

# Contacts and Controversies between Muslims, Jews and Christians in the Ottoman Empire and Pre-Modern Iran

edited by  
Camilla Adang  
Sabine Schmidtke





Contacts and Controversies  
between Muslims, Jews and Christians  
in the Ottoman Empire and Pre-Modern Iran

# ISTANBULER TEXTE UND STUDIEN

HERAUSGEgeben VOM  
ORIENT-INSTITUT ISTANBUL

BAND 21

Contacts and Controversies  
between Muslims, Jews and Christians  
in the Ottoman Empire and Pre-Modern Iran

edited by

Camilla Adang  
Sabine Schmidtke

WÜRZBURG 2016

---

ERGON VERLAG WÜRZBURG  
IN KOMMISSION

Umschlaggestaltung: Taline Yozgatian

Umschlagbild: Beginn der *Risālat ilzām al-yahūd fīmā za‘amū fī l-tawrāt min qibal ‘ilm al-kalām* des al-Salām ‘Abd al-‘Allām (Handschrift Fatih 2994, ff. 1b-2a, mit freundlicher Genehmigung)

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

ISBN 978-3-95650-194-4

ISSN 1863-9461

© 2016 Orient-Institut Istanbul (Max Weber Stiftung)

Das Werk einschließlich aller seiner Teile ist urheberrechtlich geschützt. Jede Verwertung des Werkes außerhalb des Urheberrechtsgesetzes bedarf der Zustimmung des Orient-Instituts Istanbul. Dies gilt insbesondere für Vervielfältigungen jeder Art, Übersetzungen, Mikroverfilmung sowie für die Einspeicherung in elektronische Systeme. Gedruckt mit Unterstützung des Orient-Instituts Istanbul, gegründet von der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft, aus Mitteln des Bundesministeriums für Bildung und Forschung.

Ergon-Verlag GmbH  
Keesburgstr. 11, D-97074 Würzburg

## Contents

List of Contributors .....	7
Preface .....	11
<i>Judith Pfeiffer</i>	
Confessional polarization in the 17 <sup>th</sup> century Ottoman Empire	
and Yūsuf İbn Ebī 'Abdü'd-Deyyān's	
<i>Kesfū'l-esrār fī ilzāmi'l-Yehūd ve'l-ahbār</i> .....	15
<i>Camilla Adang</i>	
Guided to Islam by the Torah:	
The <i>Risāla al-hādiya</i> by 'Abd al-Salām al-Muhtadī al-Muhammadī .....	57
<i>Sabine Schmidke</i>	
Epistle forcing the Jews [to admit their error]	
with regard to what they contend about the Torah,	
by dialectical reasoning ( <i>Risālat ilzām al-yahūd fīmā za'āmū</i>	
<i>fī l-tawrāt min qibal 'ilm al-kalām</i> ) by al-Salām 'Abd al-'Allām.	
A critical edition .....	73
<i>Monika Hasenmüller</i>	
Die Beschreibung Muhammads im Evangelium.	
Eine muslimische Polemik gegen die Christen	
aus dem osmanischen Reich (Anfang 18. Jhdt.) .....	83
<i>Paolo Lucca</i>	
Şabbetay Şewi and the Messianic Temptations of Ottoman Jews	
in the Seventeenth Century According to Christian Armenian Sources .....	197
<i>Elisabetta Borromeo</i>	
Le clergé catholique face au pouvoir ottoman.	
Les brevets de nomination ( <i>berāt</i> ) des évêques	
et des archevêques (17 <sup>ème</sup> siècle) .....	207
<i>Heleen Murre-van den Berg</i>	
Apostasy or 'a House Built on Sand'.	
Jews, Muslims and Christians in East-Syriac texts (1500-1850) .....	223
<i>Rudi Matthee</i>	
The Politics of Protection.	
Iberian Missionaries in Safavid Iran under Shāh 'Abbās I (1587-1629).....	245

*Dennis Halft*

Schiitische Polemik gegen das Christentum  
im safawidischen Iran des 11./17. Jhdts.

Sayyid Aḥmad Ḥalāwī *Lawāmi`-i rabbānī dar radd-i šubḥa-yi naṣrānī*..... 273

*Reza Pourjavady & Sabine Schmidtke*

Sayyid Muḥammad Mahdī al-Burūjirdī al-Ṭabāṭabā`ī's (d. 1212/1797)  
debate with the Jews of Dhu 1-Kifl.

A survey of its transmission, with critical editions  
of its Arabic and Persian versions..... 335

*Vera B. Moreen*

Iranian Jewish History Reflected in Judaeo-Persian Literature..... 397

Index..... 413

## List of Contributors

Camilla Adang is Senior Lecturer at the Department of Arabic and Islamic Studies at Tel Aviv University. Her fields of specialization include interreligious polemics and classical Islamic religious thought. She is the author of *Islam frente a Judaismo. La polémica de Ibn Hazm de Córdoba* (Madrid 1994) and *Muslim Writers on Judaism and the Hebrew Bible: From Ibn Rabban to Ibn Hazm* (Leiden 1996) and co-editor, with Sabine Schmidtke and David Sklare, of *A Common Rationality. Mu'tazilism in Islam and Judaism* (Würzburg 2007). She is one of the editors of the Series "Studies in the Children of Abraham", published by Brill, Leiden. She is currently preparing a monograph on the creed of Ibn Hazm.

Elisabetta Borromeo is attached to the Laboratoire Etudes turques et ottomanes led by Gilles Veinstein at the Collège de France (Paris). A specialist on the travel history of the Levant, she is the author of *Voyageurs occidentaux dans l'Empire ottoman (1600-1644)* (Paris 2007). She has also published several articles on a number of travellers as well as on the image of the "Turk" in Europe. She is particularly interested in the Ottoman Catholics and in their rapport with the two powers they depended upon: the temporal power of the Sultan and the spiritual power of the Holy See. She is currently preparing a study on the relationship between Islam and Christendom in the Modern Age.

Dennis Halft has studied Islamic, Comparative Religious and Iranian Studies at Freie Universität Berlin, the Institut National des Langues et Civilisations Orientales in Paris and the Institut Français d'Études Arabes in Damascus. Between 2006 and 2007 he worked as advisor on Lebanon, under the auspices of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development. In 2008 he was researcher at the Dominican Institut M.-Dominique Chenu, Berlin, and joined the Order of Preachers in 2009. His current research concentrates on Christian-Muslim polemical writings in Safavid Iran and Mughal India.

Monika Hasenmüller earned her master's degree in Islamic studies from Freie Universität Berlin in 2008 after studying Islamic and Arabic studies as well as Political Science in Bamberg, Cairo and Berlin. Until January 2009 she worked at C.H.Becht publishing house, Munich. Her edition of a polemical tract against Christianity published in this volume is a revised version of her master's thesis.

Paolo Lucca holds a doctorate in Oriental Studies (2007) from the Ca' Foscari University of Venice, where he is currently Teaching Fellow in Hebrew Language and Literature. During his doctoral program he specialized in ancient Armenian and Syriac. He has published on the textual criticism of the Armenian Bible and is working on a critical edition of the Armenian books of *Chronicles*. He is a member of the translation group preparing the Italian version of the *Septuagint* led by Paolo Sacchi.

Rudi Matthee is Unidel distinguished Professor of Middle Eastern History at the University of Delaware. He received his PhD in Islamic Studies from UCLA, 1991. He has published extensively on early modern Iranian history and is the author of the award-winning books *The Politics of Trade in Safavid Iran: Silk for Silver, 1600-1730* (1999) and *The Pursuit of Pleasure: Drugs and Stimulants in Iranian History, 1500-1900* (2005). He is co-editor (with Beth Baron), of *Iran and Beyond: Essays in Honor of Nikki R. Keddie* (Mazda 2000); and (with Nikki Keddie), of *Iran and the Surrounding World: Interactions in Culture and Cultural Politics* (University of Washington Press 2002). His most recent book, *Persia in Crisis: The Decline of the Safavids and the Fall of Isfahan*, will be published by I.B. Tauris in 2010.

Vera B. Moreen received her PhD from Harvard University. She has been a Visiting Associate Professor at Swarthmore College and the University of Pennsylvania. Her primary research areas are the cultural world of Iranian Jewry as depicted in medieval and pre-modern Judeo-Persian literature and history, Iranian Jewish history and the interface between Muslim and Jewish religious, literary, and artistic topoi. She is the author of *Miniature Paintings in Judaeo-Persian Manuscripts* (Cincinnati 1985), of *Iranian Jewry's hour of peril and heroism. A study of Bābāī ibn Lutf's chronicle, 1617-1662* (New York 1987) and of *In Queen Esther's Garden: An Anthology of Judeo-Persian Literature* (New Haven/London 2000). She is co-editor of the *Encyclopaedia of Jews in the Islamic World* (Leiden: Brill).

Heleen Murre-van den Berg is Professor for the History of Modern World Christianity at Leiden University. Her research is focused on 'non-western' forms of Christianity and her current projects concentrate on the Christianity of Iraq (especially concerning the Church of the East, Assyrian and Chaldean), as well as on Christian views of the 'Holy Land'. She is the author of *From a Spoken to a Written Language. The Introduction and Development of Literary Urmia Aramaic in the Nineteenth Century* (Leiden 1999) and has edited *New Faith in Ancient Lands. Western Missions in the Middle East in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries* (Leiden 2006).

Judith Pfeiffer teaches Islamic history at the University of Oxford. Her current research focuses on conversion processes, in particular conversion to Islam in the Mongol Empire, and the interaction between the local and Mongol elites. She has published widely on religion and politics during the Mongol period and is co-editor of *History and Historiography of Post-Mongol Central Asia and the Middle East. Studies in Honor of John E. Woods* (Wiesbaden 2006, with Sholeh A. Quinn) and of *Theoretical Approaches to the Transmission and Edition of Oriental Manuscripts* (Würzburg 2007, with Manfred Kropp).

Reza Pourjavady is a research associate at McGill University (Montreal) for "The Post-classical Islamic Philosophical Database Initiative". He obtained his PhD degree at Freie Universität Berlin in 2008 with a study on the life and work of Najm al-Din Ḥājjī Maḥmūd al-Nayrīzī, an Iranian philosopher from the early

Safavid period, after studying philosophy and Islamic Studies in Tehran, Leeds and Berlin. Together with Sabine Schmidtke, he has published *A Jewish Philosopher of Baghdad. 'Izz al-Dawla Ibn Kammūna and his writings* (Leiden 2006) and edited *Critical Remarks by Najm al-Dīn al-Kātibī on the Kitāb al-Ma'ālim by Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī, together with the Commentaries by 'Izz al-Dawla Ibn Kammūna* (Tehran 2007).

Sabine Schmidtke is Professor of Islamic Studies at Freie Universität Berlin. She is sectional editor (theology & philosophy) of *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. and co-founder and -coordinator of the Mu'tazilite Manuscripts Group (established 2003). She has published extensively on Islamic and Jewish intellectual history. Her works include *Theologie, Philosophie und Mystik im zwölferschiitischen Islam des 9./15. Jahrhunderts. Die Gedankenwelt des Ibn Abī Jumhūr al-Ahsā'ī (um 838/1434-35 – nach 906/1501)* (Leiden 2000) and, together with Reza Pourjavady, *A Jewish Philosopher of Baghdad. 'Izz al-Dawla Ibn Kammūna and his Writings* (Leiden 2006) and *Critical Remarks by Najm al-Dīn al-Kātibī on the Kitāb al-Ma'ālim by Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī, together with the Commentaries by 'Izz al-Dawla Ibn Kammūna* (Tehran 2007). She has co-edited, with Camilla Adang and David Sklare, *A Common Rationality. Mu'tazilism in Islam and Judaism* (Würzburg 2007).

