

Spaces of Freedom? Shopping Together, Living Apart

In 2007, two shopping malls opened their doors in Maputo and Johannesburg, the Greenstone Shopping Centre in north-east Johannesburg and the Maputo Shopping Centre in downtown Maputo.¹ In Johannesburg, this new mall was one amongst many others in the differentiated shopping centre landscape. Yet in Maputo, the gleaming golden mall constituted a new and unique type of urban space, although it has received competition from new malls since then. In many cities around the globe, shopping malls have become important spaces where urban dwellers of all walks of life – not only the middle classes and the elite – engage in manifold practices, ranging from grocery shopping to socialising with neighbours, playing arcade games and people watching. Every society and every mode of production produces its own space (Lefebvre 1996 [1974]). In this sense, the shopping mall is one of the quintessential spaces of globalising, neoliberal economies. Shopping malls emerged in the second half of the 20th century, first in the USA, then in Europe and South Africa, and since the 1990s, increasingly in many other cities of the Global South. One of the reasons for their mushrooming is that shopping centres are considered relatively secure investments (Goss 1993: 21). Not least because of the volatility of the financial markets, property has become a favourite asset. Shopping centres economies of scale and the all-encompassing planning make them attractive to real estate investors in the Global South and elsewhere, especially where states struggle to provide urban infrastructure and public spaces which are considered attractive by the growing aspirational classes. As we have seen in the previous chapters, such capitalist interests in property have also transformed Maputo and Johannesburg neighbourhoods, being a key force in the politics of proximity (see chapter 5) and the politics of loss (see chapter 4).

In large African cities, especially in Southern Africa, shopping malls are burgeoning. In South Africa, where most of the existing research on African malls has been conducted, the construction of shopping malls has profoundly influenced the urban consumption landscape and public life since as early as the 1960s. In other cities like Maputo, shopping malls are a new phenomenon and related to the deepening of economic liberalisation. In the Southern African region and beyond, retail investors from

1 Sections of this chapter have been published in the journal *Anthropological Forum* in an article written together with Aceska (Aceska and Heer 2019, © Taylor & Francis). A previous version of parts of the chapter has been published in an edited book (Heer 2017). I thank the respective publishers, editors and co-author for the permission for reprint.

South Africa play a major role in the shaping of mall landscapes (Miller 2008, Miller et al. 2008). It is likely that in the coming decades more malls along the lines of the South African model will be built across Africa.²

The chapter unravels the way in which shopping malls function as important spaces of public life in African cities, and how they stand in specific relations to broader society and to other urban spaces. Rather than being perceived as inferior spaces in comparison to so-called *proper* public spaces or as fortified enclaves which exclude the African urbanities, malls should be viewed as relational and connected spaces serving as spaces of encounters in African cities where entanglements, hence forms of sociability crossing social boundaries, emerge. Using Foucault's notion of heterotopia, the ethnography will illuminate that malls are not uniform, abstract spaces, even if mall builders design them as such, but rather gain multiple layers of meanings, emerging in diverse forms of practical appropriation, in competition with diverging local conceptions of what the malls are and in manifold entanglements with other urban spaces.

Beyond the Enclave: Malls as Entangled Spaces of Heterotopia

Shopping malls are privately owned spaces of public life. Containing multiple shops and diverse leisure establishments such as restaurants, movie theatres, and sometimes even game arcades, they are planned, developed, managed and owned by a non-state entity (Falk 1998: 15). Historically, they can be seen as descendants of the European 'Passage', an architectural ancestor of the mall invented in European cities at the turn to the 19th century (Watson 2009: 55). Shopping malls can also be seen as a contemporary form of urban market (Wehrheim 2007). They differ from other markets in African cities by being strongly regulated spaces with differentiated mechanisms of security and control, with rules set up and enforced by the private owners and their security personnel. Often, they have very clear spatial boundaries setting them apart from the surrounding state-managed urban spaces.

Although malls are private spaces with regard to their ownership structure, from the point of view of users, they are spaces of urban public life. Lofland defines public life as social life characterised by the co-presence of "personally unknown or only categorically known" urban dwellers (Lofland 1989: 453). As Sennett (1983 [1974]) points out, public life is about visibility and accessibility. Accessibility to shopping malls is, however, subject to the many limitations and rules imposed and sanctioned by the mall management. Helten (2007) even suggests approaching shopping malls as total institutions (Goffman 1961). Many malls exercise a high degree of control and regulation of people's behaviour. The architectural designs of many shopping malls even resemble the panopticon and prisons (Helten 2007: 245). Yet power and control tend to be "exercised through a seductive spatial arrangement, where the experience of being in the space is itself the expression of power" (Allen 2006: 454). The landscape artists and interior designers aim to create a sense of place which attracts urban dwellers to

2 The shopping landscape in Maputo and Johannesburg is changing rapidly. The following ethnography refers to 2010–2012, and the shopping circuits thus described may have changed since then (in Johannesburg with the opening of the Alexandra Mall and maybe the Mall of Africa, and in Maputo with the opening of Baia Mall and others).

the mall, often in unconscious ways (Goss 1993: 22). The shopping mall planners therefore distinctly aim at shaping lived space (Lefebvre 1996 [1974]), meaning the way urban dwellers feel and act in space and what they associate with it.

One may distinguish two opposing academic discourses on shopping malls: a negative discourse which sees malls as enclaves and a more positive discourse which acknowledges malls as new spaces of urban sociability. The more positive discourse emphasises the agency of urban dwellers and the mall's potential for providing space for new forms of publics and public life (Heer 2017, Houssay-Holzschuch and Teppo 2009, Leeuwen 2011, Murray 1997, Nuttall 2004, Perez, Salcedo and Caceres 2012, Underhill 2004, Van Eeden 2006, Vries 2008), whilst also acknowledging the multiple negative aspects like forms of exclusion. This ethnography seeks to contribute to the literature focusing on malls' capacities to both open up opportunities and reproduce systems of exclusion. In the negative discourse, shopping malls have become symbols or epitomes for the loss of public space within the context of the increasing privatisation and commercialisation of cities (e.g. Sorkin 1992). Many urban scholars claim that malls are a phenomenon of the globalised economy, diminishing locality and human agency (Olivier 2008, Salcedo 2003). They tend to be seen as spaces of hyper consumption and social control (Dirsuweit 2009, Fu and Murray 2014, Marks and Bezolli 2001, Mbembe 2004, Miles 2010, Miller et al. 2008, Salcedo 2003). Malls have been said to limit political and democratic practices like demonstrations (Németh 2009). By excluding the poor and other marginalised groups they are seen as constituting fortress-like, exclusionary and elitist spaces sanitised of urban poverty and decay (Dirsuweit 2009, Dirsuweit and Schattauer 2004). Because of the mobility of South African capital in Africa, the spread of malls regionalises or globalises class and race divisions in African cities (Miller et al. 2008).

Critical voices claim that the emergence of malls has consequences for conviviality in the city as such. In generally reinforcing tendencies toward urban sprawl they contradict the often stated goals of urban integration (Beavon 1998, Turok 2001). Contributing to the fragmentation of the urban landscape, they are drivers of postmodern forms of segregation (Caldeira 2000, Davis 2006 [1990], Murray 2008, 2011, 2013, Paasche and Sidaway 2010). Caldeira most prominently proposed the notion of a 'fortified enclave', under which she subsumes gated communities, offices complexes and shopping malls. These enclaves are typical of cities like São Paulo, Los Angeles and Johannesburg, and "negate the main characteristics of the modern democratic ideal of urban public space" (Caldeira 2000: 304). This view has come to dominate academic discourses on malls in African cities. Myers and Murray (2006) argue accordingly:

With the increasing privatisation of basic social services and the overall neglect of physical infrastructure, the privileged middle class with global connections have increasingly cloistered themselves into the fortified enclaves of Western modernity that have materialized in cities all over Africa. As the propertied, the privileged, and the powerful have retreated behind the protective shield of gated residential communities, enclosed shopping malls, and other barricaded sites of luxury, the urban poor are often left to fend for themselves in urban environments that have deteriorated almost beyond repair (Myers and Murray 2006: 5).

According to the *Oxford Dictionary*, enclave in the strict sense of the term means “a small territory surrounded by a larger territory whose inhabitants are of a different culture or nationality” (Waite 2013: 294). In urban studies, most prominently, Marcuse defined enclave as a “area of spatial concentration in which members of a particular population group, self-defined by ethnicity or religion or otherwise, congregate as a means of protecting and enhancing their economic, social, political, and/or cultural development” (Marcuse 2005: 18). Understanding shopping malls as enclaves as Caldeira (2000) and Myers and Murray (2006) do has, however, several shortcomings.

The first fallacy of approaching malls as enclaves is that it implies that the users of the mall constitute a homogeneous group, clearly delineated from people outside the mall, who, by implication, do not frequent the mall (Aceska and Heer 2019: 49). As this chapter will show, well-off urban milieus may dominate malls, yet there is also ample space for their appropriation by less affluent milieus. In addition, in both Maputo and Johannesburg, they are spaces of religious, ethnic and even economic heterogeneity rather than marked by homogeneity. The metaphor of enclave thus reproduces the *mosaic thinking* of the Chicago School, which understood the city as comprising patches of social groups, neatly separated and distributed across urban spaces.

The second fallacy is that the metaphor of the enclave does not distinguish between the users of malls and the builders of malls. It assumes that the urban elites desire to retreat from the city, and hence mall builders respond to this need. In reality, this is a bit more complex. Although the property developers, mall management and shop owners clearly depend on the users' demand, it is a fairly oversimplified understanding of consumption to assume that the interests and ways of seeing malls of mall builders and mallgoers simply coincide. Often there are multiple and even contradictory representations of shopping malls purposed by diverse actors, as this chapter will show. In addition, mall builders and mall users have a distinctly different relationship to these spaces. For mall builders, they are abstract spaces (Lefebvre 1996 [1974]: 49). Abstract space serves the purpose of creating profit, it is based on exchange relations and it is quantified and assessed based on its exchange value. Its use value is only relevant as long as it can be subjugated to quantifying measures such as price, size and the costs determining its exchange value. Based on such abstract calculations, property owners and property developers assess, plan, sell and manage malls, they are *abstract space-makers* (see chapter 5, Aalbers 2006, Thompson 2017). As the discourses by mall managers and mall architects show in this chapter, their thinking and acting is based on the idea that by shaping space, they can determine who uses malls and how they use them. This biased and old conception of space as a container (Bachmann-Medick 2006: 289) assumes that space determines what takes place within it (Aceska and Heer 2019: 49).

The production of space (Lefebvre 1996 [1974]), however, is an ongoing process and is not finished when the cranes and diggers have left. Despite the tight surveillance and restrictions on accessibility as constraining structural conditions, urban dwellers can to a certain degree *appropriate* these abstract spaces (Carrier 1996) and turn them into spaces of sociality, self-stylisation (Nurtall 2004) and leisure. By acting in and on space, urban dwellers imbue malls with meanings, memories and dreams; as *social space-makers*, they constitute malls as lived space (Lefebvre 1996 [1974]). Consumption practices may be silent and barely visible, but they may even entail hidden forms of resistance (Certeau 1984). These two rationalities – the builders and users, *abstract* and

social space-makers – need to be disentangled in order to fully understand the social functioning of malls.

The third fallacy of the metaphor of enclave is that it overemphasises the spatial and social rupture between malls and the surrounding city, whilst removing attention from the many connections between them (Aceska and Heer 2019: 49). Overstating separation and segregation, the metaphor renders invisible the many entanglements and relations to the ‘outside’ which are as constitutive of the malls as the ruptures. Understanding malls as enclaves is a form of what Amin calls ‘telescopic urbanism’, namely, a sense that the city is “a collection of settlements with varied geographies of affiliation rather than as the sum of its parts” and not a “field of shared life and common rights” (Amin 2013: 477). But actually, only through the entanglements with other spaces do malls become constituted.

A fourth fallacy of the rather negative appraisal of malls is that it is caught up in a modernist public–private dichotomy, lamenting the economisation of what is nostalgically imagined as a civic space open to everyone (the former public space). Yet feminist research and others have amply shown that each *agora* (Arendt 1959 [1958]) and public sphere (Habermas 2002) is characterised by processes of exclusion, and that the idea of unitary modern public space is a naïve ideal, especially for societies characterised by diversity and inequality (Benhabib 1995 [1992], Fraser 2001 [1997]). Again, the public–private dichotomy overstates the importance of closure as a defining feature of malls, whilst neglecting other aspects.

As an alternative to conceptualising malls as privatised public spaces and enclaves, this chapter suggests approaching shopping malls as *entangled spaces of heterotopia*. Michel Foucault coined the notion of heterotopia in a lecture in 1967 (for more details see Foucault 2009: 13–14). By the term, he meant various spaces and institutions that interrupt the normality and continuity of everyday life and ordinary spaces and are hence *other spaces* (Dehaene and Cauter 2009: 4). While utopias represent society in a perfected, utopian form, yet are unreal spaces, heterotopias are really existing spaces:

There are also, probably in every culture, in every civilization, real places – places that do exist and that are formed in the very founding of society – which are something like counter-sites, a kind of effectively enacted utopia in which the real sites, all the other real sites that can be found within the culture, are simultaneously represented, contested, and inverted (Foucault 1986 [1967]: 24).

What makes shopping malls heterotopic spaces is that, amongst other things, they have the capacity of “juxtaposing in a single real place several spaces, several sites that are in themselves incompatible” (Foucault 1986 [1967]: 25). In a shopping mall, there may be a gym next to a fast-food restaurant, or a marketing discourse alluding to nature, while for the construction of the mall, nature was actually destroyed. In a movie theatre at the mall there is the projection of a three-dimensional space onto a two-dimensional screen, hence two spaces which are actually incompatible. Heterotopias are spaces entailing multiple logics, and they become constituted by the play between binaries such as public–private, normal–extraordinary, imagined–real, homogeneous–heterogeneous, and are thus fundamentally ambiguous and contradictory.

A further key characteristic is that heterotopias “presuppose a system of opening and closing that both isolates them and makes them penetrable” (ibid: 26). Malls, pris-

ons or hamams are not freely accessible like public spaces, but there are certain systems in place that determine entry, like purification rituals, a juridical sentence, or clothing standards. In addition, heterotopias are often linked to ‘*slices in time*’, they thus constitute a break with the time of ordinary life; museums enable us to travel in time, cemeteries are places where the dead are put to rest for the rest of eternity, and, as we will see, shopping malls enable temporary refuge in urban utopias, a rejuvenating pause from bustling city life (ibid).

The most important aspect of heterotopias for the analysis of malls, though, is their heterotopic relation to other urban spaces: heterotopias “have a function in relation to all the space that remains” (ibid: 27). They are “spaces that have the curious property of being in relation with all the other sites, but in such a way as to suspect, neutralize, or invent the set of relations that they happen to designate, mirror, or reflect” (ibid: 24). Foucault distinguishes six types of heterotopia: heterotopias of crisis, of deviance, of illusion, of compensation, of festivity and of permanence. As this comparative ethnography reveals, the Maputo Shopping Centre can be seen as a *heterotopia of illusion*, which exposes “every real space ... as still more illusory” (ibid: 27). The mall makes visible what is usually not acknowledged, for example that which is often seen as an urban reality, namely, that urban elites can live enclaved lives disconnected from others in the city, which becomes exposed as an illusion at the mall. Greenstone Mall, in contrast, emerges as a *heterotopia of compensation*, whose “role is to create a space that is other, another real space, as perfect, as meticulous, as well arranged as ours is messy, ill constructed, and jumbled” (ibid). The notion of heterotopia hence proves useful for comparative ethnography.

Heterotopias cannot be understood only in terms of themselves; their meanings derive from the entanglements, the relationship to other urban spaces and to the larger urban society. The concept of heterotopia brings therefore into focus for the urban dweller the relationship in which the mall stands with the rest of the urban world and the place it takes within their urban lives. This allows the analysis to move beyond the problematic idea of malls as enclaves, separated and disconnected, deterministic and absolute spaces. Malls are rather relational spaces, their social roles and meanings only emerging in relationship to other urban spaces. This also means that malls always need to be analysed in relation to the specificities of their urban contexts. Although malls may be financed by foreign money and built according to transnational architecture, they are nevertheless lived and imagined locally, and hence only come into being in relation to the local setting. This invites comparative research on malls across diverse settings, in ways that do not presuppose what malls ought to be and how they ought to be used, but in ways which are empirically open to all the variety of uses and meanings malls take on in diverse cities and for diverse groups.

This analysis of shopping malls as entangled spaces of heterotopia, as I develop it here, focuses on four analytical aspects, namely, (1) spatial practices by users, (2) representations of the malls, (3) encounters in malls, and (4) the relationship between the mall and other urban settings. Shopping has spatial dimensions (Gregson, Crewe and Brooks 2002). Shopping-related movements between home, work and consumption spaces form part of the spatial practices (1) through which urban dwellers link different urban spaces, embedded within the rhythms of everyday life, and therefore contribute to the production of the space of the city (Lefebvre 1996 [1974]). Urban dwellers weave together particular shopping spaces which results in shopping circuits, recognised in

their totality only by their users (Magnani 1996: 23). The Maputo Shopping Centre and the Greenstone Shopping Centre are just one space among many that urban dwellers weave into their individual shopping circuits, which differ from others depending on milieu background, the transport possibilities urban dwellers have, where they live, how much they earn; however, gender, lifestyle preferences, and whether they have to look after dependants or not may play a role. Any analysis of malls needs to ask which role this specific mall plays in urban dwellers' shopping circuits.

Yet malls also need to be analysed with regard to the multiple, contradictory and competing representations and discourses (2) upheld by diverse actors about the mall. This second aspect grasps that malls are not only material but also conceived spaces, and that different actors imagine and represent the malls differently. The relation between these multiple representations is shaped by power; there is often a competition over how the mall should be seen, and the importance of these representations not least derives from the fact that they can influence social practices, for example whether or not people shop at a mall.

The third analytical aspect in the empirical analysis of entangled spaces of heterotopia refers to the sociabilities and urbanisms through which encounters at malls may emerge (3). These encounters bring about co-presence and the mutual visibility of urban dwellers who live apart, and whose lifeworlds become entangled in new ways at malls. These encounters – often ephemeral, sometimes more intense – across economic and ethnic boundaries cause urban dwellers to imagine other realities and question their place in the broader society. Urban dwellers link, juxtapose and compare these mall encounters, based on habitualised experiences and urban knowledge, with encounters in other settings. The meaning of entanglements created at malls can only be understood in relation to other entanglements. This leads to the fourth analytical aspect: malls need to be analysed with regard to their heterotopic relationships to other urban spaces or urban realms (4), like urban religion, domestic work or street life. Malls may turn out to be heterotopias of compensation as in the Johannesburg case, compensating for inequalities in encounters outside of the mall, or heterotopias of illusion in the Maputo case, as it exposes otherwise hidden aspects of urban reality. This unravels the way malls work on people's imagination of their social place in the city as a material and social setting.

Maputo Shopping Centre – The Mirror of Mozambique

The Maputo Shopping Centre (locally called Maputo Shopping) is located in the city centre of Maputo, more precisely in the Baixa section of the inner city, and is easily accessible on foot. Pedestrians walk through the mall on their way home and informal traders sell their goods at the entrances. This is quite unusual for a mall. Malls in the US and in South African cities are commonly built on empty land in suburban areas, only to be reached by car, as is the case with Greenstone Shopping Centre (locally called Greenstone). This central location of Maputo Shopping reflects and reinforces the monocentric form of the city, which is, however, gradually shifting towards a more polynuclear form, as exemplified by malls emerging in areas of expansion such as along the coast line. Maputo Shopping consists of two main buildings, a large courtyard and an outside parking area usually jammed with cars. The mall attracts its cus-

tomers with a shiny façade consisting of grey aluminium panels and window fronts made of blue mirrored glass. This is a contrast to Greenstone Mall and many malls based at transport axes on the urban outskirts. These malls tend to have an inward-oriented 'siege architecture' (Murray 2004: 142) which pays little attention to the outer façade. The interior design of the main building of Maputo Shopping is strongly influenced by Middle Eastern aesthetics and mall architecture. The floor is covered with elaborate mosaic patterns made of shiny marble tiles. Many young people from Polana Caniço experienced this building as exceptionally beautiful; they describe it with the term *bonito*, which they equally apply to the luxury mansions in the elite area of Sommerschild II. In contrast, members of the urban elite of African and Portuguese descent, who had travelled extensively to malls in South Africa and elsewhere, tend to perceive it as ugly and overloaded. They read the decoration as distinctly 'Indian' and associate the mall with the Indian ethnic group. Raquel, a 40-year-old resident of Sommerschild II, explained it like this:

Raquel: The shopping centre as a building is a bit overly Indian (laughs). Its decoration ... but I understand, as the owner is Indian, right. Barbara: But in which way is it overly Indian? Raquel: It's overly golden, the decoration is ... it's not a simple thing, it's not modern. This is when I compare it with malls in South Africa where I normally go (Raquel, resident of Sommerschild II, January 2011).

Maputo Shopping belongs to the company MBS, which is also the colloquially used abbreviation for Mohamad Bachir Suleman, the owner of the mall, who is indeed a well-known, affluent Indian merchant. He apparently invested 32 million dollars in the 52,000 square metre mall (Canalmoz 2007). The initial plan of the mall was drawn up by an architect, but later the owner changed it according to his own taste and had it built by a Chinese construction company (Sebastião, manager of the Maputo Shopping Centre, November 2010). Since then, the mall has been a work in progress rather than a completed endeavour, with facilities added or rebuilt over time. The mall is owner-built, as well as owner-managed, which is also quite rare for a mall. The owner himself, making himself an actor in the transnational flow of ideas, travelled to Brazil and headhunted an experienced shopping mall manager. In 2012, the mall owner Bachir did not have a contract with a private security company (so-called *seguranças*) but employed the security personnel himself (so-called *guardas*). In 2012, the enforcement of the official rules (according to a sign at the entrance it is forbidden to smoke, to drink alcohol in the hallways, to carry weapons, to run, to take photographs or film, or to leave children unattended) was not particularly strict, however. In the afternoons and at the weekend in particular, groups of children roamed the centre without their parents, and were seen running up and down the escalators. Sebastião, the mall manager, claimed in an interview that informal traders were not allowed at the mall entrances, but in reality, they were seen standing there quite often, although security personnel sent them away from time to time. This relatively relaxed implementation of the rules stands in contrast to Greenstone Mall where I could neither observe trespassing by users nor tolerance by the security employees. The sometimes contested boundary between inside and outside and disjunctions between official rules versus lived reality question the enclave character and total control which the existing literature often describes for shopping malls.

Maputo Shopping contains a supermarket and many small boutiques which specialise in clothing, electronics, books and gifts, as well as a movie theatre, a gym and a games arcade. There are two food courts: one is on the fourth floor and this is where the non-Muslim mall users who can afford to buy food at a restaurant usually mingle. The other is an open court between the two buildings called Guebuza Square. Many of the restaurants here are Indian-owned and focus on Muslim customers; they offer halal food and do not sell alcohol. In the middle of the square there are chairs and tables where people are allowed to sit without being customers of a restaurant: here mall visitors, usually in groups of two to ten, sit down, socialise and people watch. They often include mall visitors with little means who have bought food or drink at the supermarket.

Like an onion, Maputo Shopping contains several layers ranging from more public to more private spaces, with increasing access restrictions. Besides the mall spaces open to the customers, there is a Muslim prayer room on one of the top floors, only accessible to people who share the faith of the owner. Then there is a back region, as Goffman (1959) would call it, to which only the workers have access, including service rooms and the offices of the mall management. The most private and most secluded spaces are the mall owner's private rooms, probably situated on the topmost floor. The existence of these private rooms is publicly announced by a golden elevator which is reserved solely for Bachir, a symbol for his wealth and inaccessibility. In November 2014, the owner was nevertheless kidnapped by armed perpetrators in this very mall and he was only released a month later. Such incidents undo the perception of malls as highly secured and secure spaces. Equally, in Johannesburg, shopping malls are not safe from attack (Mtakati 2014).

In 2010, the centre was attracting about 300 to 400 people per day and around 12,000 people a month. The centre management was content with these numbers but wanted to increase them by around 20 per cent (Sebastião, mall manager, November 2010). Not least because of this, the centre management opened new facilities; in 2012, a mini-theme park, the Maputo Game Centre, was installed on the fifth floor, mainly to make the mall more attractive to families. This venue, which includes coin-operated entertainment devices (games arcade), simulates a fantasy underwater world. On Sunday afternoons when Maputo Shopping is at its busiest, the games arcade – the air filled with the sounds of video games and carousel music – becomes inhabited by families and groups of children and teenagers from diverse social milieus. One of the salespersons confirmed this: “It attracts all kind of people, all the different classes, humble people and people who own more” (Salesperson at Game Centre, July 2012). In such a world of fantasy, spaces open up for ephemeral entanglements across lifeworlds.

Global Modernity or Money Laundromat?

When the mall was inaugurated on 8 May 2007, the then president of Mozambique, Armando Guebuza, gave a speech in which he portrayed the mall as a driver of economic development and modernisation in the commercial sector, as it increased competition and diversified the shopping possibilities (Canalmoz 2007). Referring to the regional and global competition between cities, Guebuza argued that the mall constituted a new architectural contribution to the cityscape which would improve the image of the city as a whole. The owner, Bachir, claimed at the opening that from then on it would be possible to buy in Maputo the best goods in the world (ibid). He repre-

sented Maputo Shopping as the only place in Mozambique where urban dwellers could indulge in all the achievements of modernity and the global consumer culture. These inaugural speeches, based on tropes of progress and development, represented the mall as the entry point to the global consumption-scape of brands and shopping experiences. They portrayed the mall as a global, cosmopolitan island in the midst of a yet developing city and nation.

Such tropes of modernity and development need to be contextualised to the Mozambican history of consumption. During the socialist phase and the civil war, consumption possibilities in Maputo were very limited (Pitcher 2002: 90). At this time of nationalised industry, the often sparsely stocked shops and wholesalers were owned by the government and by Indian merchants (Miller 2006: 154). The acute shortage of imported goods led to considerable illicit border trade and a black market (Gastrow 2003: 11). During the transformation from a socialist to a market economy, the liberalisation of prices and free choice of suppliers enabled the expansion of the retail sector. The growth of elite and the middle-class milieus, plus the presence of well-paid expatriates, led to a considerable demand for consumer goods in the city. In 2008, the municipality considered the retail sector to be one of the most important and most dynamic economic sectors of the city (Município de Maputo 2008: 118-9). The retail landscape in Maputo is nowadays highly diversified (Dawson, Findlay and Paddison 1990).

The end of apartheid in neighbouring South Africa ended the sanctions and opened the way for the investment of over-accumulated South African capital into other African countries. Foreign investment started to come back to Mozambique after 1994, when investors perceived the country as politically stabilising and the government as more legitimate (Pitcher 2002: 151). In the last few years, South African retailers have entered the Mozambican market, which, in turn, has become more and more competitive (Lucas 2007: 1). In 2008, the municipality of Maputo believed that this trend would continue in the future (Município de Maputo 2008: 119). Nevertheless, tariffs, transportation costs and rents captured by traders make goods relatively expensive in the city, which is why many Mozambicans like to shop in South Africa and informal cross-border trade is a lucrative business.

In 2012, movie theatre was inaugurated at the mall. At the ceremony, Armando Artur, the then minister of culture, congratulated the Portuguese cinema distributor Lusomundo for bringing new 3D technology to Maputo. He claimed that this was a “big contribution to the growth of the country in terms of its development” (Artur quoted in Canalmoz 2012). A representative of Lusomundo, Luís Moto, called the new 3D technology ‘revolutionary’ and claimed that Maputo ‘deserves’ the best technology in the world (Canalmoz 2012). Following the fight for independence from colonialism, the socialist ‘revolution’ and the turn to democracy, the revolution of consumption is now taking place, guided by the Maputo Shopping Centre, it seems. This discourse of modernity and newness, however, silences local history. Cinema has a long history in the city but the introduction of Structural Adjustment Programmes in the 1990s led to a decline in national cinema production (Power 2004: 261).³

3 The first cinematic exhibition in Maputo took place in 1890 (Power 2004: 264). During colonial times, the local population was not allowed to enter the cinemas; under the Portuguese they were exclusive, racialised spaces. Nevertheless, movies reached the local population in the form of mobile cinemas. In

At the opening of the 3D theatre, the mall management emphasised that the new movies would be screened at the same time as in Europe and South Africa (Sebastião, mall manager, August 2012; Canalmoz 2012). This statement referred to the fact that until 2012, movies were screened in Maputo only a couple of months after they had been screened elsewhere and after many people had already watched them at home using cheap DVD copies bought on the black market. With the immediate screening of new movies, Maputo had become synchronised with the rest of the world – the mall allowed this African city to connect to global time.

The Brazilian mall manager, Sebastião, was an important promulgator of the discourse of modernity and a significant actor in the flow of ideas from elsewhere to Maputo. His frame of reference was not the local shopping landscape of markets, informal stalls and *mercearias* (small shops); but compared Maputo Shopping to malls in Brazil and South Africa whose standards of quality and professionalism he believed they should aspire to. He saw his job as going far beyond managing a facility. Rather, acting as a facilitator of what he understood as modernisation, his task was to influence local practices of going to the mall and shopping. The urban population had to be taught how and when to go to the mall.

Shopping malls are a novelty in Mozambique ... People only now started to develop the habit of going to the mall. Before that, they shopped in the city centre. Now we succeeded that they associate shopping with the shopping mall (Sebastião, manager Maputo Shopping Centre, November 2010).

He explained that through their marketing, customers in Maputo would develop the habit of frequenting the mall in order to buy a gift for commercialised holidays like Mother's Day or Valentine's Day. His goal was to make 'mall-ing', meaning going to the mall for shopping, leisure and entertainment, an important habit in Maputo public life. In this sense the management saw itself as pioneer; they were creating new urban practices by offering a new space to the urban population.

This discourse of economic development and modernity was not, however, positively received by all users of the mall. In an interview with Nelinha, the 16-year-old school girl living in Polana Caniço, I showed her a photograph of the mall and, as mentioned in chapter 5, she immediately associated it with the planned gentrification of her neighbourhood and the threat of removal.

1975, Frelimo inherited 42 cinemas from the Portuguese colonial state (ibid: 263-4). Cinema has always occupied an important position in the making of identities in Mozambique (ibid: 278). At the beginning of the 1990s, the movie theatres were in state of neglect and many were taken over by the Universal Church, an influential Brazilian Pentecostal church (ibid: 276). According to Van de Kamp (2016: 13) this was not only a change of the use of these buildings, but also a shift in public life. As movies were no longer screened, going to church was welcome entertainment. The national cinema production and screening companies never recovered. Mozambican investors were taken over by foreign private sector involvement (in this case by the Lusomundo media group, the biggest communications group in Portugal). Most of the screened movies are nowadays Hollywood productions. Prices that were once quite low have become inaccessible for the majority of the population. Movie theatres in Maputo also have a hard time because of pirate DVDs which can be bought on any street corner.

They say they will construct hotels and restaurants [similar to this mall] in Polana Caniço and because of this we have to leave ... And imagine one day I would be walking past where my old house was and I would see such a shop [like the mall]. I would stop to look and think about the house which was there originally. I would cry, point to the inside where my bed used to be, where my room used to be, where the kitchen used to be. So the *saudade* (longing, yearning) will become very strong. But then I would have to leave the city which used to be my home in order to reach the outskirts where there is no civilisation, in the complete bush. So that is difficult. But it would be good for the country. For the country it would be very good (Nelinha, resident of Polana Caniço, November 2010).

While the shiny façade of the mall promises the illusion of modernisation for everyone, Nelinha sees through it, seeing her old house being replaced by a similar development in Polana Caniço. This excerpt from the interview exemplifies how many urban dwellers experience the current economic growth symbolised by the mall and the luxurious mansions constructed in Sommerschild II. Many people like Nelinha see it as a development which is not for them, a development from which they are excluded. Ordinary salaries stay the same while living costs rise constantly. Within the nationalist discourse of modernisation employed by Frelimo, which Nelinha picks up on in the quote above, the plight of the individual becomes subordinated to the higher goal, the economic growth of the nation. For this young woman, the 'beautiful' mall becomes a symbol for this ambivalent process of modernisation which Maputo is undergoing, and which threatens her neighbourhood and her lifeworld. The mall as heterotopia hence emerges through the entanglement of Nelinha's home and biography with the larger processes of gentrification, embedded in ambivalent understandings of modernity.

The discourse of the mall as Maputo's entry point into global modernity is quite powerful, not least as the management can reproduce this image in promotional texts on their website, in newspaper articles and in speeches by politicians and the owner at opening ceremonies. There is an alternative representation, however, which is in competition with this discourse of global modernity. It is a counter-image upheld by the urban dwellers, which portrays the mall as a money laundromat, as a place that assists its owner, Bachir, to launder illicitly earned money. This is a very powerful and highly political image, with the power to alienate many customers from frequenting the mall, exemplifying the entangledness of malls and politics.

The end of the civil war and the first democratic elections in 1994 not only brought political stability and economic growth to the country, but it also led to an increase in organised crime. Because of the long Mozambican coastline and the weak state institutions in the 1990s, the country became one of the main transit routes for drug trafficking, trafficking in human organs and money laundering.⁴ Knowledge about this illegal and dangerous economy consists of rumours, scandals uncovered by the newspapers, and a few research reports such as the one by Gastrow and Mosse, not least because it is dangerous to research such networks (Gastrow and Mosse 2003, Irish-Qhoboshe-

4 Drug trafficking is an old trade in Mozambique, though. Apparently, Swahili towns in northern Mozambique have been involved in this trade for centuries, even before Portuguese colonisation (Gastrow and Mosse 2003: 50).

ane 2007: 3). One of these transnational drug networks probably consists of Pakistani and Mozambican citizens belonging to the Indian merchant milieu (Gastrow and Mosse 2003: 48). Many of them are involved in the import/export business and it is a commonly held belief that certain Indian business men smuggle drugs hidden in the fridges, chickens and other goods they import (ibid: 51). These illicit activities are said to become facilitated by close connections to influential politicians and there is the popular perception that with enough money, criminal actors can buy themselves immunity (ibid: 51-52). In everyday conversations, in TV debates, newspaper editorials and readers' letters the view that the economy, politics and the illegal are highly intertwined is regularly raised.

Drug trafficking is accompanied by the demand for money laundering. Some of the money is spent on objects of conspicuous consumption like cars, and some of it is said to be channelled into real estate investments in Maputo and elsewhere (Gastrow and Mosse 2003: 52, Hanlon 2010). There are rumours that a considerable portion of the new high-rise buildings that have been added to the Maputo skyline in the last few years were financed by capital from such sources. The illegal economy seems to be one of the factors pushing new urban developments in Maputo. These rumours become crystallised in the Maputo Shopping Centre:

Barbara: Do you sometimes go to the Maputo Shopping Centre? Senhor Sousa: I don't enter *lavandarias* (laundry shops). I only enter the laundry of my grandmother. When I have driven past Maputo Shopping, I have to disinfect myself at home. (Laughing). I am joking, but I have indeed never entered (Senhor Sousa, resident of Sommerschield II, July 2012).

For Senhor Sousa, a 70-year-old Christian Indian living in Sommerschield II, as for many other urban dwellers, Maputo Shopping is anything but a neutral space; rather, they perceive it as the embodiment of the owner's economic power. The metaphor *lavandaria* (laundry) alludes to the rumour that the mall is an instrument for channeling the profits from the illegal economy into real estate investment.

As already mentioned, MBS, the way in which urbanites colloquially refer to the owner Mohamed Bachir Suleman, is a public figure, and has the reputation of being one of the wealthiest people in the city. The mall users have heard many rumours about the apparently dubious origins of his wealth. These rumours reached an even wider audience and garnered more legitimacy when the United States blacklisted the owner of the mall on the basis of being a drug baron in June 2010 (Hanlon 2010, US Department of the Treasury 2010).⁵ Many mall users observe that a considerable number of

5 In June 2010, Bachir became named a drug baron by the US president Barack Obama under the Foreign Narcotics Kingpin Designation Act (US Department of the Treasury 2010). This explicitly designated the Maputo Shopping Centre and two of Bachir's other businesses as being part of his drug trafficking network. This designation made it illegal for any American businesses to conduct business with Bachir's companies and American citizens were forbidden to enter them. The American embassy even called on their American and Mozambican employees not to shop at the mall (Hanlon 2010). Bachir himself, the Frelimo government and media close to Frelimo have since denied the allegations. As a result of the scandal all the banks at the mall closed their branches within a few weeks in order to protect their reputations (Club of Mozambique 2010). At least until 2012 there was no ATM at the mall and customers could only pay in cash.

the luxurious boutiques at the mall hardly ever have customers, which makes them think that these shops are really just a front for money laundering. According to the centre management, the mall recovered quickly from the decline in customer turnover after the scandal, but research showed that many members of the urban elite avoid the mall, as they do not want to be associated with the rumours.

What also fuels this image of the mall is the fact that the outside food court has been named Guebuza Square. The name is in English ('square' instead of *praça*), which alludes to Nelson Mandela Square, the European-styled piazza in Johannesburg's most famous mall, Sandton City, which is named after the South African icon Nelson Mandela. Guebuza Square is well known across the entire country, as it is often used as a stage for marketing events by brands advertised on TV. The mall management named this hypermodern space Guebuza Square in order to honour the then president, Armando Guebuza (2005–2015), and in order to underline the commitment of the Indian business man to the Mozambican nation. However, mall users interpret the name quite differently: Bachir and Armando Guebuza are said to be close friends, and Bachir is known to have funded Frelimo campaigns with considerable sums of money. The naming of the square after the president is for the urban dwellers the material representation of the interlacing of political and the economic power, and also of the connection of the president himself to criminal networks. In informal conversations, urban dwellers would say the name Guebuza Square with an ironic or sarcastic tone, humorous sarcasm being a common way in which urban dwellers in Maputo articulate their view that their country and their government is malfunctioning.

The mall as entangled heterotopia thus makes visible for its users what is otherwise supposed to be invisible, namely, the entanglements between the realm of politics and economic power. As heterotopia it exposes the democratic ideal, that is, that a president should represent the interests of the population and not be captured by powerful economic players, as an illusion. In addition, malls as conceived spaces come into being through multiple, contradictory and competing representations and discourses upheld by the mall management, politicians, users and others.

Maputo's Shopping Lifeworlds

Urban dwellers transform malls into far more than mere spaces of consumption. As in markets (Watson 2009), at malls multiple practices and forms of sociality become enacted. In Maputo, urban dwellers themselves distinguish between two ways of using the mall: on the one hand, there is *fazer compras*, which refers to buying things in its literal sense. On the other hand, there is *passear*, which means to go for a walk or to stroll around and refers here to a leisure activity involving moving through space, mostly in company of others, observing others and enjoying the space simply because it is there. In actual shopping trips, the two usages, leisure and shopping, are often intertwined. The distinction, though, is empirically and analytically important, and draws attention to the differing position of the mall within users' shopping circuits and emic perceptions. Users who come to the mall mainly for shopping (*fazer compras*) situate it within their shopping circuits and compare it to other consumption spaces, while users who frequent the mall for *passear* locate it within their leisure circuits and compare it to other spaces of leisure and public life. Different milieus use the mall differently: members of Muslim-Indian elite milieus frequent the mall for socialising and leisure, while urban elites of Portuguese or African descent tend to frequent it only

for shopping. Among residents from Polana Caniço, who frequent the mall less often than more affluent urban dwellers, both uses exist. There seems to be a tendency for young people from Polana Caniço to explore the mall as a leisure space, while adults buy things there they cannot find elsewhere. So for different users, the mall takes on different meanings in everyday life. Yet these lifeworlds of people who live apart in the city – for example in the entangled neighbourhoods of Sommerschild II and in Polana Caniço – come to intersect at the mall.

From the Beach to the Mall: Indian Public Life

The Maputo Shopping Centre has an important place in the leisure circuits of Indian milieus, both Muslim and non-Muslim, as well as Muslims from other regions. Non-Indian urbanites tend to refer to them as 'Indian', an imprecise term conflating people from the Pakistani and Indian diaspora in Mozambique, the majority of them Muslims, with Muslims from the Middle East and other Muslims wearing the Islamic clothing fashions influenced by Saudi Arabia. I have adopted this local taxonomy, but I use it in the plural (Indian milieus) to avoid erasing the diversity.

As the shops of Indian merchants are closed on Sundays, this is an important day for the fostering of social relations and enjoying sociability. On Sunday afternoons many come to the mall with their extended families where they bump into relatives, friends and acquaintances. Members of Indian milieus populate the tables in the restaurants, sit in the open Guebuza Square and stroll through (*passear*) the hallways of the mall. So, on Sundays, the mall is transformed into a space of experience, leisure and sociability. The building itself with its elevators and its ornate decorations, as well as the strolling visitors, become attractions for the Indian crowd who enjoy, always in groups of friends or family, the co-presence of intimates, relatives, acquaintances and strangers who somehow belong to their Indian-Muslim social world.

Many members of the Indian elite living in Sommerschild II, like Senhor Mattar, the 55-year-old head of the prayer place in the neighbourhood, frequent Maputo Shopping regularly.

Barbara: So do you plan to meet there with friends on Sundays or how does it work?
 Senhor Mattar: No, the friends come if they are around, maybe some may be travelling or tired, but sometimes it happens that we all meet there. Then the table becomes very large. We go there with children, in a group of maybe eight people (Senhor Mattar, administrative head of the Muslim prayer place in Sommerschild II, August 2012).

The Indian or Muslim identity ascribed to the mall, especially on Sundays, is not least because of the women's Muslim dress, increasingly influenced by fashions from the Middle East, such as the black, floor length hijabs. Yet such dress practices are anything but homogenous: there are a few fully veiled women, then there are women wearing a hijab-like robe but no headscarf, others again combine the headscarf with Western jeans, and many women also wear Western clothing without a headscarf and even short skirts. The majority of the Muslim men wear jeans and t-shirts, yet there is also a minority with long beards and prayer robes. This diversity can even be found within a group of people spending time at the mall together, for example a fully veiled women walking around with her cousin in a mini-skirt. But for everyone, going to the mall entails dressing up: mallgoers put on their good jeans, their new sneakers or their

new hijab. Women in *capulana* (African cloth) and destitute people (*pé descalço*, figuratively and literally poor people without shoes), both associated with the rural or the peri-urban, are a rare sight, especially on Sundays.

The main activity of the Muslim-Indian visitors at the mall is not shopping (*fazer compras*); shopping bags and pushing trolleys are rarely seen. Instead, many of these mallgoers walk up and down the mall in groups of two to eight people (*passerar*). They tend to be multigenerational groups consisting of family members, or they are in certain age groups which are either gender segregated (e.g. ten women in their early twenties) or consist of several friends or married couples of a similar age. People tend to stroll around slowly on Sunday afternoons, adults and children walking up and down the elevators, strolling through the hallways, crossing Guebuza Square outside and then returning back inside. Groups of children play games together in the games arcade, run around the hallways glancing into shop windows, and then return for a quick break to the restaurants where their parents are sitting with relatives and friends. The children eat chicken and fries, and then continue their games. Parents seldom tell their children not to run around or to be quiet. They enjoy socialising in the midst of strangers while their children are playing in an environment which they experience as child friendly and safe. The composition of the groups in the restaurant constantly changes, with friends or relatives arriving and leaving. Within minutes, the waiters rearrange tables and chairs in order to make space for these shifting group compositions. This constant adaptation of chair–table arrangements to the forms of sociability is typical of restaurants in Maputo and, hence, turns the mall into a typical Mozambican social space.

On Sundays, many families of Indian milieus congregate with relatives at home, and more private celebrations like weddings, birthdays and funerals take place. Yet, when there is no family gathering planned, many enjoy going to spaces of public life (*passerar*) on Sunday afternoons. Before the mall opened in 2007, the beach front along Marginal Avenue and 10 de Novembro Avenue served as a meeting place for Indian milieus on Sundays, as 60-year-old Senhor Ismail and others explained:

Senhor Ismail: In the past people used to sit at the Marginal, but since the Maputo Shopping opened, people go there as it is very convenient ... People go there for eating, for shopping. They bump into each other and meet each there. Barbara: They don't go to the Marginal anymore? Senhor Ismail: Only very few. In the past it used to fill up, driving past there was almost impossible (laughing) (Senhor Ismail, resident of Sommerschild II, October 2010).

Some interviewees referred to these social gatherings as the 'marriage market', where parents look for potential husbands and wives for their children, and where young people themselves come to see and be seen.⁶ So when the mall opened in 2007, this 'marriage market' moved from the beach to the mall, the mall thus being appropriated and integrated into already existing forms of sociability and patterns of public life. According to Sebastião, the centre manager, there was no plan for the mall to become

6 In the past, parents had a great influence on their children's choice of marriage partner in Indian milieus but people told us that this influence is decreasing. Indian milieus still have a reputation of opposing exogamous marriages, however, i.e. with Mozambicans of African descent.

a space of public life for the Indian milieus, it simply happened. Customers who frequent the mall for *passear* (leisure) instead of *fazer compras* (shopping) are welcomed by the management as they observe that the families nevertheless spend money at the shops and restaurants.

Not Good Enough: Urban Elites' Expectations

Affluent and middle-income urban dwellers who do not feel that they belong to the Indian milieus use the mall quite differently. For them, the mall is a place for shopping and they evaluate it accordingly. Raquel, a resident of Sommerschild II of Portuguese descent, explained to me: "I sometimes go to the mall to buy specific things, but I don't go there to hang out (*passear*)" (Raquel, January 2011). They go to the mall because goods are sold there that they cannot find elsewhere or because the prices are lower. Many urbanites do not buy all their groceries at one shop but tend to buy specific products at specific supermarkets or grocery stores because prices, freshness and quality of the products can vary considerably. Many members of the urban elite buy groceries at one of the many small, often Indian-owned, grocery stores in the city centre (*armazens, mercearias*), or they buy them at the Mercado Central, the central market, or at informal stands on inner city streets. They increasingly also frequent the growing number of supermarkets, like the HyperMaputo at the Maputo Shopping, and the South African owned Shoprite, Woolworths, Game and Mica. None of the residents of elite Sommerschild II who I interviewed shops at the many markets in *bairros* for groceries, like the nearby market Compone; these are clearly outside their shopping circuits.

Some of the new supermarkets are located outside the city centre and shopping there enables elite urban dwellers to stay away from the inner city which many elite interviewees experienced as noisy and clogged with cars. Besides the Maputo Shopping, members of the elite frequent the Polana Shopping Centre, situated in the upper part of the city centre, and the Shopping Centre Super Marés, which opened its doors in 2012 on Marginal Avenue at Costa do Sol beach, close to the new upmarket gated communities and villas. Super Marés is owned by a local business man, but the architecture shows clear influences of contemporary mall architecture in South Africa. This shopping facility is situated some distance from the city centre and forms part of an emerging edge city development. In an online newsletter aimed at the expatriate community, the new shopping mall is advertised as a place where one can park without stress, alluding to the lack of parking in the inner city (Club of Mozambique 2011). There are several more mall projects being planned for Maputo, many involving South African investors. Urban elites' everyday trajectories become increasingly transversal in the sense of driving from suburb to suburb rather than from suburb to the centre and back.

Members of the urban elite, as well as less affluent urban dwellers, feel that the shopping opportunities in Maputo are still limited and of inferior quality in comparison to nearby South Africa or Europe. The shopping circuits of Maputo's elite are hence deeply transnational: many elite families drive several times a year to Nelspruit, a South African town about three hours away by car from Maputo. Besides enjoying sleeping at a four-star hotel, going to the movies and eating at South African restaurants, the families go to buy clothes in Nelspruit, where they are cheaper and of better quality than in Maputo where much of the clothing is imported from China. For many,

the clothes shopping circuits even expand to other continents: business trips or family visits to Europe or the Middle East are used as an opportunity for clothes shopping and the purchase of consumer electronics. Until few years ago, many even bought groceries in South Africa. With the depreciation of the Mozambican metical in relation to the South African rand since 2000, however, and the later trade liberalisation in the SADC region, price differences have been reduced.

Hélder, a 55-year-old member of the Frelimo elite living close to the fish market, in a neighbourhood similar to Sommerschield II, claims to not have bought a single piece of clothing in Maputo since 1995 (Hélder, resident of the fish market area, September 2010). Like many others, he finds the prices of clothes and furniture at the Maputo Shopping overpriced and the quality poor in comparison to abroad. Jorge, a 30-something, well-paid lawyer living in the inner-city neighbourhood Coop, likes to buy branded clothing, but he suspects, again like many others, that the branded products sold at the Maputo Shopping may be counterfeits imported from China. Raquel does not like the Maputo Shopping because the presentation of the goods does not conform to her standards and disconcerts her senses. The supermarket smells of meat and there are flies, she explained to me (Raquel, a 40-year-old resident of Sommerschield II, January 2011). The products on the shelves at HyperMaputo are indeed sometimes full of dust and damaged, and not always of impeccable quality (Club of Mozambique 2016).

Like many others, Senhor Benedito, a former deputy-minister living in Sommerschield II, does not go to the mall for leisure purposes: “I go to one of the shops to buy something and then I go home. I don’t go to stroll around (*passrear*)” (Senhor Benedito, 47-year-old resident of Sommerschield II, August 2012). One important reason why many members of the elite emphasise that they do not *passrear* at the mall is that they fear that by spending time at the mall, they become publicly associated with hidden networks of power and corruption (see above). Some claimed it was also about ethics; they have hesitations about spending their money in a mall allegedly constructed with money from the drug trade.

Too Expensive, but there are Escalators: Mallgoers from Bairros

The meanings of heterotopias derive from the entanglements, their relationships to other urban spaces and to the larger urban society. In order to understand Maputo Shopping as a social space, it is necessary to look at the place the mall takes within the larger everyday shopping routines of its diverse users. For the majority of the residents from Polana Caniço, Maputo Shopping does not form part of their everyday shopping circuits, mostly because they have the perception that the prices there are too high. Their shopping circuits are rather centred on the markets, informal stalls (*bancas*) and small grocery stores (*contentores*, *barracas*) in the *bairros*, although they tend to buy electrical appliances and plastic household utensils in the Baixa section of the city centre.⁷ For clothing and consumer electronics, there are parallel legal and illegal markets based on transnational connections, as these goods are too expensive

7 Informal traders buy household items in the city centre and sell it in the ‘bairros’ at higher prices, so that it is cheaper to buy them in the city centre. For fruit and vegetables people say it is the other way around, as they either originate from the informal traders’ own fields or traders buy them in bulk at the wholesale market on the outskirts of the city; buyers in the city centre pay a higher price due to transport costs.

for Polana Caniço residents at normal shops. Many residents buy cell phones and similar items on the black market *Estrela* or through underhand dealings with acquaintances. When my cell phone was stolen in 2010 my friends told me half serious, half joking to look for it the following day at the *Estrela* black market. Young men travel to Johannesburg to buy stolen goods, usually through criminal networks constituted by co-nationals, and sell them back in Maputo, as Leandro, a 30-something former stolen goods trader, explained to me (Leandro, August 2012). Many *bairro* residents buy second-hand clothing from Europe (locally known as *roupa da calamidade*) on one of the many markets (especially Xipamanine), as they are of better quality and cheaper than the Chinese clothes sold in the city centre stores. Many residents of Polana Caniço also make a living based on these trades, for example by selling the second-hand clothing they buy from importers, who are usually Indian merchants (Brooks 2012: 288). As urban dwellers living in Polana Caniço can generally not afford to go on shopping sprees to nearby South Africa, entrepreneurs have made a business out of cross-border trade. The transnational networks of Indian merchants, criminal networks with South Africa and cross-border trade enable urban dwellers in Maputo to access consumer goods they could otherwise not afford.

Olívia, who was about 30 years old in 2012, was such a second-hand clothing seller on the market Compone, yet even though her husband was minibus driver it was still hard for her to feed her four children. She was a neighbour of the family I was staying with from time to time in Polana Caniço, and we became something like friends, although I did not know how to speak XiShangana and she did not speak much Portuguese. When she found out about my interest in the Maputo Shopping Centre, she proposed that we go there together. Because she believed that she needed money to enter the mall, she had never gone there: "What will I do in there?" she asked herself. Accompanying me seemed a good enough reason (Olívia, August 2012).

We eventually went to the mall together one week day. Olívia wanted to go into the supermarket to check the prices of powdered milk. She found to her surprise that it was actually cheaper to buy it there than at the *contentor* in her neighbourhood. When walking through the supermarket, Olívia put a shopping basket on her arm, not because she was used to it but, as she explained, because she had always wanted to shop this way. At a *contentor* in the *bairro*, she had to stand in a queue till the sales clerk, working behind a counter, gave her the goods she ordered from the shelves. Touching packed groceries and studying the prices was therefore something special for her, which she only did once a year when they did bulk shopping at Shoprite for the festive season.

Earlier that day, before we had left her house to go to the mall, she asked in a wave of insecurity: "Will I not embarrass you?" The question deeply troubled me but made me aware of how much going to the mall meant venturing into a 'foreign country' for her; how much it meant crossing social boundaries. Before we left her house, she had replaced her *capulana* with a white skirt and a colourful blouse and she put on her best shoes, her wedding sandals, as she explained to me. Yet there were things she could not change: a couple of her front teeth were missing, for example. She had braided her natural hair into neat rows, but in contrast to the shiny hair extensions of other women at the mall, her hairstyle was very simple, not least because of the tiny bits of maize stuck in it from pounding maize in the morning. For people living in *bairros*, being clean and neat, which is what they think urbanites should look like, demands work and

even tricks. Many office workers change their shoes before they enter their workplace, as their other shoes are full of sand from the *bairro* paths they had to use to get to work. Like the office, the mall is an urban space for which one's body needs to be prepared to go, and where urban dwellers can feel deeply out of place if they struggle to keep up to what they see as normative standards. Going to the mall even entails acquiring certain skills and bodily knowledge. Like many others who have never been to the mall, Olívia knew that the building had escalators but she had never been on one. When we went on the escalators, Olívia grasped my arm firmly and felt deeply anxious, preferring to take the stairs on the way down. Her experience of the mall stands in contrast to her everyday physical practices, and hence constitutes a space of exception, a break with the ordinary.

Many residents of Polana Caniço we talked to, even 47-year-old Senhora Aurora from the middle-class milieu in Casas Brancas, thought that “one cannot go to Maputo Shopping without money” (Senhora Aurora, August 2012). Gustavo, a resident of Maxaquene (a neighbourhood next to Polana Caniço) and a worker at Café Sol in Sommerschild II, went to the mall for the first time out of curiosity because he had never been on an escalator before. He told me that he was surprised that the prices were similar to other places, and as a consequence he started to go to the mall regularly to buy specific products at HyperMaputo which were cheaper there than elsewhere. When he went there for the first time, he bought something small to take home which he did not actually need, almost like a souvenir: “I had to come home with something from the Maputo Shopping Centre” (Gustavo, resident of Maxaquene, October 2010). Many inhabitants of the *bairros* never go to the mall, yet for those who do, the mall is something extraordinary, almost like a tourist attraction. “I felt well and as if I was not in Mozambique” (Senhora Aurora, August 2012). Some, like Gustavo, start including the mall in their shopping circuits for specific bargains. Yet only a few adults from Polana Caniço go to the mall for leisure, and if they do, it tends to be people with a formal job or who have had a lucky break, or to celebrate a birthday or a graduation one of the restaurants, for example at the popular restaurant Mimmos in the upstairs food court, rather than at one of the *halaal* restaurants downstairs.

Young people from Polana Caniço were less hesitant than the adults to appropriate the mall for their own purposes. As the mall is situated in the city centre, children and youth can easily sneak into the mall after school on their way home. Many young people from *bairros* venture regularly to the mall as a leisure space (for *passar*), which for them is full of interesting experiences they do not need much money for. Riding up and down the escalators, staring at the shop windows and other mall users, and sharing cheap food like biscuits with each other is not expensive. In contrast to the members of the Indian milieus who tend to come as families, these children and young people rarely come here with parents, but rather with groups of friends from school, from church or from the *bairro*.

On the trip to the mall with Olívia, the second-hand saleswoman from Polana Caniço, we were roaming around the games arcade on the fifth floor when Olívia's attention was caught by an Indian family whose children were sitting on a carousel, each with a pack of juice in their hands, and the mother holding a pizza carton. Imagining herself in this mother's position, Olívia commented that she would like to do that, too – come here with her family and eat together. Living in a *bairro* like Polana Caniço where many of her neighbours and probably also herself have experienced hunger, try-

ing to make a living in times of hardship, makes the social practice of eating luxury foods like pizza at the mall extraordinary.

Eating at the mall is also important for the youth. Children of all ages, some in school uniform and others not, sometimes gather in the afternoons on Guebuza Square in large groups and arrange the tables so that they can sit in a circle and share cheap biscuits and soft drinks bought at the HyperMaputo. For many of the interviewees from Polana Caniço, eating something whilst sitting with others at Guebuza Square, be it pizza or chicken ordered at a restaurant, be it *bolacha* (biscuits) or ice cream bought at the supermarket, was an important aspect of trips to the mall, which they remembered fondly in conversations about the mall. Sérgio, a 30-year-old university student living with his family in Polana Caniço, told me that he did not like going to the mall with his girlfriend, as she would want him to buy chocolate and other things which he considered unnecessary. While she was dreaming about eating out, he explained to me, he would be worrying about the empty bag of rice at his mother's house. At the mall, he experienced conflict between the demands of his girlfriend and his need to give money to his family for basic necessities like rice (Sérgio, August 2012). Unlike in romantic relationships, where the man in the breadwinner role is often expected to pay, in outings in groups, be it a group of friends from the church, from school or from the neighbourhood, everyone is generally expected to contribute to the meal, depending on how much money they could organise. In the context of the economic hardship typical of urban life in Maputo, eating such extraordinary food like ice-cream, pizza or chicken at the mall took on a ritual dimension. Doing something extraordinary together, although knowing that the money could be spent more wisely, creates a kind of 'communitas' (Turner 1991 [1969]) among people whose commitment to the group became expressed by their financial contribution. Social relations then become constructed through the practice of shared consumption, strengthening some social relations while weakening relations with absent others (Miller 1995, 1998).

Heterotopia of Illusion: The Mall as Mirror

A security guard of the Maputo Shopping Centre once told me proudly: "Maputo shopping mall is the mirror of Mozambique" (security guard, October 2010). When I asked what he meant by this metaphor, he explained that the mall is unique in the country, that it is beautiful, and that it is the first thing in Maputo tourists see when they arrive in a cruise ship at the nearby harbour. When reflecting on the security guard's mirror metaphor, I came across Foucault's formulation of heterotopia in which the mirror also plays a pivotal role, and which turned out to illuminate the ethnography of shopping malls as social spaces. According to Foucault, heterotopias have a representational, mirroring role with regard to society and other urban spaces.

In the mirror, I see myself there where I am not, in an unreal, virtual space that opens up behind the surface; I am over there, there where I am not, a sort of shadow that gives my own visibility to myself, that enables me to see myself there where I am absent: such is the utopia of the mirror. But it is also a heterotopia in so far as the mirror does exist in reality, where it exerts a sort of counteraction on the position that I occupy. From the standpoint of the mirror I discover my absence from the place where I am since I see myself over there. Starting from this gaze that is, as it were, directed toward me, from the ground of this virtual space that is on the other side of the glass, I come back toward

myself; I begin again to direct my eyes toward myself and to reconstitute myself there where I am. The mirror functions as a heterotopia in this respect: it makes this place that I occupy at the moment when I look at myself in the glass at once absolutely real, connected with all the space that surrounds it, and absolutely unreal, since in order to be perceived it has to pass through this virtual point which is over there (Foucault 1986 [1967]: 24).

The mirror is an actual existing object, yet when I look at myself in the mirror, I see myself in a place that actually doesn't exist, namely in a mirrored image of the reality. This tricky relation between the real and the unreal is for Foucault characteristic of all heterotopias, making them places of powerful illusions and fantasies. Linking my reading of Foucault with the ethnography of the mall, this means that, first of all, like the mirror, which is an actual existing object, the mall is a materially existing urban place that people go to. Urban dwellers integrate the Maputo Shopping into diverse shopping circuits, giving the mall a distinct, yet milieu-dependent, role in their everyday spatial practices. Secondly, Foucault says that the mirror has the power to turn the actors' own existence more real, because from the mirror, they can look at themselves, and see how they or their world 'really' is. This is also the case for the mall: the mall as mirror renders the urbanites' own reality more visible to them, they can see themselves from a new perspective (through the mirror), and hence they become more aware of their reality. As the guard explained above, the mall as a mirror reflects and makes visible to Mozambicans and tourists the achievements of the country, like the recovery from civil war and socialist times with empty shelves, being now a nation where at least the better-offs are able to participate in global consumer culture. Hence, looking at the mall is like looking into a mirror; it makes you aware of where the nation is actually standing, as if it were the embodiment of the mall managers' and politicians' discourses of modernisation and national progress. Yet it also renders visible, it materialises a further aspect of Mozambican reality: in the eyes of many users, the building and Guebuza Square is concrete proof that the rumours of corruption and the links between the legal and the illegal, between Guebuza and Bachir, are real. The mall hence makes socially visible the otherwise hidden social relations ruling the economy and politics, and at the same time unmask what seems to be visible reality as an illusion. Not least, because of this mirror-like capacity the mall becomes formed in relation to all these other realms of urban life.

The third aspect of the mall as mirror is that there is something fundamentally unreal about the mirror, as it projects the actors' real selves onto a virtual space "on the other side of the glass", which is an "unreal, virtual space that opens up behind the surface" (ibid: 17), a place where the actor are actually absent, but the mirror makes them believe that they are there, in this other world 'inside' the mirror. Translating this to the mall, it means that the mall enables urban dwellers to project themselves into a virtual, unreal world, which mirrors the real world but, like a utopia, can also suspend and overturn in. Because of this capacity, mirrors, shopping malls and other heterotopias have one fundamental effect on human beings: they spark their imagination. Heterotopias invite actors to reflect on their place in the world, make them more aware of what their reality is like and at the same time inviting them to imagine alternative ways of being in a utopic world.

Nelinha, the 16-year old school girl from Polana Caniço, walked past the large mansions hidden behind high walls in Sommerschild II on her way to school every day, and sometimes she saw the residents driving past her, sitting behind the darkened windows of their luxury cars. On some days after school, she used to go to Maputo Shopping, either with school friends, or alone to stroll around (*passar*), or to visit relatives working at a shop in the mall. She and her friends would walk around, stare at the windows and also stare at the Indian elite. At the mall, for once the elite are not hidden behind walls or car windows but share the same public space and can hence be observed, studied and judged.

Barbara: How did you feel when you were there? Nelinha: Uneasy. Because there were only (pause) big people (*gente grande*). I felt very small. I just walked past them, my eyes fixed on the floor ... I just watched, from the outside [of the shops], but I couldn't enter to buy anything. See, my parents (pause) they are poor. So there is always lack of something (Nelinha, resident of Polana Caniço, November 2010).

Being in this space together with *gente grande* (euphemism for wealthy and powerful people) felt uncomfortable to her, not least because the high prices and her empty pockets made her feel excluded. This provoked her reflections about her own reality, making her aware of her own social position, the poverty of her parents and the many unsatisfied desires. The mall has an extraordinary relationship to reality, according to Nelinha. It is a fantastic place which renders visible her inner dreams, it is a paradise of abundance where everything she desires is available, the only thing lacking is money:

It is something from a different world and exaggerated. It seems as if you were in a world of dreams, as you see everything, everything that you want. You think: "If I had money, I could simply take this, and that and that." When you get out of the mall, it feels as if you were having a shock. As if inside it was ... I don't know, but you always walk out differently from the way you entered. You enter and something changes there inside, and when you get out, you breathe, and you notice how you returned to the normal life (Nelinha, resident of Polana Caniço, August 2012).

For Nelinha, being at the mall was a deeply transformative, almost religious experience, which she found extraordinary and, like an experience of liminality (Turner 1991 [1969]), made her feel different once she left the building and returned to the busy streets and to real life. When I asked her whether she felt better or worse after the visit at the mall, Nelinha explained:

There is always the feeling of deception, but nevertheless, I usually feel much better, because I think ... I can still dream, I still have the capacity to achieve what I want. This is the spirit you feel when you get out: "I see things which I cannot buy and neither my parents can buy it for me." So I think I will study now with even more effort to be able to give to my children what I was not able to have (Nelinha, resident of Polana Caniço, August 2012).

Observing the wealthy provokes reflection on Nelinha's own place in society; it triggers her imagination about her own future, her plans to study in order to move out of

poverty. Because she is young, she reasons, she can still dream about her future. The visit to the mall and walking through the world of the wealthy did not so much leave her feeling deceived about life, but rather motivated her to study harder. “One day I will come back, one day I will shop here” she thought (Nelinha, November 2010).

Where Minorities become Majorities

In the neoliberal, post-socialist context of Mozambique, the Indian milieus occupy an ambivalent, tension-laden position. After the abolishment of the socialist *homen novo* ideology, citizenship became relatively undefined and a ‘floating signifier’, a symbol with no fixed meaning. Many Indians fear becoming the new ‘outsiders’ (Sumich 2013: 114). At Maputo Shopping, though, they distinctly claim their space in the city and in urban society. In contrast to other spaces where they are a small minority, here they dominate the place, especially on Sundays, which does not always lead to an easy conviviality. For members of the Indian milieus, going to the mall is mainly about being together with members of their own milieu, while paying little attention to others.

On a Sunday in August 2012, I observed an Indian family, probably a mother, her husband and their daughter, sitting at a table in the middle of Guebuza Square for about 40 minutes, and they were, just like me, the anthropologist, observing the crowd. They performed ‘civil inattention’ (Goffman 1963) towards members of African milieus and barely looked at them, while they openly gazed at mall users from their own religious and ethnic background. They commented to each other about them, apparently without worrying that the observed could see that they were being gossiped about. They greeted and were greeted by other Indians and Muslims. In interviews, Indian users of the mall told me that they have a heightened awareness of being observed and being gossiped about at the mall by members of their own milieus. Senhor Ismail, 60-year old Indian resident of Sommerschield II, claimed that: “I don’t like the ambience very much ... It’s full of people, and there is a lot of gossip, a lot of talking (laughing)” (Senhor Ismail, resident of Sommerschield II, October 2010). For him, Maputo Shopping is not an anonymous place; here he sees and is seen by others who belong to his own social world, encounters which contribute to constituting this very same social world. This exposure to the Muslim-Indian public and the related gossip is experienced by him and others as social pressure to conform to certain morals and values, which is why he presented the mall as a place that he did not like.

The social closure enacted through looks and civil inattention provokes critique from urban majorities who have become the minority at the mall. Many non-Indian interviewees told me that they feel uncomfortable at the mall on Sundays afternoon and prefer to frequent it on other days when the Indian presence is less.

Diogo: On the weekends the mall becomes full of Indians. The majority of black people therefore go on weekdays when it is emptier. Barbara: And why do they prefer to go during the week? Diogo: I don’t know, because it’s less full. And some also say: “It’s full of those *monhês*, I don’t like it there” (Diogo, 21-year-old resident of Sommerschield II, August 2012).

Historically, the term *monhé* was applied to Swahili and African Muslim chiefs in the 19th century. In the 20th century, the Portuguese used the term to refer to Muslim Indians and people of Indian descent (Bonate 2007b: 139). Nowadays in Maputo, *monhé*

is used by urban dwellers to refer to members of Indian milieus of diverse origins. It has, however, a clearly derogatory tone, and it invokes stereotypes about the allegedly racist attitudes of Indian milieus which held an intermediary position during colonialism. In such moments of competition over urban spaces, when the Indian milieus, which otherwise constitute a minority, become a dominant majority in the Sunday mall, urban dwellers reactivate such colonial stereotypes about the allegedly racist attitudes of these milieus. They critique the Indian milieus' dominance with reference to the past system of racial hierarchy.

Twenty-year old Jacinta, a student living in the Casas Brancas section of Polana Caniço, often travels to Nelspruit to buy clothes which she sells in Maputo. In an interview about her experiences of South African cities, she told me that she sometimes felt unwelcome in restaurants with predominantly white customers in South Africa. They would attend her because she was a client, but she felt that they did not actually want her there. When asked about whether spaces like this also exist in Maputo, she compared it to an experience at the Maputo Shopping Centre.

I remember that once at the Maputo Shopping, I was entering the mall with friends. Some *monhés* came and blocked our passage because they wanted to enter first. This created confusion, we almost fought. We felt as if they wanted to enter first because they are *monhés* and we are black. But this doesn't exist here. If they are not happy, they should return to India ... Here you have to learn to live together with blacks because it's a country of blacks. But it does not exist a lot here, I don't feel it often (Samira, about 20-year-old resident of Casas Brancas, August 2012).

In Samira's narrative, Maputo Shopping becomes constructed as a place where racial hierarchies from colonialism can, especially on Sunday afternoon, return to the city. The sociality at the mall provides glimpses into the problematic past, a past which instances of encounters can bring back to reality in this heterotopic space. Like a history book, the mall as heterotopia makes her aware of the urban past, it renders the colonial heritage of the city more visible to her, while also increasing her awareness that these times are over, that she is now also a full citizen, and that she can claim her right to be in this space by literally entering the door first.

Heterotopic Relation between Malls and Domestic Work

Approaching malls as heterotopias unravels how malls are entangled with other spheres of urban life, one of them being the labour entanglements existing in the realm of domestic work. When Olívia and I were strolling around the games arcade, Olívia drew my attention to an Indian-Muslim family, consisting of a woman in *hijab* and head scarf, her husband and a couple of their children, who were accompanied by a woman in a uniform with an apron. The woman in the apron was a domestic worker looking after the youngest child, a toddler. Olívia became angry at this sight and explained to me that it was despicable of this employer to make her domestic worker wear a uniform at the mall. She exclaimed with moral outrage: "They want her to use these clothes in order to mark difference, in order to show the difference to the public" (Olívia, August 2012). I asked how she believed the domestic worker felt in this situation. The domestic worker must be unhappy, she explained, as aprons are only supposed to be worn inside the house and were inappropriate for the mall. Olívia felt

negatively affected by the situation and disapproved strongly of the behaviour of the *patrão* (employer). For Olívia, denying the domestic worker the right to present herself as an urban citizen with decent clothes in this space of public life was an act of discrimination by the Indian employer. Later on the same day, on our way to the supermarket, we walked past another Indian family accompanied by a domestic worker. Olívia exclaimed: “Look, again, they force the domestic worker to wear work clothes in public to mark difference” (Olívia, August 2012). Only then she explained to me that she had looked for a job as a domestic worker recently herself. She was hence not only feeling pity for the domestic worker, but she imagined herself in her role, hence seeing herself where she was not (Foucault 1986 [1967]: 24).

At Maputo Shopping, the mall as a mirror makes urban dwellers more aware of the reality of urban society, its hierarchies and their social position in it. For Olívia, the mall makes visible the way employers treat their domestic workers, that they oblige them to wear uniform to mark social difference in public. This visibility of relations, which are usually lived in the intimate spaces of the home, renders the urban elites subject to critique and they become objects of moral judgement. The optical illusion of the mirror makes Olívia see herself in the role of the domestic worker, exposing her to the harsh reality which seems even harsher in the public of the mall. Maputo Shopping hence becomes a *heterotopia of illusion*, which exposes otherwise hidden aspects of urban reality, even exaggerates them, and also exposes “every real space ... as still more illusory” (ibid: 27). The mall makes visible what is usually not acknowledged, namely, that the elite’s lifestyles are deeply entangled with the lifeworlds of poorer milieus in the city, and domestic workers are needed to make their lives work, even on a family outing. What is often seen as an urban reality, namely, that urban elites can live enclaved lives disconnected from others in the city, is exposed as an illusion at the mall.

Greenstone Shopping Centre

The Greenstone Shopping Centre is a regional mall situated on a hill in north-eastern Johannesburg, next to Edenvale and Modderfontein. Until a few years ago, this land formed part of a belt of green veld which became transformed into the spatial expressions of privately driven city building. The new area referred to as Greenstone is made up of secured business parks, warehouse complexes, shopping malls, townhouse complexes and gated residential communities with free-standing houses. The Greenstone Shopping Centre itself constitutes the centre, so to speak, of this new edge city officially called ‘Greenstone Hill’. In contrast to the Maputo Shopping Centre, which is spatially integrated into the city centre, Greenstone Mall corresponds more to the type of suburban malls, as it is located in an area of urban sprawl, it is difficult to reach on foot, and it has inward-oriented architecture.

The inside of the mall consists of one long alley surrounded by shops and restaurants on two storeys. The mall is divided into two parts by a large main square with restaurants, movie theatre, and a large glass front leading to an artificial green area outside. This area has an artificial grass floor where users can sit down, with playground equipment for children and a fountain. One can see the blue sky if looking upwards, but the square is surrounded by multi-storey car parks in grey cement. With its 85,000 square metres Greenstone Mall is a third larger than Maputo Shopping. It

has the facilities typical of a South African regional mall, with national retailers (Game, Edgars etc.), of which some seek to attract better-paid suburbanites (Pick n Pay, Woolworths), and some cheaper shops like Mr Price and PQ Clothing cater for the youth and people in search of lower prices. There are also a few boutique stores which do not belong to a chain. They moved here from the town centre of Edenvale which was the commercial centre for the larger area till the mall opened. The mall has leisure facilities like a movie theatre, a couple of restaurants, an indoor playground for children and even a licensed gambling venue. The shops and facilities cater largely for families with mid-range incomes; it is neither as fancy as the famous Sandton City mall nor is it oriented towards low-budget customers like some malls in the townships.

From the hill one has a nice view onto the high-rise buildings of the lower-lying Johannesburg CBD and the surrounding suburbs. John, a design architect who was engaged in many mall projects in Johannesburg and elsewhere explained to me that the builders probably did not take advantage of this view onto the cityscape because the inward-oriented architecture draws mallgoers attention to the appearance of and sociability with other mallgoers, which is more enjoyable than looking at the cityscape: "I believe that people enjoy seeing people. They interact with people in the way they pass each other, in the way they see each other dressed. There is a far stronger attraction to that than looking at a nice view" (John, October 2012).

Unlike the Maputo Shopping Centre where the boundaries between inside and outside are gradual and where there is a certain tolerance by the security personnel of informal traders at the entrance, the Greenstone Shopping Centre is tightly controlled and there is no room for economic activities apart from the formal. In contrast to the Maputo Shopping Centre where Guebuza Square is used by many pedestrians as a shortcut through the city, Greenstone Mall is not located on any existing pedestrian routes and is therefore only entered by people who specifically want to come to the mall. In contrast to Maputo Shopping where one can observe occasional beggars in Guebuza Square and poorly dressed children running up and down the escalators, at Greenstone Mall, the presence of visibly destitute people is exceptionally rare. The entry to the parking area is guarded by security booms and often security personnel stand at the boom and control the cars. The boom signals clearly that one is entering a space controlled by private ownership and private security companies. Heterotopias are contingent on such mechanisms of opening and closing, not least because they distinguish them clearly as different from spaces of ordinary life (Foucault 1986 [1967]: 26).

Greenstone Shopping Centre is owned by the Sasol Pension Fund, Sasol being a large South African company in the mining/energy sector. Sasol hence owns several malls in the country, not least because "large regional shopping centres perform better than any other segment of the property market in South Africa" (John, design architect, October 2012). During apartheid there were, however, also political reasons for investing in malls: shopping malls in South Africa became a target for real estate investors because sanctions prohibited them from investing abroad (Marais 2001: 123). Sasol, nowadays a transnational company, was founded as a public corporation tightly linked to the apartheid modernist project and was privatised in 1979. The company has grown to what it is today as a result of subsidies and protection by the apartheid state and the cheap cost of African labour during apartheid. The profits generated at the mall will be used to pay the pensions of Sasol's workforce, a workforce which is still made up mostly of male, often Afrikaner, employees. Many mallgoers do not know

who or what the owner of the mall is, and hence the history and politics behind Sasol's surplus capital and the complex ways in which the money spent by the consumer in the mall flows back to the pension pay-outs of Sasol employees remain unmentioned on in the city, a reality hidden behind the shiny façade. This stands in contrast to Maputo Shopping where the economic powers behind the mall are constantly commented on by urban dwellers.

Abundance, Pollution and Exclusion

In the representations of Greenstone Mall, at least three different discourses are involved: there is (1) the narrative created by the marketing branch of the management in the promotional material which represents the mall as a space full of abundance, even nature and social relations; (2) there is a counter-discourse by environmental activists which blame the property developers for destroying nature, and (3) there is the discourse employed by the architects and planners of malls which portrays them as totally planned and calculated institutions with invisible walls which keep the poor away.

"Simply sensational shopping", was the slogan of the mall management on the Greenstone Mall website in 2013, and they promised that the mall offers "something for everyone" (Greenstone Shopping Centre 2013).⁸ Here you can buy "everything you need" for school at the stationery retailer CNA and customers can "eat as much as you like" for R75 at the Breakfast Buffet at the Cape Town Fish Market restaurant. In these website texts, marked by the extensive use of adjectives and superlatives (like 'trendy' fashions, 'exquisite' gifts, 'fabulous' home furnishing, 'fantastic' food outlets), the mall management portrayed the mall as a space of endlessly available goods. Yet the website promised more than mere consumption: it claimed that the mall is "a delightful oasis to those seeking a respite from it all", portraying Greenstone Mall as a secure oasis of abundance, to which urban dwellers can retreat from busy, stressful and chaotic city life. The introductory text on the website in 2013 announced that the mall was opened in 2007 "much to the delight of communities from Edenvale and surrounding areas". The reference to 'communities' indicates that the management want the mall to be seen not as an anonymous commodified space, but as a 'warm' and 'welcoming' place where the local 'communities' meet. With that they emphasise the rootedness of the mall, the connection to the locality and meaningful social relations. The logo of the mall consists of the name 'Greenstone' against a backdrop of two lines which allude to hills, probably representing Greenstone Hill on which the mall is located.

In the book *The Urban Revolution*, Henri Lefebvre pointed out that nature becomes one of the key problems in an urbanising world. What has once been abundant – space, water, air – becomes scarce, yet in advertisement, nature becomes fetishized. While nature is actually shrinking in the city, signs of nature and the natural are "multiplying, replacing and supplanting real 'nature'. These signs are mass-produced and sold. A tree, a flower, a branch, a scent, or a word can become signs of absence: of an illusory and fictive presence" (Lefebvre 2003 [1970]: 27).

The fetishization of 'nature' in the naming of the mall as 'Greenstone' as well as its logo becomes particularly clear when juxtaposing it to the second representation

8 The following analysis is based on texts on the website as it was in April 2013 (Greenstone Shopping Centre 2013) as well as promotional pamphlets collected during fieldwork in 2012.

of the mall upheld by environmental activists. Peter (ca. 65), is a resident of nearby Modderfontein whose parents moved from England to South Africa many decades ago in order to work for the dynamite company AECI. The company AECI was given about 4000 hectares of land by the Kruger government, land which then served as a safety buffer zone between the dynamite factory and the residential areas of Johannesburg. AECI constructed a workers' town, Modderfontein, for the European artisans (for more details see Behrens 2005). What used to be workers' houses separated according to their country of origin ('ethnic villages') has been transformed in the last few decades into affluent gated communities and retirement villages where many of the former AECI employees live. In the early 2000s, AECI's property arm Heartland Properties, began to transform the former buffer zone, which was no longer needed because technologies had changed, into highly profitable urban land by pushing for its rezoning, putting in urban infrastructure like sewage in place, and selling it. The first large piece of land, 320 hectares, is where Greenstone Shopping Centre, as well as many strip malls and gated communities, were built.

The rapid transformation of green veld into the Greenstone area was not welcomed by some long-term residents of Modderfontein like Peter, not least because environmental pollution has become a major problem. The Modderfontein area contains a system of dams and a nature conservation area (Modderfontein Nature Reserve) with wetlands and a lake zoned as open land. These are areas which are not supposed to be built on. Since the Greenstone edge city has been built, the dams have suffered from severe pollution. Political activists, residents and politicians blame Heartland for this; apparently the bulk sewage infrastructure put in by Heartland before selling the Greenstone land for development was not large enough to carry the high density living.

Peter hence founded a small organisation lobbying to protect Modderfontein's nature. He remembers nostalgically his childhood days spent playing on the dams:

Before all this happened, when we were kids, we played and learnt to swim here, safely, and we fished and it was also a place where frogs and much more lived (Newsletter by Peter, November 2013, sent through Linbro Park Community Google Group).

Peter blames AECI and Heartland for selfish, profit-oriented practices which led to the pollution of rivers and dams, now "filled with sewerage, mountains of ash, trash, paint, oil and millions of golf balls" (Newsletter by Peter, November 2013, sent through Linbro Park Community Google Group). In 2013, AECI sold the second large piece of land, 1600 hectares, to the Chinese developer Shanghai Zendai for 1.06 billion rand. The Chinese company was planning to build a new Sandton-like city (Scott 2015, Ballard et al. 2017). The transaction was one of South Africa's largest single foreign direct investments. The sale was received very critically by the local activists as they fear that the Chinese will not be interested in ecological rehabilitation of the waterways.

Greenstone Mall and its representations as a place of abundance situated on Greenstone Hill upheld in its advertisements, or as a place where nature has been destroyed, a representation upheld by environmental activists, would appear to be an embodiment of Lefebvre's nature-urban relation. At the same time as nature becomes scarce, which the environmental activists criticise, the "ideological naturalization becomes obsessive" (Lefebvre 2003 [1970]: 27). In contrast to Maputo where the counter-discourse that Maputo Shopping is a place of money laundering is very popular and even

influences shopping practices, in Johannesburg the counter-discourse of environmental destruction is little known beyond residents of Modderfontein who read the local newspapers.

In academia, malls are often portrayed as ‘enclaves’ and this also corresponds closely to the ways in which practitioners like John, a mall designer, represent malls, namely, as totally planned and calculated institutions with invisible walls which keep the poor away. John had been involved in many retail projects over his career. When developing a mall, he explained to me, “you want to create a machine which is going to draw as much money out of the surrounding population as possible” (John, design architect, October 2012). Shopping mall experts like him have developed a whole science of shopping including calculating walking distances, choosing certain colours and materials and avoiding others, choosing the lighting and the arrangement of shops and goods in such a way as to create an environment that seduces the urban dweller to consume maximally and to feel at ease (Chebat and Morrin 2007, Helten 2007: 247).

While urban dwellers appropriate spaces and imbue them with meanings, mall designers regard malls in abstract numbers, such as the internal rate of return (IRR) or foot traffic statistics. Despite this appraisal of the mall in abstract terms, John, like other mall planners, is also highly aware of the social relevance of malls. “It becomes a social heart of the city, for those who can afford” (John, design architect, October 2012). Yet he emphasised that the first motive for mall designers is to create profits, and the social characteristics are only of secondary importance. Mall investors and mall designers see urban dwellers primarily as consumers with spending power.

In the 1980s many malls had ‘themes’, yet this architecture of fantasy and escapism became widely criticised by architects in South Africa and elsewhere and was eventually replaced by what John calls ‘international modernism’, which is almost “Zen-like where less is more”, a functional architecture with flat and monochromatic materials, usually working with rectilinear forms avoiding curves (John, design architect, October 2012).⁹ This architecture of disconnection from cultural references makes sense in the post-apartheid city, according to John:

It has become this non-architecture, an architecture that is a statement of disconnection from the realities of people’s traditional heritage. Which is just as bad and disconnected as the theme architecture. The reason for that is, I think, what they call the rainbow nation. There are many different ethnic groups that make up South Africa. There is the fear that by selecting one ethnic group you are going to drive away others (John, design architect, October 2012).

9 Some of the financially most successful malls in the country, according to John, are themed malls, as their interior design does not demand adjustment to changing fashions. Other shopping malls tend to have a very short lifespan, as ways of lighting, types of shop front and fashion in design materials change quickly, and hence after a mere seven to ten years the finish of the mall is outdated. Investors either have to re-invest in order to keep up with newer malls or the mall will enter a downward spiral in which the high-end stores and wealthy customers will leave and value stores like factory outlets will enter (John, design architect, October 2012). All over Johannesburg there are indeed half-empty malls which have lost their appeal and struggle to survive. Designed as commercial spaces, appropriation for other uses is difficult, apart from fitness centres and outlet stores (Parlette and Cowen 2011).

In contrast to apartheid where many shopping centres were reserved for white people, nowadays many different 'ethnic groups' interact at the mall. In terms of class, however, mall developers do not want to be as inclusive, but mall planners often purposely design barriers for poor people:

That is a wonderful transition that has happened. The only barrier in the design of shopping centres is the barrier to poor people. You try to keep them out in many respects. And that's done in a subtle way. If you ask any of the developers, they will not be as honest as I. They will say: "No, the shopping centres are completely open to all levels of society." Whilst that is true in the effect that there is no physical barrier, the centres are designed to suit those that have money (John, design architect, October 2012).

According to John, the upper classes feel uncomfortable and unsafe in the co-presence of the very poor "because they perhaps are not as refined in manners and their methodology of dealing with each other. They are loud, they are maybe aggressive, they may be dirty", as John explained. The lower classes will also have feelings of insecurity "because they do not have as much as those who have more." In order to keep a mall profitable, a 'line' against the very poor needs to be drawn. Poor people driving away the rich at malls is the "biggest social reason for failure in South Africa" (John, design architect, October 2012).

In township malls the expenditure per capita is lower and customers who arrive by public transport (minibus taxi) stay longer in a mall than people arriving by car. Therefore, the malls and hallways in township malls are designed to be wider in order to accommodate greater numbers of people. At a mall like Greenstone, John explained, designers avoid wide hallways, as large open spaces can appear empty and anonymous. Designers rather try to create pedestrian congestion, especially in front of shops, in order to force people to enter them. Details like the number of toilets, the standard of the fittings in the toilets and the walking distance to the toilets can be used to influence consumer behaviour, such as how much time customers spend at the mall. Pedestrians are not preferred customers as they have very low incomes, but taxi ranks – for people who can at least afford to pay the minibus taxi – are often integrated into the parking areas of South African malls. The taxi ranks, however, need to be positioned wisely, John explained, as car owners get uncomfortable if crowds of people with big packets walk past their newly leased cars which could get scratched.

For the selection of stores the notion of 'comparative shopping' is important for mall designers and marketing specialists: the various clothing stores are often positioned relatively close to each other so that customers have more options. The choice of the main supermarket ('anchor store') of the right size is crucial, as different supermarket chains appealed to different customers. The desire to keep the poor out is also the reason why many shopping malls do not provide many benches or other free seating areas apart from restaurants where mallgoers are obliged to order something: "As soon as you provide too much of those facilities, you allow the poor to occupy your spaces, which drives away the rich" (John, design architect, October 2012). Representations of malls by their designers often do not correspond to the way users actually appropriate malls, however. Approaching malls as entangled spaces of heterotopia entails multiple logics and is constituted by irresolvable tensions and contradictions, like the one between the advertisement of the mall as 'Greenstone' and its destruction

of nature, and the contradiction between the fantasy of exclusion of the poor and the messier reality.

Shopping Routines in Johannesburg

The notion of enclave emphasises the disconnection and closure of a space. Foucault's notion of heterotopia, however, draws our attention to their entanglements with other spaces, and to systems of opening and closing which not only isolate heterotopias, but also "make them penetrable" (Foucault 1986 [1967]: 26). Shopping malls only come into being as spaces with social relevance by virtue of their connections and exchanges between inside and outside. Malls, like Greenstone Mall, can only create profit on the condition that urban dwellers integrate them into their shopping and leisure circuits and prove willing to cross the boundaries between home and mall, between public space and the privately owned space of public life, and often also between social worlds. Any ethnography of malls hence needs to explore how urban dwellers integrate the mall into their everyday urban trajectories.

Suburban Mall Routines

HERE'S one thing that no other city in the country can offer like Johannesburg does: shopping ... shopping for Africa. From the upmarket Sandton Shopping Centre and Nelson Mandela Square to the fun Oriental Plaza and not-to-be-missed Rosebank Flea Market, Joburg is a shopper's paradise (Official website of the City of Johannesburg 2013).

Johannesburg has an elaborate and diversified shopping landscape. There are large, regional malls like Greenstone, strip malls without an entertainment character, old, deserted malls which lost customers because newer, fancier malls were constructed close by (e.g. Rosettenville Junction); new malls which cater for specific lifestyles like the middle-class youth (The Zone@Rosebank) or the commercial design scene (Design Quarter). Shopping malls constitute the central spaces in the shopping and leisure circuits of affluent urban dwellers like the property owners in the suburb of Linbro Park. It was not always like this. Before the construction of the Greenstone edge city, the affluent Linbro Park residents used to shop in Edenvale, a separate town on the East Rand belonging to the neighbouring municipality Ekurhuleni which has become drawn into the polynuclear conurbation of the Johannesburg city region.

Now the whole area has just filled [with new suburbs and malls]. I have been around 20 years in Edenvale, I can see the changes, I am becoming one of those 'remember when' (laughs) (Laura, 45-year-old resident of Edenvale, working in Linbro Park, May 2012).

With the construction of the new neighbourhood Greenstone Hill, with its malls and townhouse complexes, shopping circuits shifted away from Edenvale's town centre. Only a few local businesses, often family-run stores owned by ethnic minorities like Indians, Greeks, Portuguese, Italians or Jews, were able to survive (see also Hyslop 2005: 8).

Till the 1970s, suburbs mostly had a residential function and suburbanites commuted by car to the Johannesburg city centre for work, leisure and shopping. With the

edge city developments, these spatial practices started to change. For the majority of middle-class shoppers from the northern suburbs the CBD is no longer of importance, as on their way to the city centre they pass several malls with the same items found in the centre of any first-world city (Beavon 2000: 3). Also, members of the Linbro Park property owning milieu seldom venture into the CBD, and some even get lost on the streets of the CBD if they have to pick someone up from the long-distance bus station or show visiting family members around.

In order to grasp cityscapes and the way urban dwellers live in and constitute cities ethnographically, there is a need to replace conceptions of space as absolute, bounded territories with relational perspectives (Harvey 2006: 121, 133). In absolute terms, the mall is located at a distance of about five kilometres from the suburb Linbro Park, which takes about ten minutes by car. In relative terms, Greenstone Mall is 'just around the corner' for property owners in Linbro Park, in terms of how they describe it. Many of them visit the mall daily or at least a couple of times a week in order to buy groceries, go to the bank, visit the gym or eat out. For the property owners and many other milieus in Johannesburg, shopping malls have become the preferred site for leisure and consumption activities (see also Van Eeden 2006: 39). Today, urbanites even venture to shopping malls to visit movie theatres, bars, nightclubs and children's play parks.

Johannesburg's post-Fordist, postmodern shopping-scape depends on automobility (Czeglédy 2004). Since crime increased in Linbro Park in the 1990s, residents no longer even walk within the suburb, but drive to visit neighbours or attend community meetings. The drive from Linbro Park to Greenstone takes ten minutes if there is no traffic; in Johannesburg, where suburbanites are used to commuting long distances, these five kilometres constitute a short drive. Some of the tenants living in Linbro Park take much longer drives of up to 35 kilometres to areas to the east, like to Benoni and Boksburg, where groceries are cheaper. "The closer you get to Johannesburg's central areas, the more expensive the shops get" (Liz, 55-year-old resident of Linbro Park, June 2012).

Anna, tenant in Linbro Park, used to live with her brother who was a property owner and worked at a bank in Greenstone Mall. She usually took the backroads to the mall, as the highway was often packed with traffic. Every day she drove through the same entrance and parked her car in the same section which she chose carefully because of its proximity to her workplace as well as the supermarket (Anna, April 2012). In order to find her car again in the large, concrete jungle of the car park, she remembered landmarks like the name of a bar written on the concrete wall, after which she knew she had to turn left to return to her car. Because the many parking areas and the several entrances all look alike, users of the mall depend on way-finding devices (Lynch 1960: 3), mainly the fronts of restaurants and stores, in order to avoid getting lost.

Property owners in Linbro Park explain that they go to Greenstone because it is practical, and not because they seek out a specific public. "It's convenient and quiet" Claudia, about 30 years old, living in nearby Edenvale and working in Linbro Park, explained to me (Claudia, March 2012). Rachel, resident of Linbro Park, liked Greenstone because "it is big, open, there is everything you want, it has banks, and it is in the area" (Rachel, May 2012). Sixty-five-year-old Sarah, also a property owner in Linbro Park, works as manager of a shop at a nearby mall. She describes Greenstone Mall as a 'working class' mall, by which she does not refer to blue-collar workers, but to

the work-related rhythm of quietness and business which characterise the mall. The mall becomes busy at lunch time when employees working nearby meet friends or colleagues at the mall, it gets busy after work in the evenings when employees come to buy milk and bread, and on the weekends when families and couples come here for leisure and their weekly shopping. Unlike Sandton City and other high-end malls where the elite who do not depend on office hours mingle on weekdays, she pointed out to me, Greenstone Mall is quiet during the week.

Elderly people from surrounding suburbs frequent the mall. Nearby old age homes organise transport for their pensioners who spend some hours in the morning at the mall, shopping, strolling around and sitting at restaurants, till the transport fetches them again. Laura, a 45-year-old resident of Edenvale working in Linbro Park, explained to me: “My mother stays at a retirement home in the area. Monday, they go to Greenstone, Wednesday, they go somewhere else, Friday I think they go to Riebeeck mall” (Laura, May 2012). In the mornings, mothers come with their toddlers to the mall to meet their friends after they have dropped the older children off at school. In the afternoons, teenagers come on romantic dates, drinking milkshakes together until they are fetched by their parents. For the children of Linbro Park property owners who are now in their twenties, however, Greenstone Mall does not form part of their leisure circuits, as they associate it with ‘family’ and prefer to go to the movies, restaurants and bars in more fashionable malls in Bedfordview, Sandton or Rosebank. Unlike the Maputo Shopping Centre where users tend to socialise at the mall in larger groups of up to ten people, the frequency of Greenstone is more individualised. Customers walk around alone, in groups of two or as nuclear families, reflecting the more individualised social structure of the city. The walking speed at Greenstone Mall generally tends to be higher than at Maputo Shopping. During the week visitors tend to walk at a fast pace with a clear aim. The Mozambican strolling around (*passaar*) at a slow pace for the sake of enjoying the public and the architecture is rather rare. On the weekends many Greenstone users’ walking speed is more relaxed, but their attention tends to be on the shops and the goods on display and not so much on other mallgoers. The shopping mall is hence integrated in the diverse everyday practices and spatial routines of urbanites living in surrounding suburbs like Linbro Park. Malls hence emerge as deeply contextual and relational spaces, constituted by the way Johannesburg residents use the mall within the rhythms of their everyday life.

Township Shopping Circuits

Greenstone Shopping Centre are just one space among many that urban dwellers weave into their shopping circuits. The shopping circuits Alexandra residents engage in in their everyday life look quite different from the shopping routines of the Linbro Park suburbanites. The retail facilities as well as physical access to them still reflect apartheid inequalities, yet there is also considerable change. During apartheid, shopping malls were predominantly frequented by white milieus. The Reservation of Separate Amenities Act (1953) gave the local state as well as private enterprises the right to reserve their publicly accessible facilities for specific racial groups. Petty apartheid separated everyday lives and spatial practices on a micro-geographical level (Housay-Holzschuch and Teppo 2009: 355). Poverty and lack of transport also restricted the possibilities of participating in the mall landscape, which started to emerge from the 1970s on. Township dwellers’ shopping circuits continued to take them to the CBD

and the informal shops in the township (Tomlinson and Larsen 2003: 48). Larger retail developments were forbidden in townships during apartheid and up to 1994 townships only had small, informal retail businesses (*spaza* shops) (Ligthelm 2012: 37, Tomlinson and Larsen 2003: 49). Still today township dwellers buy small quantities of the groceries they require daily like milk and bread at these shops. The Pan Africa commercial area, based in the industrial area of Wynberg at the entrance to Alexandra, has served Alexandra as a retail and transport hub for decades. The small supermarkets and butcheries have the reputation of being very cheap, so that domestic workers living in the nearby suburbs like Linbro Park come to shop here. Since the 1990s, the spending power of township residents has increased significantly. National retailers have thus become interested in expanding into these untapped markets, not least because suburban areas have become saturated (Ligthelm 2012: 37). Like many other townships in the last few years Alexandra has also received its own shopping malls. In 2009, Pan Africa Shopping Mall was opened, in relation to the urban renewal initiative, the Alexandra Renewal Project (ARP). The Pan Africa Mall is seen by many as a sign of the development of the township and a symbol for the growing inclusion into the affluent consumption world of Johannesburg. In comparison to Greenstone Mall, however, many see Pan Africa Mall as quite ordinary. Bertha, resident of River Park, explained her comparative experience of the two places like this: "The first time I entered Greenstone, I was like 'wow'. And when I enter Pan Africa I am like 'ok, this is simply a mall'" (Bertha, June 2012).

The shopping landscape has become diversified for Alexandra's residents. Many Alexandra residents continue to go to the CBD where small, often immigrant-owned shops offer low prices. Many of the women interviewed compare prizes across the different supermarkets available in the Pan Africa area and buy goods where they are cheapest. For township shopping rhythms, time is an important factor. Township dwellers who get a monthly salary buy small items like bread at a nearby *spaza* shop, and then buy in bulk once they get their salary. Shopping rhythms by households with multiple income sources, though, depend on more complex rhythms. Bertha, 30 years old and living with her sister in River Park, used to go shopping on the first, the tenth and the twentieth of the month. On the first day of the month, she receives child grants, on the tenth she receives the rent from their tenants (she and her siblings own property in River Park), and on the twentieth her sister gets her salary. As many households can only afford to shop once they receive the grants, the rhythms of the malls they frequent are entangled with the rhythms of grant pay-outs.

Based on the interviews and observations I could distinguish at least four different types of mallgoer from Alexandra at Greenstone Mall. The first type are members of aspiring middle-class milieus who own a car and have adopted similar shopping practices to suburban milieus, except that they continue to live in the township, often for financial reasons. They drive to Greenstone or another mall almost daily to buy groceries, and malls have become a firm part of their leisure and shopping circuits. The second type of mallgoer from Alexandra is people who shop for 'specials', so people who only go to the mall because of a specific sale. These members of poorer milieus hear about sales and specials on the TV, in newspapers or pamphlets, and go to buy in large quantities. The third type of visitor is the young township dwellers who go to Greenstone for what they call 'window shopping' (see below). with or without money in their pockets they go to the mall as a leisure activity, to look at goods or people, similar to

the Mozambican *passerar* (strolling around). On Saturdays in particular I used to bump into acquaintances from Alexandra at Greenstone Mall who were there for ‘window shopping’, in the company of their romantic partners or friends. The fourth type of township mallgoer from Alexandra is the workers who are employed at the Greenstone Mall or at nearby malls and spend their lunch breaks there.

Greenstone is also about five kilometres away from Alexandra, yet for township dwellers, it is more complicated to get there than for suburbanites who own a car. Alexandra’s convenient location in the midst of the northern suburbs puts it in the proximity of many malls in the surrounding areas, like Balfour Park, Norwood and Greenstone, but it is complicated to get there by public transport and relatively expensive. In order to save transport money, many River Park residents, the part of Alexandra situated closest to the N3, prefer to walk to Greenstone. There are no sidewalks, which means that pedestrians walk along dangerous roads. Apart from speeding cars, criminals are also major obstacles on the walk from River Park to Greenstone. Muggers waiting on the pedestrian bridge across the N3 highway are well aware of when people receive their social grants or salaries and mug workers and mallgoers on their way. Some workers, therefore, avoid the bridge and directly walk or run across the N3 highway, which is obviously very dangerous. In addition, trails have emerged along the highway where pedestrians often walk. The concrete jungle, where usually only cars speed by, has become appropriated by urban dwellers, making the city the product of many builders (Lynch 1960: 1). On the one hand, this shows that Greenstone Mall is indeed characterised by many barriers, limiting its accessibility for people with no car and little income. On the other hand, it shows the importance of acknowledging that despite these barriers, at least some township dwellers regularly venture to Greenstone Mall, weaving it into their shopping and leisure circuits. Because of urbanites’ agency, exemplified by the trails along the highway, a mall sitting on a distant hill like Greenstone becomes entangled with township spaces.

Heterotopia of Compensation

Shopping malls as heterotopias have, in relation to the rest of the spaces, a function (Foucault 1986 [1967]: 27). Maputo Shopping Centre has the function of illusion: for its users, the mall dismantles reality as illusory, it renders visible things which are otherwise invisible, and it sparks imagination. The Greenstone Shopping Centre, in contrast, has the function of compensation. As an entangled heterotopia, the mall compensates for what urban dwellers find is lacking in other urban spaces. Such heterotopias of compensation create “a space that is other, another real space, as perfect, as meticulous, as well arranged as ours [the rest of the spaces] is messy, ill constructed and jumbled” (ibid: 27, 21). Heterotopias as counter-spaces are real places “situated outside all other spaces destined to efface, to neutralize, to compensate or purify the spaces they oppose” (Boyer 2009: 54). Greenstone Shopping Centre is such a heterotopia of compensation in relation to the troubled, cramped shack living, the danger of chance encounters with strangers in public streets and the deep inequality felt in domestic work relations.

Safe Chance Encounters

Many of the Linbro Park property owners have become regular customers at stores in Greenstone Mall and the surrounding strip malls. Interactions between customers and shop employees are in general informal and friendly; after few visits they acknowledge that they know each other, and the relationship becomes more personal. Greeting rituals (Hello, how are you?") often transform into brief conversations about the weather and many soon ask for each other's names and remember them. When I accompanied Regula, a 30-year old Swiss tenant living in Linbro Park, to the gym on Greenstone Hill, I noticed that she greeted the gym employees by name and vice versa. Gabriel, the 23-year old son of a property-owning family in Linbro Park, works out every day at the fancy Virgin Active gym at Stoneridge (one of the strip malls at Greenstone) and often eats there at the Fruit & Veg City supermarket with his best friend.

The managers are all Portuguese and Greek boys, they know us. And they always put extra pasta for our bowls. They are the best (Gabriel, 23-year-old son of a property-owning family in Linbro Park, May 2012).

Becoming a regular customer at a bar, restaurant, shop or gym meant for them that urban anonymity became transformed into acquaintanceship. Although the supermarket chain Fruit & Veg City has multiple stores across the city of Johannesburg, the branch at Stoneridge takes on a different meaning for Gabriel because of his casual social relations to the managers. Many young people drive across town to a specific franchised branch of News Café, a bar popular among middle-class youth and young professionals. Although the food and drink served at News Café in Sandton are identical to the News Café branch in Bedfordview, customers may have become friends with the manager and other customers, social relations which give the otherwise anonymous franchised bars a distinct identity. Through the construction of social relations as well as memories attached to spaces, apparently identical franchised branches become lived spaces with distinct place identities. Such forms of appropriation are easily overlooked, as they do not leave traces nor are they visible to outsiders.

Linbro Park residents go to Greenstone mostly with the intention to shop and less for leisure, but nevertheless social relations with other customers become enacted at the mall in ephemeral situations of interaction. As explained in chapter 4, with the end of apartheid and conflicts about competing future visions for Linbro Park, the active, leisure-based associational life in the suburb has diminished since the 1980s. Victorian sports have ceased to be a key realm for the construction of neighbour relations and nowadays it is through the internet and in activities related to security governance that residents build up at least some neighbour sociability. The mall is one of the very few urban places where neighbours from Linbro Park can bump into each other by chance. Neighbours may have very little to do with each other in everyday life, but serendipitous encounters at the mall help to keep up the relations, and to remind each other of the neighbourliness, so that these relations can more easily be reactivated in case one needs help from a neighbour, for example because a horse has strayed or a burglary has taken place.

Laura was living with her family in Edenvale and working at the King's School which belongs to the charismatic church LRC in Linbro Park. For her, the mall has a bit of the character of a town centre where: "You often meet somebody that you know.

From church, from school, your neighbour. You don't even get to see your neighbour usually, but when you see them it's in the mall (laughs) or driving past" (Laura, May 2012). So not only neighbour but also church relations are fostered through chance encounters at the mall. This social relevance of Greenstone Shopping Centre for the strengthening of religious ties is even mentioned in sermons at the LRC Church in Linbro Park. At one church service, a volunteer said:

Yesterday I went to Greenstone Shopping Centre, to go to a shop, just to buy something. But then I only came out two hours later. I bumped into people from the church, we went to have coffee. You can't go to the mall without meeting anybody from the church (volunteer, church service LRC Church, September 2012).

The church not only provides spiritual guidance but also creates a warm, sociable environment, which stretches beyond the church into other urban spaces like the mall and which is strengthened through chance encounters. Apart from the mall, the possibilities for chance encounters have become very limited in Johannesburg where suburbanites rarely walk on public streets, moving around largely in their cars. Chance encounters with strangers in public settings like streets are mainly seen as threatening by suburbanites: they suspect the stranger may be a criminal aiming to hijack their car or to grab their handbag. In relation to these other urban spaces, where chance encounters are dangerous and avoided, the tightly secured and orderly spaces of shopping malls with their franchised gyms and restaurants become heterotopias of compensation. Here suburbanites can enjoy the serendipity of urban public life, mingle safely among strangers, build friendly acquaintanceships without any responsibilities, and keep up the feeling of belonging to certain 'communities', like the church or the neighbourhood, without actively investing much time in them.

Escape from the Shack

Surprisingly, this enjoying of safe encounters, compensating for experiences in other urban realms, also shows up in narratives by mallgoers from Alexandra, the big difference being, however, that Alexandra residents need to cross social and spatial boundaries to get to the mall. While the mall in Alexandra, the Pan Africa Mall, is in their view a space belonging to the township lifeworlds, Greenstone is experienced as a social space determined by different public orders, populated by other milieus than they ones they share everyday life with, and with a different sense of place. Bertha, 30-year-old resident of River Park, considers Greenstone to be tidier, quieter and less tiring than the bustling Pan Africa commercial area with its many informal traders on the street.

[Pan Africa] It's cheap and it's less, but it looks untidy. When you get out from the mall, you can't even move your trolley from there to there, because everyone is making noise, everyone is selling. When I come back, I have this huge headache (Bertha, resident of River Park, June 2012).

At Greenstone Mall, Bertha and others believe, customers are expected not to shout or to run. At the end of the month when workers receive their salaries the supermarkets at Pan Africa commercial area become very busy, a time which many customers expe-

rience as stressful, not least because they have to remain aware of pickpockets. There are cameras in shops, but they cannot capture who steals from whom in the pushing and shoving. Greenstone, on the other hand, Bertha explains, “is open”, and hence you can “do your shopping peacefully” and “feel free” (Bertha, June 2012). Being ‘free’ here does not refer to the idea that one is able to purchase whatever one likes, but rather to the safe sense of place, to being able to let one’s guard down. Because of the tight security at the mall, mallgoers are protected from encountering “people that you didn’t even want to meet” (Letsatsi, resident of River Park, June 2012), like pickpockets. At Greenstone, you could lose your purse, and because of the mutual visibility in the open hallways, there is more social control, and someone would give it back to you, Bertha explained.

You can throw something, maybe a purse, someone will say: “Sorry mam, you lost your things.” You can learn and understand. A person can see a person. But in Alexander, someone would pick it up and take it. I would also do that (Bertha, resident of River Park, June 2012).

Nnana¹⁰, field assistant from River Park, was living a life in limbo, sometimes working part-time in a coffee shop or as a domestic worker in Linbro Park, sometimes living at ‘home’ in a rural area where life was cheaper and where the shack was larger than the one her mother rented in River Park. In 2012 she considered her life to be difficult and felt that she lacked perspectives for her future. The lack of private space in the small shack she shared with her family was often difficult for her, especially when she was angry or stressed. In order to avoid fighting at home, she sometimes escaped to the mall, where she could calm down. “And when I come back, I am better again” (Nnana, June 2012). For Nnana, being at the mall was like entering a dream world, which compensated for the world outside and enabled her to forget about the intricacies of everyday life. Window shopping was for her a form of escapism and a ritualistic cleansing experience which she even compared to going to church. Entering the mall without money could be ‘painful’ for Nnana, as she explained to me, but this would not hinder her from enjoying being there.

Nnana and many other township dwellers live in conditions of high density with a lack of private space. This situation can cause anxiety and stress, which many township dwellers experience as pathological (see chapter 2). Privacy and private space are constantly contested privileges in Alexandra. For these township women, escaping to Greenstone compensates for the continuous invasion of their personal space taking place in dense township living. As a heterotopia of compensation, Greenstone is a more orderly, quieter and safer space than the bustling commercial centre of Pan Africa, allowing township dwellers to let their guard down and feel ‘free’. For these moments, the mall as heterotopia neutralises the hardship of everyday life, it provides an escape into an illusionary world where everything is inverted: density turns into openness, lack turns into abundance, sorrow turns into carefreeness, at least for a couple of moments. Also managing to look good and to receive compliments, albeit with simple clothes (Aceska and Heer 2019), can give a sense of victory and achievement,

10 In Heer (2017) I referred to Nnana as Sbgongile for reasons of anonymisation. Because she desired so, I use in this publication her actual name.

providing an instantaneous compensation for the harsh reality of urban inequality where you can only lose because you were born in the wrong neighbourhood, went to the wrong schools, and you have the wrong passport, or none at all.

Domestic Workers: Glimpses of Freedom

Rita was a domestic worker living and working in Linbro Park in 2012, and she sometimes frequented Greenstone Mall to which she drove in her *skorokoro* (Sesotho word used to refer to dilapidated old cars). She used to buy her groceries at the cheaper supermarkets in Alexandra, in the Pan Africa commercial area, but sometimes she ventured to Greenstone just for leisure and window shopping. She would enjoy having a coffee at one of the restaurants and observing the other visitors who had more money than her, she told me. While mixing with these people from all races she would feel 'free', but also a bit isolated, especially as she was generally short of money. For Rita, this 'freedom' was not possible in Linbro Park. She and many other workers living in domestic quarters in Linbro Park experience a 'lack of freedom' in the suburb, not least because their landlords, who are at the same time their employers, impose house rules like forbidding visitors or having their children live with them (see chapter 3). Many also experience a 'lack of freedom of speech', by which domestic workers meant in interviews that in the asymmetric relation of dependence it is very hard to speak up to their employers. So for Rita, the freedom of mixing with affluent suburbanites at the mall was linked to her experience of a 'lack of freedom' whilst living in a white neighbourhood, entangled in a dependent, paternalistic relationship with the property owners. Hence, for her and others, the mall offered alternative, new forms of encounters between township dwellers and suburbanites beyond what she was used to within the realm of domestic work. Here, she enjoyed moments of togetherness, of solidarity, even hints of feelings of equality with white women, compensating for the structural inequality shaping her interactions with her employers in Linbro Park.

Nnana's mother worked for a property-owning family in Linbro Park for decades, while she and her sister grew up with relatives at 'home' in a rural area. Sometimes they came to stay with her mother for a couple of weeks, and they played with the children of the property owners.

I started meeting white people when I used to visit my mam, when she used to live in Linbro Park. I would find other kids there, the white kids, and we played together. That's how I have met whites for the first time. But now, that I am older, I can go to a mall, you know, and find white people. They are not so bad, like we have been told, you know (laughing) (Nnana, resident in River Park, June 2012).

At the time of the research, Nnana sometimes stayed for a couple of weeks in her mother's shack in River Park, and for the rest of the year she lived in a township in her rural 'home'. Her encounters with whites had become reduced to the workplace – she was sometimes employed as a day-worker for property owners and family businesses in Linbro Park – and to the Greenstone shopping mall. While her experiences at the workplace were often rather negative, as she found the work overly taxing, badly paid and she often felt poorly treated, her narratives about encounters at the mall were more positive. When I accompanied Nnana to the affordable clothing store PQ at Greenstone, she repeatedly drew my attention to white customers, as she found their pres-

ence quite remarkable. Other interviewees from River Park mentioned that they were positively surprised to see white people in the low-cost shops at the mall, because they shared the stereotype that all whites are wealthy. Looking for bargains side by side at PQ and knowing that ‘the other’ was also concerned about affordable prices, produced positive feelings, and what I call *shopping solidarity*. In situations of shopping solidarity, social boundaries become crossed and ephemeral feelings of equality and togetherness based on these similar shopping concerns, namely finding bargains, emerge.

When I enter a shop today in Alexandra mall, I find a woman, when I go to Greenstone mall, I find a mother doing the shopping. I am like “Madam, this is so expensive, how food costs too much.” And then we talk about it (Bertha, resident of River Park, June 2012).

Bertha does not refer to a racial category in this narrative, but from the fact that she addresses the stranger with ‘Madam’, a term used in domestic work relations, it can be deduced that she has a woman from an affluent suburban milieu in mind. Apart from sharing concerns about money, their similar roles and concerns as mothers may lead to shopping solidarity, and hence provoke an instantaneous sense of fellow feeling among female strangers who share concerns regarding the care of their dependants and households. The women would make use of those moments of standing side by side at a shelf checking prices to start a friendly conversation, commenting on the goods that the other was scrutinising, complaining together about the rising grocery prices or recommending that the other buy a certain piece of clothing. Sometimes men would start talking to Nnana in shops and ask for her opinion about a gift they were buying for their girlfriend or wife. These short interactions constituted an key part of the pleasurable experience at the mall: “You get to meet different people from different places, you know, you get to know different people, how they operate” (Nnana, June 2012). She would first compliment the person with a simple ‘hello’ and from the tone of voice in the response, whether it was friendly or disinterested, she would decide whether to start a conversation or to walk away. Rejected encounters often became recounted in negative terms in the interviews, interpreted as a re-enactment of racial boundaries. Basani, a 26-year-old woman living with her boyfriend in the same yard as Nnana in River Park, remembers one negative experience with a white man at the mall. She was standing in the line to draw money from an ATM and the white man in front of her asked her to move backwards. She asked why and he responded: “You are too close, I need air.” She then talked with her friend in Xitsonga and the white man got angry, complaining that they were insulting him. In the interview she speculated about his intentions, wondering whether he was thinking that she as a black woman wanted to steal his money and was therefore standing so close to him in the queue. But she also recounted positive experiences across racial boundaries at the mall, for example a white man who wanted her advice when he was buying clothes for his baby (Basani, resident of River Park, June 2012).

When I asked Bertha whether it made a difference if these mall users she would briefly chat to at the mall were black or white, she responded that only a minority of them would still have ‘empty knowledge’ (a euphemism for racism).

For some people, they still have that thing of 'we are white and they are blacks'. But normally, people change. Some of them change because of the religion [LRC Church]; they have learned that we need to love one another. They have learned that, now, they are white, but they still need domestic workers, and they are black. So they need to learn to love, because those people, they are keeping their children, and those people, they are cooking for them, so they need to learn. And look at the garden boy, it's a black guy (Bertha, resident of River Park, June 2012).

In this quote Bertha links her experiences with white people at the mall to the discourse of the LRC charismatic church (see chapter 6), which she had frequented for a couple of years. She links the need for whites to become less racist to the everyday realities of interactions in the workplace and the often-unacknowledged dependency of white women on their domestic workers and gardeners for child rearing, cooking and security. Living apart yet shopping together at the mall thus enables these women to create sociabilities and ways of belonging which move beyond the old racial categories, even though these become easily reactivated in encounters experienced as negative. The mall becomes a stage where chance encounters across social boundaries can take place, chance encounters imbued with considerable symbolic meaning derived from their heterotopic relationships with other urban realms like domestic work, urban religion and street life.

Conclusion

Whether the mall constitutes a normal place or not, a part of everyday routine or rather of rupture, varies across urban milieus and lifestyles and is, hence, less determined by the architecture of the space than by the place urban dwellers accord the mall in their everyday lives. For the residents of affluent areas, both in Maputo and Johannesburg, the respective mall has a firm place in their daily routines, they go there regularly to shop and to stroll around; it constitutes a familiar ground where they feel comfortable and know how to act. For the residents of poorer areas, again in both cities, the malls hold an extraordinary place in their urban lives, the visits are special occasions, the urbanites need to cross social and spatial boundaries to get to the mall where they constitute a minority. Going to the mall is something which they have to learn; the mall may become familiar, more or less known to them, but not entirely normal.

At the beginning of my research I told the DA politician, Thomas, about my plans to do research on encounters between suburbanites and township dwellers at the Greenstone Shopping Mall, and he reacted with surprise, because, as he pointed out, people from Alexandra do not shop at Greenstone. When I talked to a domestic worker in Linbro Park about the politician's reaction, she responded: "They [people from Alex] do shop at Greenstone! Not all of them, some go to Pan, but they do!" She wanted to know whether the person who had told me the contrary was black or white. When I said that he was white, she said. "Ah, some white people think we can't go shopping where they go because they think we can't afford. But even with a little money we can go there and shop" (Agnes, domestic worker in Linbro Park and resident of River Park, April 2012).

I remembered this conversation when the ethnographic analysis of Maputo Shopping revealed the extent to which Indian mallgoers more or less politely ignore the

presence of African customers, while observing people from their own milieu. While interviewees from the poor neighbourhood of Polana Caniço in Maputo and Alexandra in Johannesburg told many stories about encounters with urban elites at the mall, in interviews with the urban elites few such stories came up. They paid little attention to mall users who did not belong to their own social world; for them it was rather encounters with members of their own milieus that created the sociability they talked about in interviews. When I asked Sarah, a resident of Linbro Park who managed a shop at Greenstone, whether residents from Alexandra frequented the mall, she responded: "I think they do, because (laughs) I know they have an awful lot of problems there with security" (Sarah, property owner in Linbro Park, May 2012). Referring to Alexandra's residents as security threats at the mall, she denied them recognition (Honneth 2003) as fellow consumers, making them socially invisible. Such social invisibility of marginalised mallgoers in the eyes of the dominating group has also been observed elsewhere. Van Leeuwen, in her ethnography of middle-class lifeworlds and malls in Jakarta, describes how the middle classes were 'blind' to the presence of beggars at the mall:

The ability to overlook people unless they complied visually with middle-class standards of dress and appearance seemed an innate quality of the people who did comply with this dress code. I never saw, for instance, children take notice of beggars, street children or scavengers, except when forced to, that is, when approached whilst in a car. It seemed as if they simply did not exist, as if they did not form part of the social configuration of the moment (Leeuwen 2011: 168).

Mall builders and mall architects like John portray malls as exclusionary spaces where the poor are made to feel uncomfortable on purpose, so that the wealthy feel safe and consume maximally. Mall designers believe that they can use architecture to attract or repel groups of customers and seduce them to consume. This conception of malls as abstract spaces, as containers that determine agency, is intentional. It is not an innocent representation but an ideology serving their capitalist strategy: they want potential investors to trust them that malls are perfectly designed money-making machines, and hence invest capital in their projects.

This ideology of malls as tightly controlled, secluded spaces of the wealthy has impacted on academics' views on shopping malls. Portraying malls as enclaves of the elites, disconnected from urban realities and hence like a foreign body in the organically grown urban tapestry, reflects the ideology of mall builders, of how they want their malls to be seen by potential investors. The lived reality of malls, however, is much more entangled, multiple and contradictory. The representations of the malls by their marketing specialists are influential: so, the portrayal of Maputo Shopping as entry point to global modernity, where the city becomes connected to the synchronicity of global time, and the narrative that Greenstone Mall is a safe place for rejuvenation and abundance where customers can flee the bustling city life. These hegemonic images of the malls, however, become contested by counter-representations of these spaces, upheld by mallgoers as critical citizens: in Maputo, there is the image that Maputo Shopping is a place of money laundering, where the hidden relations between the political and the economic become manifested in Guebuza Square. In Johannesburg, environmental activists criticise the destruction of nature and pollution the Green-

stone Mall and surrounding gated communities have brought to this urban area. Malls are hence anything but uniform, uncontested urban spaces; rather there are multiple and competing ways of conceiving malls. Although the mall management and mall builders have the most resources and the power to spread their definitions of what malls are – through marketing activities and professional knowledge – they do not have total control over who uses their malls, how urbanites use them and how they conceive them.

Seeing malls as enclaves is a limiting, partial perspective on these urban spaces. Rather than emphasising disconnection and disembedding from the local context, the ethnography of the two malls drew attention to the way urban dwellers integrate the malls into their shopping circuits and everyday routines, in ways which reflect and constitute their milieu membership. Urban dwellers embed the malls through their ways of appropriating and using them within the local context, giving them a local 'flair', like the Mozambican way of rearranging tables and chairs constantly in line with the changing group composition of families and friends spending time together at Guebuza Square. Malls need to be understood as relational spaces, constituted by the spatial practices of their users, and receiving their meanings only from their relationship to other urban spaces. Understanding malls as heterotopias places these multiple relations to other urban spaces at the centre of the ethnographic analysis; malls as social spaces cannot be understood only in terms of themselves.

Maputo Shopping, on the one hand, can be seen as a *heterotopic mirror*, making the urban dwellers more aware of what urban reality looks like and of their place in society, yet at the same time it also inspires them to imagine a different life, not least because here the lives of urban elites, otherwise hidden behind walls, become visible to them. As a mirror, the mall renders the invisible visible, and makes reality intelligible, like the hidden relations between political and economic power, between the legal and the illegal. The mirror enables the mall users to look at the city from a mirrored angle and makes intelligible where the city is heading in the future: an urban development driven by the interests of capital in which gentrification will expel Nelinha and other mallgoers from Polana Caniço to peri-urban areas.

Greenstone Mall, on the other hand, emerges as a *heterotopia of compensation*. Suburbanites, and less often township dwellers, venture here to replace the danger of stranger interactions in public spaces with the safe sociability of shopping side by side in the orderly, quiet, spacious mall. The mall is a utopian world, yet also a real place, where township dwellers can pretend to be affluent, where they can flee to from their small shacks and enjoy the glitz and glamour, where interactions with white women evoke hopes and dreams about a transforming world. For suburbanites it compensates for the lack of urban joys in their other spaces of everyday life, like the tightly secured, walled homes, the lonely cars, the streets, where strangers are always a threat and where chance encounters are a problem. The mall promises safe mingling in anonymous crowds, with ephemeral encounters with acquaintances, neighbours and distantly known fellow churchgoers, which is a sociability distinct from the denser social ties and even social control enacted by the Indian elite at Maputo Shopping.

These distinct meanings of the two shopping malls under scrutiny – *heterotopic mirror* versus *heterotopia of compensation* – are also reflected in the relationship between the mall and domestic work in the two cities. In Maputo, the mall turns the social relations between Indian elites and their domestic workers visible, and hence invites

critique and moral outrage from mallgoers at this essentially colonial relationship perpetuated in the postcolonial city. In Johannesburg, the mall offers an alternative, new form of interaction between township dwellers and suburbanites beyond the domestic work relationship. Here, domestic workers are freed from the asymmetric, paternalistic relations and can enjoy moments of togetherness, of solidarity and maybe even feelings of equality with white women, instances which compensate for the structural inequality shaping their domestic worker relationships outside the mall. In both cities, in both malls, the stock of knowledge and memories of encounters in domestic work relations in suburban homes distinctly shape the way in which encounters at the mall become interpreted and experienced. Because of such heterotopic relations between the mall and domestic work and between other diverse spaces of urban life, be they places of private or public life, our understanding of cities can only be enhanced if we focus on the entanglements of spaces and people.



©Barbara Heer, Maputo Shopping, 2011



©Barbara Heer, Greenstone, 2012



©Barbara Heer, N3 highway, 2011



©Barbara Heer, River Park, 2015

