

Between Dwarfs and Giants

Aesthetics of the Pasticcio between London and Hamburg

GESA ZUR NIEDEN

Let me begin with a historical example of the labelling of an opera as a pasticcio in the context of the manifold and often misinterpreted transfers between northern Germany and England during the 18th century. In his *Grundlage einer Ehrenpforte* of 1740, Johann Mattheson listed all the performances of Handel's operas that to his knowledge had been produced in Hamburg up to that point, not without complaining about the inadequate handling of the musical works in question:

“The remaining *Singspiele* from Handel's pen, as *Rinaldo*, 1715; *Oriana*, 1717; together with the just mentioned *Agrippina*, 1718; *Zenobia*, 1721; *Muzio Scevola* and *Floridante*, 1723; *Tamerlan*, *Julius Cäsar* and *Otto*, 1725; *Richardus I*, 1729; *Admetus*, 1730; *Cleofida* (also called by its correct name *Porus*) and *Judith*, 1732; lastly, *Rodelinda*, 1734, have been played here in Hamburg in his absence and [their scores] have been sent in from outside. Such was also the case with the music to Brockes' *Passion*, which he also composed in England, and had sent here by post in an uncommonly close-written score. [...]

While the Handelian operas are, most of them, composed to Italian words, yet they have been performed here partly in that language, but partly subjected to the greatest alterations through translation and interpolation. [...] In all 19 or 20 of his dramatic pieces are known here in Hamburg, although in London there are perhaps still more, from which arias have been engraved there, and are somewhat expensive.”¹

1 “Die übrigen Singspiele von Händels Feder, als *Rinaldo*, 1715; *Oriana*, 1717; samt der ebenerwehnten *Agrippine*, 1718; *Zenobia*, 1721; *Muzzio Scevola* und *Floridantes*, 1723; *Tamerlan*, *Julius Cäsar* und *Otto*, 1725; *Richardus*, I. 1729; *Admetus*, 1730; *Cleofida*, (sonst mit dem rechten Nahmen *Porus* genannt) und *Judith*, 1732, zuletzt die *Rodelinda*, 1734, sind in seiner Abwesenheit hier in Hamburg gespielt, und von aussen eingesandt worden. Eine solche Beschaffenheit hat es auch mit der Brockeschen Passions-Musik, die er gleichfalls in England verfertigt, und in einer ungemein eng-geschriebenen Partitur auf der

Mattheson's remarks contain not only important information on his own preoccupations with authorship issues, but also on the distribution of operas via post and printed sheet music. According to him, the separation between the score and its author resulted in the many "Einflickungen", i.e. interpolations of arias which seems to have been quite a normal procedure in Hamburg. As can be seen in the example of Mattheson's list of "Singspiele", this practice was not explicitly labelled with the term "pasticcio" but was connected to the operatic genre in general.²

Yet, upon further inspection of Mattheson's remarks on the treatment of Handel's operas in Hamburg and their reception in other metropolises or courts, transregional differences of the early modern reception of pasticcios can be revealed. This can be shown by the example of the above-mentioned opera, *Judith*, which was performed in Hamburg from 1733 to 1737 in an arrangement by the then director of the Hamburg opera, Georg Philipp Telemann.³ Mattheson was incorrect in qualifying *Judith* as a "Singspiel" by Handel, since the main part of the music was taken from Fortunato Chelleri's *L'innocenza difesa*, even if this opera had already been readapted on several occasions: Chelleri's opera was composed to a libretto by Francesco Silvani, which had first been performed with music by Giuseppe Maria Orlandini in Verona in 1714.⁴ Chelleri's setting of *L'innocenza difesa* might have already been staged in Florence in 1721.⁵ In addition, a libretto which is very similar to Silvani's version set to music by Chelleri but without any indication of the composer's or librettist's names survives. It was published

Post hierher geschickt hat. [...] Inzwischen sind die händelschen Opern zum Theil, so wie die meisten abgefaßt, in italienischer Sprache hier aufgeführt worden; zum Theil aber durch Übersetzungen und Einflickungen, der grössten Veränderung unterworfen gewesen. Das mag einen jeden Componisten billig abschrecken, nichts von seiner Arbeit an solche Oerter zu verschicken, da man nach eigenem Gutdüncken verfährt, und das *absens carens* spielet. Auch eine Lehre! In allem werden 19. oder 20. dramatische Stücke alhier in Hamburg von ihm, in London aber vielleicht noch einige andre bekannt seyn, daraus die Arien dort in Kupffer gestochen, und ziemlich theuer sind.“ MATTHESON, 1740, pp. 96f, translation by DEUTSCH, 1955, p. 504.

2 Cf. STROHM, 1981, pp. 37-54.

3 MARX/SCHRÖDER, 1995, p. 255.

4 See <http://corago.unibo.it/libretto/DRT0024125>, 11.02.2020.

5 *L'Innocenza difesa. Dramma per Musica da rappresentarsi in Firenze Il Carnovale dell'Anno 1721. Nel Teatro di Via della Pergola sotto la protezione dell'Altezza Reale del Serenissimo Grand Principe di Toscana. E dedicato all'Eccellenza illustrissima dell'Signor Duca Francesco Bonelli [...]*. In Firenze, Per Dom. Ambrogio Versi [...] 1721; online: <http://bibliotecaestense.beniculturali.it/info/img/lib/i-mo-beu-70.h.6.7.pdf>, 11.02.2020.

in Venice in 1722,⁶ before being performed once more as *La Giuditta* in Kassel in 1726⁷ and finally as *Die vertheidigte Unschuld/Die beschützte Unschuld* in Brunswick and Wolfenbüttel in 1731.⁸ For the Hamburg production of 1733, Georg Philipp Telemann added three arias from Handel's *Lotario* (London 1729) to Chelleri's version, plus three arias newly composed by himself for the child role of Fabio, which until then had been a silent.⁹ Even if in this way Telemann continued the strong orientation towards Handel's operas and the practice of recitative translations that were common in both Hamburg and Brunswick, there is no justification to consider the Hamburg *Judith* an opera written by Handel.¹⁰

-
- 6 *L'Innocenza difesa. Drama per Musica da rappresentarsi nel Teatro di S. Angelo Nel Carnovale dell'Anno 1722 dedicato al Serenissimo, e Reverendissimo Principe Giovan-Teodoro Duca dell'una, & dell'altra Baviera, Conte Palatino del Reno, Landgravio di Leictemberg, e Vescovo di Ratisbona ec.* In Venezia, MDCCXXII. Presso Marino Rossetti, in Merceria all'Insegna della Pace; online: <http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/libretti/00/Lo000971/>, 11.02.2020.
- 7 A copy of this opera is preserved in D-K1, Israel-Anhang 12 under the title "La Giuditta (1. Akt)" and dated 1726. Cf. GOTTWALD, 1997, pp. 834f.
- 8 *L'Innocenza difesa. Drama per Musica da rappresentarsi sul famosissimo teatro di Bruns- viga nella fiera d'estate l'anno 1731/Die vertheidigte Unschuld in einer Opera vorgestellet Auf dem grossen Braunschweigischen Theatro in der Sommer-Messe 1731.* Wolfenbüttel, Druckts Christian Bartsch Herzogl. Hof- und Canzeley Buchdrucker; online: <http://diglib.hab.de/drucke/textb-91/start.htm>, 11.02.2020; *L'innocenza difesa. Drama per Musica con Prologo da rappresentarsi al teatro ducal di Wolfenbuttel festeggiandosi il nome gloriosissimo della Sac. Ces. E Catt. Real Maestà di Elisabeta Cristina imperadrice regnante. / Die beschützte Unschuld in einer Opera nebst einem Prologo vorgestellet auf dem Hoch=Fürstl. Theatro zu Wolfenbüttel an dem Gloriösen Nahmens=Tage dero Röm=Kays- serl. Und Cathol. Königl. Majestät Elisabethen Christinen Regierenden Römischen Kay- serinnen ec. Ec.* Wolfenbüttel druckst C. Bartsch Herzogl. Hof= und Canzeley=Buchdr online: <https://daten.digital-e-sammlungen.de/0005/bsb00054998/images/index.html?id=00054998&groesser=&fip=yztseayaayaqrsxdsydsdaseayaqrssdas&no=8&seite=6>, 11.02.2020. On Chelleri's life and music see TALBOT, 2011, pp. 51-58 and VAVOULIS, 2000, pp. IX-XI.
- 9 "Judith Gemahlin Kaiser Ludewig des Frommen", D-B Mus.ms.9057. For the mute role of Judith's son cf. *L'Innocenza difesa. Drama per Musica da rappresentarsi nel Teatro di S. Angelo Nel Carnovale dell'Anno 1722 dedicato al Serenissimo, e Reverendissimo Principe Giovan-Teodoro Duca dell'una, & dell'altra Baviera, Conte Palatino del Reno, Landgravio di Leictemberg, e Vescovo di Ratisbona ec.* In Venezia, MDCCXXII. Presso Marino Rossetti, in Merceria all'Insegna della Pace. In this libretto Fabio is named Carlo. In Handel's *Lotario*, there is no child role.
- 10 On the similarities of operatic productions in Brunswick and Hamburg and on Telemann's relations to Brunswick see POETZSCH, 1993, pp. 63-69.

The complex production history of *L'innocenza difesa*, *La Giuditta*, *Die vertheidigte Unschuld* and *Judith* continued to provoke different genre attributions even in the second half of the 18th century, when the term “pasticcio” seems to have been attributed to the Hamburg *Judith* for the first time: in his description of Handel’s life from 1785, Charles Burney adopted Mattheson’s reflections on the Hamburg performances of Handel’s operas, but wondered if *Judith* was “an Oratorio, [...] of which nothing is known in England”.¹¹ Just a year later, in a German translation of Burney’s account, Johann Joachim Eschenburg, a “professor from Brunswick”, where Chelleri’s *Die vertheidigte Unschuld* had been performed, rectified Burney’s error with the following footnote: “The latter was not an oratorio, as M. B. supposes, but an opera, and this Judith is not the biblical one, but the wife of Louis the Pious. Nearly all the arias are in Italian, and the German recitatives are set by Telemann. It seems to be a mere pasticcio.”¹²

Burney’s error is remarkable, since even if he states that a *Judith* is not known in England (which is true since there is no Handel opera or oratorio entitled *Judith*), three oratorios called *Judith* had been performed in London between 1733 and 1761. The first of them had been composed by Willem de Fesch and was given at Lincoln’s Inn Fields in February 1733, right at the time of the Hamburg performance of the opera *Judith* and only one year after the performance of Handel’s first oratorio *Esther*.¹³

Let me briefly resume this little *tour d’horizon* between early 18th-century Hamburg, London and Brunswick in order to formulate the main question of my paper: firstly, each author contextualizes the genre of the opera, *Judith*, with the local repertoire best known to himself. Therefore, operatic pasticcio productions are mostly understood in the light of local operatic practices like the translations into German in Hamburg or the shift from opera to oratorio in London. Secondly, Mattheson and Burney qualify *Judith* in relation to the important role played by Handel as composer renowned throughout Europe. Due to this person-centered view, both authors concentrate on the distribution of Handel’s works in their entirety and not on the multi-composer dramaturgy of music patchworks like Telemann’s adaptation of Chelleri’s *Judith* for Hamburg. Mattheson, for example, acknowledged the honor that was paid to Handel in London. At the end of his Handel biography, in *Grundlage einer Ehrenpforte*, he reflected on the Handel statue in Vauxhall Gardens, which he had learned about in the English periodicals accessible in Hamburg.¹⁴ Against this background, it becomes clear that the term “pasticcio” is an

11 BURNEY, 1785, pp. 50f.

12 “Die letzte war kein Oratorium, wie Hr. B. glaubt, sondern gleichfalls eine Oper; und diese Judith ist nicht die biblische, sondern eine Gemahlin Ludwigs des Frommen. Die Arien sind fast alle italienisch, und die deutschen Recitative von Telemann gesetzt. Es scheint ein blosses Pasticcio zu seyn.“ BURNEY/ESCHENBURG, 1785, p. XXIII.

13 ZÖLLNER, 2000, pp. 158-171.

14 At the end of his Handel biography, Mattheson writes: “[...] this has often been reported in the English court journals that a marble honor column and statue has been erected for him by some private persons in Vauxhall Gardens, that is already something. In these gardens, that are accessible for everybody to enjoy, many concerts for money are organized.” (“[...]

anachronistic generic description for the opera practices of the early 18th century that evolved between complex cultural transfers, a widespread yet often misleading or incorrect literal and musical intertextuality, and a continuous crystallization of a person-centered conception of authorship. Consequently, the term was used only in the second half of the 18th century as has been shown here by the example of Eschenburg.

In the following study, I will address the aesthetic role of an operatic practice that was based on the compilation of arias written by different composers during the first half of the 18th century. How can the general structural features and aesthetic functions of early modern operatic ‘pasticcios’ be described from a historical point of view when those works seemed to be part of the general set of local operatic practices? And how can the transregional dimensions of such local practices be outlined? For this, I will first analyze the aesthetic value of operatic works compiled out of preexisting materials, which was reflected upon in the references to opera and oratorio in the caricatures and aesthetic treatises circulating in the musical world of early 18th-century London, i.e. where Mattheson and Burney supposed *Judith* to have been performed for the first time. In the second part, I will describe the transfers of such aesthetics from London to Hamburg before concluding with an analysis of Telemann’s *Judith* for the Hamburg opera between the dramaturgy of its libretto and the aesthetics connected to its musical structure made of arias by Chelleri, Handel and Telemann.

***Judith* in the context of the aesthetic discourses of 18th-century London relating to different arts**

The motivation of a Hamburg arrangement of *Judith* with airs from Handel’s *Lotario* can surely be explained by Johann Gottfried Riemschneider’s engagement at Handel’s Royal Academy of Music in London for the 1729 performance of that opera.¹⁵ In 1732, just one year before the production of *Judith*, Riemschneider was back in Hamburg where he sang in *Cleofida* after Handel’s *Poro*.¹⁶ After having seen the London production of *Lotario*, Giuseppe Riva compared the singer to a boar by describing him as “a bass from Hamburg that has a voice more like a natural contralto than a bass, he sweetly sings in his throat and his nose, pronounces Italian like German, acts like a young wild

nur dieses ist oft in den engländischen Hof-Zeitungen gemeldet worden, daß ihm von einigen Privat-Personen, in den Gärten zu Vaux-Hall, eine marmorne Ehren- und Bildsäule errichtet worden, welches schon was beträchtliches ist. Es werden in diesen Gärten, dahin jedermann gehen und sich erlustigen kann, viele Concerte für Geld gehalten.“), MATTHESON, 1740, p. 101.

- 15 On the importance of the singer’s mobility for the production of pasticcios cf. the articles by PELLICCIA (pp. 225-239), OVER (pp. 285-328), ZSOVÁR (pp. 425-446) and RYSZKA-KOMARNICKA (pp. 621-657) in this volume.
- 16 MARX/SCHRÖDER, 1995, p. 453. According to Mattheson, Riemschneider had returned to Hamburg by the year 1730. MATTHESON, 1740, p. 101.

boar and has a face looking more like a valet than like anything else. Beautiful, really beautiful!”¹⁷

Such a contrasting, figurative and metaphorical description of an ‘imported’ Hamburg singer in London as a boar looking like a servant resembles the presentations of singers and composers in the many graphic prints and periodicals that circulated in the British capital. These prints dealt especially with the transfer of Italian opera to the London music life and the presence of Italian composers and singers there. As will be shown in the following passages, the confrontation of Italian and English opera provoked an extensive discourse on the formation of taste. This is especially true for William Hogarth’s graphic prints in London and of the intertextual as well as interconnected relations that surrounded them.

In relation to the English oratorio *Judith* that Burney took to be the origin of the Hamburg opera with the same title, William Hogarth published a graphic print entitled *A Chorus of Singers, or The Oratorio* (December 1732) even before the first performance of the version by Willem de Fesch and William Huggins (Figure 1).¹⁸ It shows four voices under the direction of Willem de Fesch who appears at the top of the picture as a conductor without wearing his wig. The center of the graphic is occupied by a person with a boar-like nose wearing a long wig. Around 1800, Johan Ireland and Georg Christoph Lichtenberg considered this figure to be an Italian (“A gentleman,—pardon me,—I meant a singer, in a bag-wig, immediately beneath his uplifted band, I suspect to be of foreign growth. It has the engaging air of an *importation from Italy*.”).¹⁹ Indeed, further graphics by Hogarth in this context illustrate that the ‘Italian’ in the center could be an allusion to Handel. Firstly, the second plate of Hogarth’s *The Rake’s Progress* (produced in 1732-1734, published 1735) shows Handel with a long wig at the harpsichord.²⁰ This posture and portrait was later retaken by Joseph Goupy in his famous caricature, *The Harmonious Boar*, which shows Handel as a boar playing the organ (Figure 2).²¹ Secondly, antithetical to the with-and-without-wig contrast between an ‘Italian’ and an English composer in *A Chorus of Singers, or The Oratorio*, the image of a public musician without a wig would be used as well by Louis François Roubiliac for the Handel monument in Vauxhall Gardens which the French sculptor accomplished in 1738 under the guidance of Hogarth. In Vauxhall, this monument was placed under a

17 “un basso d’Amburgo che à voce più da contralto naturale che da basso, canta dolcemente nella gola e nel naso, pronuncia l’italiano alla cimbrica, atteggia come un pargoletto Cinghiale, ed à più faccia da valet de chambre che d’altro. Bello! bello ma bello!” Letter by Giuseppe Riva to Paolo Antonio Rolli, 11 December 1729 (I-MOe), quoted after HÄNDEL, 2003, p. VII. Translation mine.

18 HOGARTH, 1732, in: <https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/392588>, 01.02.2020. On William De Fesch’s oratorio *Judith* and its mostly lost music see HICKS/ABRAHAM, 1986, pp. 34-37.

19 IRELAND, ²1793, p. 280; LICHTENBERG, 1805, p. 56.

20 HOGARTH, 1735, Plate 2.

21 GOUPY, 1743-44.

huge open arch that shows some similarities with the frontispiece of Mattheson's *Grundlage einer Ehrenpforte* of 1740.²² By these resemblances, the graphic print *A Chorus of Singers, or The Oratorio* already hints at the complex intertextuality of early modern representations connected to music as an aesthetic but also as a political art. Yet a comprehensive view of the above-mentioned graphics shows that Hogarth's prints allowed dialectic attitudes which were simultaneously ironic and admiring towards English and Italian composers in 18th-century London. Thus, by describing Riemschneider as a boar looking like a servant, London musical critique integrated the singer into the local musical life where composers and musicians or singers constantly teetered between aesthetic completion and failure.

Figure 1: William Hogarth, *A Chorus of Singers* (1732), bpk / Herzog Anton Ulrich-Museum.



22 BUSCH, 2014, pp. 39-52. Cf. the title page of MATTHESON, 1740.

Figure 2: Joseph Goupy, *The Harmonious Boar* (1743-1744), Fitzwilliam Museum Cambridge.



Indeed, besides these more general resemblances that point above all to the national contours of ‘Italian’ and ‘English’ music in London, *A Chorus of Singers, or The Oratorio* shows an important element for the formation of musical taste in early modern London musical life. In contrast to the other singers, both de Fesch and Handel, the two composers representing Italian and English opera or oratorio, are wearing glasses. In addition, another figure on the right is holding a magnifying glass above his score. Following this, many caricatures of the time deal with magnifying glasses that sometimes turn into mirrors.²³ This is also true for the Handel caricature *The Harmonious Boar*, which is a pasticcio as well, since the dwarf who holds a magnifying glass in front of Handel’s face was taken by Joseph Goupy from a copy of a drawing by Annibale Carracci. In Goupy’s caricature the magnifying glass can be interpreted as an invitation to study the pasticcio-like arrangement of elements in the left half of the graphic to form one’s taste instead of falling into mere gluttony.²⁴ Such an invitation seems to be expressed in Hogarth’s *A Chorus of Singers, or The Oratorio* as well, since the print seems to play with the dialectic of musical involvement and analytical study of music. On the one hand, John Ireland and Lichtenberg already underlined the fact that Hogarth had successfully created a

23 ZUR NIEDEN, 2019, p. 33.

24 ZUR NIEDEN, 2019.

real musical image: “To paint a sound is impossible; but as far as art can go towards it, Mr. Hogarth has gone in this print. The tenor, treble, and bass of these earpiercing choristers are so decisively discriminated, that we all but hear them.”²⁵ On the other hand, the graphic lines of the score merge with the drawing of the persons, thus hinting at an accurate construction of the musical image. In this way the graphic prints circulating in London were built upon one another, reflecting a dialectic formation of taste between Italian opera and (English) popular music theater as well as between the sensation of music and the study of musical scores.²⁶ Such a study seems to rely on the magnifying glass as an instrument to see single items in detail and to enlarge them far from their usual contexts or to see them in contrast to differing objects and music practices.

Telemann’s reception of the London aesthetics in Hamburg

But what did this mean for the Hamburg productions of Handel’s operas in adapted versions? Even if we do not know exactly which subjects were discussed during the long-lasting friendship between Handel and Telemann, there are two connections to the above-described London aesthetics in the work and writings of Telemann. Firstly, Telemann was occupied with the aesthetics of the magnifying glass as well by reflecting on giants and dwarfs in the compositions that he addressed to a broader public. In 1728/29 Telemann included six pieces on Jonathan Swift’s *Gulliver’s Travels* in *Der getreue Music-Meister*, among them a *Lilliputsche Chaconne* and a *Brobdingnagische Gigue*.²⁷ In these pieces for two violins without bass, Telemann depicts the giants and dwarfs of Swift’s novel in the score. *Gulliver’s Travels* had been published in London in 1726 and translated into German by Telemann’s librettist Christoph Gottlieb Wend in 1727/28.²⁸

By including some little pieces referring to *Gulliver’s Travels* in his instructive periodical *Der getreue Music-Meister*, Telemann addressed three problems that interested him in general: (1) a reflection on the parallelisms of music and painting, (2) the contrast between musical performances and the reading of librettos and scores (these were also constantly addressed in Luise Adelgunde Victorie Gottsched’s and Johann Adolph Scheibe’s translations and quotations of English periodicals who complained about the patchwork of stage designs and the appearance of different animals on the London stages),²⁹ and (3) the grouping of single musical pieces in a collection addressed to a

25 IRELAND, 1793, p. 279.

26 On the partially European-wide discussions of rationalism and sensualism see MAZZOTTI, 2004, pp. 119-146, and STIENIG, 2017, pp. 39-67.

27 TELEMANN, 1728, pp. 32 and 36.

28 HIRSCHMANN, 2007, p. 75.

29 See e.g. “Das XIV. Stück. Freytags, den 16. März [1710]” in: *Der Zuschauer*, 1750, pp. 65-70.

broader public.³⁰ In *Der getreue Music-Meister*, these problems are partially solved by the notational differences of single musical styles or generic norms that allowed one to distinguish the narrowly patched single pieces by eye. Moreover, Telemann stressed the importance of the musical notation by creating many figurative hints at certain passages in Swift's *Gulliver's Travels* in the *Gulliver Suite*: In the "Lilliputsche Chaconne", the tying to the ground of Gulliver's body by the Lilliputians is visualized by 256 notes. In the "Brobdingnagische Gigue", Gulliver tries to play a jig written in a white square notation on the giants' spinet with two sticks in his hands that could have been visualized by the two violin bows in Telemann's *Music-Meister*.³¹ In a nutshell, Telemann's *Der getreue Music-Meister* was concerned with the above-mentioned dimension of musical notation as a basis for a thorough study of stylistic differences by a broader public. This study was also fostered by a visual extension of the dramaturgical dimensions in his musical manual that was published in consecutive parts.

Secondly, in spite of this mediated approach to the formation of public taste via a more dramaturgical reflection on dwarfs and giants in his music scores, Telemann appears to have had the same aesthetic interests and to have been part of the network of people occupied with William Hogarth's concept of aesthetic beauty: above all, Telemann shared Hogarth's interest in Louis Bertrand Castel's ocular harpsichord of 1725. In 1739, Telemann published a *Beschreibung der Augen-Orgel oder des Augen-Clavicimbels, so der berühmte Mathematicus und Jesuit zu Paris, Herr Pater Castel, erfunden und ins Werk gerichtet hat*, where he stressed the fact that both colors and sounds apply to the issue of aesthetic reception due to their minimal differences and their shared qualities which might be discovered in detail by the recipient.³²

In 1753, William Hogarth also first planned a passage on that harpsichord for his *Analysis of Beauty. Written with a View of Fixing the Fluctuating Ideas of Taste*, that

30 Steven Zohn stresses the fact that, among other things, Telemann aimed at instructing a broad audience through variety. ZOHN, 2017, p. 70. On the relationship of Telemann's *Der getreue Music-Meister* to England see also LANGE, 1997, pp. 116 and 121f.

31 TELEMANN, 1728, pp. 32 and 36. For Gulliver playing the giant harpsichord see SWIFT, 2002, p. 105.

32 "The sounds only please because of their pronounced difference, by their accordance and comparison. Colors are as manifold as sounds and have certain accordances. The eye may compose them, develop their comparisons and feel their order and disorder. Such a sensation generates the pleasure and stimulation in all things, and the real pleasure of music consists in the noticing of such difference immediately and bit by bit several times over a short duration." ("Die Klänge gefallen nur durch eine deutliche Verschiedenheit, durch ihre Uebereinstimmung und Vergleichung; Die Farben sind so mannigfaltig, als die Klänge, und haben gewisse Uebereinstimmungen. Das Auge kann sie zusammenfügen, ihre Vergleichungen entwickeln und ihre Ordnung und Unordnung empfinden. Diß Empfinden verurhsachtet das Vergnügen und Anreizen in allen Dingen, und das eigentliche Vergnügen der Music bestehet in dem, solchen Unterschied augenblicklich, und nach und nach in kurzer Zeit mehrmals zu bemerken.") TELEMANN, 1739.

he later cancelled. In this passage, emphasizing Telemann's perception of the aesthetic value of the ocular harpsichord, he criticized the classic opinion "that colours and sound [are] of the same nature and that like dispositions of them both would answer the same purpose, i.e., that a jig in notes would be literally a jig in colours",³³ i.e. to declare oneself in favor of a reformation of taste through comparison and distinctness. Such orientation can also be underlined by the fact that Hogarth based his arguments on Roger de Piles' *Principles of Painting* (London 1743), i.e. on one of the first writers who had given a definition of the early modern pastiche. In de Pile's case, pastiche was strongly linked to comparison.³⁴ Since Hogarth joined an ironic passage on cookery to his own theoretical reflection on beauty, he might well have alluded to the representation of Handel's gluttony in Goupy's print *The Harmonious Boar* that also stressed the importance of the magnifying glass.³⁵

In relation to Hogarth's emphasis on comparison in opposition to a synthetic view of visual arts and music, there are some hints for the fact that Telemann was interested in the comparative dimension of single artistic objects or parts as well. Just one year after its publication in England, Hogarth's *The Analysis of Beauty* was translated into German by the Leipzig scientist Christlob Mylius, a cousin of Gotthold Ephraim Lessing.³⁶ When Mylius traveled through Hamburg in 1753, he visited Telemann in his large garden "where there are many strange and beautiful plants" ("worin viel fremde und schöne Pflanzen sind").³⁷ At the same period, between 1750 and 1754, Handel kept on sending exotic plants from England to Telemann in Hamburg. In 1750, Handel wrote to Telemann:

"[...] I send you a box of flowers which the experts of these plants assured me to be chosen of a charming rarity, if they tell me the truth. You will have the best plants of all of England, the season is still proper to have flowers; You will be the best judge, I am waiting for your decision on it."³⁸

33 GB-Lbl, Egerton Ms.3012, fols. i5r-i7r; also reprinted in HOGARTH, 1997, pp. 131f.

34 BARLOW, 2005, p. 16. On Roger de Pile's role for the early modern theorization of pastiche as a genre cf. HOESTEREY, 2001, pp. 4-6. To be able to conceive the artistic skill of a "pasticheur", de Piles recommended a comparison with the original: "'Tis the same with all pastici, and if we wou'd not be deceiv'd by them, we shou'd examine their *Goût* of Design, their Colouring, and the Character of their Pencils, with the Originals from whence they were taken." PILES, 1706, p. 75.

35 CHRISSOCHOIDIS, 2009, p. 580.

36 MYLIUS, 1754.

37 Christlob Mylius 1753, cited in: ECKARDT, 1983, p. 42.

38 "[...] je Vous envoie une Caisse de Fleurs, que les Connoisseurs de ces Plantes m'assurent d'être choisies et d'une rareté Charmante, s'il medisent le vray. Vous aurez des plantes les meilleures de toute l'Angleterre, la saison est encore propre pour en avoir des Fleurs ; Vous en serez le meilleur Juge, j'attends Vôtre decision la dessus." Letter by George Frideric Handel to Georg Philipp Telemann, 25 December 1750, in: TELEMANN, 1972, p. 343.

Exotic plants also play a central role in Hogarth's *Analysis of Beauty*. Until now, his writings have been mostly analyzed in relation to his "lines of beauty", i.e. the S-curved "waving lines", but the first part of his analysis is explicitly dedicated to the variety and distinctness of aesthetic compositions that Hogarth explains by the example of the composition of different flowers. Here Hogarth wants to abandon the classical aesthetics of harmonious proportions.³⁹ Instead, he opts for an inner variety of an aesthetically beautiful form thus recalling the general dialectics that were present in his prints as well. Not least, for the development of perfect shapes, Hogarth employs a zooming in and out of the objects in question:

"When you would compose an object of a great variety of parts, let several of those parts be distinguish'd by themselves, by their remarkable difference from the next adjoining, so as to make each of them, as it were, one well-shap'd quantity or part, as is marked by the dotted lines in figure ++ (these are like what they call passages in music, and in writing paragraphs) by which means, not only the whole, but even every part, will be better understood by the eye: for confusion will hereby be avoided when the object is seen near, and the shapes will seem well varied, tho' fewer in number, at a distance; as figure supposed to be the same as the former, but removed so far off that the eye loses sight of the smaller members."⁴⁰

Following this kind of aesthetic approach, grounded in the tasteful reception of artistic intertextuality represented by the magnifying glasses in early 18th-century graphic prints, the question of whether *Judith* is a pasticcio or just an opera adaptation has to be modified: more than pointing at a special musical genre, the practice of patching different music into an opera seems to have been aligned with central aesthetic preoccupations in early modern London and Hamburg musical life. Instead of decrying the patch as "Einflickung" like Mattheson already did in 1740, its relevance for the formation of a dialectical taste must be examined based on the compositional handling of single passages, i.e. musical motives, styles and dramatic expressions by processes of augmentation and detailed variation in view of a well-balanced shape or dramaturgy. Following this approach, the size of the compiled or patched parts between little borrowings and inserted arias comes to the fore, so that a historically-informed research has to look at the impact of arrangements on larger or smaller scales.

Dramaturgical shifts and stylistic contrasts in *Judith*

How such aesthetics of comparison and contrast via diminution and augmentation are perceivable in the compositional processes of single operas is not easy to tell. Nevertheless, Hogarth's theorization underlines the importance of single parts that form a harmo-

39 See e.g. HOGARTH, 1753, pp. XIII and 76f.

40 *IBID.*, p. 42.

nious unity. This is why in the following paragraphs a musical analysis of single melodic and accompanimental formulas will be adopted. Such an analysis aims at detecting the stylistic as well as dramaturgical shifts provoked by the augmentation or diminution of single musical formulas or by the interpolation of new arias into Chelleri's *La Giuditta*.

Telemann's arrangement of Silvani's *L'innocenza difesa* for Hamburg highly depended on Fortunato Chelleri's *La Giuditta*, performed in Kassel in 1726. From this production a manuscript score of the first act survives.⁴¹ Apart from a few transpositions and the non-observance of Chelleri's indicated cuts in the aria "Come in mare procella fra l'onde", the music of this score is congruent with the music of the first act in the *Judith* score for the Hamburg production.⁴² That the main part of the arias of the second and third acts were also composed by Chelleri can be deduced from his *Cantate e arie con stromenti*, published during his stay in London in 1727. On the title page of the print Chelleri described himself as the *Kapellmeister* of the landgrave of Hesse-Cassel. The *Cantate e arie con stromenti* contain the arias "Pupille care del mio bel nume" (II,1), "Soffri costante breve tormento" (II,4) and "Piangi se pianger vuoi" (II,5) which are nearly identical with the Hamburg score of *Judith*.⁴³ The only deviation concerns Chelleri's corrections of "Piangi se pianger vuoi" in the second violins which the composer introduced between the first and second engravings of his London publication and which have not been retained in the Hamburg score. From this, we can deduce that the musical source for the Hamburg version might have well been the now lost second and third acts of the Kassel score dated 1726.⁴⁴ This is also proven by the textual congruences between the Hamburg version and the librettos of Chelleri's productions in Venice 1722.

A dramaturgical overview of Chelleri's setting shows that the composer sought to characterize the different roles by common musical, melodic, and accompaniment patterns like broken chords, repetitions of single notes, unison sections, interpolations of short violin motives between the sung phrases, dotted or tripled rhythms, sequences of ascending and descending passages in various parts, intervallic leaps, etc. For example, from the beginning of the opera, Lotharius' melodic lines are characterized by broken chords that are often accompanied by a unison bass. Chelleri exposes this feature right from Lotharius' first entrance in the first aria (I,1), where he responds to Adalgisus with this melodic material. In Lotharius' first individual aria (I,3), the unison broken chords are transformed into a contrapuntal setting between the sung line and the bass accompaniment which contrasts the unison settings of the following arias by Bernhard (I,4, with a violoncello solo accompaniment playing in unison with the sung part) and the first Telemann aria for the child role of Fabius (I,6, light unison accompaniment with some interpolated motives of the violins). Since the violin interpolations that were present in

41 CHELLERI, 1726.

42 *Judith Gemahlin Kaiser Ludewig des Frommen*, 1732-1740.

43 TALBOT, 2011, pp. 63-67.

44 For Chelleri's corrections in the London cantata publication of 1727 cf. TALBOT, 2011, p. 66. For the Hamburg version cf. *Judith Gemahlin Kaiser Ludewig des Frommen*, 1732-1740, p. 69.

Fabio's aria are retaken in the following aria sung by Fabio's mother Judith (also in I,6), it must be stressed that in comparison with Chelleri's setting, Telemann emphasized Fabio as a musico-dramaturgically important role within the play, the violin interpolations otherwise being introduced by Judith and not by her son. Telemann's dramaturgical shift can be underlined by the fact that, perhaps due to the restricted singing ability of the child role (until now, no further information has been passed down on the cast of the Hamburg *Judith* production), all three arias written by the Hamburg composer for Fabio's role favor a unison accompaniment of the voice by the violin parts or a setting with voice and *basso continuo* only. For example, in Fabio's second aria "Ach lass dich doch mein Flehn erweichen" (I,10) the violin part is very close to the singing voice.⁴⁵ In this way, Telemann strengthened the musical feature of unison passages in the first act that otherwise would have been restricted for the most part to Lotharius' first aria "Un raggio di speranza" (I,3).

In contrast to such a shift that emphasizes the close relation between Fabio and his mother Judith and that was obtained by an enlargement of an already prominent musical feature within the dramaturgy of the first act by the interpolation of Fabio's arias, the overall structure of Chelleri's version can be described as a constant intensification of the various musical patterns that culminate in the arias at the end of the third act. Such intensification is already perceivable in the central aria of the first act, i.e. the aria "Come in mare procella fra l'onde" sung by Lotharius right after Telemann's compositional connection of Fabio's and Judith's arias in I,6. Here, not only the broken chords, but also the sequences of downward scales appear together with tone repetitions in a somehow unmotivated patchwork of those features. Nevertheless, by bringing together Lotharius' main musical element (the broken chords) with features of other characters (sequences of downward scales in his son's Adalgisus aria "Il mio cor già si consola" (I,2), tone repetitions in Asprando's aria "Siegui pure con regio valore" (I,5), Chelleri creates a first dramaturgical climax before introducing a completely different musical setting in the final aria of the first act "Veggio il porto e veggio il lido" (octave leaps and fast alternating intervals of a second; the aria is sung by Lotharius' son Adalgisus). In the second act, dotted and triple rhythms are frequently employed in alternation with a combination of broken chords and tone repetitions, before culminating in a reintroduction of unison passages and interpolated violin motives in the third act. Consequently, the third act shows the most comprehensive conglomeration of the employed features from broken chords over triple rhythms up to unison passages, sequences of downward and upward scales or tone repetitions (see Table 1).

45 *IBID.*, p. 46.

Table 1: Musical features in Telemann's arrangement of Judith

Act, Scene	Aria	Role	Composer	"Paratexts", musical features
I	Sinfonia			"Tromba di caccia", broken chords
I,1	<i>Bacio ô Padre la tua mano</i>	Adalgisus	Chelleri	Broken chords, dotted violin motive
I,2	<i>Il mio cor già si consola</i>	Adalgisus	Chelleri	Interpolation of sequences of downward scales between the sung passages
I,3	<i>Un raggio di speranza</i>	Lotharius	Chelleri	<u>Unison passages</u> , broken chords, at the end counterpoint
I,4	<i>O' con l'armi, o col consiglio</i>	Bernhard	Chelleri	"Violoncello solo", <u>unison passages</u> , long note values
I,5	<i>Siegui pure con regio valore</i>	Asprandus	Chelleri	<u>Unison passages</u> , sequences of upward scales, <i>tone repetitions</i>
I,6	<i>Ich küsse Dir [die] Hand</i>	Fabius	Telemann	<u>Unison passages</u> with INTERPOLATED VIOLIN MOTIVES
	<i>Qual sia qual core che in sen mi palpita</i>	Judith	Chelleri	INTERPOLATED VIOLIN MOTIVES, sequences of upward scales
	<i>Come in mare procella fra l'onde</i>	Lotharius	Chelleri	"Oboe", broken chords, sequences of downward scales, <i>tone repetitions</i>
I,7	<i>Ti sovenga di quel sangue</i>	Judith	Chelleri	"violetta col basso", upward and downward scales with ornaments
	<i>Scherza in mar la navicella</i>	Gildippe	Handel	"Sung by Sig.ra Strada in Lotharius", "Hautb. 1 et 2", after the <i>segno</i> "pianissimo senza Cembalo e Bassons" Downward scales in coloraturas
I,8	<i>Viva il Pio Felice Augusto [e Giusto]</i>	Judith	Chelleri	"Corni di caccia"
I,10	<i>Ach lass dich doch mein Flehn erweichen</i>	Fabius	Telemann	violin part is close to the sung part, INTERPOLATED VIOLIN MOTIVES
I,11	<i>Veggio il Porto e veggio il lido</i>	Adalgisus	Chelleri	Octave leaps, <i>fast alternating interval of a second</i>
II,1	<i>Pupille care del mio bel nume</i>	Gildippe	Chelleri	Triple rhythm , sequences of downward scales
II,2	<i>Questo nome troppo offende</i>	Adalgisus	[Chelleri]	Octave leaps, <i>fast alternating interval of a second</i> , dotted rhythm
II,3	<i>Fra gl'allori di mia chioma</i>	Lotharius	[Chelleri]	Dotted rhythm in coloraturas
II,4	<i>Soffri costante breve tormento</i>	Asprandus	Chelleri	Broken chords

Act, Scene	Aria	Role	Composer	“Paratexts”, musical features
II,5	<i>Der theuren Mutter klugen Willen</i>	Fabius	Telemann	Only with b.c.
	<i>Piangi se pianger vuoi</i>	Judith	Chelleri	“Con sordine e flauti traversiere insieme”, dotted rhythm , short downward and upward scales
II,6	<i>L’innocenza difendete</i>	Bernhard	[Chelleri]	“Flauti e violini/senza flauti”, dotted rhythm , short downward and upward scales, <i>interpolated motive with tone repetition</i>
II,7	<i>Amoretti Vezzosity</i>	Gildippe	[Chelleri]	“Oboe solo, bassono”, dotted rhythm , INTERPOLATED VIOLIN MOTIVES, tutti passages
II,10	<i>Par che mostri, e calma, e lido</i>	Bernhard	[Chelleri]	Broken chords, <i>tone repetitions</i>
II,12	<i>Come il vago ruscelletto</i>	Adalgisus	Chelleri	Broken chords, <i>tone repetitions</i>
III,1	<i>Questo braccio e questo petto</i>	Asprandus	[Chelleri]	“La braccio con basso”, virtuoso bass line, wide leaps
III,2	<i>Di Tiranno il nome accetto</i>	Lotharius	[Chelleri]	Broken chords, <u>unison passages</u> , <i>tone repetitions</i> , downward scales
	<i>In dolce, calma e bella</i>	Bernhard	[Chelleri]	Triple rhythms , <i>fast alternating interval of a second, tone repetition</i> , wide leaps, broken chords
III,3	<i>Mostra che m’ami</i>	Adalgisus/ Gildippe	[Chelleri]	“Oboe soli”, octave leaps, triple rhythm
III,4	<i>Sia speme o inganno</i>	Judith	[Chelleri]	Sequences of downward leaps, INTERPOLATED VIOLIN MOTIVES with broken chords
III,7	<i>Vedrò più liete e belle</i>	Judith	Handel	“Sung by Sig.r Fabius in Lotharius S. Hendel”, dotted rhythm , broken chords
	<i>Arma lo sguardo d’un dolce dardo</i>	Adalgisus	Handel	“Sung by Sig.ra Merighi in Lotharius”, <u>unison passages</u> , downward scales, INTERPOLATED VIOLIN MOTIVES with broken chords
III,9	<i>Festeggia in questo di la pace</i>	Chor	[Chelleri]	“Trombe e corni da caccia”

On the basis of such an analysis, the interpolation of Handel’s arias can also be discussed. In the first act, Telemann placed the Handel aria “Scherza in mar la navicella” between two arias sung by Judith. By doing this, he replaced Chelleri’s aria “Son qual

nave in mezzo all'onde" that had been part of the Brunswick production of 1731.⁴⁶ This aria has come down to us in an undated copy from the 18th century.⁴⁷ It is characterized by a drumming bass accompaniment (*Trommelbass*) and by tone repetitions. Thus, in the original version by Chelleri, the composer decided to elaborate a melodic feature of the central aria of the scene, i.e. Lotharius' "Come in mare procella fra l'onde". In contrast to Chelleri's tone repetitions, Telemann sought to emphasize the instrumentation of the central scene by the employment of oboes. This is not only deducible from the omission of Chelleri's cut of a repetition of a passage played by the oboes in Lotharius' "Come in mare procella fra l'onde",⁴⁸ but also from the fact that besides a passage "pianissimo senza Cembalo e Bassons", Handel's aria "Scherza in mar la navicella" provides for two oboes ("Hautb. 1 et 2") which shadow the melody of the voice part but without playing it as a unison. Thus, looking at the overall dramaturgy of the opera, via the emphasis on the oboes in Handel's "Scherza in mar la navicella", Telemann established a full symmetry of the dramaturgical organization that seemed to have been already planned by Chelleri: while the beginning, the climax and the end of the opera were accentuated by the trumpets and horns, the first and third part of the opera (I,1-I,11 and II,7-III,9) now contained two arias with oboes and thus perfectly surrounded the arias now accompanied by flutes in the second act (Table 2):

Table 2: Instrumentation of arias in Act I and Act II

Act, Scene	Aria	Role	Composer	Instrumentation
I	Sinfonia			"Tromba di caccia"
I,1	<i>Bacio ô Padre la tua mano</i>	Adalgisus	Chelleri	
I,2	<i>Il mio cor già si consola</i>	Adalgisus	Chelleri	
I,3	<i>Un raggio di speranza</i>	Lotharius	Chelleri	
I,4	<i>O' con l'armi, o col consiglio</i>	Bernhard	Chelleri	"violoncello solo"
I,5	<i>Siegui pure con regio valore</i>	Asprandus	Chelleri	
I,6	<i>Ich küsse Dir [die] Hand</i>	Fabius	Telemann	"unisoni"
	<i>Qual sia qual core che in sen mi palpita</i>	Judith	Chelleri	
	<i>Come in mare procella fra l'onde</i>	Lotharius	Chelleri	"Oboe"
I,7	<i>Ti sovenga di quel sangue</i>	Judith	Chelleri	

46 *L'Innocenza difesa. Drama per Musica da rappresentarsi sul famosissimo teatro di Brunswicka nella fiera d'estate l'anno 1731/Die vertheidigte Unschuld in einer Opera vorgestellt Auf dem grossen Braunschweigischen Theatro in der Sommer-Messe 1731.* Wolfenbüttel, Druckts Christian Bartsch Herzogl. Hof- und Canzeley Buchdrucker, I,6 (unpaginated).

47 *Son qual nave in mezzo all'onde. Aria da Kelleri Viol. Pmo. 2do & viola, n.d.*

48 Cf. above p. 165.

Act, Scene	Aria	Role	Composer	Instrumentation
	<i>Scherza in mar la navicella</i>	Gildippe	Handel	“Hautb. 1 et 2” , after the <i>segno</i> : “pianissimo senza Cembalo e Bassons”
I,8	<i>Viva il Pio Felice Augusto [e Giusto]</i>	Judith	Chelleri	“corni di caccia”
I,10	<i>Ach lass dich doch mein Flehn erweichen</i>	Fabius	Telemann	
I,11	<i>Veggio il Porto e veggio il lido</i>	Adalgisus	Chelleri	
II,1	<i>Pupille care del mio bel nume</i>	Gildippe	Chelleri	
II,2	<i>Questo nome troppo offende</i>	Adalgisus	[Chelleri]	
II,3	<i>Fra gl'allori di mia chioma</i>	Lotharius	[Chelleri]	
II,4	<i>Soffri costante breve tormento</i>	Asprandus	Chelleri	
II,5	<i>Der theuren Mutter klugen Willen</i>	Fabius	Telemann	
	<i>Piangi se pianger vuoi</i>	Judith	Chelleri	“Con sordine e flauti traversiere insieme”
II,6	<i>L'innocenza difendete</i>	Bernhard	[Chelleri]	“Flauti e violini”, “senza flauti”
II,7	<i>Amoretti Vezzosity</i>	Gildippe	[Chelleri]	“oboe solo”, “bassono”
II,10	<i>Par che mostri, e calma, e lido</i>	Bernhard	[Chelleri]	
II,12	<i>Come il vago ruscelletto</i>	Adalgisus	Chelleri	
III,1	<i>Questo braccio e questo petto</i>	Asprandus	[Chelleri]	
III,2	<i>Di Tiranno il nome accetto</i>	Lotharius	[Chelleri]	
	<i>In dolce, calma e bella</i>	Bernhard	[Chelleri]	
III,3	<i>Mostra che m'ami</i>	Adalgisus/ Gildippe	[Chelleri]	“oboe soli”
III,4	<i>Sia speme o inganno</i>	Judith	[Chelleri]	
III,7	<i>Vedrò più liete e belle</i>	Judith	Handel	
	<i>Arma lo sguardo d'un dolce dardo</i>	Adalgisus	Handel	
III,9	<i>Festeggia in questo di la pace</i>	Chorus	[Chelleri]	“Trombe e corni da caccia”

Telemann's augmentation of the sonic element of instrumentation (unison passages and oboes) results in a reorganization of the general dramaturgical structure but also of the dramaturgical constellation of the different characters. Telemann's interpolations of Handel's aria in the first act shifted the zoom from Lotharius to other (female) characters of the opera like Judith or her daughter Gildippe who sang the Handel aria in

question.⁴⁹ Through the addition of three arias written by himself for the child role of Fabio, Telemann also balanced the overall dramaturgy of the opera by enlarging the plot through the relation between Fabio and Judith in the first act. This constellation was then to be replaced by the personal conflicts and love relationships between Gildippe, who is meant to marry Lotharius' son Adalgisus, as well as Bernhard, who is said to have a love relation with Judith in the following acts.

Above all, such a balancing of the different constellations of characters can also be traced in relation to the interpolation of the other two arias by Handel at the end of the third act, sung by Judith and Adalgisus. Especially with Handel's aria "Arma lo sguardo d'un dolce dardo", Telemann demonstrates the London composer's virtuosity in harmonizing Chelleri's already mobilized musical features of unison passages, downward scales, interpolations of violin motives, broken chords and dotted rhythms. All these features are present in the last two arias by Handel and thus make up a final climax within the musical dramaturgy created by Chelleri. In addition to that, by transposing Handel's aria "Arma lo sguardo d'un dolce dardo" a third up, Telemann eventually created a last reminiscence of the child role of Fabio, even if such a transposition might only have responded to the technical and vocal capacities of the singer in charge of Adalgisus' role.

It is worth noting that Handel's arias not only combined Chelleri's musical features which belonged to the general repertoire of melodic and accompanimental formulas of the time. Indeed, Handel's arias contrast with Chelleri's music by their characteristic motives that the London composer created out of the named musical features for each of the two arias. As it happens, all three Handel arias begin with a sequence or a variation of a concise motive instead of being based on sequences of upward and downward scales or on tone repetitions in various forms. While Chelleri's aria "Come in mare procella fra l'onde" depicted the textual metaphor of a ship on the sea by regular waving motives, Handel's aria "Scherza in mar la navicella" combines the atmosphere of an upcoming storm with the musical expression of jokingly unsteady melodic lines.⁵⁰ On the basis of such contrasts, Telemann not only fixed the musico-dramaturgical structure of Chelleri's *La Giuditta* by enlarging the dramaturgical ends that Chelleri had already set up, but also pointed to stylistic differences between Chelleri and Handel in their dealing with common compositional features.

When perceiving the handling of the musical features in "Scherza in mar la navicella" that was very different from Chelleri's often mere juxtapositions of those melodic and accompanimental elements, the contrasting of the two aria styles might have well initiated comparisons that generated a more detailed understanding of compositional motives and their combinations. In any case, such a confrontation reflects the composition of different standards of styles in the graphics and caricatures that have been analyzed above. Parallel to the magnifying glasses, one might speak of a zooming in on the musical features by listening to different standards of style.

49 While doing this, Telemann might have strengthened a development that had already been fostered by Chelleri, cf. GOTTWALD, 1997, pp. 834f.

50 *Judith Gemahlin Kaiser Ludewig des Frommen*, 1732-1740, pp. 31-35 and 35-39.

That Telemann wanted to stress such stylistic contrasts becomes clear when re-tracing the process of the dramaturgical reworking undertaken by himself. As the libretto print shows, in the beginning, Telemann and his librettist Johann Georg Hamann had planned to place a newly composed aria on a German translation of Handel's aria "Vedrò più liete e belle" in the first act which would then reappear in its original Handelian version at the end of the opera.⁵¹ Finally, Telemann chose to omit a new German aria and to bundle the original Handelian version in Italian with another virtuoso Handel aria at the end of the third act. Since this second aria entitled "Arma lo sguardo" also combined stormy and joking moods, especially in the line "poi nel suo core del folle amore si riderà", Telemann recreated the contrast between a more regular aria and an aria with virtuoso coloraturas between rage and humor which had already characterized the dramaturgical moment of the first Handel aria in *Judith*.⁵² At the end of the drama, "Arma lo sguardo" not only reflects Adalgisus' distrust of Judith, but once again the art of joking in music in situations of strong emotion. Furthermore, since the two arias were sung just before the great showdown of the piece in a *mise en abîme* taking place in an amphitheater on the scene (III,8: "The scene presents an amphitheater with a throne on one side and balconies filled with the public"),⁵³ in some way, they represent a little individual piece within the large dramaturgy of *Judith*. Therefore, the contrasting grouping of Handel's arias augments a comparative view on the employed musical motives; it underlines Handel's art of composing and it creates a supplementary dimension to the dramatic action in the libretto.

Finally, one has to stress the fact that Telemann's reworking of Chelleri's musical setting of *Judith* on the sonic level did not diminish his attention to the contemporary tendencies in Hamburg operatic dramaturgy. That Telemann chose two arias by Handel with texts referencing the gaze ("lo sguardo") and on the eye ("vedrò") for the big final scene of the opera is not a coincidence: it conforms to the interest for the crossings of rationalistic and sensualistic world views in the Hamburg operatic dramaturgy of the time that were often addressed via the metaphors of the eyes and their failure or capacity to see the truth. This was especially the case in the librettos of Johann Georg Hamann who translated the Italian recitatives of *Judith* into German. For example, in the central scene of the first act (I,6), the eye is connected to political power via the image of the "apple of the eye" (eyeball). The third act then stresses the parallels between love and political

51 *Judith, Gemahlin Kayser Ludewigs des Frommen; oder Die Siegende Unschuld, in einer Opera auf dem Hamburgischen Schau-Platze Ao. 1732 vorgestellt.* Hamburg 1732, I,2 and III,7 (unpaginated). The text of the aria "Die Kraft der schönen Augen" is a free translation of Handel's "Vedro più liete e belle" into German. The translation of the aria in the third act differs from the rhymed and metrically unified translation inserted into the first act.

52 *Judith Gemahlin Kaiser Ludewig des Frommen, 1732-1740*, pp. 115-117.

53 "Der Schau=Platz stellet ein Amphitheater vor, mit einem Thron an der Seite, und Logen voller Volck." *Judith, Gemahlin Kayser Ludewigs des Frommen; oder Die Siegende Unschuld, in einer Opera auf dem Hamburgischen Schau-Platze Ao. 1732 vorgestellt.* Hamburg 1732, III,8.

power (e.g. III,4 and III,5). Finally, by the texts of the two Handel arias that Telemann and Hamann put into the third act, the shining of the beloved eyes in “Vedrò più liete e belle” (Judith) was confronted with the caution that is needed when being lured by a beautiful woman in “Arma lo sguardo” (Adalgisus). Even if the pronounced political orientation in the realm of the German enlightenment does not address the invitation to zoom in on several stylistically contrasting objects that was discussed in London and that seemed to interest Telemann as well, in his theoretical writings Hamann underlines the importance of the eyesight that he considers more advantageous than the power of the spoken word.⁵⁴ In this way, by his particular interest in an extension of the sonic features of Chelleri’s *La Giuditta* that he achieved by fostering the presence of oboes and the high voice of a child, Telemann established a musical sensual dimension that was stressed in Hamann’s aesthetic approach in relation to the sense of sight.

Conclusion

Telemann’s handling of Chelleri’s *La Giuditta* might only be one way to respond to the aesthetics that circulated between London and Hamburg. In summary, Telemann’s version somehow oscillated between Hamburg operatic dramaturgy and an English-like attention to stylistic comparisons and consequently also for an aesthetic hierarchy of single composers. Actually, during the period of the reworking of *L’innocenza difesa* as *La Giuditta*, as printed single arias and as *Die vertheidigte Unschuld*, Chelleri was not very successful in establishing himself as an opera composer in London. And, as we have seen, Telemann took care to rework the whole dramaturgical structure by interpolating three arias by Handel and three arias by himself.⁵⁵ Such a reworking might have been at the origin of Mattheson’s misunderstanding of *Judith* as an opera written by Handel, and indeed, the musical outline stressed Handel’s qualities as a renowned opera composer. Consequently, it can be presumed that not only operas written by a single composer paved the way for a constantly stronger notion of authorship, but that the compilation of operas with arias by different composers exerted an important influence on this cultural and social process. What is more, such a practice was not only aligned to central aesthetic issues of the 18th century, but also strongly linked to dramaturgical considerations in their different local configurations.

54 BEISE, 2012, pp. 867-876.

55 On Chelleri’s ambitions in London see TALBOT, 2011, pp. 56f. Telemann’s reworking of Handel’s *Ottone* of 1726 seems to be a similar case of arrangement, cf. LYNCH, 1981, p. 123.

Sources

- BURNEY, CHARLES, *An Account of the Musical Performances in Westminster-Abbey and the Pantheon, May 26th, 27th, 29th; and June 3^d, ad 5th, 1784*. In *Commemoration of Handel*, London 1785.
- Id., *Dr. Karl Burney's Nachricht von Georg Friedrich Händel's Lebensumständen und der ihm zu London im Mai und Jun. 1784 angestellten Gedächtnisfeyer*. Aus dem Englischen übersetzt von Johann Joachim Eschenburg, Professor in Braunschweig, Berlin/Stettin 1785.
- CHELLERI, FORTUNATO, *La Giuditta* (1. Akt), 1726; score: D-K1, Israel-Anhang 12, online: <https://orka.bibliothek.uni-kassel.de/viewer/metadata/1357916224968/1/>, 08.04.2020.
- Id., *Son qual nave in mezzo all'onde*. Aria da Kelleri Viol. Pmo. 2do & viola; parts, n.d.: S-L, Sammlung Engelhart Nr. 531.
- Der Zuschauer*. Aus dem Engländischen übersetzt. Erster Theil. Zweyte verbesserte Auflage. Leipzig, bey Bernhard Christoph Breitkopf, 1750.
- GOUPY, JOSEPH, *The Harmonious Boar, 1743-44*, Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum/The Bridgeman Art Library.
- HÄNDEL, GEORG FRIEDRICH, *Lotario*. Opera in tre atti HWV 26 (Hallische Händel-Ausgabe II,23), ed. by MICHAEL PACHOLKE, Kassel 2003.
- HOGARTH, WILLIAM, *The Analysis of Beauty*. Written with a View of Fixing the Fluctuating Ideas of Taste, London 1753.
- Id., *The Analysis of Beauty*, GB-Lbl, Egerton Ms.3012.
- Id., *The Analysis of Beauty*, ed. by R. Paulson, New Haven/London, 1997.
- Id., *A Chorus of Singers, or The Oratorio, December 1732*, in: <https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/392588>, 01.02.2020.
- Id., *A Rake's Progress*, London 1735.
- Judith Gemahlin Kaiser Ludewig des Frommen, 1732-1740*; score: D-B, Mus.ms.9057.
- Judith, Gemahlin Kayser Ludewigs des Frommen; oder Die Siegende Unschuld*, in einer Opera auf dem Hamburgischen Schau-Platze Ao. 1732 vorgestellt. Hamburg 1732; libretto: D-B, 24b in: Mus.T7, online: <https://digital.staatsbibliothek-berlin.de/werkansicht/?PPN=PPN688466265>, 08.04.2020.
- L'Innocenza difesa*, Drama per Musica da rappresentarsi nel Teatro di S. Angelo Nel Carnovale dell'Anno 1722 dedicato al Serenissimo, e Reverendissimo Principe Giovan-Teodoro Duca dell'una, & dell'altra Baviera, Conte Palatino del Reno, Landgravio di Leictemberg, e Vescovo di Ratisbona ec. In Venezia, MDCCXXII. Presso Marino Rossetti, in Merceria all'Insegna della Pace; libretto: I-Bc, Lo.00971 (and other copies), online: <http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/viewschedatwbca.asp?path=/cmbm/images/ripro/libretti/00/Lo00971/>, 11.02.2020.
- L'Innocenza difesa*, Drama per Musica da rappresentarsi sul famosissimo teatro di Brunsviga nella fiera d'estate l'anno 1731/*Die vertheidigte Unschuld* in einer Opera vorgestellt Auf dem grossen Braunschweigischen Theatro in der Sommer-Messe 1731. Wolffbüttel, Druckts Christian Bartsch Herzogl. Hof- und Canzeley Buch-

drucker; libretto: D-W, Textb.91, online: <http://diglib.hab.de/drucke/textb-91/start.htm>, 11.02.2020.

L'innocenza difesa, Drama per Musica con Prologo da rappresentarsi al teatro ducal di Wolfenbüttel festeggiandosi il nome gloriosissimo della Sac. Ces. E Catt. Real Maestà di Elisabeta Cristina imperadrice regnante. / Die beschützte Unschuld in einer Opera nebst einem Prologo vorgestellt auf dem Hoch=Fürstl. Theatro zu Wolfenbüttel an dem Gloriösen Nahmens=Tage dero Röm=Kayslerl. Und Cathol. Königl. Majestät Elisabethen Christinen Regierenden Römischen Kayserinnen ec. Ec. Wolfenbüttel druckst C. Bartsch Herzogl. Hof= und Canzeley=Buchdr; libretto: D-Mbs, Slg.Her 1808, online: <https://daten.digitale-sammlungen.de/0005/bsb00054998/images/index.html?id=00054998&groesser=&fip=yztseayaeya-qrsxdsydsaseayaqrssdas&no=8&seite=6>, 11.02.2020.

LICHTENBERG, GEORG CHRISTOPH, Ausführliche Erklärung der Hogarthischen Kupferstiche, mit verkleinerten, aber vollständigen Kopien derselben von E. Riepenhausen, Achte Lieferung, mit Zusätzen nach den Schriften der englischen Erklärer, Göttingen 1805.

MATTHESON, JOHANN, Grundlage einer Ehrenpforte, Hamburg 1740.

MYLIUS, CHRISTLOB, Zergliederung der Schönheit, die schwankenden Begriffe von dem Geschmack festzusetzen, geschrieben von Wilhelm Hogarth. Aus dem Englischen übersetzt von C. Mylius, London. Bey Andreas Linde, J. R. H. der verwittweten Prinzessin von Wallis, Buchhändler, und in Hannover bey J.W. Schmidt. 1754.

ORLANDINI, GIUSEPPE MARIA, L'innocenza difesa. Drama per musica da rappresentarsi in Verona l'autunno 1714. Dedicato all' [...] Manfredo Conti pod. e M. Antonio Quirini cap. - Verona: fratelli Merli, [1714]; libretto: several copies, online: <http://corago.unibo.it/libretto/DRT0024125>, 11.02.2020.

PILES, ROGER DE, The Art of Painting and The Lives of the Painters, London 1706.

SILVANI, FRANCESCO, L'Innocenza difesa, Dramma per Musica da rappresentarsi in Firenze Il Carnovale dell'Anno 1721. Nel Teatro di Via della Pergola sotto la protezione dell'Altezza Reale del Serenissimo Grand Principe di Toscana. E dedicato all'Eccellenza illustrissima dell'Signor Duca Francesco Bonelli [...]. Firenze, Per Dom. Ambrogio Versi [...] 1721; libretto: I-MOe, 70.H.06 (7) (other copy in I-Bc), online: <http://bibliotecaestense.beniculturali.it/info/img/lib/i-mo-beu-70.h.6.7.pdf>, 11.02.2020.

SWIFT, JONATHAN, Gulliver's Travels, ed. by ALBERT J. RIVERO, New York 2002.

TELEMANN, GEORG PHILIPP, Beschreibung der Augen-Orgel oder des Augen-Clavicimbels, so der berühmte Mathematicus und Jesuit zu Paris, Herr Pater Castel, erfunden und ins Werk gerichtet hat, Hamburg 1739.

ID., Briefwechsel. Sämtliche erreichbare Briefe von und an Telemann, ed. by HANS GROSSE/HANS RUDOLF JUNG, Leipzig 1972.

ID., Der getreue Music-Meister welcher so wol für Sänger als Instrumentalisten allerhand Gattungen musicalischer Stücke, so auf verschiedene Stimmen und fast alle gebräuchliche Instrumente gerichtet sind, und moralische, Opern- und andere Arien... nach und nach alle 14 Tage in einer Lection, Hamburg 1728.

Literature

- BARLOW, JEREMY, *The Enraged Musician. Hogarth's Musical Imagery*, New York 2005.
- BEISE, ARND, '...indem eine Opera keine Philosophische Geschichte ist.' Johann Georg Hamanns musikdramatische Aufklärung, in: *Hamburg. Eine Metropolregion zwischen Früher Neuzeit und Aufklärung*, ed. by JOHANN ANSELM STEIGER/SANDRA RICHTER, Berlin 2012, pp. 867-876.
- BUSCH, WERNER, *The Visible Power of Music. Louis François Roubiliac's Handel Statue for Vauxhall Gardens*, in: *Göttinger Händel-Beiträge 15* (2014), pp. 39-52.
- CHRISOCHOIDIS, ILIAS, *Handel, Hogarth, Goupy: Artistic Intersections in Early Georgian England*, in: *Early Music 37/4* (2009), pp. 577-596.
- DEUTSCH, OTTO ERICH, *Handel. A Documentary Biography*, London 1955.
- ECKARDT, HANS WILHELM, *Hamburg zur Zeit Johann Matthesons: Politik, Wirtschaft und Kultur*, in: *New Mattheson Studies*, ed. by GEORGE J. BUELOW/HANS JOACHIM MARX, Cambridge 1983, pp. 15-44.
- GOTTWALD, CLYTUS, *Die Handschriften der Gesamthochschul-Bibliothek Kassel, Landesbibliothek und Murhardsche Bibliothek der Stadt Kassel*, vol. 6, Kassel 1997, online: <https://orka.bibliothek.uni-kassel.de/viewer/image/1357916224968/1/>, 11.02.2020.
- HICKS, ANTHONY/ABRAHAM, GERALD, *Oratorio and Related Forms*, in: *Concert Music (1630-1750)* (New Oxford History of Music 6), ed. by GERALD ABRAHAM, Oxford 1986, pp. 34-37.
- HIRSCHMANN, WOLFGANG, 'Ein Zwydorn von einem Sachsen und Schlesier' Materialien zu Christoph Gottlieb Wend, in: *Die Oberlausitz – eine Grenzregion der mitteleuropäischen Barockmusik* (Ständige Konferenz Mitteldeutsche Barockmusik. Jahrbuch 2006), ed. by PETER WOLLNY, Beeskow 2007, pp. 72-86.
- HOESTEREY, INGEBORG, *Pastiche. Cultural Memory in Art, Film, Literature*, Bloomington 2001.
- IRELAND, JOHN, *Hogarth Illustrated*, vol. 2, 2nd ed., London 1793.
- LANGE, CARSTEN, *Telemann und England*, in: *Aspekte der Englisch-Deutschen Musikgeschichte im 17. und 18. Jahrhundert* (Arolser Beiträge zur Musikforschung 5), ed. by FRIEDHELM BRUSNIAK/ANNEMARIE CLOSTERMANN, Cologne/Sinzig 1997, pp. 111-140.
- LYNCH, ROBERT D., *Händels 'Ottone': Telemanns Hamburger Bearbeitung*, in: *Händel-Jahrbuch 27* (1981), pp. 117-139.
- MARX, HANS JOACHIM/SCHRÖDER, DOROTHEA, *Die Hamburger Gänsemarkt-Oper. Katalog der Textbücher (1678-1748)*, Laaber 1995.
- MAZZOTTI, MASSIMO, *Newton for Ladies: Gentility, Gender and Radical Culture*, in: *British Journal for the History of Science 37/2* (June 2004), pp. 119-146.
- POETZSCH, UTE, *Georg Philipp Telemanns Oper Der Sieg der Schönheit in Braunschweig*, in: *Barockes Musiktheater im mitteldeutschen Raum im 17. und 18. Jahrhundert*. 8. Arolser Barock-Festspiele 1993 (Arolser Beiträge zur Musikforschung 2), ed. by FRIEDHELM BRUSNIAK, Cologne 1994, pp. 63-69.

- STIENIG, GIDEON, *Algarotti's Saggio sopra l'opera in musica im Kontext der Aufklärungsphilosophie*, in: *Oper der Aufklärung – Aufklärung der Oper. Francesco Algarotti's 'Saggio sopra l'opera in musica' im Kontext (Frühe Neuzeit 214)*, ed. by FRIEDER VON AMMON et al., Berlin/Boston 2017, pp. 39-67.
- STROHM REINHARD, *Die Tragedia per Musica als Repertoirestück: Zwei Hamburger Opern von Giuseppe Maria Orlandini*, in: *Hamburger Jahrbuch für Musikwissenschaft 5 (1981)*, pp. 37-54.
- TALBOT, MICHAEL, *Fortunato Chelleri's Cantate e Arie con Stromenti (1727): A Souvenir of London*, in: *De musica disserenda VII/1 (2011)*, pp. 51-68.
- VAVOULIS, VASSILIS, *Fortunato Chelleri. Keyboard Music*, Madison/Wisconsin 2000.
- ZOHN, STEVEN, *Morality and the 'Fair-Sexing' of Telemann's Faithful Music Master*, in: *Consuming Music. Individuals, Institutions, Communities, 1730-1830*, ed. by EMILY H. GREEN/CATHERINE MAYES, Rochester 2017, pp. 65-101.
- ZÖLLNER, EVA, *Murder Most Virtuous: The Judith Oratorios of De Fesch, Smith and Arne*, in: *Music in Eighteenth-Century Britain*, ed. by DAVID WYN JONES, Aldershot 2000, pp. 158-171.
- ZUR NIEDEN, GESA, *'Native' – 'foreign'. Zum Nexus von Sozialstruktur und Rezeptionsästhetik in der Musikmetropole London*, in: *Göttinger Händel-Beiträge 20 (2019)*, pp. 27-44.

