

## 9. Furthering Synergetic Constellations

---

The task of this chapter is to make suggestions for locally-grounded urban development tools and measures. Derived from the insights gained through the study of the sub-case locations, pilot-projects suited to the neighbourhood-specific set-ups are proposed for each of the four sites. This thesis argues for urban development approaches based on the close study of location (see chapter 8.2), in order not to impose pre-conceptualised standards in implementation, which have not been tested for their performance under local conditions (see chapter 2.2). As discussed in chapter 8.2, the current statutory planning prioritising development of tourism areas marginalises tending to the immediate needs of the wider population and, hence, needs to be questioned in favour of recognising a wider range of local interests. Jobs in the building sector are insufficient legitimisation for giving up sites, networks and resources permanently to exclusively commercial developments. It is, therefore, proposed that a variety of everyday urbanisation practises need to be legitimately acknowledged not as an alternative, but as co-existent to planning (see chapter 8.2) in Bahir Dar's urban development. Managing the process of urbanisation with the aim of inclusiveness regarding such an amplified spectrum of urban planning regimes is therefore proposed. Suggestions are made as to how a wider range of needs can be accommodated in urban development, by widening the target focus of urban policy strategies in the context of the neighbourhoods. Thereby, the toolbox for implementation of the strategies needs to develop to reflect the widened spectrum of contextual strategies based on actor interests. To do so, pilot projects in the neighbourhoods offer the opportunity to explore asset-based approaches to urban development. Drawing from the findings from the sub-case sites and based on the recommendation in chapter 8 to counter tendencies of segregation by introducing a decidedly inclusive stance on urban development, the pilot-projects proposed in this chapter can function as discussion bases on which the actual actors and stake-holders in Bahir Dar can reflect and negotiate their interests.

The institutional setting in which planning takes place, the way content was determined, the strongly limited options of participation and evasive practices in implementation seem to be challenging the BDIDP. However, it is necessary to

define a strategic vision and it is assumed that BDIDP as an instrument can integrate the measures on the neighbourhood scale. As a reflexive instrument originally intended to incorporate the transparent negotiation of an underlying development principle, it can take on the role as a platform simultaneously to its function as a reference and documentation. However, the BDIDP in its current shape will need substantial revision to fulfil these tasks, will have to be open to renegotiation of its guiding principles and, hence, has to move away from its current set-up as a master plan with strategic projects towards more holistic and participative regimes. It has to resist the temptation to develop standardised plans for different communities and develop local aims for urban development in Bahir Dar. The qualities and internal potentials of neighbourhoods – also of low-income structures – therein need to provide more input to shape a stronger decision-making base. On the grounds of having to integrate competing regulation systems as well as a large variety of residential and commercial interests while facing high population influx, the BDIDP's normative underpinnings should be renegotiated. The underlying paradigm of the plan and the resulting standards should, thereby, be publicly negotiated and participatory, the decision-making process and the result should be made transparent. Although deciding on the guiding principles of urban development in Bahir Dar should remain in local hands, it is suggested here to decide on an inclusive approach towards urban development to replace the development regime. Thereby, the standards the IDP proposes for urban development in the form of building regulations, land-use and action plans, etc., have to be lowered to a level that can actually be met by a majority of the population, in order to make the plan relevant and binding. The idea is to make the IDP function as an integrated planning tool that reflects the values of urban society, by which the majority abides and with which it also engages. The plan needs to develop a manageable framework, allow for private initiative, set local aims and develop not only measures, but monitoring criteria linked to these to suit the local context in Bahir Dar.

Understanding urban development as a “collective governance effort” (see Healy 2012: 192 and chapter 8.3) requires expanding the range of actors in urban development to be understood beyond the actors of statutory urban planning. From the empirical research, it is understood that the major players in the negotiation of Bahir Dar's urbanisation are political figures, private investors, Bahir Dar University acting as a major project developer, rural-urban migrants arriving in town, established communities of various backgrounds and interests, local business and subsistence-oriented households. The different rationales of state and non-governmental actors need to be integrated into constellations in which they can work synergically, decide on trade-offs, administer resources and address effects of urbanisation. The proposals on contextualised planning need to be broken down into specific sets of action on the neighbourhood scale. Depending on the intervention context, different sub-aims, responsible actors and planning tools

can be negotiated on the intervention scale and, thereby, address the overall aim of distributive justice.

This calls for a revised role of the institutional planner towards a communicative effort. While the architectural and planning practice can only act within the political and administrative frame that the country provides (Myers 2011: 48), planners have to contribute and coordinate the process of prioritising “action areas”, selecting and designing tools adequate for the local context on the basis of the results from local stakeholder negotiation. It needs to monitor that the BDIDP is broken down into smaller units, as already attempted by the current “action plans”, but needs to see to it that the plans across various scales are congruent. Thereby, it is further proposed that these smaller plans are understood as community development plans that are set up after priority areas for intervention have been negotiated on the city scale and based on the revised planning paradigm. On the grounds of inclusiveness, marginalised communities, underserviced areas and the unattended rural-urban population influx would deserve particular attention and, hence, neighbourhoods affected by these phenomena would rank high on the project agenda. However, the site-specific situations require problem-specific policy recommendations and planning measures have to be selected accordingly.

Although the sub-case areas might not reflect the outcome of such a participatory prioritisation of intervention areas, they will be discussed as examples of what a contextualised planning approach based on inclusive principles could look like in the following.

## 9.1 MIXED-USE ZONING

The diversity of Bahir Dar’s downtown area should be viewed as an asset and supported in its development as such. Urban lifestyles in Ethiopian cities do not necessarily stand for individualisation but are rather tied in to community structures. However, the city as a context for reinventing identities and accepting an increasingly diverse population requires acknowledgement in urban development. There are increasingly different ways of manoeuvring the city that should find a variety of support systems and be awarded recognition. However, the area has problems regarding the quality of building structures, due to overcrowding in housing and lack of adequate infrastructure to create sanitary conditions. Unequal distribution of infrastructure and access to services has to be countered and a basic service provided for all urban dwellers as well as for those expected to move to the city in the mid-term. Also, rising land-use pressure needs to be acknowledged in the negotiation of urban development with the stakes in place. Currently, the low and middle-income occupants of the existing buildings in the inner city do not have tenure-security. Although the houses are Kebele homes or have been built in line with the tenure-regulations the building-standards have been changed to allow for

a large part of the existing structures to be demolished and replaced by commercial development. Unless the occupants can pay for multi-storey buildings they have to leave their plots.

*Aim:*

The aim is the provision and access to diverse typologies of housing and income opportunities in the city centre. Keeping people in place should be a high priority, as relocation presents a risk for the most vulnerable residents, such as the poor and frail. Strategies countering the structural issues in downtown Bahir Dar, such as the eradication of buildings and removals from the city centre, need to avoid contributing to sub-urbanisation and fragmented, segregated land-use patterns. The IDP needs to question the displacement of existing housing and substitution of social and provision structures within the city by preferred medium and large-scale investment more carefully. Instead of relocation, a synergistic approach to tackle the issues of sanitation and densification is suggested, by installing an in-situ-upgrading strategy, thus securing social ties, keeping job-opportunities in the micro-economy in the city centre and improving living conditions for the long-settled residents in low and middle-income housing. In doing so, the personal resilience of the wider urban public would be improved in a context where subsistence levels and low incomes are frequent and irregular incomes are the normal situation. Questions of tenure-security need to be looked into by the municipality and the mix of de-facto land use needs to be acknowledged. This way the current focus on commercial development can shift to a more varied concept of inner-city use.

*Tools:*

The inner-city can serve as an implementation site for a pilot-project exploring the effects of a “mixed-use” zoning category in the BDIDP. Mixed-use zoning acknowledges the ties between living space, opportunities of income generation and business operation. The view based on what is the maximum achievement possible regarding construction should, thereby, shift towards defining minimum standards of safety with which buildings have to comply to be legal. Further, the IDP’s possibilities of including the residents already in place in upgrading and allowing them to improve their living conditions through participation in the urban development decisions should be considered to devise an inner-city concept meeting a broadened variety of interests. Exact specifications can be negotiated on a neighbourhood scale and an upgrading-plan devised based on existing structures. This plan does not serve for compensation, but as an inventory for conservative construction measures.

The precondition for granting a cosmopolitan outlook on local residence and, thus, allowing participation in central city life for a wide range of population groups including diverse genders, religions and ethnicities, is transparency in the negotiation of urban issues. Within this negotiation, the attractiveness of the in-

ner-city plots is an asset that can be used for cross-funding in conditions of a weak tax base. In mixed-use areas, cross financing of affordable accommodation and micro-business to benefit low-income households can be made a building requirement in turn for development opportunities for economically strong investors. Here, tourism should lose its exclusive priority status in urban development in favour of a diversified economic strategy. Within these negotiations, urban planning needs to revise its understanding of the micro-economy to see the potential of the agency small-scale business displays. Micro-business and local production need consideration before real-estate development. Recognising the existing (informal) economies not as a sector, but rather as ways of living in the city and as an opportunity to engage in urbanism is fundamental to the set-up of negotiation on land-use interests.

*Actors:*

The Municipality of Bahir Dar should take responsibility for this project. While the RUPI can function as the institution devising the plan, negotiations on the actual site needs to be in the hands of an institution closer to the locals. However, to fulfil such tasks, the municipality needs to be equipped with the necessary resources and decision-making powers. Its role however is that of a mediator between land-use interests in the interest of the urban public.

*Implementation:*

At the moment, needs and the provision of basic infrastructure (as for example defined in the UN's MDGs) are not systematically approached by the administration and delegated to NGOs. It should be made a priority in political and administrative action, but needs to rely on know-how from technical experts. Their opinion needs to be considered against land-use interests. On this basis, the mixed-use determined in the IDP can be broken down into actual use-patterns for a designated site in the city centre. Residential use, small-scale manufacturing and different types of commercial use (micro- and large-scale) should be allocated according to proportions agreed on in a public document. Success of the project should be measured by its ability to sustain a wide range of diversity across forms of residence, subsistence, production and commercial activity.

## 9.2 ARRIVAL STRUCTURES AND TEMPORARY HOUSING

Looking at the sub-case site around the textile factory, the residential area has been successful in consolidating and providing for its residents until now but, considering the current developments Bahir Dar faces due to the population influx, its structure and facilities also need to be questioned in the face of continued urbanisation. Currently, the textile area houses well established long-term residents and

provides short term housing only for the well qualified staff of the textile factory that can rely on fixed employment. The well-off residents are largely not reliant on having to rent out space to generate income and are, hence, not operating informal hostels, which currently have to provide for the rural-urban arrivals, daily labourers and temporary and seasonal migrants in town. The textile area is, therefore, largely exempt as an area of reception.

*Aim:*

Phenomena such as multi-locality, temporary residence and rural-urban migration have to be considered not an interim phenomenon of transition but a permanent set-up in the medium term. Under conditions of urban growth, the seclusion of the textile area needs to be questioned regarding its receptiveness towards non-permanent residence and new arrivals. It is suggested, that established residential areas, such as the textile neighbourhood can accommodate a share of the new and temporary urbanites. As Simone (2011: 390) puts it, "Instead of trying to keep people in place in newly democratic and decentralised localities, perhaps emphasis should be placed on how to make already existent movement more productive and convenient, and to accede to the possibility that urban residents "come to go and go to come", resulting in "making productive use of urbanities of movement as a formal resource". If migration patterns were studied for an estimate of type and amount of required habitat in the foreseeable future, housing delivery could adapt and diversify its quality of housing provision based on these insights to provide new forms of housing for moving households and periodical residence. For the specific case of Bahir Dar, this requires flexible measures for employment and accommodation, suited to the average low levels of education and income of the new urban arrivals (cf. Pieterse 2010). Connected to this issue of non-permanent residence is also the question of representation of a substantial part of urban society in urban life and decision-making bodies, if residents are only staying in town temporarily.

*Tools:*

A variety of measures can be adopted, to accommodate the different needs of different types of non-permanent settlement in the site of the textile neighbourhood. Temporary housing can be provided as insertion in the consolidated area, rent regulations can be improved to strengthen tenant rights and quality of dwellings, and public representation of non-permanent citizens can be made a policy issue. In the residential neighbourhoods such as the textile area, new opportunities for housing beyond the existing informal hostels, informal housing and often crowded rental situations, could be created. Accommodation for temporary residents can be provided by emergency shelters, new models of shared housing or certified hostels. Thereby, the provision of such can be depended on the private sector, while certi-

fication needs to be accredited on a pre-defined set of criteria by the authorities. This way, income opportunities are created while the city's tax base is not strained.

However, as part of a range of diversified urban identities and livelihood concepts, temporary residents need acceptance in urban decision-making. They also need to be addressed as part of the urban community by urban policy. Since the rationales of everyday urbanisation have a very fluid and mobile nature, it has to be expected that, as urban planning takes a wider range of practices into account will have to broaden its spectrum of instruments beyond long-term projections and has to deal with target groups that are not necessarily available for long-term engagement and agency or advocate the needs of multi-local set-ups that go beyond a temporary and situation-based need. The competing rationales identified can, therefore, not generally be expected to have spokes-people on urban planning. Urban policies addressing them need to take this into consideration and explore the limits of their reach in such highly dynamic conditions.

*Actors:*

As stated, the projects proposed can be run by public institutions. However, services provided by private initiative are a viable model for financing, project development and operation. In this case, administration should engage with architects for developing standards for temporary housing (hostels). A pilot project in the textile area on state land could provide experience on these issues. Beyond this, the municipality should make it its task to look into revising rental regulations to strengthen tenant rights and protect tenants from arbitrary eviction. Grass-roots initiative on representation of temporary residents in decision-making bodies and tenant rights should be welcomed and supported by public administration.

*Implementation:*

Information structures for new arrivals would, thereby, best be situated not in the residential areas, but at the arrival points. Currently this is pre-dominantly the bus station in the city centre. Here, information on accommodation available could be provided and the arrivals could be distributed to various neighbourhoods of the town. Assistance in job hunting could be provided, as well as information on access to services.

### 9.3 INCREMENTAL BUILDING ZONES

The residents of the urban village have been resident in town for more than four generations and need to be considered in future urban development. Diversification of livelihoods, with urban agriculture for subsistence and small-scale entrepreneurship, are the current steps in urbanisation in this village. However, the rapid transition from rural to urban society in the location of Bahir Dar is calling local

tradition into question in favour of modern lifestyles that are considered more “urban”. As ethnic ties and family structures are replaced by new sociality and individual roles in an urban setting, the traditional lifestyles and ethnic communities are facing marginalisation in everyday encounters and by systematic exclusion from upgrading proposals. By reading the results from the sub-cases, it has become evident, that traditional practices are not part of the modernisation agenda. While trained architects and urban planners are rare, the formal planning system imposes a negative pre-disposition regarding building practice reliant on traditional expertise. It, thereby, inserts a competition between the informal/traditional urbanisation practice and a new professionalised system, which excludes the wider public from the composition of their urban habitat on the grounds of introducing standards of urban and architectural design. It needs to be questioned, whether the formal system thereby promotes an inclusive approach and whose interests are represented by the regulations. It is possible to obtain standardised house designs from the municipality but, currently, the formal way of building is too complicated or expensive for the majority of inhabitants in Bahir Dar (see chapter 5.5).

*Aim:*

The provision and access to housing typologies needs to be amplified by statutory planning, to include simplified criteria of construction as legal. It needs to provide for everyday rationales, without destroying flexibility, resilience and sustainability of local practices. Livelihood strategies found in this area, such as subsistence agriculture, home production, foraging, petty trade and bartering need to be fully accepted as part of city life, as long as alternative livelihoods are not sufficient or adequate for substantial parts of the population. Eventually, Bahir Dar will have to find ways to unite local traditions with cosmopolitan attitudes towards difference. The spatial requirements of these activities, hence, need to be qualified to work towards such an aim. Regarding the existing building structures, the integration of such informal urbanisation into general development strategies is dependent on the fact, whether these structures and processes conform with guiding principles and political strategies and aims. The identification of informal structures does not necessarily have to result in their destruction, as they can be legitimised.

*Tools:*

Instead of disrupting the process and dislocating the community, an in-situ upgrading approach can also be implemented here, if also with different building requirements than in the downtown area. For the urban village incremental building zones can be designated, to give them a legal status and allow for their consolidation. As a reference, the city of Cape Town has devised the instrument of the “incremental housing area”, within which construction activities are generally allowed and negotiated by the local community (City of Cape Town 2007). Incremental production of space and place through auto-construction signifies that,

mostly, there is no separation between the design and the production of urban structures but, instead, the product is determined by the availability of material. It allows to learn from traditional building practice by using local material, building in modular shapes and hence increasing resilience and sustainability. In the face of an uncertain economic situation, climate change, changing water levels/ receding national resources, incremental building can house a lifestyle that does not have to maintain structures in times of uncertain income. This can prove advantageous for the residents, as regular payments for housing do not have to be made. However, the building regulations specify minimum safety standards by which the resulting buildings can be assessed by the administration (ibid). Rules for conforming to these building standards are set for a designated area of land. Through introducing incrementalism to achieve the standard gradually, the specifications can actually be met by the population in place and are not rules that are out of reach of compliance.

*Actors:*

The administration of such resources, including the administration of land, can be left to the community leaders on specified conditions (e.g. rules for gender equality). By this, parallel/coexisting practices of land-distribution are acknowledged and incorporated into processes of gaining tenure-security for communities in place. Although it can acknowledge the elders as authorities, this step would also have to re-invent tradition and see it as a cultural value that is changeable.

*Implementation:*

It has to be recognised that the natural resources on which the livelihoods of the urban village are still important for income generation and subsistence for many in Bahir Dar. However, these resources (including fish, sand, soil, stones, but also the landscape and animal life as a resource for tourism are not managed. In the condition of population growth around Lake Tana, there is hence a strong danger of over-exploitation. In order to preserve these resources their use should be monitored to sustainability criteria. The criteria should be set, to balance the use and protection of resources with the increasing demand. In the interests of food security, small-scale activities like urban agriculture, line-fishing, or even outtake of drinking water from the lake should not be sanctioned and enjoy a liberal handling within the realm of health standards. However, activities concerning the exploitation of non-renewable resources such as stone mining and larger scale resource exploitation of the lake and forests need to be monitored in the interests of the environment. The administration needs to be responsible for the distribution of these resources by establishing protection standards and overlooking their abidance. Urban policy needs to establish what the resources of the region are, whether they are renewable and how their exploitation impacts on the environmental sys-

tem. On the basis of such an inventory, land-use, access to resources and development or protection areas can be established.

## 9.4 NETWORKS OF INNOVATION

A major issue in the discussions documented on urban development is not about the need but rather the desire to modernise and engage in development. This is a risky issue but in the context of rapid urbanisation, development as progressing from the status quo is inevitable. Thereby innovation in urban development through revised building standards and a local development agenda, as well as an innovation policy with spatial elements to accommodate the local economy are in need of re-conceptualisation. These fields have previously been fed by external ideas and can be revised on the grounds of introducing locally contingent standards valid for the specific situation in Bahir Dar. However, knowledge generation and higher education in Bahir Dar University are currently not well connected to civil society, and the exchange of knowledge between the campus and the city can be much improved to work on these questions locally and in communication with the population and other decision makers in the city. The interaction of the university with the rest of the city holds potentials that are, currently, not being used to the full extent.

*Aim:*

Off-campus accommodation for students as a choice of living can provide income for private hostels and establish personal ties to the city for the graduates. However, it could also counter the idea of an egalitarian treatment of students on the campus. The proposals made for the incorporation of the university into urban development under terms of inclusiveness, therefore, focus on its potentials as a hub of innovation to benefit Bahir Dar's society. If networked with the city, the university can give impulses and benefit urban development far beyond its own campus.

Thereby, the issues of discussion can be manifold. The appearance of the city, for example is a topic of debate at the moment, yet under the aim of innovation, the question of urban design should move from visual ideas to questioning the underlying principles. The provision of serviced urban areas needs qualifications beyond provision for plain quantities of housing units, including new concepts for subsistence. Local start-ups are in need of accompanying structures and advice. Access to information technology and devices needs to be substantially improved and holds potential for co-operation between university projects and private enterprise.

Moving away from sanctuary and engaging in the management of the cultural process of urbanisation actively by supporting the city's society, thus forming networks of innovation, would strongly benefit the town. Therein, not conformity

to proclaimed standards, but rather free thought for local solutions should be the aim. The idea of a powerful authority will therefore have to be reframed from a controlling and repressive role to that of a facilitator of invention.

Yet, such ideas on adaptability and the embrace of novelty will have to be brought into urban development practice with regard to the precarious economic situation of the urban residents. Therefore, progressive development or modernisation needs implementation strategies that are grounded in local assets and situated measures.

*Tools:*

Open access to knowledge and the implementation of (digital) learning centres as well as creating mobile learning facilities, can be included in the formulation of a spatial development strategy within the urban development framework. Community learning centres and libraries are, thereby, key institutions to build on for education, training and building community knowledge.

*Actors:*

Urban administration in Bahir Dar should consider a municipal strategy by which highly qualified graduates are considered a resource and can be encouraged to stay in the region to engage economically and innovatively in the urban transition. Therefore, the administration should closely co-operate with the University and try to win students and graduates to engage in the projects as volunteers but also as entrepreneurs. Bahir Dar Municipality should hence invest into experts who serve local demands and create synergies among businesses, urban society and university institutions.

*Implementation:*

The projects need to be developed in a set of workshops and should eventually be transferred into a city-wide spatialised strategy. Starting with incubator projects, the municipality could incrementally expand the programme and act as a co-ordinator between the interest groups.

