreiter: overcoming structural injustices – soothing social tensions – advancing reconciliation | 270 |
| 4.3.4 | Miroslav Volf: genuine justice involves embrace | 273 |
| | Conclusion to Part I | 278 |
| Part II. | Memory and practical steps to reconciliation and Christian unity | 281 |
| | Introduction to Part II | 281 |
| | Chapter V. Healing of the burdened memory | 283 |
| 5.1 | The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church: on history and memory | 283 |
| 5.1.1 | The duty to remember | 283 |
| 5.1.2 | “Leave the past to God and... to historians” | 286 |
| 5.1.3 | The purification of memory | 289 |
| | The individual examination of the conscience | 290 |
| | Learning the truth about the past | 292 |
| | Drawing lessons from the past | 294 |
| 5.1.4 | The healing of memory: main issues | 296 |

| | | |
|-------------|---|-----|
| 5.1.4.1 | Polish-Ukrainian reconciliation | 296 |
| | Reconciliation through prayer | 296 |
| | What unites both nations | 299 |
| | “The past through the prism of Christianity” | 301 |
| 5.1.4.2 | Healing the memories of World War II | 305 |
| | Teaching: redefining victory in moral terms | 305 |
| | What others say | 311 |
| | The actions | 315 |
| 5.1.4.3 | Reconciliation with the Russian Orthodox Church | 317 |
| | Recognition of historical faults | 317 |
| | Destruction of Orthodox dioceses in western Ukraine | 322 |
| | The struggle for the patriarchal status of the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church | 324 |
| | When will the Patriarchs meet? | 327 |
| 5.1.4.4 | The missing memory of Jews | 331 |
| | Tony Judt. Why the memory of Jews is absent in Ukraine: the point of view of a historian | 331 |
| | Omer Bartov. The guilt of Ukrainians from the point of view of a Jew | 336 |
| | Myroslav Marynovych. Jewish-Ukrainian reconciliation from the point of view of a Greek-Catholic | 339 |
| | The controversy on Metropolitan Andrei Sheptytskyi | 344 |
| | The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church on the Jewish-Ukrainian relations | 350 |
| 5.2 | Robert Schreiter: on the moral truth of the past | 356 |
| 5.2.1 | Social healing of memories | 356 |
| 5.2.2 | Discovering the moral truth of the past | 360 |
| 5.3 | Miroslav Volf: how to treat the burdened memory | 362 |
| 5.3.1 | Rules of salutary remembering | 362 |
| 5.3.2 | Slipping into oblivion | 372 |
| Chapter VI. | On the value of spiritual unity or how to promote reconciliation | 374 |
| 6.1 | The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church: how spiritual unity may advance social transformation | 374 |
| 6.1.1 | All-Ukrainian reconciliation for the transformation of the country | 374 |
| 6.1.2 | Reconciliation between the Churches – spiritual unification of Ukraine | 379 |

| | | |
|---------|---|-----|
| 6.1.2.1 | The ecumenical significance of the Patriarchate of the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church | 381 |
| 6.1.2.2 | The united Kyivan Church | 385 |
| | “Holiness of united people of God” | 385 |
| | The inclusive Ukrainian/Kyivan Patriarchate | 387 |
| | Not uniatism but communion | 390 |
| | Practical project of communion | 395 |
| | Unity in diversity | 396 |
| 6.1.2.3 | Practical steps towards Church unity in Ukraine | 398 |
| 6.1.2.4 | Unity of the Church – unity of the nation | 402 |
| 6.2 | John Paul Lederach: on moral imagination or how to promote social changes | 409 |
| 6.2.1 | The dynamics of moral imagination | 409 |
| 6.2.2 | The value of relationships | 411 |
| 6.2.2.1 | Feeling connected | 411 |
| 6.2.2.2 | The qualities of web-making | 416 |
| 6.2.2.3 | Language, narratives | 418 |
| 6.2.2.4 | Building the platforms of cooperation | 420 |
| 6.2.3 | The role of the Church in reconciliation: educate, empower, sanctify | 422 |
| 6.3 | Robert Schreiter: how to reach reconciliation | 426 |
| 6.3.1 | The dynamics of transition and challenges to reconciliation | 426 |
| 6.3.2 | Rituals and sacraments in the service of reconciliation | 428 |
| | Conclusion to Part II | 431 |
| | General conclusion. The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church’s approach to reconciliation: The reappraisal | 433 |
| | Bibliography | 449 |

List of abbreviations and acronyms

| | |
|---------|---|
| Gulag | <i>Glavnoye upravlyeniye ispravitel'no-trudovykh lagyerey i koloniy</i> , the Main Administration of Corrective Labour Camps and Labour Settlements in the USSR |
| KGB | <i>Komitet gosudarstvennoy bezopasnosti</i> , the Committee for State Security of the USSR |
| OUN–UPA | <i>Orhanizatsiia ukrainskykh natsionalistiv – Ukrainska povstanska armiia</i> , the Organisation of the Ukrainian Nationalists – the Ukrainian Insurgent Army |
| ROC | The Russian Orthodox Church |
| SVU | <i>Spilka vyzvolennia Ukrainy</i> , the League for the Liberation of Ukraine |
| UGCC | The Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church |
| UPA | <i>Ukrainska povstanska armiia</i> , the Ukrainian Insurgent Army |
| USSR | The Union of Soviet Socialist Republics |

List of diagrams

| | | |
|------------|--|----|
| Diagram 1: | Denominational map of present-day Ukraine (number of communities in per cent as for January 1, 2014) | 40 |
| Diagram 2: | The Churches of the Kyiv tradition (number of communities as for January 1, 2014) | 44 |

