

Renate Kirsch | Elke Siehl
Albrecht Stockmayer [eds.]

Transformation, Politics and Implementation

Smart Implementation in Governance Programs



Nomos

giz Deutsche Gesellschaft
für Internationale
Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the views of the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit GmbH.

© Coverpicture: Pauline Heusterberg based on pictures derived from the GIZ data bank

Copy Editor: Robert Furlong

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

ISBN 978-3-8487-3738-3 (Print)
978-3-8452-8051-6 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-3738-3 (Print)
978-3-8452-8051-6 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Kirsch, Renate / Siehl, Elke / Stockmayer, Albrecht
Transformation, Politics and Implementation
Smart Implementation in Governance Programs
Renate Kirsch / Elke Siehl / Albrecht Stockmayer (eds.)
371 p.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-3738-3 (Print)
978-3-8452-8051-6 (ePDF)

1st Edition 2017

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2017. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the editors.

Foreword by Sabine Müller

The year 2016 marked a significant change for development cooperation: A new global consensus encapsulated in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development came into effect. With its universal and transformative goals and targets, the 2030 Agenda promotes a conceptual shift from “aid” to “global goods,” and from development work to international cooperation. It acknowledges today’s global challenges (e.g., climate change, refugees, and migration), and thus confronts development practitioners and partners likewise with the task of finding new ways to implement this joint vision.

Some of the questions include: “How can development programs lead to effective change in complex environments that are characterized as political, non-linear, and only partly predictable in their outcomes?” “What are the rules, principles, or instruments for practitioners to manage implementation in such contexts?” “What can or needs to change about the implementation of development programs in order to enhance development effectiveness and sustainability?”

Recently, initiatives in development organizations, think tanks, and universities have taken up this challenge by exploring in more depth how development programs are implemented and which role implementation has in enhancing the effectiveness of sustainable development cooperation. For example, the World Bank with other development partners started the Science of Delivery and Global Delivery Initiative, Harvard University and the Overseas Development Institute issued a manifesto for Doing Development Differently (DDD), and the Developmental Leadership Program started research programs exploring how leadership, power, and politics influence successful implementation. These are insightful discussions that – as an implementing agency – draw attention and to which we hope to contribute.

Here at the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), we offer locally embedded support for capacity development to public and non-governmental partners. By analyzing our body of knowledge on implementation, we want to contribute to the ongoing international debate and share our experiences and insights, with the intention of advancing the 2030 Agenda and actively promoting the exchange formats provided by the Global Delivery Initiative (GDI).

Based on nine case studies, this book illustrates *how* program implementation unfolded in each case and how program staff maneuvered in complex work environments. The experiences reported by the authors illustrate our mode of work and our ongoing considerations about – what we titled – smart implementation. A central finding is that we rarely have ready-made solutions to local problems. More often, solutions emerge in cooperation with local partners and are then tested and rolled out. Political astuteness, attention to forging cooperation, as well as a focus on addressing local and regional issues are core parameters of our way of implementation. By applying these measures to our cooperation approach, we hope to accompany our partners as technical advisors and facilitators through their transformative processes.

We hope that this volume contributes to a better understanding of the dynamics and frame conditions that shape implementation processes in our partner countries and to the debate on enhancing the effectiveness of development cooperation to achieve the goals and targets of the 2030 Agenda.



Eschborn, March 2017

Sabine Müller (PhD)

Director Sector Departments

Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ)

Co-Chair of the Advisory Board of GDI

Foreword by Joachim Fritz

Today's requirements for governance programs are more demanding than ever. As the recently published *World Development Report 2017: Governance and the Law* succinctly put it, we moved from "What is the right policy?" to "What makes policies work?" Previously, we referred to generally agreed best models for modernizing the state and its administration. It seemed that solutions and the content of reforms could be easily laid out; they just needed to be implemented. Awareness about what needs to be considered to enhance state legitimacy, resilience, and effectiveness has grown considerably. Consequently, the content of governance reforms has become substantially more complex. The borders between the public and private spheres are blurring, and institutional boundaries are vanishing. At the same time, the complexities of the problems that require governance are increasing, for example in the cases of climate change, international migration, urbanization, and digitalization. As advisors and practitioners supporting governance reforms in partner countries, we are required to continuously develop practices and processes on how policies work in such settings. This requires insights beyond the functionality of the public sector and needs to take the political dimensions of reform into account. Based on the results of two conferences held in 2009, the GIZ Governance and Conflict division reviewed its understanding of change processes and adopted the concept of transformation, which describes development as a non-linear, reflexive, and only partly predictable and manageable process. Subsequently, we improved our political economy analysis instruments and applied them more systematically during program preparation and implementation. Over the last years, we made an effort to craft knowledge on how to better implement governance programs in complex settings. The insightful results of this discussion are presented in the case studies and summarized in the final chapter of this publication.

As GIZ's Governance and Conflict division, we draw two main conclusions from the empirical debates in this book. The first is that the closer integration of governance, peace-building, and security approaches would provide great potential in finding appropriate, innovative, and lasting solutions to the types of governance challenges with which we are asked to assist. The second conclusion is that the way we carry out governance and

conflict programs requires institutional space to find the right fit: Space for programs to adapt to local issues is vital for developing solutions that are effective and sustainable.

Knowing how difficult it is to take time out of a busy and hectic work schedule in order to reflect, document, and share experiences, concepts, and lessons, I would like to thank and commend the outstanding efforts of all contributors to this book. We hope that the experiences presented in this publication inspire others to follow and demonstrate how to adapt, analyze, as well as reflect on their work, which are all critical steps when managing an implementation process.



Eschborn, March 2017

Joachim Fritz

Head of GIZ Governance and Conflict Division

Sectoral Department

Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ)

Acknowledgements

This publication was meant to encourage internal discussions in GIZ's Governance and Conflict division – and it did. Thus, many people contributed to it to whom we owe a word of thanks for their support.

The entire Governance and Conflict division showed great interest and support for this book from the outset. Almost everybody in the division contributed to it at some stage. We would like to thank all planning officers and the respective heads of the four units in the division – Ute Böttcher, Dunja Brede, Elisabeth Leiss, and David Nguyen-Thanh – for their efforts. Ideas for possible case studies were also provided by Nico Lamade and Annette Schmid. Angela Langenkamp went the extra mile to ensure that gender became the focus of one case study. The division's Management Team jointly decided on the concept and selection of cases as well as key messages.

The authors of the case studies and their partners in country form the heart of this publication. They showed stamina in their attempts to convert tacit knowledge into shareable experiences and guts by writing about mishaps, ruptures, failures, and detours with the same level of reflection as when they presented successes. We greatly appreciate that each of them allowed us to challenge and guide them in the development of the case studies. We would like to thank Tim Auracher, Godje Bialluch, Franziska Böhm, Christine Brendel, Thomas Fiegle, Franziska Gutzeit, Lisa Hiemer, Anne Hitzegrad, Astrid Karamira, Ruan Kitshoff, Heiner von Lüpke, Mark Mattner, Yvonne Müller, Jazmín Ponce, Stephanie Schell-Faucon, Markus Steinich, Sabrina Storm, Tobias Tschappe, Christopher Weigand, Agnes Wiedemann, and Melanie Wiskow for the inspiring cooperation. Thomas Meyer is the leader of the program “Legal approximation towards European standards in the South Caucasus.” He does not appear as an author, but it was due to his decision and leadership that the South Caucasus case become part of this book.

We asked Verena Fritz and Neil Hatton for external perspectives on implementation challenges in development cooperation, and GIZ in particular. Both have long-lasting working relationships with GIZ and inside knowledge on GIZ's modes of operation. It has been extremely helpful to

have them on board to challenge us with their insightful understanding on the subject.

Several ideas and proposals for case studies were submitted that, for various reasons, did not make it into this publication. We thank Chris Backhaus, Peter Dineiger & Annika Wolfram, Christoph Feyen, Daphne Frank, Jörg Holla, Magali Mander & Mathis Hemberger, Hartmut Paulsen, Javier Portocarrero & Luz Gamarra, Jens Pössel, Scherry Siganporia & Sharon Kharshiing, Felix Richter, and Lena Weiler for their interest and contributions.

As editors, we were motivated and felt challenged by the international discussion on implementation and wanted to contribute. Duncan Green and his blog “From Poverty to Power” was an inspirational nudge for us to start this book and share our reflections on implementation. Several blog posts over the last two years have presented examples of how other development organizations have tried to “do development differently.” The same holds true for the work of the Politics and Governance Programme at the Overseas Development Institute (ODI). These posts led to wonderfully engaging conversations in front of the coffee machine among staff. David Booth and Alex Duncan sparked the discussion in the sectoral department with their training on political economy analysis. ODI staff invited us to join discussions on Doing Development Differently at ODI and to openly share our implementation experiences, which are based on a different business model than that of many other development organizations. We greatly appreciate their work and their interest in ours. Several of our colleagues in the Governance and Conflict division signed up for the Problem-Driven Iterative Adaptation e-learning course at Harvard. The works of Matt Andrews, Lant Pritchett, and Michael Woolcock and other scholars have inspired our discussions greatly.

Draft versions of articles were circulated to other GIZ divisions and units for comments. Several case studies were also reviewed by partners of GIZ programs and close program allies. The discussions these comments inspired were indispensable for finding our position as an organization on many accounts. We are grateful to Ferdinand M. Amante Jr., Aasmund Andersen, Katharina Brendel, Jens Deppe, Jörg Freiberg, Joachim Fritz, Joachim Göske, Virginia Guanzon, Oliver Haas, Peter Hauschnik, Andrea Kramer, Lothar Jahn, Aziz Jardin, Isabel Lamers, Richard Levin, Ulrich Müller, Zeno Reichenbecher, Petra Riedle, Hanlie Robertson, Anselm Schneider, Budi Sitepu, Paul Smoke, Sonny Syahril, Constanze Westervoss, and Georgia Wimböfer for their valuable questions, com-

ments, advice as well as their longstanding, trusting cooperation in the implementation of GIZ's governance programs.

Pauline Heusterberg was the intern on the team for six months. She contributed to the introduction and synthesis chapter and polished the manuscript until it shined. Robert Furlong edited the manuscript and Carsten Rehbein was a very patient and supportive publisher. The space and resources required to work on these issues was provided and generously supported by our management. We are grateful to have been given this opportunity, in particular to Sabine Müller and Joachim Fritz.

Contents

Abbreviations	17
---------------	----

Introduction

Smart Implementation in Development Cooperation: An Introduction to Issues and Concepts	23
<i>Renate Kirsch, Elke Siehl, and Albrecht Stockmayer</i>	

Tackling Implementation Challenges in Development Organizations

Polka or Parker? What Management Could Learn About Smart Implementation from Music	51
<i>Neil Hatton</i>	

Doing Development Differently: Understanding the Landscape and Implications of New Approaches to Governance and Public-sector Reforms	75
<i>Verena Fritz</i>	

Case Studies

Reforming Liberia's Mining License Administration System: Circumventing Implementation Challenges by Adapting Lessons from Sierra Leone	101
<i>Astrid Karamira and Mark Mattner</i>	

Reforming the Legacy of an Authoritarian State: The Case of Tunisia	123
<i>Markus Steinich, Thomas Fiegle, Anne Hitzegrad, and Agnes Wiedemann</i>	

Smart Implementation of Public Service Administration Reform in South Africa: Experiences from the Governance Support Programme	151
<i>Godje Bialluch, Lisa Hiemer, Ruan Kitshoff, and Tobias Tschappe</i>	
FOCEVAL – Promoting Evaluation Capacities in Costa Rica: Smart(er) Implementation with Capacity WORKS?	175
<i>Sabrina Storm</i>	
Safe Enterprises: Implementation Experiences of Involving the Private Sector in Preventing and Fighting Violence Against Women in Peru	195
<i>Christine Brendel, Franziska Gutzeit, and Jazmín Ponce</i>	
Rule of Law in Public Administration: Building Up an Administrative Legal System in the South Caucasus	221
<i>Franziska Böhm and Christopher Weigand</i>	
Strengthening the Eastern Partnership in Azerbaijan: Challenges in Implementing a Civil Service Training Capacity Program with a Focus on EU Affairs	247
<i>Melanie Wiskow</i>	
Implementing Change Processes for Inclusive Social and Economic Development in Situations of Conflict and Fragility: Lessons from the Philippines	263
<i>Yvonne Müller and Stephanie Schell-Faucon</i>	
Challenges and Opportunities for Implementing Financing Mechanisms for Climate Change Mitigation Guided by Principles of Good Financial Governance: The Case of Indonesia	303
<i>Tim Auracher and Heiner von Lüpke</i>	

Synthesis

Smart Implementation in Transformation: Findings and Outlook	327
<i>Pauline Heusterberg, Renate Kirsch, Elke Siehl, and Albrecht Stockmayer</i>	
About the authors	361

Abbreviations

AA	Association Agreement
AusAid	Australian Agency for International Development
BAPPENAS	State Ministry of National Development Planning (Indonesia)
BMZ	German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development / Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CFAD	Centre for Training and Support for Decentralization / Centre de Formation et d'Appui à la Décentralisation
CLADEM	Comité de América Latina y el Caribe para la Defensa de los Derechos de la Mujer
CMPPPO	Co-Management Project and Program Office (Philippines)
CMSC	Co-Management Steering Committee (Philippines)
CoGTA	Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs (South Africa)
CoMun	Cooperation with Municipalities
ComVoMujer	Combating Violence Against Women in Latin America
COP	Conference of the Parties
COSERAM	Conflict Sensitive Resource and Asset Management Program
CSC	Civil Service Commission under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
DAR	Department of Agrarian Reform (Philippines)
DCFTA	Deep and Comprehensive Free Trade Area
DCoG	Department of Cooperative Governance (South Africa)
DDD	Doing Development Differently

DeCGG	Decentralisation as a Contribution to Good Governance
DENR	Department of Environment and Natural Resources (Philippines)
DFID	Department for International Development (United Kingdom)
DILG	Department of Interior and Local Government (Philippines)
DJPk	Directorate General of Fiscal Balance (Indonesia)
DoC	Drivers of Change
DPME	Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation (South Africa)
DPO	Development Policy Operation
DPSA	Department of Public Service and Administration (South Africa)
EaP	Eastern Partnership
ECCF	Eastern Cape Communication Forum
EITI	Extractives Industries Transparency Initiative
ENA	Tunisian National School for Administration
EU	European Union
FNVT	Tunisian National Federation of Cities / Fédération Nationale des Villes Tunisiennes
FOCEVAL	Strengthening Evaluation Capacities in Central America
FORCLIME	Forests and Climate Change Programme
GCIS	Government Communication and Information System (South Africa)
GDI	Global Delivery Initiative
GHG	Greenhouse Gas
GIS	Geographic Information System
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
GSP	Governance Support Programme
IRP	Institutional Reform Plan
LRA	Liberia Revenue Agency

M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MCAP	Mining Cadastre and Revenue Administration (Liberia)
MCAS	Mining Cadastre Administration System (Liberia)
MENA	Middle East and North Africa
MIDEPLAN	Ministry of National Planning and Economic Policy (Costa Rica)
MIMDES	Ministry for Women and Social Development (Peru)
MIMP	Ministry of Women and Vulnerable Populations (Peru)
MLME	Ministry of Lands, Mines and Energy (Liberia)
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
NCIP	National Commission on Indigenous Peoples (Philippines)
NEDA	National Economic and Development Authority (Philippines)
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NMA	National Minerals Agency (Sierra Leone)
NPA	New People's Army (Philippines)
NT	National Treasury (South Africa)
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PAKLIM	Policy Advice for Environment and Climate Change (Indonesia)
PDIA	Problem-Driven Iterative Adaptation
PEA	Political Economy Analysis
PIT	Project Implementation Team
PKPPIM	Center for Climate Change and Multilateral Policy (Indonesia)
PPP	Public–Private Partnership
PSC	Public Service Commission (South Africa)
RDF	Revenue Development Foundation
REDD+	Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and forest Degradation in developing countries
SALGA	South African Local Government Association

Abbreviations

SINE	National Monitoring and Evaluation System / Sistema Nacional de Seguimiento y Evaluacion (Costa Rica)
SOE	State-owned Enterprise
TNA	Training Needs Assessment
TWG	Technical Working Group (Philippines)
TWP	Thinking and Working Politically
UK	United Kingdom
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USMP	University of San Martín de Porres
VAW	Violence Against Women