

reader, the fifth case looked similar to other Protestant rural and semirural churches throughout Thailand both in its practices and in the quality and style of its relationships with Buddhists.

The five case studies are framed by an early chapter questioning whether Thai Buddhism is really more tolerant than Christianity. The author does not say where this question comes from, and his analysis is brief. He cites historical cases where Thai Buddhism (or at least the Thai Buddhist state) indeed acted oppressively toward Christians, yet he somehow retains the assumption that Thai Buddhism is indeed “more tolerant” (he recites the line again later in the book), and he also fails to discuss at length other factors (such as internal and external politics, the rise of modern cultural nationalism, and the pressures of Thailand’s engagement with “semi-colonialism,” or the internal natures of the two religions themselves) that might have contributed to these patterns.

The chapters following the five case studies suggest that a major reason for the continuing Thai resistance to Protestant Christianity is the persistence of what Fleming calls *khwammankhong* Buddhism, an interactive set of historical, political, social, and cultural discourses that might best be translated as “Buddhism as a bulwark of national security.” The existence of this style of Thai Buddhism has long been noted among overseas scholars, and the roots of this rhetorical complex (and the uses to which it has been put over the past century) have been well explored by scholars as varied as Peter A. Jackson, Patrick Jory, Michael Herzfeld, Kamala Tiyanich, Tamara Loos, Justin McDaniel, Pattana Kittiarasa, Craig J. Reynolds, Somboon Suksamran, and Thongchai Winichakul. Moreover, as several of these authors show, the type of conservative nationalist Buddhist rhetoric that Fleming has called *khammankhong* Buddhism is really a kind of “official,” “socially respectable” Buddhism that represents the positions and outlooks of a particular set of social and intellectual interests within Thai society without necessarily reflecting the practices and concerns of many lay Thai Buddhists (see J. T. McDaniel, *The Lovelorn Ghost and the Magical Monk. Practicing Buddhism in Modern Thailand*. New York 2011, among others).

On the other side, the author criticizes Thai Protestants for failing to “adapt” to Thai culture (and especially for failing to adopt symbols and rhetorics associated with conventional Thai religious practice) in ways that might make the Protestants seem less different from the Buddhists and, therefore, more socially acceptable. This assumption that a more visible Protestant adaptation to Thai Buddhist culture might lead to greater acceptance, and possibly also to greater church growth, has been voiced in Thailand for at least 50–70 years, as Fleming himself notes. Yet this assumption has never been supported by solid social statistical research. In contrast, the statistical analyses contained in Marten Visser, “Conversion Growth of Protestant Churches in Thailand” (Zoetermeer 2008) suggest that from 1978 until about 2006 (the time of his comprehensive survey) the Protestant churches and church districts that tended to grow most *robustly* were precisely those churches (such as Baptists, Pente-

costals, and “independents”) that most explicitly *rejected* such adaptations, despite the difficulties that this “failure to adapt” might create for their converts, who were being asked to break explicitly from older traditions, beliefs, and practices.

It is exactly in this area – the strains experienced by Buddhist converts to Christianity, and vice versa – that the author’s notion of “encounter” might have proved most useful. For almost every Thai Christian is in constant “encounter” with Thai Buddhist relatives, work mates, bosses, government officials, and business partners, and this produces strains that are constantly talked and prayed about among local Thai Christians themselves. As Fleming notes, the opposite is often not the case, because, due to the small size and uneven geographical distribution of Thailand’s Christian communities, many Thai Buddhists know almost nothing about Christians and Christianity, and freely admit this. Therefore, the strain of these daily “interreligious encounters” normally falls most heavily on the Christians.

Yet, at least on a public level, the outside observer can easily find evidences of strategic cooperation between religious communities, even at the same times and places where, on other levels, Christian individuals, families, and congregations may be feeling beleaguered. Protestant Christian foundations such as World Vision, Food for the Hungry, and anti-trafficking groups often cooperate with their Buddhist counterparts in social welfare efforts. Thai Protestant Christians can now be found in public administrative posts that in earlier years might have been denied to them (Fleming himself interviewed a fairly high-ranking Christian civil servant in Uttaradit province). And the official English translation of the traditional “three pillars” formula created by King Rama IV (Vajiravudh) in the early 20th century (“nation, religion, and king,” with “religion” traditional defined as “Buddhism”) was recently changed by the Royal Thai Army to read (in English) “defending the nation, king, religions [plural], and people,” a rewording clearly meant to include Thailand’s Muslims and possibly also Christians. Fleming makes very little reference to these larger contexts, and indeed says very little about the complex ways that social, economic, and political forces and interests might be affecting the tone and style of contemporary interreligious “encounters” in Thailand and elsewhere.

Consequently, despite the work’s contributions, especially in the details of its five case studies, there is much more to be done. Truly high-quality integrative works on Thailand’s Protestants and on contemporary Christian-Buddhist relations have yet to be written, and the time may have come to begin producing them. Fleming’s book is yet another contribution to the growing body of materials on which such works might eventually be based.

Edwin Zehner

**Frembgen, Jürgen Wasim:** *Nocturnal Music in the Land of the Sufis. Unheard Pakistan*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012. 160 pp. ISBN 978-0-19-906506-6. Price: £ 11.99

The majority of Pakistan's population of well over 190 million people are followers of non-orthodox devotional Sufi Islam. "Nocturnal Music in the Land of the Sufis. Unheard Pakistan" is a rich entry into musical and spiritual dimensions of this predominant, vast, and diverse culture in a country otherwise famous for sectarian violence and terrorism. Accessible and entertaining, this "travel narrative" is written for anyone – scholar, student, or layperson – with an interest in daily life in contemporary Pakistan, Islamic Sufism, and its multifaceted musical forms and genres. The book conveys vivid ethnographic glimpses of shrine life and music gatherings, sensitive details on Sufi practice, poetry, and cosmology and, notably, a connoisseur's knowledge of the classical genres of South Asian music and its genealogy and technical terms. With his more than 30 years of professional and – not least – personal involvement in Pakistani Sufism, Jürgen Wasim Frembgen, anthropologist and Chief Curator of the Oriental Department at the Museum of Ethnology in Munich, succeeds in this project with both wit and sensitivity. The book is complete not only with glossary and colour photos, but also an appendix with listening recommendations and links to online music sources.

In previous work, Frembgen has documented the devotional and ecstatic traditions of Pakistani Sufis, especially followers of the saint Lal Shabaz Qalandar (d. 1274). Particularly in his ethnographic travelogue "At the Shrine of the Red Sufi" (2011), Frembgen takes the reader along on a journey to the annual *urs* festival celebrating the saint's death and union with God. Adopting a similar vignette-style, "Nocturnal Music in the Land of the Sufis" deals with other aspects and "flavours" of rapturous music culture in Pakistan. The book is composed of five chapters or "five ethnographic reports and travel images" (135). The reader is introduced to rural Punjabi Sufi culture by way of a musical gathering at a shrine in the mountainous northern Salt Range; to some of the musical genres, schools, and dynasties of Sufi maestros, dancers, and poets in Lahore performing at shrines, private spiritual gatherings (*mehfil e-sama*), and commercial concert places alike; to the more intense and "masculine" trance rhythms of ecstatic *dhol* drumming and trance dancing at the shrine of Shah Jamal (d. 1639) in Lahore; to the annual death anniversary of the major Chishti saint Baba Farid (d. 1265) in the town Pakpattan and the *qawwali* music being performed here; and finally the reader is invited to partake in the more mellow yet ardent atmosphere at the shrine of Shah Latif (d. 1753) in the province of Sindh in southern Pakistan. At "sacred places in Pakistan," Frembgen sums up, "we hear a language of the heart and soul, doors to otherwise hidden spiritual rooms open, each with its own scenery, colours, fragrances, and sweet flavours" (134).

Now, what is it that music does? Frembgen writes, quoting the Sufi teacher Inayat Khan, "Music is the best means to awaken the soul and the shortest and most direct path to God!" (132). Interestingly, tying the devotional music of the Sufis to the journey of the soul found in shamanism, music is fundamentally about transgressing the boundaries between this world and the next (23 f.). "After all", as he also states, "musical experiences are always

steps toward self-realization" (35). A major contribution is Frembgen's extremely apt contextualisation of the musical traditions of South Asia, especially in relation to Islam. His experience-based expertise is evident when he writes on the Sufi philosophy and poetry of the music, the local instruments as well as the various genres and styles (such as *khayal*, *ghazal*, *thumri*, and, of course, *qawwali*) and classical North Indian *raga* music more generally (45 f.). The book is replete with intriguing details such as how the poetry of certain saints and the praising of God in *qawwali* is sung in high-pitch falsetto emulating the voice of a woman (128) – the addressed God is the masculine subject of a poetic courtship. Over the pages of the book, we also learn how Sufi mystic music involves the whole body and all of its senses, including "the ear of the heart" (136) – it is a "holistic hearing" as opposed to "the rather stiff atmosphere of western concert halls" (35).

The author's nostalgia for a world less tainted by the stress and superficiality of the West is evident; the ethereal dimensions of Sufi music becomes a "refuge to which I can retreat from the madness, acceleration, and consumerism of this world" (118), Frembgen poignantly writes. This should not, however, leave the impression that the book has little to say about the present sociopolitical state of affairs in Pakistan. Sufism is far from some archaic phenomenon of the past, but very much a vibrant presence in most corners of the troubled country, especially the populous provinces of Sindh and Punjab. Reading Frembgen's book, it becomes clear how Sufi tradition and music play a vital (and *also* implicitly political) role in present Pakistan, not least in the opposition Sufis face from more Orthodox branches of Islam, epitomised in the fatal suicide attacks on shrines in Pakistan since 2009. Overall, the book gives an excellent taste of "the tremendous power of music" (136) in Pakistan. And Frembgen takes a clear stance: "If only the bigoted mullahs and others who disdain music would realise that music opens hearts and lifts the veil between man and God" (136), as the final sentences read.

With an ambition to convey not only an ethnographic account of an "extremely versatile musical culture" (35), but indeed also his subjective experiences, longing and joy, Frembgen offers his personal account of a seeker's journey. Listening to a private *qawwali* concert, Frembgen recounts how the "sound of the music carries my soul away, to scenes far beyond rationality. I fall into a trance, a total experience of emotions. My eyes fill with tears" (114). Some readers may find this "subjective premise" somewhat unscientific or romanticising. I am personally of the opinion that this only adds to the credibility of the book since it never jeopardizes any in-depth information on rich ethnographic or musical technical details. In fact, as someone with an anthropological interest in Sufi cultures of Pakistan, I find Frembgen's own (spiritual) investments and humility in conveying them, valid and intriguing ethnographic (self)explorations in themselves. On the style of the book, Frembgen in the epilogue asserts that his "diary entries and reflections are not scientific or analytical, nor are they ethno-musicological or ethno-sociological studies, but memories of enjoyable journeys to

extraordinary musical events. Naturally, they can only be interpretations of reality such as I have personally experienced” (135). Thought-provokingly, Frembgen also raises this question: “Was it not pointless to try to identify differences of degrees of rapture in the spectators and listeners? I thrust aside these attempts at an anthropological explanation because basically they were trite: ultimately each person present found his own path to a vision of God and enjoyed the spectacle in his own way” (83). I salute Frembgen’s honesty and self-exploratory ethnography along with his meticulous attention to sensuous detail and vast knowledge on various dimensions of Pakistani Sufism. Ida Sophie Matzen

**García-Sánchez, Inmaculada M<sup>a</sup>:** *Language and Muslim Immigrant Childhoods. The Politics of Belonging.* Malden: John Wiley & Sons, 2014. 361 pp. ISBN 978-0-470-67333-1. Price: £ 66.95

Inmaculada M<sup>a</sup> García-Sánchez’s “Language and Muslim Immigrant Childhoods” is a linguistic anthropological account of the politics of race, language, and migration that shape Moroccan migrant children’s lives in southwestern Spain. Geographically, the book is set in an agricultural community where Moroccan migrants comprise an unusually large portion (37%) of the population. More broadly, this investigation of migrant children’s linguistic worlds is set against a backdrop of emerging public anxieties in Spain about the children of migrants, following Spain’s migration boom of the 1980s and 1990s. Following a core group of focal children, their classmates and teachers, and their families, García-Sánchez focuses on the “micropolitics” of belonging, emphasizing the everyday interactional contexts and linguistic practices that make up migrant children’s daily lives and their understandings of themselves as minorities.

This book is ambitious in scope. García-Sánchez melds detailed, technical linguistic data and analysis with rich ethnography, incorporating data from participant observation, ethnographic interviews, audio- and video-recordings, children’s lifemap drawings, and media analysis. Most impressively, she follows the children across multiple contexts of interaction, including their homes, school classrooms and sports fields, Arabic language and Qur’an classes, outdoor neighborhood play locations, and a community health center where children often serve as interpreters. Throughout her analysis of these contexts, García-Sánchez strikes a careful balance between revealing her research participants’ vulnerability (which comes with being children, migrants, and religious minorities) and insisting on their intelligence, unique personalities, and active responsibilities in the lives of their families. She includes heartbreaking vignettes of migrant children’s failed attempts at social inclusion among Spanish peers, as well as triumphant accounts of their linguistic competence and sophisticated social maneuvering.

After a brief “Introduction,” chapters 2 through 4 provide background information for the study. Chap. 2 describes the historical context for Spanish antipathy toward migrants in general and Muslims in particular. Chap. 3

provides an unusually in-depth discussion of methodology. Although oriented more towards readers in linguistics and linguistic anthropology and less toward cultural anthropologists and others already convinced of ethnography’s value, the methods chapter will be useful to students and to scholars considering ethnographic approaches to research on language. The detailed discussion of how to overcome various fieldwork obstacles will be helpful for future audio- and video-recorded research with children in multicultural contexts. In chap. 4, readers meet the focal children of the study, who represent a diverse array of personalities and migrant experiences, as well as their main interactional contexts.

Chapters 5–8 take readers through the various interactional contexts in which García-Sánchez conducted fieldwork. Chap. 5 contributes to understandings of migration and linguistic diversity in public schools by focusing on the politics of everyday interaction in the classroom rather than the implementation of language policy or curriculum. The author traces Spanish children’s systematic “pattern of avoidance” (131) of Moroccan children, but the chapter’s real revelation is how Moroccan children are excluded not through overt or extreme aggression, but rather through microaggressions within “seemingly banal exchanges” (178), especially in the form of tattling and peer directives meant to shame migrant students. Chap. 6 focuses on Moroccan children’s Arabic language learning in two sites, the public school and a mosque-oratory. In the process, García-Sánchez highlights class differences among the diverse Moroccan population in Spain by detailing the two Arabic instructors’ mutual suspicion. The chapter argues that “heritage” language learning, that explicitly links language to national and religious identity, can provide migrant children with a positive, self-esteem building resource, while also solidifying their sense of migrant outsidership.

Chap. 7, one of the strongest, provides original, unique research on children translating for their parents at a local health center. Refusing common framing of children’s language brokering practices in terms of questions of linguistic competence, García-Sánchez insists that children’s translation practices are more shaped by a “discerning ethical sophistication” (225) that is clear in children’s efforts to protect adult migrants from racialization and surveillance. She carefully untangles children’s careful decisions about how and what to translate and what words or phrases to change or omit, relating these decisions to their keen awareness – even at young ages – of how Moroccans are perceived in Spain. One young translator, for example, omits some of a Moroccan mother’s comments for fear they will raise a Spanish doctor’s suspicions of child abuse among the migrant community. Arguing against characterizations of child translating as a complete role reversal or power reversal between children and adults, García-Sánchez draws on norms of intergenerational responsibility in Moroccan households to argue that children’s linguistic help to their parents fits within a Moroccan familial ethos. A final ethnographic chapter explores children’s heteroglossic games, looking at how “socio-political and moral tensions” (260) imbue heteroglossia