

de las planteadas por Fortis y Wachowich: “all skilled action was considered natural and all natural acts considered potentially skilled” (120).

Nos encontramos, finalmente, frente a un libro, simultáneamente, amplio en los casos abordados – desde los inuit del Ártico hasta los carpinteros ingleses – y coherente en sus perspectivas (que deben mucho a las elaboradas por uno de los compiladores). Se trata, por ello, de una publicación no solo valiosa sino probablemente también necesaria en un contexto que los autores tratan explícitamente de contravenir.

Juan Javier Rivera Andía

Hegewald, Julia A. B. (ed.): *Jaina Painting and Manuscript Culture*. In Memory of Paolo Pianarosa. Berlin: EB-Verlag Dr. Brandt, 2015. 421 pp. ISBN 978-3-86893-174-7. (SAAC, 3) Price: € 78.00

The Jaina community may account for less than 1% of the total population of India, but they are well-known for their high levels of literacy and commitment to the preservation of manuscripts. “Jaina Painting and Manuscript Culture” is an impressive collection of essays focused on the contents, histories, and ritual uses of some of these lamentably understudied manuscripts from both Jaina sects, Digambara and Śvetāmbara, now housed in collections in India, Europe, and the United States. The volume was brought together by Julia Hegewald to commemorate the opening, in 2012, of the Pianarosa Jaina Library at the University of Bonn, which houses 1,600 books on Jaina studies in European and Indian languages that were collected by the Italian Jaina expert Paolo Pianarosa (1949–2010).

After a history of Jaina studies at the University of Bonn, a biographical sketch of Pianarosa, and an overview of some of the ways in which Jaina manuscripts are worshiped, stored, and read, the remaining chapters each focus on a different manuscript collection or component of Jaina manuscript culture. Nick Barnard’s “Jaina Paintings and Manuscripts in the Victoria and Albert Museum” describes the development of Jaina painting from the 15th–19th centuries through a detailed visual analysis of the Jaina sources of painting at the V & A. While his analysis of the historical development of Jaina painting is not new, and most of the pieces he examines have previously been published, Barnard does provide additional analysis; his discussion of several previously-misidentified deities on a 15th-century tantric ritual diagram the “Victory Diagram,” *jayatra yantra*, for example, is helpful.

Nachiket Chanchani’s “Cultural Cache,” which looks at an illustrated late-15th-century *Kalpasūtra* manuscript and an invitation scroll (*viñāptipatra*) housed at the New York Public Library, provides fewer details than Barnard’s chapter. While he places the invitation scroll – a painting made to invite a mendicant to stay in a particular town for the rainy season – in the 18th century, he is not able to locate the city in which the scroll was made. The scroll deserves further study, as it contains remarkable paintings of city life in 18th-century Western India, including portraits of a mosque and a Hindu Śrīnātha temple.

In “Cause and Effect. Illustrating the *Pañcakalyāṇaka*,” Robert J. Del Bontà is the fourth author in a row to discuss a manuscript of the Śvetāmbara text, the *Kalpasūtra*, this time focusing on a manuscript of the *Kalpasūtra* made in Patan, Gujarat, in 1501 C.E. and held at the Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art in Kansas City, Missouri. The *Kalpasūtra* is recited every year for an important Śvetāmbara festival, and as such became one of the most popular Jaina texts for which to create illustrated manuscripts. Del Bontà shows the creative process of illustrating the biographies of the Jinās found in the *Kalpasūtra*. I especially appreciate how he compares this Śvetāmbara manuscript with Digambara depictions of the lives of the Jinās, since Digambaras are often overlooked in the study of Jaina art and manuscript culture.

In the following chapter, “Illustrations from a *Bhūpā-lacauvīsikāvyaabhāṣārtha* Manuscript,” Patrick F. Krüger also looks at the depictions of the five auspicious events in the lives of the Jinās. Krüger focuses on some illustrations from a Digambara manuscript of a Sanskrit poem to the 24 Jinās that was composed in Rajasthan in 1830 C.E. and is now housed in a private collection in Jaipur. While this chapter is valuable in that it looks at an unpublished manuscript from the understudied Digambara tradition, Krüger admits that much is left for further research.

Nalini Balbir’s “Narratives, Visuals, Performances. Manuscripts of Jaina Stories in Vernaculars” looks at three manuscripts housed at the British Library that show, through the stories of different men, the karmic consequences of performing good and bad deeds. This chapter importantly highlights some of the many different illustrated manuscripts that have been ignored in scholarship’s focus on the more popular *Kalpasūtra* manuscripts. For example, the third manuscript discussed in this chapter, the 17th-century manuscript in Hindi, from Karanja, Maharashtra, which tells the story about a particular Digambara fast, “Sunday’s vow,” the *Ādityavāra-Vratakathā*, is the first publication on a manuscript of this type, yet it is an extremely popular topic of illustrated manuscripts in the Digambara community.

Jennifer Howes also highlights some popular, yet understudied, types of Jaina texts in “Illustrated Jaina Collections in the British Library.” The *Navagrahakuṇḍalākṣaṇa* palm leaf manuscript pictured in this chapter, an 18th-century Sanskrit text from Karnataka on the construction of altars used in the Jaina worship of the nine planets, is a type of ritual manual commonly found in Digambara manuscript collections but overlooked in scholarly discussions, which prefer to focus on the depictions of narrative stories rather than on instructional or ritual diagrams. Howes, however, does not discuss the contents of this manuscript, but instead focuses on the biographies and motivations of the collectors of the British Library’s manuscripts: Hermann Jacobi (1850–1937), William Erskine (1773–1852), and Colin Mackenzie (1753–1821).

In “Reading Śatruñjaya *Paṭas* as Mnemonics. Performing Mental Pilgrimages of Devotion (*Bhāva Yātrā*),” Andrea Luithle-Hardenberg says she will bring ethnography to bear on the examination of Śvetāmbara Jains’ cloth

maps of the pilgrimage hill site Śatruñjaya. Comparing a depiction of the Śatruñjaya hill from the 1990s to a 19th-century cloth painting, Luithle-Hardenberg explains how monks will encourage worshippers to use these maps to perform a mental pilgrimage of five sites highlighted on these maps. She does not, however, draw on her ethnographic research at Śatruñjaya to fully understand these pilgrimages. I was curious to hear worshippers describe what, exactly, is involved in these mental pilgrimages in terms of how long they take, if physical offerings and recitations are involved, what exactly is visualized, how common they are, and so on.

The following chapter, “Colossi and Lotus Feet. *Paṇḍitas* and *Bhaṭṭārakas* in the North Indian Digambara Legacy,” by Eva De Clercq and Tillo Detige, discusses the artistic production of 1,500 Jaina images at the fort at Gwalior, in Central India, in the 15th century, and provides a useful overview of the histories and roles of Digambara celibate clerics (*bhaṭṭāraka*) in Rajasthan, northwest India. While most of the discussion of this chapter does not explicitly relate to the topic of this volume – painting and manuscript culture – the authors do note the role *bhaṭṭārakas* played in composing and preserving manuscripts on topics overlooked in scholarship such as *āyurveda*, *mantraśāstra*, and astrology (*jyotiṣa*). Future publications will have to look at the contents of these manuscripts.

Finally, in “The Transmission of the Devotional Songs of Ānandghan,” Imre Bangha does look at the contents of understudied manuscripts, those of the poems of the 17th-century Śvetāmbara ascetic Ānandghan. Focusing mostly on different transmissions of the anthology of poems (*pada*) called the “Collection of Seventy-Two” (*Bahattarī*), Bangha suggests that literary, not philosophical or sectarian, concerns dictated which poems became part of the canon of this important, yet little-known, author. Because of the range of methodologies used and the highlighting of many unknown sources of data on Jainism, this volume will remain an important resource for students and scholars interested in a variety of approaches, from textual studies, to art history, to museum studies, to ritual studies. Ellen Gough

Heinrich, Hanna, und Harald Grauer (Hrsg.): *Wege im Garten der Ethnologie*. Zwischen dort und hier. Festschrift für María Susana Cipolletti – Caminos en el jardín de la etnología. Entre aquí y allá. Publicación en homenaje a María Susana Cipolletti. Sankt Augustin: Academia Verlag, 2013. 414 pp. ISBN 978-3-89665-632-2. (Collectanea Instituti Anthropos, 46) Preis: € 35.00

Der von Hanna Heinrich und Harald Grauer herausgegebene Band “Wege im Garten der Ethnologie / Caminos en el jardín de la etnología” ist der Ehrung der Person und des Werks von María Susana Cipolletti gewidmet. Und so wie die Geehrte ein weites Themenfeld innerhalb der Altamerikanistik bearbeitet, beinhaltet auch der Band eine Fülle von Themen. Der Titel “Wege im Garten der Ethnologie” wäre deshalb hervorragend gewählt, würden die Beiträge nicht über das eigentliche Feld der Ethnolo-

gie hinausgreifen. “Wege im Garten der Altamerikanistik” hätte vielleicht eher beschrieben, was dem Lesepublikum in diesem Band geboten wird.

Der Band besteht neben seiner sehr knappen Einleitung und einem ausführlichen Schriftenverzeichnis von María Susana Cipolletti aus 20 Beiträgen auf Spanisch, Deutsch oder Englisch. Die Artikel behandeln Themen aus den Bereichen der Ethnologie, Soziologie, Historie und Ethnohistorie, Linguistik und Archäologie. Um sich in diesem Labyrinth nicht zu verirren, haben die Herausgeber eine Einteilung in drei große Schwerpunkte vorgenommen, wobei jeder Beitrag einem dieser Schwerpunkte zugeordnet ist: “Übergänge/Transiciones”, “Reisestationen/Estaciones de viaje” und “Ursprünge/Origenes”. Die Autoren gehören, wie das bei einer Ehrung zu erwarten ist, alle dem Kreis derjenigen an, die in irgendeinem Moment und/oder Zusammenhang mit María Susana Cipolletti zu tun hatten, sei es im Rahmen der Lehre, sei es in der Forschung.

“Wege im Garten ...” ist eine hervorragend gewählte Metapher, wenn man unter einem Garten ein größeres Stück Land versteht, das mal sehr gepflegt, mal ein bisschen unordentlich ist, stellenweise wild wuchert und wieder woanders fast brachliegt. Ein Garten also, in dem man manchmal droht, die Orientierung zu verlieren. Die Vielfältigkeit des Gartens erschwert es, auf jeden einzelnen Artikel tiefer einzugehen. Stattdessen soll hier, den Schwerpunkten folgend, für die Mehrzahl der Beiträge nur ein kurzer Abriss gegeben werden, um damit Hinweise für das Begehen des Gartens zu geben.

Den ersten Schwerpunkt als “Übergänge” zu bezeichnen, stellt sich als glücklicher Griff heraus. Eingeleitet wird dieser Teil mit einem Beitrag von M. Münzel, der mit einer Reflexion über die Totenrituale aus verschiedenen Weltteilen und den Umgang verschiedener Kulturen mit ihnen beginnt. In einigen Kulturen werden die Toten in ehrendem Gedenken gehalten, andere dagegen “verjagen” oder “verscheuchen” sie, damit sie die Lebenden nicht stören können. Münzel stellt fest: “Der Umgang mit Fortgegangenen findet sich wieder im Umgang mit Geistern, über den wir aber in der ethnologischen Literatur relativ wenig lesen. Merkwürdig: Welcher Ethnologe hat bei seiner Feldforschung nicht von Geistern gehört, da müsste die ethnologische Literatur doch überquellen von Berichten über sie?” (36). Dies bringt den Autor zu seinem Anliegen, eben über Geister zu reden und Geschichten über sie zu erzählen, sowie die Beziehung zwischen Geistern und Seelen anzusprechen, die natürlich von Kultur zu Kultur verschieden ist.

Münzels erhellende und exzellent geschriebene Einführung in den Garten dieses tatsächlich ethnologischen Themas gehört eher in den wilderen und interessanteren Teil. Amüsant auch seine Bemerkung zur Nichtbehandlung von Geistern durch (oft) verbeamtete Ethnologen und den möglichen Zusammenhang von Verbeamtung und dem auffallenden Desinteresse an Geistern. Münzels souveräner Blick auf das Thema Geister hängt sicherlich auch damit zusammen, dass er sich seit seiner Emeritierung außerhalb des engen akademischen Korsetts bewegen kann, das zwar den Unterhalt sichert, dem wissen-