Hip-Hop and Intersectional Music Education: Learning from Hip-Hop Feminisms[1]

Shanti Suki Osman

Abstract *The concept of intersectionality stems from Black feminist theory and recognizes the reality of multiple and simultaneously existing forms of discrimination (Crenshaw 1989; Hill Collins 2008; Combahee River Collective 2017). Intersectionality as an approach and consideration in music education in Germany has experienced a recent surge, and researchers and practitioners from this field are also addressing Hip-Hop culture and music, including its accompanying problems and possibilities, in the classroom (Honnens 2012, Siedenburg 2022). Among the currents that were developed from Black feminist theory is Hip-Hop feminism, a feminism that seeks to create a more nuanced and practice-based approach to dealing with intersectional marginalized perspectives and knowledge production (Morgan 1999; Lindsey 2015; Knight Steele 2021). I consider four developments of Hip-Hop feminist theory—digital Black feminism's threading and stitching (Knight Steele 2021); bringing the wreck (Pough 2004); kinetic orality (Gaunt 2006); and melodious misogyny (Lindsey 2015)—and suggest how these methods and concepts can contribute to a critical, intersectional Hip-Hop music education.*

Introduction: Intersectionality and Hip-Hop

The concept of intersectionality stems from key developments in Black feminist theory that recognize the reality of multiple and simultaneously existing forms of discrimination (Crenshaw 1989; Hill Collins 2008; Combahee River Collective 2017). The importance of intersectionality in research (Walgenbach

1 Thank you to the many students whose bachelor's and master's theses on gender, race, and Hip-Hop I was asked to supervise. It forced me, as a feminist scholar, to finally grapple with the big messy mountain of discourse surrounding it, which I had honestly been trying to avoid. Thank you also to Treva B. Lindsey for inspiration and teaching.

2007; Winker/Degele 2010) and in educational contexts (Riegel 2016) has been, and is being, thoroughly explored, internationally and in the German-speaking discourse, notably by Black feminists such as Denise Bergold-Caldwell in her work on social, racial, and gender contracts (Bergold-Caldwell 2020). This paper will focus on examples that consider the importance of intersectionality when working with Hip-Hop within music education, which I expound upon below.

Treva B. Lindsey accurately declares that, "[u]sing intersectional analyses to access and engage Black women and trans* people as violable subjects, Hip-Hop feminism's elasticity allows for a wider range of people to figure as hip-hop subjects" (Lindsey 2015: 69). Jasmine Hines argues for the inclusion of intersectional musicians and musical sources in the music classroom to create more space for marginalized students to self-identify (Hines 2020), and Siedenburg likewise expounds the importance of intersectionality (Siedenburg, 2022). Referring to its origins in African American culture and its continued practice by racialized, classed, and discriminated actors, Siedenburg points out the potential of Hip-Hop culture for intersectional positioning and identity construction, despite its often-problematic lyrics, content, and contexts (Siedenburg 2022: 45). With regards to working with Hip-Hop in schools in socioeconomically deprived areas, she warns of a practice of essentialism based on what teachers think students of that school will like (ibid.: 46). Whilst understanding the need to counter stereotypes and essentialist depictions (Hines 2020: 323), Hines nevertheless centers her approach in the suitably "gray" area (Morgan 1999: 59) of Hip-Hop feminism and contends that sometimes the ability to self-express and self-identify, here specifically referring to Black female students and Black queer students, is just as important (Hines 2020: 318). Indeed Leila Haghighat (2018) discusses the clash between a government-led garden project intended to improve the standards of a so-called deprived neighborhood in Marseille and the counternarrative of rap and Hip-Hop that is characteristic of and celebrated by the inhabitants of the neighborhood, but ignored and not incorporated in the decisions and execution of this community arts project. Here the members of the community were denied a practice of representation when Hip-Hop was not employed as a vehicle for engagement (Haghighat 2018: 101).

Intersectional approaches to music and arts education require accepting and considering contradictions and sometimes, as an educator, not knowing exactly what to do, or better still, having to unlearn ideas about what we thought was given, true, standard, and correct (Osman 2023). Morgan's

concept of embracing contradictions (Morgan 1999) and the abovementioned problems and possibilities of essentializing practices encourage a similar approach and are key steps forward in using Hip-Hop in music education. They indicate, however, only the surface level of theories and concepts that have grown from Hip-Hop feminism. Indeed, further potential of Hip-Hop in music education can be unlocked when we as music educators not only rethink how we approach it, but actually reshape what our understanding of Hip-Hop is. Alongside the characteristic elements of Hip-Hop—"emceeing, deejaying, graffiti, and b-boying/b-girling" (Lindsey 2015: 59)—what other components are there? Where do they come from and how could this reshaping contribute to an intersectional music education?[2]

When I started writing this article, I was convinced that digital Black feminism, with its focus on redefining what technology is from the perspective of Black women, would constitute the bulk of the text. However, on my journey through the offshoots and developments of Hip-Hop feminism since its inception by Joan Morgan in 1999, I have discovered that a myriad of theories and concepts exist that can help music educators rethink and reshape what Hip-Hop is, and therefore, the role it can play in the music classroom. To that end my paper will take the following form: after a brief introduction to Hip-Hop feminism followed by examples from the burgeoning field of intersectional music education in Germany, I want to present four developments of Hip-Hop feminism theory and practice that can help us to rethink and reshape what we understand Hip-Hop to be:

a) Digital Black feminism's concept of *threading and stitching* (Knight Steele 2021) as part of how Black women redefine technology will trouble the notion of *technology and tools* in Hip-Hop.
b) Gwendolyn Pough's concept of *bringing the wreck* (Pough 2004), with its focus on self-articulation, will redefine whose *image* represents Hip-Hop.
c) Kyra Gaunt's adaption of *kinetic orality* (Gaunt 2006) will redefine the notion of *storytelling* in Hip-Hop.

2 The German Hip-Hop and gangsta rap researcher and lecturer Martin Seelinger also critiques that the narrow focus on these reified aspects of Hip-Hop culture prevent a more nuanced examination of the power relations surrounding and indeed producing them (Seelinger 2013). The idea of Hip-Hop as a culture of the four elements is also critically discussed in Kattenbeck (2022).

d) Finally, the controversially named *melodious misogyny* (Lindsey 2015: 63) will focus on how Black women and girls experience sound, allowing us to redefine and rethink the role of *sound* and *listening* in Hip-Hop.

Hip-Hop Feminism

"Hip-Hop feminism" is a term that was coined by Joan Morgan (1999) to describe a concept for the difficult position held by those who embrace Hip-Hop culture but acknowledge and detest the misogyny and overt patriarchy that accompanies it. Hip-Hop feminism seeks to acknowledge, accept, and hold the "gray areas" (ibid.: 59) between empowerment, self-expression, and the amplification of marginalized voices; and the often misogynistic, homophobic, and violent content, as expressed though lyrics and video images, and context of Hip-Hop culture and music. In the United States, Morgan's pivotal book *When Chickenheads Come Home to Roost* was viewed by many young Black women as a way for them to define their own feminism, distinct and yet still developed from scholars such as bell hooks and Patricia Hill Collins. Indeed, a key feature of the burgeoning Hip-Hop feminist generation was its embrace of a feminism that included nonacademic standpoints (Morgan 1999; Knight Steele 2021) as a way to make space for the contradictions of political standpoint and lived experience (Lindsey 2015: 56)—for example, by taking pleasure from listening and dancing to music which is often misogynistic (Gay 2014). With her concept of *melodious misogyny* (Lindsey 2015: 63), which I will expound upon below, Treva B. Lindsey maintains that Hip-Hop feminism addresses and works against the devaluation of women and girls in Hip-Hop, which accordingly has a positive effect on the marginalization of girls in community projects, urban education, and schools.

There has also been scholarship on and development of Hip-Hop feminism in Germany. German Hip-Hop feminist researcher Heidi Süß has most recently expounded upon Hip-Hop feminism in the German rap scene in relation to gender roles and masculinities (Süß 2022). Reyhan Şahin does not explicitly refer to Morgan's notion of Hip-Hop feminism but still characterizes her own version of it in *Yalla Feminismus* as intersectional (Şahin 2019: 36 and 124). This important contribution to the German discourse on Hip-Hop feminism disquiets stereotypical images of Muslim women in Germany, hijab wearing or otherwise (Şahin 2019: 161). Similarly, Penelope Braune coined the

term *Pussytionierung*,[3] creating a vocabulary for postmigrant female rappers in Germany to situate their experience, knowledge, identity, and artistry (Braune 2022). Noam Gramlich's intersectional analysis of wealth, racialization, and queerness (Gramlich 2021) can also be situated in the genealogy of German Hip-Hop feminist discourse.

Intersectional Music Education in Germany

Before exploring the abovementioned theories and concepts of Hip-Hop feminism and their potential to allow us to reshape what we understand as the characteristic elements of Hip-Hop, I want to focus on intersectional approaches in music education and music education research. The international discourse on intersectionality and music education is broad and varied and an overview would be beyond the scope of this article (see, e.g., Escalante 2020; Koskela et al. 2021; Talbot 2023). As Vincent Bates shows, systematically employing intersectional frameworks to pursue social justice objectives in music education refocuses the music classroom as a political microcosm (2022). Despite my own academic socialization in Anglo-North American discourses, I situate my music education research and practice in the critical and intersectional discourse in Germany. An overview of current developments is therefore necessary to address the questions of how far along we are, so to speak, with regards to critical approaches in music education, as well as my insistence that the growing field of intersectional music education in Germany offers an appropriate place to house new critical developments in Hip-Hop and music education.[4]

Stemming from considerations of transcultural music education, including Lehmann-Wermser's focus on whiteness and racism in the music classroom (Lehmann-Wermser 2019) and Blanchard's critical perspectives on cultural diversity in music classrooms (Blanchard 2019), there has been a recent, welcome increase of intersectional approaches in German-language music education and music education research. Particularly noteworthy are Dunkel's

3 Braune uses the word Pussytionierung—a play on the word "pussy" and the German word for positionality—to focus the presence of gender and sex in identity construction for postmigrant female rappers in Germany (Braune 2022).

4 An earlier version of the following paragraph appears in German in Osman (2023) and in English in Osman (2022a).

reflections on how the concepts of intersectionality and diversity in music education can be dealt with together, so as to mutually benefit each other—as opposed to considering intersectionality as a completely new concept that supersedes and negates previous work (Dunkel 2019). Honnens's research on hegemonic masculinities and music tastes in school-aged male adolescents as expressions of right/successful or wrong/failed forms of integration (Honnens 2021) is another significant example. Here, the intersectional examination of young people's own categorization of degrees of apparent integration illustrates how much this is related to performances of gender and power, with the young people determining that people who listen to gangsta rap are immature and disobedient, and therefore not properly integrated, whereas those who listen to Arabesque music are mature, considerate, well-mannered and therefore well integrated into German society.[5] In a recent article (Osman 2022b) I explicated the concept of *diskriminierungskritische*[6] Music Education. *Diskriminierungskritisch* is a term used increasingly in German speaking arts and music education. It describes an approach that does not only expose, name and work against forms of discrimination and develops a sensitivity towards them, but also wants to examine the conditions and interdependence of these discriminatory aspects (ibid.). A *diskriminierungskritisch* approach includes a self-reflection of the actors of the situation (be it teachers, workshop leaders, organisers or participants). I emphasize here that the notion of intersectionality does not mean merely adding up the characteristics of a person, but looking at how these different factors interact with each other and influence a person's experience and perception of a situation (ibid.: 31). In her work on Black fem-

5 Arabesque describes a genre of Turkish music which was first developed after the 1920s when Ataturk banned classical Ottoman music from radio to make room for Western music. Turkish musicians and music lovers then turned to Arabic influences and sounds to create this new genre. Whilst discussing this text with music education and music teacher training students at the University of Arts in Berlin in 2023 during the seminar "Postmigrant Music and Music Education," one student who identified himself as having a migrant and possibly postmigrant background pointed out the irony of Arabesque—a very traditional music often linked to national identity—being associated with a migrant's successful integration into the host country.

6 There is no direct English translation for the term *diskriminierungskritisch*. Carmen Mörsch uses this German language term as a translation of the concept of critical diversity (2023). See also Josties and Gerards (2020/2019) for an in-depth discussion of this approach in Music Education in schools and extra-curricular settings.

inist epistemologies,[7] Patricia Hill Collins discusses this notion as standpoint theory. Standpoint theory forms a key part of many developments of Hip-Hop feminism; however, it is suitably remixed and reshaped to include not just an adult academic woman's perspective, but also that of a girl or nonacademic woman (see Brown 2008, 2013 and Black Girl Standpoint Love 2012).

A recent article by Ilka Siedenburg is worth looking at more closely here since it considers Hip-Hop and intersectionality in school music education (Siedenburg 2022). Focusing on race, gender, and class (Winker/Degele 2010), Siedenburg acknowledges the importance of approaching Hip-Hop in music education from an intersectional perspective to create a more nuanced site for gender identity construction (Siedenburg 2022: 43). She defines intersectional music education as striving to counter discrimination and support children and young people to reach their potential without being limited by stereotypes and attributed assumptions about their gender identity, social background, or other aspects of who they are or where they come from (ibid.: 47). Siedenburg suggests that Debus's strategies of approaching gender in education (Debus 2017) can be used in intersectional music education with varying degrees of how explicit the topics and relevant categories are named. This ranges from explicitly mentioning and addressing the topic of gender (*Dramatisierung*), to explicitly mentioning gender but allowing for nuance within the category (*Entdramatisierung*), to not explicitly mentioning gender at all but rather allowing aspects of gender to be evident in and affect pedagogical decisions and actions (*Nicht-Dramatisierung*) (Siedenburg 2022: 47). Siedenburg centers the article around the problems and possibilities of what she calls, overstepping the lines of difference (ibid.: 48), suggesting that intersectional approaches can allow for this more easily. In some ways, I support this conclusion, for example in the cases of marginalized students being able to break stereotypical and essentialist images of themselves (Osman 2022, 2023) and self-identity within or without the lines of categorization and difference (Hines 2020; Siedenburg 2022). However, the emphasis on the ease of overstepping lines of difference to enable intersectional approaches is less valid when used as a justification for cultural appropriation. It is beyond the scope of this article—and my academic interest—to dive into the topic of cultural appropriation. I do, though, want to

7 See Dunkel et al. (2022: 20–21) for a description of my dissertation research, in which I describe the concept of intersectional epistemologies as influenced by Black feminist epistemologies.

point out the misgivings I have about conclusions drawn by Siedenburg. Referencing the arguments made earlier in her article with regards to how hegemonic masculinity dictates that a girl playing the drums strengthens their societal position, whereas a man doing ballet is thereby weakened in their societal position (Siedenburg 2022: 44; Cornell 1995), Siedenburg concludes that a male ballet dancer and a white person taking part in Afro-American cultural practices are both examples of overstepping lines of difference and taking part in a culture that is maybe not official theirs (Siedenburg 2022: 48). I would however argue that this likening lacks the very hegemonic critique surrounding the former mentioning of the male ballet dancer: namely that, whilst a man doing ballet is thereby arguably weakened in their societal position, the white person taking part in Afro-American cultural practices is arguably strengthened by this cultural "win." It is precisely these power relations in cases of cultural (mis)appropriation that need to be considered, and since Hip-Hop is an oft-cited and used vehicle for such exploration of difference and nuance in identity construction and expressivity (Hines 2020; Gramich 2021; Süß 2022), I strongly believe that considering new ways of forming the components of what we understand Hip-Hop to be could contribute to further intersectional approaches to music education. I propose an overstepping of the lines of difference that necessitates a redrawing of them.

Developments of Hip-Hop Feminisms

In the following section I will turn to the four theories and developments of Hip-Hop feminism that I propose can contribute to working with Hip-Hop in critical music education by ultimately guiding us in reshaping our idea of what Hip-Hop is.

a) Threading and Stitching—Redefining Technology and Tools

The concept of *threading and stitching* belongs to a range of components of digital Black feminism, as expounded by Catherine Knight Steele (2021).[8]

8 Other aspects of digital Black feminist "Praxis" detailed by Knight Steele are *capturing* and *publishing* (Knight Steele 2012: 95–122). Key principles for a digital Black feminism include *agency*, *the right to self-identify*, *gender nonbinary spaces of discourse*, *complicated allegiances*, and the *dialectic of self and community needs* (65–93). Many of these resonate

Digital Black feminism aims to redefine technology from the perspective of Black women, including defining technology as not only referring to handheld practical tools but to tools of social practice, too. The process of tracing the relationship between Black women and technology includes navigating racial and gendered stereotypes, historical erasure, storytelling power, and epistemic injustice (ibid.). Beginning from what she refers to, with a humanizing intention, as the time when people were *enslavers* and people were *enslaved* (Knight Steele 2021: 162n2), Knight Steele details the historical relationship that Black women have had—and have not been allowed to have—with technology. The colonial notions of both being a woman and being a laborer excluded Black women, since *women* were white, and *laborers* were Black men (ibid.: 25). However, it was within the realms of household labor and physical labor that they developed their technologies.[9] Since these realms of household and physical labor were not places where Black women's presence or power were acknowledged, neither were the technological tools, tricks, methods, and means that they developed within them:

> Black women have always engaged in technology; it is the definition of technology and technical expertise that shifted. Black women, as purveyors of the home, had to master many forms of technology. However, if the everyday use of the term *technology* shifts to no longer include their tools, systems of labor, and modes of communication, their labor, bodies, and expertise could be devalued. (Knight Steele 2021: 29)

Knight Steele also states that with the advent of the image of the technical expert being white and male, Black women's technological practices and any records of them also disappeared from history (ibid.: 30).

The concept of *threading and stitching* (ibid.: 116) allows for a rethinking of the definition of technology to include further tricks and tools of social practice,[10]

---

with notions of intersectional music education and with the possibilities of using Hip-Hop in music education (see in particular Hines 2020).

9 Referring to the film *Hidden Figures*, Megan Thee Stallion laments in a New York Times op ed that she "wish[ed] [she]'d learned in school about this story as well as more earthly achievements: Alice H. Parker filed the patent for the first home furnace, or that Marie Van Brittan Brown created the first home security system" (Stallion 2020).

10 The imagery and metaphor of *threading and stitching* in relation to Black feminist epistemologies and methodologies is a longstanding theme, with one recent example being Katherine McKittrick's work (2021) on Black methodologies and storytelling.

which can contribute to a critical employment of Hip-Hop in music education contexts. Here Knight Steele directly explains this as the quality of interweaving artistic persona or/and working persona with personal persona—including biography, positionality, action, and everyday experiences. In her explication of intersectional Hip-Hop feminism, one of Reyhan Şahin's most pointed digs at German gangsta rap is that misogyny is often argued away as being part of the artist persona, and not representative of the actual opinions of the rappers (Şahin 2019: 70). Indeed, there is the argument that rappers and Hip-Hop artists subjected to an intersection of marginalization use this artist persona as a way to vent frustration and to stage successful and empowered identities, which may not reflect their actual everyday lived experience, namely, when they are not seen as a rap artist (Oğlakcıoğlu 2019). Here the principle is a separation of self and artist persona, but Knight Steele's discernment of the digital Black feminist technology of *threading and stitching*, suggests exactly that—a sewing together and intertwining of actual lived experience with artistic expression (Knight Steele 2021: 116). I suggest that a more concrete use of this approach can, on the one hand, further validate the situated knowledge and lived experience of marginalized groups, and on the other, allow users of misogynistic language and tropes to not just reproduce them, but add their own voice and views in critiquing and countering them in Hip-Hop practice. Both of these notions allow for more nuanced experiences of Hip-Hop in music education settings.

b) Bringing the Wreck—Redefining Representation and Image

Gwendolyn Pough's theory of *bringing the wreck* (Pough 2004) addresses the public gaze on Black women and considers how Black women in Hip-Hop employ techniques of causing a stir and creating a spectacle in order to redefine how they are represented within the field and beyond (Lindsey 2015: 57; Pough 2004). The action of Black women inserting themselves and demanding visibility is characteristic of many offshoots and developments of Hip-Hop feminism. Knight Steele (2021) identifies aspects of digital Black feminist practice that involve the curated self. This performance of self is simultaneously very real, in the sense that it is an intended and chosen representation of themselves in a space that would rather render them invisible (ibid.: 103). Morgan too, in the retrospectively added afterword to the original book,[11] wrote

11 This comprises a conversation between Treva B. Lindsey and Joan Morgen (2017).

of the selfie as being the perfect way for Black women to plant themselves in a world that does not want them while addressing the dichotomy of being *hypervisible* and simultaneously *invisible* (Morgan, 1999 and 2017).

Understanding self-identification in Hip-Hop music education as *bringing the wreck*—a need to insert oneself into the dominant discourse, which simultaneously asserts agency of self-representation and counters the dominant gaze and its accompanying stereotypes—could offer a new perspective on how the image of Hip-Hop in music education is understood, and indeed, who forms it. One example of the practice of *bringing the wreck* is the 2020 hit "WAP" by Cardi B and Megan Thee Stallion, which caused an outcry of double standards on who can express desire and pleasure in Hip-Hop and who cannot. The articles, comments, and op eds written by female and male Hip-Hop actors and non-Hip-Hop actors either defending or attacking WAP is too vast to mention or even list. Noteworthy is perhaps Snoop Dogg's critique that the song is "too rude" (Murray 2022)—this coming from a rapper who sang, in "Ain't No Fun (If the Homies Can't Have None)": "Guess who's back in the muthafuckin' house?! With a fat dick for your muthafuckin' mouth!" (1993).

Referring to intersectional music education, Siedenburg rightly points out that the images employed here as self-empowerment are visually identical to those seen in cases of objectification of the female Black body (Siedenburg 2022: 46). Understanding this method of making a spectacle and disturbing the norms of Hip-Hop imagery, however, as an attempt to insert oneself into the dominant epistemology of Hip-Hop that until now has failed to create a nuanced space in which to exist (see discourses on the Madonna-whore dichotomy, Şahin 2019: 74) could contribute to an intersectional music pedagogy, especially one that is willing to reflect, examine, and unlearn the given norms within the field (Osman 2023). One simple way that this can be incorporated is by finding ways for pupils and students to create audio or audiovisual interventions on long-term school displays, or for video and audio material to be used in class, not unlike the antiracist archival interventions that formed Karina Griffith's works *Proposal #1: Intrude* and *Proposal #2: Obtrude* (2022) at the International Short Film Festival Oberhausen.[12] Here, Griffith projected

12 From Karina Griffth's artist statement: "*Confrontation of Cultures* was a special film and discursive program of the 1993 Oberhausen Film Festival. The event was, in part, interested in exploring Black aesthetics in film. To that end, festival director Angela Haardt invited Black filmmakers and films from the United States, U.K. and the Caribbean along with guest curators Coco Fusco, June Givanni and Monica Funke-Stern, and

images and made handwritten suggestions to a film festival program from 1993 that failed to include any Black German filmmakers and German filmmakers of color. One artistic intervention from the critical race and schools project "Die Remise" included a group collaging session with textbooks of various subjects being cut up and rearranged.[13] This resulted in new images and stories literally being imposed upon the standard, old, uncritical, and at times discriminatory material (Diallo et al. 2021), forcing a disruption in the narrative. Vincent Bababoutilabo's study on racist imagery in school music textbooks concluded that the majority of images of nonwhite bodies appeared as racialized stereotypes and with that, never in association with images of a "proper" musicians (2019). Such findings are almost a direct invitation to intervene with uninvited insertions of different selves, collaged or otherwise.

c) Kinetic Orality—Redefining Storytelling

The term *kinetic orality* was first used by Cornell West to describe how, in Black popular culture, the interplay between rhythm and language provides a way for the marginalized to speak (West 1989; cf. Jenike 2023). Looking at jazz music, West described this method of storytelling with words and movement as "the concrete, everyday response to institutionalized terrorism" (West 1989: 93), with "terrorism" here of course referring to racism, discrimination and the persecution of Black people in the United States. Similarly, in *The Games Black Girls Play*, Kyra Gaunt (2006) explicates children's chants and games as being further forms of storytelling that create spaces for marginalized childhood histories to

keynote speaker Diederich Diederichsen, among others. While Black European film was a geographic category for the programming selections, no films authored by Black Germans were shown. At the time, participants such as Fusco and historian Tricia Rose raised the question, 'where are the German Black and POC filmmakers?' In 2022, Karina Griffith curated ON ALL FRONTS for the International Short Film Festival Oberhausen, a speculative film program imagining Black-authored German films as part of the original 1993 screenings."

13 "Die Remise" was a critical race and schools project initiated by Carmen Mörsch in 2018. Pupils from a primary school in Kreuzberg, Berlin, and critical art and music educators created projects, artworks, and exhibitions based on an antiracist and empowering reworking and retelling of a written school archive dated back to the 1950s. Through songs, radio, and other media, the school children of quite varied socioeconomic and cultural backgrounds exchanged ideas about racism, injustice, storytelling, and history, and were thereby encouraged to claim space with their own, new, perhaps unheard narratives—countering the texts they found in the archive.

be produced, and therefore contribute to a counternarrative of history (Jenike 2023; Gaunt 2006). *Kinetic orality* here is understood as the social tools with which Black girls form and express their musical and social identities creating a "background of relatedness" where "performances of race, ethnicity, and gender are embodied through song, chant, and percussive movement" (ibid.: 3). The use of movement in music education is nothing new,[14] but the potential of Gaunt's application and theorization of *kinetic orality* is that it is a Black girl-authored form of storytelling (Lindsey 2015: 59), which is a distinct departure from established Black feminist thought and epistemologies, which focus on the female adult perspective (Collins 2008, Lindsey 2015: 59). Adultism is the assumption that adults are superior to children and are entitled to enact power and control over them (Ritz 2013). The actors of the Hip-Hop feminist generation were not explicitly accusing elder Black feminists of this, but rather wanted to add strands to the theory of Black feminist standpoint and knowledge production that included the perspective of children.

Adultism is a form of discrimination that social workers and early years educators and scholars have been researching in schools and youth work contexts in Germany at its intersection with aspects of race, gender, and class (Ritz 2013), including the notion that marginalized bodies experience epistemic violence, microaggressions, and structural discrimination (ibid.). Colonial continuities dictate what constitutes aspects of adult gender categorization. Accordingly, the Hip-Hop feminist notion of *kinetic orality*, which provides a basis for Black girl authorship, highlights that aspects of adultism coming from perspectives formed by dominant norms do not just dismiss or determine whose voice in the classroom is considered valid and heard, but who is even treated as a child.[15] It is precisely this that can have an impact in the classroom, namely the question of who are seen as and treated as producers of knowledge or even

14 Most famously in the work of Orff (Haselbach 2011) and Dalcroze (Juntunen 2016) and in more recent work that has built on these scholars.

15 To my understanding the term "adultism" has not been directly used in this scholarship, but the concept and problematization has been expounded upon, such as by Gaunt (2006). In *Hood Feminism*, by contrast, Mikki Kendall highlights the reality of Black girls not being seen as girls, but rather treated as adults. This is not the opposite of adultism: treating children as if they are adults in situations such as Kendall describes removes their agency and renders them equally unheard. The killings of Trayvon Martin, Latisha Harlins, and Renisha McBride are just a few famous examples of children not being viewed as such, but rather as a threat because of how they are seen and thereby racialized.

innovators (Lindsey 2015: 59). If performance of race, gender and other dimensions of diversity can be situated in this dynamic form of storytelling from a marginalized perspective, I ask if taking a closer look at and incorporating this method of storytelling with words, movement, chant, and game playing could also increase the presence of (intersectional) child-authored knowledge in the intersectional music classroom.

Kruse and Gallo's work on rethinking the canon for elementary school music to incorporate Hip-Hop rightfully points out the importance of child-authored songs and chants not being stifled by parameters set by music teachers (Kruse/Gallo 2020: 62). Rather than attempting to distil parts of this informal creativity for a classroom setting, an approach using the notion of *kinetic orality* could include moments of children exchanging games and songs with each other with the simple purpose of just listening and learning. With its focus on movement, speech, and dance, the Orff approach is similarly inspired by a child's world of play. Yet to my—albeit nonexpert—knowledge of the method, it still begins with the educator determining which musical models will first be imitated and then repeated and developed. What might we learn if the starting point were to be the lived experience of a marginalized child as expressed through their storytelling and games? And what might that reveal to us about the different constructions of childhood simultaneously existing in a classroom or other educational setting?

d) Melodious Misogyny—Redefining Sound and Listening

"How can he sound so good and it be so toxic at the same time!?" were the words cooed by Radio 1 Xtra DJ and presenter Fee Mak after having played the Bryson Tiller's 2015 song, "Sorry Not Sorry,"[16] a rhetorical question which precisely depicts a much-discussed point of contention in Hip-Hop and Hip-Hop in music education (Morgan 1999; Gay 2014; Lindsey 2015). Referring to the blatant misogyny in Hip-Hop lyrics and videos, Pough exalts the importance of Hip-

16 This was heard by the author on Friday 9 June 2023 during the radio 1 xtra breakfast show (CET 8:00–11:00). Celebrating its twenty-year anniversary in 2022, Radio 1 xtra is a digital radio station based in the UK that celebrates and promotes what is described as Black music. As well as music, they increasingly provide a platform for issues concerning marginalized communities, including toxic masculinity and mental health, empowerment, institutional racism, and career and exams advice for students.

Hop feminism in tackling the issue of "what it means to be a woman who participates in and loves a culture that doesn't always love you" (Pough 2007: 90). For this development of Hip-Hop feminism, I want to visit the notion of *melodious misogyny* to consider how focusing on the sonic narrative in Hip-Hop does not necessarily render the listeners uncritical and impervious to discriminatory or controversial lyrical and visual content (Lindsey 2015: 63).

Contributing to the notion of *melodious misogyny* is Love's concept of *sonic pleasure* (Love 2012). In her ethnographic study of Black middle and high school girls in Atlanta,[17] Love centered on the expressivity and experience of Black girls and their relationship to Hip-Hop culture (Love 2012; Lindsey 2015: 62). A significant finding was that these young listeners were very much conscious and critical of negative content, but simultaneously derived great pleasure from the sound—the melodies and the beats—of the music (Love 2012: 92). *Melodious misogyny* expresses this difficult dichotomy, whilst giving prominence to the aspect of sonic pleasure. Lindsey and Love both insist not only that we need to focus on the aspect of sonic pleasure to understand the complex relationship Black girls have with Hip-Hop, but also that focusing on the sonic pleasure does not detract from efforts to combat sexism and misogyny (Lindsey 2015: 63). But what significance could this have for a music classroom setting?

To answer this question, I want to briefly address Kautny's discussion of the role of children's physical and aural enjoyment of music when working with rap in school music education (see Kautny in this volume: 137-158). Kautny refers to Wallbaum (2009), who suggests that enjoyment of musics can occur when an intrinsic sense of identification is experienced, including a felt connection to the musicians (ibid.: 145). This process of identification can also create an opportunity for students to interpret and conceptualize the pieces being played within their existing social context (ibid.: 146). Using the example of Queen Latifah, Kautny briefly suggests the possibility of dealing with questions of "gender and racism" through rap music in classroom settings (ibid.). I would argue that using examples such as Queen Latifah, who is a Black woman with a female partner,[18] can not only provide opportunities to talk about wider social issues, but also create opportunities for a wider range

17 In the United States, middle school ages are eleven to thirteen and high school ages are fourteen to eighteen.

18 Queen Latifah has never directly addressed or labelled her sexuality publicly.

of students to experience an intrinsic sense of identification, and therefore enjoyment of the music.

In her consideration of intersectionality and music education, Jasmine Hines (2020) focuses on the importance of using what she describes as "intersectional musician[s]" to provide a wider opportunity for the self-identification of marginalized students (Hines 2020: 317). She highlights the need for these diverse musicians to break stereotypical portrayals of Black women and Black girls in Hip-Hop, yet also acknowledges that whilst essentializing can occur when using Hip-Hop in music education (Haghighat 2018; Hines 2020; Siedenburg 2022), such as assumptions of which children from certain backgrounds like Hip-Hop and which do not, an assumed essentialized practice, such as playing Black female Hip-Hop artists to a group of nonwhite young women in an inner city youth club, can sometimes result in positive self-identification for Black girls in music education. (Hines 2020: 324). *Melodious misogyny* adds to the dilemma of which songs are suitable for children when using Hip-Hop in music education (see Kautny in this volume: 147) by suggesting that not using certain songs which would be deemed inappropriate could potentially mean preventing moments of pleasure—enjoyment—for the students.[19] But if music education is to utilize children's physical and aural enjoyment of music in direct relation to opportunities for their identification with (ibid.: 145) and possible ability to contextualize and interpret the musical culture (ibid.: 146), then the sonic pleasure as experienced by Black girls when listening to Hip-Hop, even to the songs which may reproduce essentialized and stereotypical images of women and use explicitly sexual, sexist, and misogynistic language (Love 2012), needs to be considered. Imagine listening to the previously mentioned example of "WAP" by Cardi B and Megan Thee Stallion alongside Snoop Dogg's "Ain't No Fun (If the Homies Can't Have None) sang" (as discussed above). Could that allow for sonic pleasure, possibly moments of identification and a chance to look at the wider social issues that are contained within—including reading the article that Megan Thee Stallion wrote about Black women and empowerment in the wake of her song's release (Stallion 2020)? Admittedly, the crudeness of lyrics in both songs renders my suggestion questionable, but it is the idea behind the suggestion, the confrontation with the messy grey areas of Hip-Hop feminism, that can encourage us to

19 It is interesting here to compare the notion of protected childhood (see Kautny in this volume: 149) to my previous comments on Black children not being allowed to be children, and consider who would be in fact protected and who would not.

employ more nuance in our understanding of contexts. Including musicians who are intersectional and possibly imperfect as argued by Hines (2020) could provide a larger surface for students with differently classed, gendered, and racialized ears to experience a sense of intrinsic identification and enjoy the experience.[20]

Conclusion: Redrawing the Lines of Difference

The main goal of this paper was to demonstrate how four key developments of Hip-Hop feminism could contribute to intersectional Hip-Hop music education. It was important to focus on more than one aspect of Hip-Hop feminism so as to proffer a range of theorization and concepts, which however negated the possibility to fully scrutinize each aspect in detail. Approaches of *threading and stitching* can lead to a demystification of the apparent artist persona and the notion of *bringing the wreck* can disrupt normative imagery in Hip-Hop. Combined with an awareness of gender and race construction in children's embodied storytelling that comes with *kinetic orality* and accepting the power of sonic pleasure described as *melodious misogyny*, even in songs with deplorable

20 Common to each of these suggested theories and methodologies is the centering of marginalized experience, voice and knowledge. Positionality also affects what and how we hear and how we perceive sound. Positionality can be understood as the various social positions we are located in in relation to others. Our gender, class, race, age, and physical ability comprise our positionality, which then affects how we experience the world, including how we are differently and variously privileged or discriminated against. Our ears are as gendered, classed, racizalized, and sexualized as we are and we therefore hear sound and listen as a result of the experiences we have from our positionality. In *Whiteness and the Ontological Turn in Sound Studies*, Marie Thompson (2017) describes two very different sound art pieces created as a result of two very different experiences of listening at an airport. The first are the field recordings of airports by white Australian sound artist Lawrence English in *Airport Symphony*. The second is the work *Airport Music for Black Folk* (2019) by Chino Amobi, a Black American sound artist and musician with Nigerian parents. Describing the pieces and extracts by English and those by Amobi, Thompson points out that the interpreted experience in airports is for the former, ephemeral, seemingly universal, abstract, and calm; whereas for Amobi, the music and sounds he created depict the anxiety, isolation, danger, and stress he experiences as a Black male body in the airport. With this comparison, Thompson is fundamentally highlighting that people experience sound differently and that positionalities, whether marginalized or more privileged, also affect this.

lyrics, could be a courageous step forward in achieving intersectional music education through using Hip-Hop. Teachers and school contexts are bound by curriculum, deadlines, targets, and evaluations and often the necessary infrastructure is lacking to support drastic changes or new approaches that require a whole rethinking of how things are done. I still, however, hope to encourage the idea to—sometimes—"fuck with the grays" (Morgan 1999: 59) to allow contradictions, marginalized perspectives, and unknown knowledge to take center stage, as messy as it might be.

References

Amobi, Chino. 2016. *Airport Music for Black Folks*, Non Worldwide.

Bababoutilabo, Vincent. 2019. "'Africa Bling Bling Hakuna Matata:' Visuelle Repräsentationen schwarzer Menschen in Schulbüchern des Fachs Musik." Thesis, Hochschule für Musik und Theater 'Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy' Leipzig.

Bates, Vincent C. 2022. "Intersectionality for Social Justice in Music Education." *Diskussion Musikpädagogik*, 94, 11–17.

Bergold-Caldwell, Denise. 2020. *Schwarze Weiblich*keiten. Intersektionale Perspektiven auf Bildungs- und Subjektivierungsprozesse*, Bielefeld: transcript.

Blanchard, Olivier. 2019. *Hegemonie im Musikunterricht: Die Befremdung der eigenen Kultur als Bedingung für den verständigen Umgang mit kultureller Diversität,* Münster: Waxmann.

Braune, Penelope. 2022. "'Wen von uns nennt ihr hier Bitch?' – Strategien der Weiblichkeitsperformance: Zur Pussytionierung postmigrantischer Rapperinnen im deutschsprachigen Rap." In Thomas Wilke and Michael Rappe (eds.). *HipHop im 21. Jahrhundert. Medialität, Tradierung, Gesellschaftskritik und Bildungsaspekte einer (Jugend-)Kultur*, Wiesbaden: VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, 77–95.

Brennan, Matt, Diljeet Bhachu, Jo Collinson Scott, and Graeme Smillie. 2017. *A Manifesto for Music Education in Scotland*, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh.

Brown, Ruth N. 2008. *Black Girlhood Celebration: Toward a Hip-Hop Feminist Pedagogy,* New York: Peter Lang.

Brown, Ruth N. 2013. *Hear Our Truths: The Creative Potential of Black Girlhood,* Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

Cardi B feat. Megan Thee Stallion. 2020. "WAP," *WAP*, Atlantic Records.

Collins, Patricia H. 2008. *Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment,* New York: Routledge.

Combahee River Collective. 2017. *The Combahee River Collective Statement First ed,* Mexico City: Gato Negro Ediciones.

Crenshaw, Kimberlé. 1989. "Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics." *University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 1, 139–167.

Debus, Katharina. 2017. "Dramatisierung, Entdramatisierung und Nicht-Dramatisierung von Geschlecht und sexueller Orientierung in der geschlechterreflektierten Bildung. Oder: (Wie) Kann ich geschlechterreflektiert arbeiten, ohne Stereotype zu verstärken?" In Ilke Glockentröger and Eva Adelt (eds.), *Gendersensible Bildung und Erziehung in der Schule. Grundlagen – Handlungsfelder – Praxis*, Münster: Waxmann, 25–41.

Diallo, Aïcha, Annika Niemann, and Miriam Shabafrouz (eds.). 2021. *Untie to Tie. Koloniale Fragmente im Kontext Schule*, Bonn: Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung.

Dunkel, Mario. 2021. "Mehr als ein 'Buzzword': zum Synergiepotenzial von Intersektionalitätsforschung und diversitätsbezogener Musikpädagogik." In Valerie Krupp, Anne Niessen and Verena Weidner (eds.), *Wege und Perspektiven in der musikpädagogischen Forschung*, Münster: Waxmann, 31–48.

Dunkel, Mario, Sophia Friedmann, Rena Janßen, Shanti Suki Osman, and Sophia Waldvogel. 2022. "Einblicke in aktuelle Forschungsprojekte an der Schnittstelle von Musikpädagogik und Intersektionalität." *Diskussion Musikpädagogik*, 94, 17–24.

English, Lawrence. *Various – Airport Symphony*. Room40, 2007, CD.

Escalante, Samuel. 2020. "Exploring Access, Intersectionality, and Privilege in Undergraduate Music Education Courses." *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, 29/2, 22–37.

Gaunt, Kyra. 2006. *The Games Black Girls Play: Learning the Ropes from Double-Dutch to Hip Hop,* New York: New York University Press.

Gay, Roxane. 2014. *Bad Feminist*, London: Corsair.

Gramich, Noam. 2021. "Bling-Bling Kweens. Intersektionale Aushandlungen von Reichwerden, Queerness und Rassifizierung in afrodiasporischen Hip-Hop-Kulturen." In Heidi Süß (ed.), *Rap und Geschlecht*, Weinheim: Beltz Juventa, 154–175.

Haghighat, Leila. 2018. "Kultur zwischen Freiheit, Macht und Beherrschung. Die Bedeutung des Hegemoniebegriffs für die Kulturelle Bildung." In Anja Schütze and Jens Maedler (eds.), *Weiße Flecken. Diskurse und Gedanken über Diskriminierung, Diversität und Inklusion in der Kulturellen Bildung*, München: kopaed.

Haselbach, Barbara (ed.) 2011. *Studientexte zu Theorie und Praxis des Orff-Schulwerks,* Mainz: Schott Music.

Hines, Jasmine. 2020. "Incorporating Intersectional Musicality within the Classroom: Black Feminism through Nina Simone and Janelle Monáe." *Journal of Popular Music Education*, 4/3, 311–328.

Honnens, Johann. 2021. "Hegemoniale Männlichkeiten in musikbezogenen Aushandlungen von Jugendlichen. Eine praxeologische und intersektionale Analyse." *Diskussion Musikpädagogik*, 90, 52–59.

Jenike, Lesley. 2023. "Kinetic Orality in 1919," https://blog.pshares.org/kinetic-orality-in-1919/.

Josties, Elke and Marion Gerards. 2020/2019. "Diversitätsbewusste Soziale Arbeit mit Musik in der (Welt-)Migrationsgesellschaft," https://www.kubi-online.de/artikel/diversitaetsbewusste-soziale-arbeit-musik-welt-migrationsgesellschaft.

Juntunen, Marja-Leena. 2016. "The Dalcroze Approach: Experiencing and Knowing Music through the Embodied Exploration." In Carlos R. Abril and Brent Gault (eds.), *Approaches to Teaching General Music: Methods, Issues, and Viewpoints*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 141–167.

Kattenbeck, Chris. 2022. "'…ein Teil der Kultur'? Überlegungen zum Beatmaking als eigenständigem Element der Hip Hop-Kultur(en)." In Thomas Wilke and Michael Rappe (eds.), *HipHop im 21. Jahrhundert*, Wiesbaden: VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, 309–330.

Kendall, Mikki. 2021. *Hood Feminism*, London: Bloomsbury.

Knight Steele, Catherine. 2021. *Digital Black Feminism*, New York: New York University Press.

Koskela, Minja, Anna Kuoppamäki, Sidsel Karlsen, and Heidi Westerlund. 2021. "The Paradox of Democracy in Popular Music Education: Intersectionalizing 'Youth" through Curriculum Analysis." In Alexis Anja Kallio, Heidi Westerlund, Sidsel Karlsen, Kathryn Marsh and Eva Sæther (eds.), *The Politics of Diversity in Music Education*, Basel: Springer Cham, 135–149.

Lehmann-Wermser, Andreas. 2019. "'Weiße' Musikpraxen zeigen: Rassistische Strukturen als relevante Kategorie musikpädagogischer Forschung?" In

Verena Weidner and Christian Rolle (eds.), *Praxen und Diskurse aus Sicht musikpädagogischer Forschung*, Münster: Waxmann, 279–295.

Lindsey, Treva B. 2015. "Let Me Blow Your Mind: Hip Hop Feminist Futures in Theory and Praxis." *Urban Education*, 50/1, 52–77.

Love, Bettina L. 2012. *Hip Hop's Lil' Sistas Speak: Negotiating Hip Hop Identities and Politics in the New South*, New York: Peter Lang.

McKittrick, Katherine. 2021. *Dear Science and Other Stories*, Durham: Duke University Press.

Mörsch, Carmen. 2023. "Unboxing – Diskriminierungskritische Perspektiven an der Schnittstelle Bildung/Kunst," Interview with Claudia Hummel und Nanna Lüth, https://criticaldiversity.udk-berlin.de/en/unboxing-diskriminierungskritische-perspektiven-an-der-schnittstelle-bildung-kunst/.

Morgan, Joan. (1999) 2017. *When Chickenheads Come Home to Roost: A Hip Hop Feminist Breaks It Down*. New York: Simon and Schuster.

Murray, Robin. 2022. "Snoop Dogg Reckons 'WAP' Is Too Damn Filthy." *Clash Magazine Music News, Reviews and Interviews*, https://www.clashmusic.com/news/snoop-dogg-reckons-wap-is-too-damn-filthy/.

Oğlakcıoğlu, Mustafa. 2019. "Gangsta-Rap: Lyrische Kunstform oder strafwürdiges Verhalten?" In Britta Lange, Martin Roeber and Christoph Schmitz-Scholemann (eds.), *Grenzüberschreitungen: Recht, Normen, Literatur und Musik: Tagung im Nordkolleg Rendsburg vom 8. bis 10. September 2017*, Berlin: De Gruyter, 3–18.

Osman, Shanti Suki. 2022a. "Towards a Feminist Pop Music Scholarship. Mohanty's Models of Feminist Scholarship in Music." In Knut Holtsträter (ed.), *Really Popular? Criteria of the Popularity of Music / Richtig populär? Kriterien der Popularität von Musik (Lied und populäre Kultur 67)*, Münster: Waxmann, 177–195.

Osman, Shanti Suki. 2022b. "Wege zu intersektionaler diskriminierungskritischer Musikvermittlung." *Diskussion Musikpädagogik*, 94, 31–35.

Osman, Shanti Suki. 2023. "Repräsentation und Diversität in der populären Musik in schulischen Musikkontexten." In Mario Dunkel and Tonio Oeftering (eds), *Musik, Sound und Politik als Handlungsfeld politischer und musikalischer Bildung*, Münster: Waxmann, 131–144.

Pough, Gwendolyn. 2004. *Check It While I Wreck It: Black Womanhood, Hip-Hop Culture, and the Public Sphere*, Boston: Northeastern University Press.

Riegel, Christine. 2016. *Bildung, Intersektionalität, Othering. Pädagogisches Handeln in widersprüchlichen Verhältnissen*, Bielefeld: transcript.

Ritz, ManuEla. 2013. "Adultismus – (un)bekanntes Phänomen: Ist die Welt nur für Erwachsene gemacht?" In Petra Wagner (ed.), *Handbuch Inklusion. Grundlagen vorurteilsbewusster Bildung und Erziehung*, Freiburg: Herder, 165–173.

Şahin, Reyhan. 2019. *Yalla, Feminismus!*, Köln: Tropen.

Seeliger, Martin. 2013. *Deutscher Gangsta-Rap. Zwischen Affirmation und Empowerment*, Berlin: Posth.

Siedenburg, Ilka. 2022. "Von der Gendersensibilität zur Intersektionalität?" *Diskussion Musikpädagogik*, 94, 43–49

Snoop Doggy Dogg feat. Nate Dogg, Warren G, Kurupt. 1993. "Ain't No Fun (If the Homies Can't Have None)," *Doggy Style*, Sony.

Stallion, Megan Thee. 2020. "Why I Speak Up for Black Women. I'm not afraid of criticism, and 'Protect Black women' should not be controversial," *The New York Times*, October 13.

Süß, Heidi. 2022. "Hoes Up, G's Down? – Transformationsprozesse im Geschlechterverhältnis am Beispiel der deutschsprachigen Rap-Szene." In Thomas Wilke and Michael Rappe (eds.), *HipHop im 21. Jahrhundert*, Wiesbaden: VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, 61–76.

Talbot, Brent (ed.). 2023. "Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion: Intersectionality and Music Education," special issue, *Music Educators Journal*, 109/3.

Thompson, Marie. 2017. "Whiteness and the Ontological Turn in Sound Studies." *Parallax*, 23, 266–282.

Tiller, Bryson. 2015. "Sorry not sorry," *TRAPSOUL*, RCA.

Walgenbach, Katharina. 2007. "Gender als interdependente Kategorie." In Katharina Walgenbach, Gabriele Dietze, Lann Hornscheidt and Kerstin Palm (eds.), *Gender als interdependente Kategorie. Neue Perspektiven auf Intersektionalität, Diversität und Heterogenität*, Opladen: Budrich Verlag, 23–65.

Wallbaum, Christopher. 2009. "Ist Grooven ästhetisch bildend? Ein Beispiel für ästhetische Rhythmus-Erfahrung in der Schule und zwei Reflexionen." In Christian Rolle and Herbert Schneider (eds.), *Rhythmus! Studien und Materialien zur musikpädagogischen Arbeit über und mit Rhythmen*, Regensburg: ConBrio, 42–54.

West, Cornel. 1989. "Black Culture and Postmodernism," In Barbara Kruger and Phil Mariani (eds.), *Remaking History*, Seattle: Bay Press, 87–96.

Winker, Gabriele and Nina Degele. 2010. *Intersektionalität: Zur Analyse sozialer Ungleichheiten*, Bielefeld: transcript.