



SHARED SAINTS AND FESTIVALS AMONG JEWS, CHRISTIANS, AND MUSLIMS IN THE MEDIEVAL MEDITERRANEAN

by
ALEXANDRA CUFFEL

ARC HUMANITIES PRESS



JEWISH ENGAGEMENTS

Further Information and Publications

www.arc-humanities.org/our-series/arc/je/

SHARED SAINTS AND FESTIVALS AMONG JEWS, CHRISTIANS, AND MUSLIMS IN THE MEDIEVAL MEDITERRANEAN

by
ALEXANDRA CUFFEL

ARCHUMANITIES PRESS

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

© 2024, Arc Humanities Press, Leeds

The authors assert their moral right to be identified as the authors of their part of this work.

Permission to use brief excerpts from this work in scholarly and educational works is hereby granted provided that the source is acknowledged. Any use of material in this work that is an exception or limitation covered by Article 5 of the European Union's Copyright Directive (2001/29/EC) or would be determined to be "fair use" under Section 107 of the U.S. Copyright Act September 2010 Page 2 or that satisfies the conditions specified in Section 108 of the U.S. Copyright Act (17 USC §108, as revised by P.L. 94-553) does not require the Publisher's permission.

ISBN (hardback): 9781641891493

ISBN (paperback): 9781802701685

e-ISBN (PDF): 9781802701678

www.arc-humanities.org

Printed and bound in the UK (by CPI Group [UK] Ltd), USA (by Bookmasters), and elsewhere using print-on-demand technology.

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	vii
Abbreviations.....	viii
Introduction	1
Chapter 1. Holy Spaces and Holy Corpses: Defining Sanctity and Veneration of the Dead from Late Antiquity to the Middle Ages.....	19
Chapter 2. The Other as Witness to the Truth: Positive Responses to Shared Religious Veneration among Jewish and Christian Pilgrims to the Middle East from Western Europe.....	49
Chapter 3. Forceful Saints and Compelling Rituals: Real and Imagined Jewish and Muslim Participation in Christian Rituals and Saint Cults from Byzantium to Western Europe	73
Chapter 4. Praising, Cursing, or Ignoring the Other: Jews, Christians, and Muslims at One Another's Holy Spaces in the Islamicate Mediterranean	109
Chapter 5. Opposition to Shared Saints and Festivals in the Islamicate World	157
Chapter 6. Upholding the Dignity of the Faith and Separating Believers and Unbelievers in Medieval Christian Societies	191
Conclusions.....	243
Bibliography.....	251
Index	309

To my mother
Victoria Jean Cuffel
who taught me to cherish research
as a hedonistic pursuit.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

THIS BOOK HAS been a long time in the making, and so, as with all such endeavours, I owe a happy debt of thanks to many individuals who shared their thoughts, encouragement and critiques over the years, and to the various organizations which provided the funding, and most of all, the time, necessary to work on this book.

My thanks to Abraham Udovitch and Shaun Marmon, both of Princeton University, under whom I wrote the initial seminar paper which was the spark for the current book, and who, even then, suggested that the topic had promise as a monograph. Many thanks also to William Chester Jordan, who patiently and kindly slogged through early drafts of my Introduction and helped me find the core through a fog of too many ideas. I am indebted to the American Council of Learned Societies and the Women's Studies in Religion Program at Harvard Divinity School which funded the initial research and writing for this book, and to the other fellows and associated scholars of the Women's Studies in Religion Program during the academic year 2006–2007, Carole B. Duncan, Caroline Johnson Hodge, Shelly Rambo, Fatima Sadiqi, Laura Nasrallah, and the director, Ann D. Braude, all of whom provided encouragement and vital feedback for the project. I am also indebted to the Institute of Advanced Studies at Princeton, and the then-Professor for medieval history, Caroline Walker Bynum for hosting me as a visiting scholar and allowing me access to the resources and support of the Institute. There I benefited immensely from the discussions and input from Emma Dillon, Marilyn Desmond, Jessica Goldberg, Nicholas Paul, Judith Pfeiffer, Luis To-Figueras, Sandy Bardsley, Patricia Crone, and of course, Caroline Bynum herself.

Coming as a fellow to the Käte Hamburger Kolleg for the Dynamics in the History of Religions between Asia and Europe in Bochum, Germany, introduced me to new sources and ideas about the configurations and interpretations of religious encounters, the significance of the Christian communities under Islamic rule, and the need to address the complexities which ensue when examining shared religious figures, spaces, and festivals in the context of a profoundly pluralistic religious milieu. While I benefited immensely from conversations with all of the faculty and fellows with whom I had the pleasure to work in the context of the KHK, I am most especially indebted to Ana Echevarria, Dorothea Weltecke, Zaroui Pogossian, Nikolas Jaspert, Andreas Bendlin, Mareille Haase, Georgios Halkias, Beate Ego, Rebecca Lesses, Amy Remensnyder, Eduard Iricinschi, Steve Berkwitz, Aziz Azmeh, Paul Fenton, Sahar Amer, and of course the original director of the KHK, Volkhard Krech. Without them, this book would have been far simpler, but also less ambitious, with many more errors.

In its final form this book is the product of two ERC projects. First, and most extensively, this book is part of the results of a European Research project for which I received funding from the Council (ERC) under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation program (grant agreement no. 647467—JEWSEAST). Through it I had the time and means by which to deepen my knowledge of the Eastern Mediterranean, Jewish-Christian relations outside of Europe, particularly in the Caucasus, Anatolia, India, and Ethiopia. While, sadly, only a portion of our explorations of Jewish-Christian

(and also Muslim, Zoroastrian, and Hindu) relations are reflected in this monograph, the broader historical contexts and methodological considerations are very much at its core. I am thankful to the team of researchers with whom I had the pleasure to work during this project: Zaroui Pogossian, Barbara Roggema, Istvan Perczel, Neda Darabian, Bar Kribus, Sophia Dege-Müller, Verena Krebs, Stephen Rapp, Radu Mustata, and Ophira Gamliel. The second half of Chapter 6 of this book, is a product of the European Research Council project ArmEN (grant agreement no. 867067), led by Zaroui Pogossian. A number of people on both projects, and also Margarita Voulgaropoulou, Rania Ahmed, Mohsen Zakhari, and Ana Echevarria have supplied bibliographic suggestions, language and editorial support. Ben Segev, my student assistant has also been immensely helpful and patient chasing down and scanning more documents than either of us care to recall. Additionally, my thanks to Wendy Belcher who enabled access to the Princeton University library during Covid, and graciously opened her home on a number of research trips.

Most of all, this book would have been neither possible nor remotely fun without my better half, Adam Knobler who, in addition to making my life a joy, has contributed his intellectual expertise and discernment, bibliographic knowledge, and editorial skills. And finally, my thanks to my mother, Victoria Cuffel, to whom this book is dedicated, who has been waiting impatiently for its completion, but at the same time has continually encouraged me to chase all interesting leads, undaunted by complexity or difficulty, reminding me that research is an endeavour done with pleasure and passion.

ABBREVIATIONS

BT	Babylonian Talmud
CSCO	Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium
EI	<i>Encyclopedia of Islam</i> , 2nd Edition
HOCP	Sawirus ibn al-Muqaffa', <i>History of the Patriarchs of the Egyptian Church</i> , known as the history of the Holy Church, Cairo: n.p., 1943–.
HOPC	Sawirus ibn al-Muqaffa', <i>History of the Patriarchs of the Coptic Church of Alexandria</i>
MGH	Monumenta Germaniae Historica
PG	Patrologia Graeca
PL	Patrologia Latina
PO	Patrologia Orientalis
TS	Taylor-Schechter Collection, Cambridge University Library