

Politik und Gesellschaft
in Afrika

Politics and Society
in Africa

Diana Kisakye

Judicial Diplomacy in African REC Courts

Navigating the Strategic Space
in the East African Court of Justice



INSTITUT
FÜR AFRIKASTUDIEN



Nomos



INSTITUT
FÜR

AFRIKASTUDIEN

The peer-reviewed series “Politics and Society in Africa” publishes research about socio-political processes and structures in African societies. The editors welcome innovative monographs and guest edited volumes in either English or German which discuss historical and current transformations in African countries with an empirical or theoretical focus. The series is open to case studies and comparative research from the social sciences and related academic disciplines.

Politik und Gesellschaft in Afrika
Politics and Society in Africa

is edited by

Institut für Afrikastudien (IAS) der Universität Bayreuth

PD Dr. Antje Daniel

Prof. Dr. Alexander Stroh

Volume 16

Diana Kisakye

Judicial Diplomacy in African REC Courts

Navigating the Strategic Space
in the East African Court of Justice



Nomos

This book is the outcome of research conducted within the Africa Multiple Cluster of Excellence at the University of Bayreuth, funded by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG, German Research Foundation) under Germany's Excellence Strategy – EXC 2052/1 – 390713894.

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Bayreuth, Univ., BIGSAS, Diss., 2025

1st Edition 2025

© Diana Kisakye

Published by

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG

Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

www.nomos.de

Production of the printed version:

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG

Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

ISBN 978-3-7560-2016-4 (Print)

ISBN 978-3-7489-5553-5 (ePDF)

DOI <https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748955535>



Online Version
Nomos eLibrary



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Acknowledgements

I am grateful to the many individuals who provided guidance, mentorship, and constructive feedback throughout the doctoral journey. I am especially indebted to my supervisor, Prof. Dr. Alexander Stroh-Steckelberg, who has allowed me scholarly independence and opened his networks to me. I have learned a lot from our joint work sessions and hope to carry these invaluable lessons. I express my sincere gratitude to my academic mentors, Dr. Rachel Ellett and Dr. Peter Brett, for accompanying me on the dissertation journey. Rachel, your encouragement helped me realise that pursuing my PhD should be an enjoyable experience rather than a struggle. I truly appreciate how you welcomed me into your home and offered thoughtful suggestions for each chapter while we shared warm beverages by the fireplace. I am happy to pay it forward!

I appreciate the work of several academics, especially Prof. James Gathii, who have shaped my thinking around alternative ways of studying Africa's international courts. Thanks to the colleagues from the iCourts Summer School 2021, First Joint Global Politics of Law & Courts Workshop 2022, IPSA RC09 2022, Oñati International Institute for the Sociology of Law Workshop 2022, and the ECPR Joint Session Workshop 2023, who read and commented on my developing chapters.

I want to give my deepest appreciation to the numerous officials within international courts, national judiciaries, NGOs, government officials, media and academia, who participated in this project by brokering contacts, partaking in interviews, and facilitating my archival research. I am particularly indebted to colleagues who shared their contacts while preparing to go to the field and to the East African Court of Justice leadership and Registrars who supported my fieldwork in Arusha and Bujumbura. I owe His Worship Yufnalis Okubo and Arnaud Gahimbare a special thank you for enabling my fieldwork in several EAC countries.

This project was supported by the *Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft* (German Research Foundation) under Germany's Excellence Strategy – EXC 2052/1 – 390713894. To the “Africa Multiple” Cluster of Excellence, I am glad to have been one of your inaugural doctoral students. Thank you for providing a vibrant academic and working space. A special shout-out to all my BIGSAS and Cluster friends with whom I shared the doctoral

journey. Your support – in all its diverse forms – made the PhD pursuit a less lonely endeavour.

I would like to express my heartfelt gratitude to my Bayreuth big *sistahs*, Prof. Dr. Serawit Debele and Dr. Azza Mustafa. From the moment I arrived in this new and distant land, you welcomed me with open arms. You have exemplified true sisterhood and academic mentorship. I have truly enjoyed watching and learning from you as I walked this journey from “*aspiring academic*” to academic.

My Kampala day ones, Agatha Asimwe, Doreen Sabiiti and Olive Kweberaho, thank you for the various forms of support you provided as I pursued this project. This work is a culmination of all the conversations we have had throughout the years. I cherish your strong sisterhood, unwavering cheer, but most of all, your fierce loyalty that I can always rely on. To my friend-turned-little sister, Amanda Ainengonzi, thank you for working with me on the case documentation, manuscript edits, and your invaluable comments and suggestions.

I also wish to thank my father-in-law, Manfred Dickersbach, who took the time to read all my chapters long before I had the courage to share them with others. I am eternally grateful for your kindness, guidance, love and support. A special thanks to the Dickersbach family members who have supported me as I embarked on this academic journey over the past ten years. Thank you all for making Germany my second home.

To my family, your encouragement and belief in me have provided the foundation for my educational pursuits. My selfless auntie, Teopista Mbabazi, your eternal light shines on through this accomplishment. Uncle George Mutabazi, thank you for loving and supporting us in our multifarious endeavours. A special thank you to my big sisters Janet Uwera and Harriet Byarugaba whose love and support know no bounds. I am indebted to my big, beautiful and supportive Rwamakuba family members whose *agaciro* has always inspired me to strive to do better. I appreciate you all.

And finally, to my loving husband, Manuel Dickersbach, words cannot express my gratitude toward you. Thank you for: never dimming my light, being my biggest cheerleader, encouraging me in the tough writing times and believing in me when I seemed to lose sight of the end of the project. For planning those impromptu and much-needed vacations between the writing and research phases, I appreciate you. But most of all, thank you for being my peace in a turbulent world. I am glad I get to do life with you. This is for us!

Table of Contents

List of Tables	11
Abbreviations and Acronyms	13
1. Introduction	15
1.1 Research Questions	20
1.2 Project Rationale	22
1.3 Project Aims	25
1.4 Dissertation Outline	25
2. Theoretical – Conceptual Framework	29
2.1 Realist Explanations	30
2.2 Rational Choice Institutionalism	30
2.3 Liberalist Approaches	33
2.3.1 Trustee Theories	34
2.3.2 Constrained Independence Theory	36
2.3.3 The Altered Politics Framework	37
2.4 Constructivist Accounts	39
2.5 African REC Courts vs Dominant Paradigms	40
2.5.1 Extraversion Explanations	41
2.5.2 Critical Studies of African ICs	43
2.5.3 Neither Agents nor Trustees	46
2.6 Judicial Diplomats in a Strategic Space	49
2.6.1 Defining Judicial Diplomacy	51
2.6.2 Theoretical Take of Thesis	60
3. Researching Judges as Political Actors	61
3.1 Case Selection	62

Table of Contents

3.2 Multi-methods Research Design	65
3.2.1 Case Mapping	66
3.2.2 Interviews	67
3.2.2.1 Selecting Research Participants	69
3.2.2.2 Interview Methods Appendix	70
3.2.2.3 Interview Summary	71
3.2.3 Participant Observation	72
3.3 Navigating Access Limitations	75
3.4 Analytic Approach	77
3.5 Reflections on Positionality	79
4. EACJ Politics & Pressures	81
4.1 East African Court of Justice	81
4.1.1 EACJ Mandate	82
4.1.2 Composition and Leadership	83
4.2 EACJ within the Integration Project	84
4.2.1 Meagre Budget Allocation	88
4.2.2 Ad hoc Service and Double Agency	91
4.2.3 Opaque Judicial Appointments	92
4.2.4 Not an Appellate Court!	94
4.3 Resistance in a Strategic Space	97
5. The “Bold” Pioneer Bench	101
5.1 Judicial Biographies	101
5.2 Judicial Off-bench Engagements	106
5.2.1 Mobilising Judicial Allies	107
5.2.2 Legal Norm Socialisation	108
5.3 From “Legal Cocoon” to Initial Backlash	111
5.4 Judicial Resistance	115
5.4.1 Formally Recording Pressures	116
5.4.2 Reactive Scholarly Engagement	120
5.4.3 Expansive Interpretation of Legal Principles	122
5.5 East Africa Law Society to the Rescue	124
5.6 The Makings of a “Bold” Bench	130

6. The “Human Rights” Second Bench	133
6.1 Becoming a Human Rights Bench	134
6.1.1 Drawing Inspiration from Other ICs	135
6.1.2 Mapping the Human Rights Trajectory	138
6.2 The Role of Allies in Shaping Human Rights Jurisprudence	145
6.2.1 Evidence and Fact-finding Assistance	147
6.2.2 Initiating Strategic Litigation	151
6.3 Beyond Human Rights Jurisprudence	157
6.3.1 Streamlining EAC Institutions	158
6.3.2 Judicial Diplomacy in Politically Charged Matters	163
6.3.2.1 Jurisdictional Limitations	165
6.3.2.2 Avoidance through the Statute of Limitations	168
6.3.2.3 Vague Explanations	170
6.3.3 Off-bench Diplomacy	172
6.3.3.1 Opening of Sub-registries	173
6.3.3.2 Engaging Academic Audiences	175
6.4 From Human Rights to Commercial Bench	177
7. The “Commercial-Diplomatic” Third Bench	181
7.1 Cooperative Solutions over Litigation	182
7.2 Limited Jurisdiction	183
7.3 Finding its Voice in Economic Jurisprudence	189
7.3.1 Beyond Declaratory Orders	190
7.3.2 The BAT case: Pushback against a Trendsetter	193
7.3.3 The Emergence of Silent Compliance	197
7.4 Shedding the Human Rights Image	201
7.4.1 Intervention in Megapolitical Disputes	205
7.4.2 Challenging Judicial Appointments	210
7.5 Judicial-led Intervention	212
7.5.1 Between Avoidance and Activism	219
7.5.2 Whither Consensual Decision-making?	225
7.6 Determined Off-bench Diplomacy	229
7.6.1 Lobbying for Funding	230
7.6.2 Localisation of Hearings	233

Table of Contents

7.6.3 Forging Judicial Alliances	234
7.6.4 Allies in the Media and Academy	236
7.6.5 Digital Socialisation	238
7.7 Towards a “Commercial” Bench	241
8. Judicial Diplomacy – Regional Integration Nexus	245
8.1 The Significance of Appointments	246
8.2 Regional Judicial Diplomats	251
8.2.1 Judicial Diplomacy On-bench	252
8.2.2 Judicial Diplomacy Off-bench	255
8.2.3 On the Role of Allies	258
8.3 Unexpected Interventions	264
9. Conclusions & Outlook	271
9.1 Main Findings	274
9.2 Lessons and Implications for Research and Policy	278
APPENDIX	285
Chapter 3	285
Chapter 4	291
Chapter 5	292
Chapter 6	293
Bibliography	295

List of Tables

Table 1:	Types, Functions, and Sources of Original Data	65
Table 2:	Interview Summary	72
Table 3:	EACJ vs EAC Budget	89
Table 4:	Pioneer Bench Judges	102
Table 5:	Pioneer Bench (2001–2007) Judgements	122
Table 6:	Human Rights Jurisprudence (Second Bench)	138
Table 7:	EALS as Amicus	147
Table 8:	Second Bench (2008–2014) Judgements	167
Table 9:	Second Bench Judges	173
Table 10:	Commercial Cases (Third Bench)	184
Table 11:	Third Bench (2015–2022) Judgements	203
Table 12:	Third Bench Judges (2015–2022)	212
Table 13:	Entire Universe of Cases per Bench (July 2022)	285
Table 14:	EACJ Judicial Leadership	291
Table 15:	List of EALS Leadership	292
Table 16:	EALS as an Applicant	293
Table 17:	Cases involving PALU	294

Abbreviations and Acronyms

<i>Abbreviation</i>	<i>Explanation</i>
AD	Appellate Division
AfCHPR	African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights ("African Court")
AU	African Union
BAT	British American Tobacco
CCJ	Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa Court of Justice
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CMJA	Commonwealth Magistrates and Judges Association
COMESA	Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa
Council	Council of Ministers
CSOs	Civil Society Organisations
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
EAC	East African Community
EACA	East Africa Court of Appeal
EACJ	East African Court of Justice
EACSO	East African Civil Society Organisations' Forum
EADB	East African Development Bank
EALA	East African Legislative Assembly
EALS	East Africa Law Society
EAMJA	East Africa Magistrates and Judges Association
ECCJ	Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) Community Court of Justice
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
EU	European Union
EU Charter	European Union (EU) Charter of Fundamental Rights
FID	First Instance Division
FTA	Free Trade Agreement
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ICC	International Criminal Court
ICs	International Courts
ICT	Information and Communications Technology
IDLO	International Development Law Organisation
IGAD	Intergovernmental Authority on Development
IL	International Law
IMLU	Independent Medical Legal Unit
IR	International Relations
KAS	Konrad Adenauer-Stiftung
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NSSF	National Social Security Fund
NTBs	Non-tariff Barriers
PALU	Pan African Lawyers Union
REC	Regional Economic Community
RWI	The Raoul Wallenberg Institute of Human Rights and Humanitarian Law
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SADCT	Southern African Development Community (SADC) Tribunal
Summit	Summit of Heads of State
UNESCO	Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNICTR	United Nations International Residual Mechanism for Criminal Tribunal
URA	Uganda Revenue Authority