



Christophe Wampach

# Armed Reprisals from Medieval Times to 1945



**Nomos**

## Studien zur Geschichte des Völkerrechts

Begründet von Michael Stolleis

Herausgegeben von

Jochen von Bernstorff

Universität Tübingen, Professur für Staatsrecht, Völkerrecht und Menschenrechte

Bardo Fassbender

Universität St. Gallen, Lehrstuhl für Völkerrecht, Europarecht und Öffentliches Recht

Anne Peters

Max-Planck-Institut für ausländisches öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht, Heidelberg

Miloš Vec

Universität Wien, Institut für Rechts- und Verfassungsgeschichte

Band 40

Christophe Wampach

# Armed Reprisals from Medieval Times to 1945



**Nomos**

The Open Access-publication of the electronic version of this work was supported by the Max Planck Digital Library.

**The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Bonn, Rheinische Friedrich-Wilhelms-Univ., Diss., 2020

ISBN 978-3-8487-7718-1 (Print)

978-3-7489-2111-0 (ePDF)

**British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-7718-1 (Print)

978-3-7489-2111-0 (ePDF)

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Wampach, Christophe

Armed Reprisals from Medieval Times to 1945

Christophe Wampach

336 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-7718-1 (Print)

978-3-7489-2111-0 (ePDF)

1st Edition 2020

© Christophe Wampach

Published by

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG

Waldseestraße 3-5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

[www.nomos.de](http://www.nomos.de)

Production of the printed version:

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG

Waldseestraße 3-5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

ISBN (Print): 978-3-8487-7718-1

ISBN (ePDF): 978-3-7489-2111-0

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748921110>



Onlineversion  
Nomos eLibrary



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

*To my grandfathers René and Emil*



## Acknowledgements

The present work is the result of a Ph.D. dissertation at the Rheinische Friedrich-Wilhelms-Universität Bonn defended in Summer Semester 2020. This book would not exist without the help and support of many persons.

I would like to first thank my supervisor, Prof. Dr. Mathias Schmoeckel from the University of Bonn, who encouraged me to embark on the doctoral journey, drew my attention to the topic of reprisals and showed great enthusiasm for my research. He also gave me an excellent environment at the Institut für Deutsche und Rheinische Rechtsgeschichte to broaden my knowledge on legal history and more particularly on the history of international law by making me one of his assistants.

My second acknowledgement goes to Prof. Dr. Dirk Heirbaut from the Universiteit Gent, who kindly agreed to become the second assessor. I am really thankful for his interest in my work, his pertinent remarks, and for exhorting me to pursue the path of academic investigation.

Thanks as well to Prof. Dr. Martin Schermaier from the University of Bonn, who organised and presided the defence under the particular circumstances of the COVID-19 pandemic that shook the world.

I am also very much obliged to the Gerda Henkel Stiftung which granted me a two-year scholarship that made the writing of my thesis financially possible.

I also want to thank my colleagues, fellow Ph.D. candidates and friends at the Institut für Deutsche und Rheinische Rechtsgeschichte for their unflinching support, our long talks about methodological issues and all the good time we spent together: PD Dr. Matthias Maetschke, Dr. Pierre Friedrich, Dr. Vincent Nossek, Dr. Gero Fuchs, Dr. Malte Becker, Dr. Alexander Kustermann, Prof. Dr. Joaquín Sedano Rueda and Frau Silvia Schmidt.

I am greatly indebted to the Milla Altabás family in Lima who welcomed me into their home and provided me with a place to serenely work, while helping me to sometimes take my mind off the naval battles, the stormy sessions in the British parliament and the fluctuating attitude of lawyers which all teemed in my head.

## *Acknowledgements*

I would like also to express my deep gratitude to my good friends Hugo W. Smart, for helping with my punctual linguistic enquiries, and Connor A. Carey, for having endorsed the burdensome task of proofreading my work.

My eternal gratitude goes to my family who has always believed in me and provided me with emotional support in times of doubt and motivation drop. Thank you, Papa, Maman, Florent, Corinne, and my grandparents.

Finally, thank you, María Belén, for all your love giving me strength to keep going. You make me feel lucky everyday to have met you.

Brussels, July 2020

# Table of Contents

Abbreviations	15
Introduction	19
I. Outline of a Burning Issue	19
1. Contextualisation of a Remark by Karl Strupp	19
2. Blurry Line between Armed Reprisals and War	25
3. Pre-1919 Practice	30
II. Leading Question	35
III. State of Research	37
IV. Research Hypotheses	43
V. Sources	44
VI. Structure	46
Chapter One. From Regulation to Deregulation up to the End of the Eighteenth Century	49
I. Introduction	49
II. Elaboration of the Medieval Law of Reprisals	49
1. Emergence and Development of Reprisals in the Early and High Middle Ages	49
2. Theory: Bartolus de Saxoferrato's <i>Tractatus Represaliarum</i>	59
(a) Significance for the Law of Reprisals	59
(b) Justification of Reprisals	63
(c) Conditions	65
i) Superior's Consent	65
ii) Just Cause	66
(d) Execution	68
3. Risks of Abuse	69
III. Politicisation of Reprisals (XVIth–XVIIIth c.)	71
1. Transition from Private to Public Reprisals	71
(a) Diplomatic Interposition of the Sovereign	71
(b) Progressive Exclusion of Private Individuals from the Execution	77

*Table of Contents*

2. Public Character of Reprisals	84
(a) General Aspects	84
(b) Blurring of the Line between War and Peace	90
(c) Vattel's Pertinent Remark	94
IV. Interim Conclusion	97
Chapter Two. Shaping of a Prerogative, 1831–1863	99
I. Introduction	99
II. Asymmetric Power Relation	100
1. Portrait of Target Countries	100
(a) Preliminary Observation: 'Reprisal Clause' in Bilateral Treaties	100
(b) Characteristics of Inferiority	104
2. Informal Imperialism through Reprisals	107
(a) Issues of Commercial Nature	107
(b) Assertion of National Dignity: 'Civis Romanus Sum', 1850	112
III. Unrestricted Resort to Reprisals	119
1. A Question of Political Opportunism: Palmerston's Policy, 1847	119
2. Eluding Legal Requirements	121
(a) Denial of Justice debated in the British Parliament, 1850	121
(b) Preventive Recourse to Amicable Means of Settlement	124
i) The Principle laid down in the 23rd Paris Protocol of 1856	124
ii) The Cagliari affair, 1857–1858	125
iii) The Prince of Wales case: British Reprisals against Brazil, 1862–1863	127
IV. On the Questionable Edge of Peace	132
1. Disproportionate Use of Force	132
(a) Standard of Proportionality versus Efficacy	132
(b) Widening of the Category of Reprisals	135
2. Confusion between War and Peace	140
3. A Right in Vertical Power Relations	147
V. Interim Conclusion	151

Chapter Three. Legal Doctrine confronting State Practice, 1848–1912	153
I. Introduction	153
II. Precursors of the Doctrinal Debate on Armed Reprisals: Wurm and Hautefeuille	153
III. Building the Legal Theory of Pacific Blockade	158
1. Rising Interest and Controversy, 1849–1887	158
2. Examination by the Institute of International Law	164
(a) First Contact at The Hague, 1875	164
(b) The Heidelberg Declaration of 1887	165
i) Triggering Event: The French Blockade of Formosa, 1884	165
ii) The Work of the Institute	169
(c) Reception of the Institute’s Declaration	174
3. Departing State Practice: The Blockades of Siam (1893) and Crete (1897–1898)	177
4. A Custom of International Law?	182
(a) “Mais si la doctrine proteste, la politique agit”	182
(b) Dialogue of the Deaf	183
(c) <i>Opinio Juris</i>	187
IV. The Larger Issue of Armed Reprisals	190
1. Twilight Zone	190
(a) Variety of Armed Reprisals	190
(b) The Uncertain Dividing Line between Peace and War	193
(c) State of Reprisals	196
2. The Blockade of Venezuela (1902–1903) as Breaking Point	199
(a) Background	199
(b) The Venezuelan Preferential Claims	205
(c) The Drago-Porter Convention of 1907	208
i) Previous Efforts of Prevention of Armed Reprisals in International Law	208
ii) The Drago Doctrine as Corollary of the Monroe Doctrine	210
iii) From Political Policy to Norm of International Law	212
iv) Second Hague Peace Conference, 1907	215
v) Mixed Impact of the Second Hague Conference on Armed Reprisals	220
V. Interim Conclusion	225

*Table of Contents*

Chapter Four. Culmination of Antagonism: Peace-Building and Armed Reprisals in the Interwar Period	227
I. Introduction	227
II. State of Mind: The Peace Treaty of Versailles and Reprisals	227
1. Enforcement of War Reparations: The Ruhr Occupation, 1923–1925	227
2. Question of the Legality of the Ruhr Occupation	231
(a) Right of Acting Unilaterally	231
(b) Allowed Measures	234
3. Outlook: The Unlikely Limitation of Armed Reprisals	236
III. Loophole in the Ius ad Bellum Mechanism of the League of Nations	237
1. System of the Covenant	237
(a) Organisation of the League of Nations	237
(b) Dispute Settlement Procedure	239
(c) Deficiency Regarding Armed Reprisals	245
2. Baptism of Fire for the Covenant: The Italian Bombardment and Occupation of Corfu, 1923	247
(a) The Facts	247
(b) Discussion in the Council	248
(c) Armed Reprisals Questioned	254
i) Interpretation of the Covenant by the Special Commission of Jurists	254
ii) Renewal of the Doctrinal Debate	257
iii) Opinion of the Small Member States	260
3. The Spectre of Armed Reprisals Looming over the League	263
(a) The Greek-Bulgarian Incident, 1925	263
(b) Japan's Invasion of Chinese Manchuria	267
IV. Involvement of the Institute of International Law	273
1. Session of Paris, 1934	273
2. Criticisms	277
V. Epilogue	281
1. An Insoluble Issue?	281
2. Prohibition of the Use of Force under the UN-Charter	282
VI. Interim Conclusion	286

*Table of Contents*

Conclusion	289
Bibliography	293



## Abbreviations

A.D.	<i>anno Domini</i>
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
a.m.	<i>ante meridiem</i>
Annuaire IDI	Annuaire de l'Institut de droit international
ArchVölkR	Archiv des Völkerrechts
Art.	Article(s)
BFSP	British and Foreign State Papers
BYIL	The British Yearbook of International Law
Cap.	<i>capitulum</i>
CaseWResJIntL	Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law
CathLaw	Catholic Lawyer
ch.	chapter(s)
Chinese JIL	Chinese Journal of International Law
CLJ	Cambridge Law Journal
Clunet	Journal du Droit International Privé et de la Jurisprudence Comparée
<i>Cod. Just.</i>	<i>Codex Justinianus</i>
col.	column(s)
CUP	Cambridge University Press
DAEM	Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters
DJZ	Deutsche Juristen-Zeitung
ed(s).	editor(s)
edn.	edition
e.g.	<i>exempli gratia</i>
EHQ	European History Quarterly
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
esp.	especially
et al.	<i>et alii</i>
f./ff.	and following
fn.	footnote(s)
F. O.	Foreign Office
fol.	folio(s)

## Abbreviations

ForeignAff	Foreign Affairs
Fundamina	Fundamina: A Journal of Legal History
GeoLJ	Georgetown Law Journal
GPO	Government Printing Office
HUP	Harvard University Press
i.a.	<i>inter alia</i>
Ibid.	<i>ibidem</i>
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ILL	Institute of International Law
IntAff	International Affairs
IntConciliation	International Conciliation
JHistIntL	Journal of History of International Law = Revue d'histoire du droit international
J.O.R.F.	Journal officiel de la République française
JSSL	Journal of the Statistical Society of London
JTransnatLawPol	Journal of Transnational Law and Policy
JUFIL	Journal on the Use of Force and International Law
Just. Nov.	Justinian, <i>Novellae</i>
Lib.	<i>liber</i>
LJIL	Leiden Journal of International Law
LMR	Law Magazine and Review: A Quarterly Review of Jurisprudence, 5th series
LNOJ	League of Nations Official Journal
LNTS	League of Nations Treaty Series
LQR	Law Quarterly Review
MilRev	Military Law Review
MLLWR	Military Law and the Law of War Review
MP	Member(s) of Parliament (United Kingdom)
NAR	The North American Review
NordJIntLaw	Nordisk Tidsskrift for International Ret
no(s).	margin number(s)
Nr.	number
N.S.	New Style = Gregorian calendar
NYIL	Netherlands Yearbook of International Law
O.S.	Old Style = Julian calendar
OUP	Oxford University Press
Para(s).	paragraph(s)

PCA	Permanent Court of Arbitration at The Hague
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PhilipLJ	Philippine Law Journal
p.m.	<i>post meridiem</i>
P. R. O.	Public Record Office
PUF	Presses universitaires de France
PUP	Princeton University Press
PYIL	Philippine Yearbook of International Law
Qu.	<i>quaestio</i>
r	recto
RdC	Recueil des Cours de l'Académie de Droit International de La Haye
RDFE	Revue de droit français et étranger
RDI	Revue de droit international, de sciences diplomatiques, politiques et sociales
RDILC	Revue de Droit International et de Législation Comparée
RevJurCat	Revista jurídica de Catalunya
RGBL	Deutsches Reichsgesetzblatt
RGDIP	Revue Générale de Droit International Public
RHEF	Revue d'histoire de l'Église de France
RIAA	Report of International Arbitral Awards
RID comp.	Revue internationale de droit comparé
RivDirInt	Rivista di Diritto Internazionale
RLT	Roman Legal Tradition
Saint Louis LR	Saint Louis Law Review
s.d.	<i>sine dato</i>
Sec.	section(s)
ser.	series/série
s.l.	<i>sine loco</i>
s.n.	<i>sine nomine</i>
Suppl.	supplement(s)
TGS	Transactions of the Grotius Society
Tit.	<i>titulus</i>
tr.	translation
UChiLRev	University of Chicago Law Review
UN	United Nations

## Abbreviations

UPaLRe	University of Pennsylvania Law Review and American Law Register
U.S.	United States
v	verso
VillLRev	Villanova Law Review
viz.	<i>videlicet</i>
vol(s).	volume(s)
WWI	World War One
WWII	World War Two
YaleLJ	Yale Law Journal
YaleRev	The Yale Review
ZAkDR	Zeitschrift der Akademie für Deutsches Recht
ZaöRV	Zeitschrift für ausländisches öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht
ZPE	Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik
ZRG GA	Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte – Germanistische Abteilung
ZVölkR	Zeitschrift für Völkerrecht