

# THE EU CHARTER OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

A Commentary

---

Edited by  
Steve Peers, Tamara Hervey,  
Jeff Kenner and Angela Ward



• HART •  
PUBLISHING

CH BECK • HART • NOMOS

## THE EU CHARTER OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union enshrines the key political, social and economic rights of EU citizens and residents in EU law. In its present form it was approved in 2000 by the European Parliament, the Council of Ministers and the European Commission. However its legal status remained uncertain until the entry into force of the Treaty of Lisbon in December 2009. The Charter obliges the EU to act and legislate consistently with the Charter, and enables the EU's courts to strike down EU legislation which contravenes it. The Charter applies to EU Member States when they are implementing EU law but does not extend the competences of the EU beyond the competences given to it in the treaties.

This Commentary on the Charter, the first in English, written by experts from several EU Member States, provides an authoritative but succinct statement of how the Charter impacts upon EU, domestic and international law. Following the conventional article-by-article approach, each Commentator offers an expert view of how each article is either already being interpreted in the courts, or is likely to be interpreted. Each commentary is referenced to the case law and is augmented with extensive references to further reading. Six cross-cutting introductory chapters explain the Charter's institutional anchorage, its relationship to the Fundamental Rights Agency, its interaction with other parts of international human rights law, the enforcement mechanisms, extraterritorial scope, and the all-important 'Explanations'.



# The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights

A Commentary

Edited by

Steve Peers  
Tamara Hervey  
Jeff Kenner  
and  
Angela Ward



• HART •  
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2014

Published in the United Kingdom by Hart Publishing Ltd  
16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW  
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530  
Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710  
E-mail: mail@hartpub.co.uk  
Website: <http://www.hartpub.co.uk>

Published in North America (US and Canada) by  
Hart Publishing  
c/o International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213-3786  
USA  
Tel: +1 503 287 3093 or toll-free: (1) 800 944 6190  
Fax: +1 503 280 8832  
E-mail: orders@isbs.com  
Website: <http://www.isbs.com>

© The editors and contributors severally 2014

The editors and contributors have asserted their right under the Copyright,  
Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the authors of this work.

Hart Publishing is an imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing plc.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval  
system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Hart  
Publishing, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate  
reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be  
covered by the above should be addressed to Hart Publishing Ltd at the address above.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data  
Data Available

ISBN (Hart Publishing) : 978-1-84946-308-9  
ISBN (Verlag CH Beck) : 978-3-406-65499-2  
ISBN (Nomos) : 978-3-8487-0472-9

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon  
Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

# Foreword

by

Vassilios Skouris, President of the Court  
of Justice of the European Union

The protection of fundamental rights in the European Union, as we know it today, is the result of an evolutionary process that lasted over five decades. In that respect, one cannot but emphatically point out the pioneering role of the ECJ. Early in the development of its jurisprudence, the ECJ sensed that the doctrines of supremacy and direct effect of Community law, as developed in the early landmark cases, could not hold their ground without being coupled with a system of judicial review of violations of fundamental rights. Notwithstanding the fact that the Treaties contained neither a Bill of Rights, nor even a legal basis for legislative initiatives in that field, the ECJ proceeded prudently by first asserting that fundamental human rights are enshrined in the general principles of Community law and protected by the Court and later on stating as sources of inspiration the common constitutional traditions of Member States and the international treaties to which they are signatories. Parallel to the evolution of the Court's case-law on human rights, legislative developments moved towards the same direction, albeit at a slower pace. The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union was the defining moment of this process not only because of its evident symbolic and substantial importance but also because of the unprecedented transparent political processes that led to its establishment.

As a consequence, the fundamental rights of Europeans are better guaranteed now than ever before. Through a combination of EU and Council of Europe instruments, on the one hand, and national constitutions, on the other, the harmonious coexistence of these parallel systems of protection over several decades has made Europe a world leader in the application and enforcement of fundamental rights. This is a stunning achievement, and one that is not to be overlooked in the light of fresh challenges, such as the accession of the European Union to the ECHR.

The Charter of Fundamental Rights undoubtedly brings transparency to fundamental rights protection. Prior to its promulgation, legal advisors were obliged to research the vast *corpus* of Court of Justice case law in order to determine whether a right they might be seeking to enforce existed as a fundamental principle guaranteed by the EU legal system, before they could even commence the task of assessing whether or not it might have been breached. Worse still, European citizens had no easily accessible instrument to which to turn, to inform them of the content of European Union fundamental rights, the guarantee of which they were entitled to expect. Both of these significant shortcomings have been cured by the advent of the Charter.

## *Foreword*

This important book takes the process of bringing transparency to EU fundamental rights protection even further. As one of the first comprehensive commentaries on the Charter written in the English language, it will reach broad audiences both within and beyond the borders of Europe, and help facilitate the Charter's implementation to a degree that has perhaps, to date, not yet been achieved. Its comprehensive article by article analysis explains simply and clearly how and when the Charter applies, while at the same time preserving the depth and integrity of the principles the Charter reflects. In addition to this, a series of essays by intellectual leaders in EU fundamental right scholarship including the Vice-President and Senior members of the Court of Justice adds a further dimension to the study.

It is an invaluable resource for practitioners, academics, and indeed anyone who wishes to learn more about the enforcement and protection of fundamental rights in the European Union. I warmly recommend it.

Luxembourg, February 2014

## Editors' Preface

Fundamental human rights. The phrase resonates in so many ways—historically, politically, socially, rhetorically and legally. The notion of inalienable rights, which inhere in human beings merely by reason of their humanity, and apply regardless of nationality, race, religion, sex, gender, sexual orientation, age, disability and other categories, is a crucial part of Europe's history, and its emergence from its dark past of the early twentieth century. While originally the Council of Europe was the institutional context for the development of human rights in Europe, the EU became involved in human rights from at least the 1970s onwards. This initial development, however, was in the context of the CJEU's jurisprudence, rather than in a single human rights instrument such as the Council of Europe's Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, or European Social Charter. It was not until the late 1990s that the idea of a fundamental rights instrument for the EU was realised in practice.

The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, which enshrines certain civil, political, social, economic and cultural rights in EU law, was given full legal effect by the entry into force of the Treaty of Lisbon on 1 December 2009. This brief description belies a long and convoluted journey which began with a decision of the European Council in 1999 to draw up a Charter of Fundamental Rights and resulted quite quickly in the publication of a first draft in 2000. By December 2000, the Charter had been enshrined in the Treaty of Nice. But between 2001 and 2004 the Charter became enmeshed in the ultimately unsuccessful effort to introduce an EU Constitutional Treaty, and by the end of 2004, with votes in the Netherlands and France having gone against the Constitutional Treaty, it appeared that the Charter would remain forever in legal limbo. Remarkably, it was revived by the Treaty of Lisbon, which at the same time provided for the accession of the EU to the European Convention on Human Rights.

The rhetorical power of human rights is undeniable. But in this book, our focus is on their legal status. The idea that human beings have rights that are legally enforceable against institutions of public power (typically, institutions of government in a state) is one of the most powerful aspects of human rights. Human rights thus embody important constitutional principles, including the separation of powers and the independence of the judiciary. As the EU has taken on greater public authority, particularly in areas where its actions affect matters that profoundly relate to human beings (such as their freedoms, dignity and equality), the need for subjecting the EU's decision-making to human rights review has become ever more pressing. Whatever doubts may have existed about the importance or legal status of the Charter during the early years of its gestation and infancy, there can be no doubt that it now plays this important role. Having come of age, the Charter now takes its place among the catalogue of international human rights instruments.

Each of the general editors of this volume has long been concerned with understanding the Charter and we have all written, spoken and taught about it; in Angela's case she has advised clients extensively about it and appeared as counsel in leading fundamental rights cases. In 2003, when the shape of the Charter was known but its ultimate fate remained unclear, two of us, Tammy and Jeff, writing in the Introduction to our book *Economic and Social Rights under the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights* (Oxford, Hart, 2003)

wondered whether 'the inclusion of economic and social rights in the Charter would signal a change of status of these values within the EU's legal order?' Only months later, Steve and Angela, writing in the Introduction to our book *The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights: Politics, Law and Policy* (Oxford, Hart, 2004) expressed the opinion that 'the Charter seems set to play an increasingly pivotal role in the development of the complex legal and constitutional order of the European Union'. It turns out we were both right and wrong. Right because the Charter has assumed huge significance within the EU legal order, wrong perhaps in anticipating that the status of social rights would change quite so fundamentally. But as many of the commentaries in this book demonstrate, there have been significant changes, even in the field of social rights.

What this Commentary demonstrates most emphatically, and to our great delight, is the depth of scholarship that has developed around the Charter. When we began this project we had hoped to assemble an expert team to help us; what became apparent very quickly was that we were able to attract many of the best and most interesting scholars currently at work in European law and human rights. It is with a suitable sense of awe that we now stand back and admire their craftsmanship and skill, and at the same time extend to them our sincerest and most heartfelt thanks. The Charter is a major part of the landscape of EU law, and our contributing authors have provided a sparkling examination of it.

The book has more than 50 contributing authors, which means that our list of thank yous and acknowledgements is inevitably a long one. First and foremost we thank our authors, who without exception accepted our invitation to contribute without hesitation, and who have brought an infectious enthusiasm to the project. We cannot single out authors for individual praise, but we thank Elspeth Guild for putting at our disposal her firm's office in London, where our first editorial planning meeting took place. We also thank President Skouris of the CJEU, who eagerly accepted our invitation to write the Foreword, and who has been an enthusiastic supporter of the project since its inception. We have leant heavily on our publisher, whose staff has been exemplary in their professionalism and skill; Rachel Turner, Mel Hamill, Tom Adams, Charlotte Austin and Hannah McAdams at Hart Publishing, as well as Christopher Long who copy edited the book, have all made signal and vital contributions. And without our editor Richard Hart embracing our vision for the project from the very beginning, we would never have realised it. Thank you. As this book hits the bookshelves, Richard and his partner Jane Parker will be leaving Hart Publishing; we wish them well in whatever they choose to do in future. We are very happy to have had the opportunity to work with them, and we offer this book as a farewell to two dedicated legal publishers.

Finally, and with sincere apologies to anyone whose contribution we may have inadvertently overlooked, we thank our families and colleagues for their forbearance and support during the long and occasionally stressful process of hatching this gargantuan book.

Tamara Hervey, Jeff Kenner, Steve Peers and Angela Ward

Sheffield  
Nottingham  
Colchester  
Luxembourg

January 2014

viii

# Contents

<i>Foreword by Vassilios Skouris, President of the Court of Justice of the European Union</i> .....	v
<i>Editors' Preface</i> .....	vii
<i>List of Contributors</i> .....	xxxix

## Part I – Commentary on the Articles of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights

<b>Article 1 – Human Dignity</b> .....	3
<i>Catherine Dupré</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 1.....	3
Select Bibliography.....	3
A. Article 1 and the Scope of EU Law.....	4
B. Interrelationship of Article 1 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	6
C. Sources of Article 1.....	8
I. ECHR.....	8
II. Council of Europe Treaties.....	9
III. UN Treaties.....	10
IV. Relevant EU Law.....	11
V. Other Sources: National Constitutions.....	11
D. Analysis.....	13
I. General Remarks.....	13
II. Scope of Application.....	15
III. Specific Provisions.....	18
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	21
V. Remedies.....	23
E. Evaluation.....	24
<b>Article 2 – Right to Life</b> .....	25
<i>Elizabeth Wicks</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 2.....	25
Select Bibliography.....	25
A. Field of Application of Article 2.....	26
B. Interrelationship of Article 2 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	27
C. Sources of Article 2 Rights.....	29
I. ECHR.....	29
II. UN Treaties.....	30
III. Other Sources.....	30

D.	Analysis .....	31
I.	General Remarks .....	31
II.	Scope of Application .....	31
III.	Specific Provisions.....	33
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	36
V.	Remedies.....	37
E.	Evaluation .....	38
 <b>Article 3 – Right to the Integrity of the Person .....</b>		<b>39</b>
<i>Sabine Michalowski</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 3 .....	39
	Select Bibliography .....	39
A.	Field of Application of Article 3 .....	40
B.	Interrelationship of Article 3 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	42
C.	Sources of Article 3 Rights.....	43
I.	ECHR.....	43
II.	UN Treaties.....	43
III.	Council of Europe Treaties .....	43
D.	Analysis .....	44
I.	General Remarks .....	44
II.	Scope of Application .....	45
III.	Specific Provisions.....	46
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	57
V.	Remedies.....	58
E.	Evaluation .....	58
 <b>Article 4 – Prohibition of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.....</b>		<b>61</b>
<i>Manfred Nowak and Anne Charbord</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 4 .....	61
	Select Bibliography .....	61
A.	Field of Application of Article 4.....	63
B.	Interrelationship of Article 4 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	67
C.	Sources of Article 4 Rights.....	70
I.	ECHR.....	70
II.	UN Treaties.....	71
III.	Council of Europe Treaties .....	74
D.	Analysis .....	74
I.	General Remarks .....	74
II.	Scope of Application .....	76
III.	Specific Provisions.....	80
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	92
V.	Remedies.....	95
E.	Evaluation .....	97

<b>Article 5 – Prohibition of Slavery and Forced Labour .....</b>	<b>101</b>
<i>Heli Askola</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 5 .....	101
Select Bibliography .....	102
A. Field of Application of Article 5 .....	103
B. Interrelationship of Article 5 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	104
C. Sources of Rights under Article 5.....	105
D. Analysis .....	106
I. General Remarks .....	106
II. Scope of Application .....	107
III. Specific Provisions.....	108
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	117
V. Remedies .....	118
<b>Article 6 – Right to Liberty and Security.....</b>	<b>121</b>
<i>Daniel Wilsher</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 6 .....	121
Select Bibliography .....	122
A. Field of Application of Article 6 .....	122
B. Interrelationship of Article 6 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	125
C. Sources of Article 6 Rights.....	126
I. ECHR .....	126
II. UN Treaties .....	126
III. Council of Europe Treaties.....	127
IV. Other Sources.....	128
D. Analysis .....	128
I. General Remarks .....	128
II. Scope of Application .....	129
III. Specific Provisions.....	131
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	132
V. Remedies.....	150
E. Evaluation .....	150
<b>Article 7 – Respect for Private and Family Life (Private Life, Home and Communications) .....</b>	<b>153</b>
<i>Jens Vested-Hansen</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 7 .....	153
Select Bibliography .....	153
A. Field of Application of Article 7 (Private Life, Home and Communications) .....	154
B. Interrelationship of Article 7 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	154
C. Sources of Article 7 Rights.....	155

D. Analysis .....	155
I. General Remarks .....	155
II. Scope of Application .....	155
III. Specific Provisions.....	161
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	179
V. Remedies.....	180
E. Evaluation .....	181

**Article 7 – Right to Respect for Private and Family Life  
(Family Life Aspects) .....183**  
*Shazia Choudhry*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 7 .....	183
Select Bibliography .....	183
A. Field of Application of Article 7 .....	183
I. Gender Equality.....	184
II. Children’s Rights .....	187
III. Free Movement, Immigration and Asylum .....	190
B. Interrelationship of Article 7 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	193
C. Sources of Article 7 Rights.....	194
I. ECHR.....	194
II. Council of Europe Treaties .....	195
III. UN Treaties.....	198
D. Analysis .....	201
I. General Remarks .....	201
II. Scope of Application .....	202
III. Specific Provisions.....	207
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	216
V. Remedies.....	220
E. Evaluation .....	220

**Article 8 – Protection of Personal Data.....223**  
*Herke Kranenborg*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 8 .....	223
Select Bibliography .....	223
A. Field of Application of Article 8.....	224
I. EU Competence on Data Protection before the Entry into Force of the Lisbon Treaty .....	224
II. EU Competence on Data Protection after the Entry into Force of the Lisbon Treaty .....	225
III. The Scope of Application of Secondary Legislation .....	227
B. Interrelationship of Article 8 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	228
I. Article 7 (Right to Respect for Private and Family Life) .....	228
II. Article 11 (Freedom of Expression and Information).....	231
III. Article 17 (Right to Property) and Article 47 (Right to an Effective Remedy and to a Fair Trial) .....	232

IV. Article 21 (Prohibition of Discrimination) .....	233
V. Article 42 (Right of Access to Documents) .....	234
C. Sources of Article 8.....	235
I. ECHR.....	235
II. UN Treaties.....	236
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	238
IV. Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development.....	238
D. Analysis .....	239
I. General Remarks .....	239
II. Scope of Application .....	241
III. Specific Provisions.....	247
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	259
V. Remedies.....	263
E. Evaluation .....	264

**Article 9 – Right to Marry and Right to Found a Family.....267**

*Shazia Choudhry*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 9 .....	267
Select Bibliography .....	267
A. Field of Application of Article 9.....	267
B. Interrelationship of Article 9 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	273
C. Sources of Article 9 Rights.....	274
I. ECHR.....	274
II. Council of Europe Treaties .....	275
III. UN Treaties.....	277
D. Analysis .....	279
I. General Remarks .....	279
II. Scope of Application .....	280
III. Specific Provisions.....	280
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	287
V. Remedies.....	290
E. Evaluation .....	290

**Article 10 – Right to Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion.....291**

*Ronan McCrea*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 10 .....	291
Select Bibliography .....	291
A. Field of Application of Article 10.....	291
B. Interrelationship of Article 10 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	293
I. Religious Freedom and Free Expression.....	293
II. Discrimination on Grounds of Religion.....	295
C. Sources of Article 10 Rights.....	298
D. Analysis .....	299
I. General Remarks .....	299
II. Scope of Application .....	300

III. Specific Provisions.....	301
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	301
V. Remedies.....	307
E. Evaluation .....	307
F. Conclusion .....	309

**Article 11 – Freedom of Expression and Information .....311**

*Lorna Woods*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 11 .....	311
Select Bibliography .....	311
A. Field of Application of Article 11 .....	312
B. Interrelationship of Article 11 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	314
C. Sources of Article 11 Rights.....	314
I. ECHR.....	314
II. UN Treaties.....	315
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	318
IV. Other Sources .....	318
D. Analysis .....	320
I. General Remarks .....	320
II. Scope of Application .....	321
III. Specific Provisions.....	325
IV. Limits and Derogations .....	327
V. Remedies.....	330
E. Evaluation .....	331

**Article 12 – Freedom of Assembly and of Association .....341**

**Article 12(1) .....341**

*Filip Dorssemont*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 12(1) .....	341
Select Bibliography .....	341
A. Field of Application of Article 12(1).....	342
B. Interrelationship of Article 12(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	345
C. Sources of Article 12(1) Rights.....	347
I. Council of Europe Treaties .....	347
II. UN Treaties.....	348
III. Other Sources .....	349
D. Analysis .....	349
I. General Remarks .....	349
II. Scope of Application .....	350
III. Limitations and Derogations.....	359
IV. Remedies.....	360
E. Evaluation .....	364

<b>Article 12(2)</b> .....	<b>367</b>
<i>Jo Shaw and Lamin Khadar</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 12(2) .....	367
Select Bibliography .....	367
A. Field of Application of Article 12(2) .....	368
B. Interrelationship of Article 12(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	368
C. Sources of Article 12(2) Rights .....	368
I. ECHR .....	369
II. UN Treaties .....	369
III. Other Sources .....	370
D. Analysis .....	370
I. General Remarks .....	370
II. Scope of Application .....	375
III. Detailed Analysis .....	375
IV. Limitations and Derogations .....	377
V. Remedies .....	377
E. Evaluation .....	377
<b>Article 13 – Freedom of the Arts and Sciences</b> .....	<b>379</b>
<i>Debbie Sayers</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 13 .....	379
Select Bibliography .....	379
A. Field of Application of Article 13 .....	379
B. Interrelationship of Article 13 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	381
C. Sources of Article 13 Rights .....	382
I. ECHR .....	382
II. UN Treaties .....	383
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	387
IV. Other Sources .....	388
D. Analysis .....	389
I. General Remarks .....	389
II. Scope of Application .....	390
III. Specific Provisions .....	391
IV. Limitations and Derogations .....	397
V. Remedies .....	398
E. Evaluation .....	399
<b>Article 14 – Right to Education</b> .....	<b>401</b>
<i>Gisella Gori</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 14 .....	401
Select Bibliography .....	401
A. Field of Application of Article 14 .....	402
B. Interrelationship of Article 14 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	407

C.	Sources of Article 14 Rights.....	408
I.	ECHR.....	408
II.	UN Treaties.....	411
III.	Council of Europe Treaties.....	412
IV.	Other Sources.....	413
D.	Analysis.....	414
I.	General Remarks.....	414
II.	Scope of Application.....	416
III.	Specific Provisions.....	418
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	419
V.	Remedies.....	420
E.	Evaluation.....	421
<b>Article 15 – Freedom to Choose an Occupation and Right to Engage in Work .....</b>		<b>423</b>
<i>Diamond Ashiagbor</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 15 .....	423
	Select Bibliography .....	423
A.	Article 15 and the Scope of EU Law.....	424
B.	Interrelationship of Article 15 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	425
C.	Sources of Article 15 Rights.....	427
I.	European Social Charter.....	427
II.	UN Treaties.....	429
III.	Other Sources.....	430
D.	Analysis.....	430
I.	General Remarks.....	430
II.	Scope of Application.....	431
III.	Specific Provisions.....	432
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	433
V.	Remedies.....	434
E.	Evaluation.....	435
<b>Article 16 – Freedom to Conduct a Business .....</b>		<b>437</b>
<i>Michele Everson and Rui Correia Gonçalves</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 16 .....	437
	Select Bibliography .....	437
A.	Field of Application.....	438
I.	Freedom to Conduct a Business as a Human Right .....	440
II.	Freedom to Conduct a Business as an Element of the European Economic Constitution.....	441
B.	Relation of Article 16 to Articles 15 and 17 of the Charter .....	442
C.	Sources of Law.....	445
D.	Analysis.....	448
I.	General Remarks.....	448
II.	Scope of Application of Article 16 .....	450

III. Specific Provisions.....	452
IV. Limitation to and Derogations from the Application of Article 16.....	458
V. Remedies.....	462
E. Conclusion.....	463

**Article 17 – Right to Property.....465**

**Article 17(1) .....465**

*Ferdinand Wollenschläger*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 17(1) .....	465
Select Bibliography .....	465

A. Field of Application of Article 17(1).....	467
B. Interrelationship of Article 17(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	467
C. Sources of Article 17(1) Rights.....	468
I. ECHR.....	468
II. UN Treaties.....	469
III. Other Sources .....	469
D. Analysis .....	470
I. General Remarks .....	470
II. Scope of Application .....	471
III. Limitations and Derogations.....	476
IV. Remedies.....	486
E. Evaluation .....	487

**Article 17(2) .....489**

*Paul Torremans*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 17(2) .....	489
Select Bibliography .....	489

A. Field of Application of Article 17(2).....	490
B. Interrelationship of Article 17(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	492
C. Sources of Article 17(2) Rights.....	494
I. The Human Rights Approach to Copyright in International Instruments.....	494
II. The Human Rights Approach to Other Intellectual Property Rights in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....	500
III. ECHR.....	501
D. Analysis .....	502
I. General Remarks .....	502
II. Scope of Application .....	503
III. Specific Provisions.....	503
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	515
V. Remedies.....	516
E. Evaluation .....	516

<b>Article 18 – Right to Asylum .....</b>	<b>519</b>
<i>Maarten den Heijer</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 18 .....	519
Select Bibliography .....	519
A. Field of Application of Article 18 .....	520
B. Interrelationship of Article 18 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	521
C. Sources of Article 18 Rights .....	523
I. ECHR .....	523
II. UN Treaties .....	523
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	526
IV. Constitutional Traditions .....	528
V. Other Sources .....	529
D. Analysis .....	530
I. General Remarks .....	530
II. Scope of Application .....	531
III. Limitations and Derogations .....	537
IV. Remedies .....	539
E. Evaluation .....	539
<b>Article 19 – Protection in the Event of Removal, Expulsion or Extradition .....</b>	<b>543</b>
<i>Elsbeth Guild</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 19 .....	543
Select Bibliography .....	543
A. Article 19 and the Scope of EU Law .....	544
B. Interrelationship of Article 19 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	545
C. Sources of Article 19 Rights .....	546
I. ECHR .....	546
II. UN Treaties .....	546
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	548
IV. Other Treaties .....	548
V. Relevant EU law .....	548
D. Analysis .....	552
I. General Remarks .....	552
II. Scope of Application .....	553
III. Specific Provisions .....	554
IV. Limitations and Derogations .....	559
V. Remedies .....	560
E. Evaluation .....	561
<b>Article 20 – Equality before the Law .....</b>	<b>563</b>
<i>Mark Bell</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 20 .....	563
Select Bibliography .....	563
A. Field of Application of Article 20 .....	563
B. Interrelationship of Article 20 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	564

C.	Sources of Article 20 Rights.....	566
I.	ECHR.....	566
II.	UN Treaties.....	567
III.	Council of Europe Treaties.....	567
IV.	Other Sources.....	567
D.	Analysis.....	568
I.	General Remarks.....	568
II.	Scope of Application.....	569
III.	Specific Provisions.....	570
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	573
V.	Remedies.....	575
E.	Evaluation.....	576
<b>Article 21 – Non-Discrimination.....</b>		<b>579</b>
<i>Claire Kilpatrick</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 21.....	579
	Select Bibliography.....	579
A.	Field of Application of Article 21.....	580
B.	Interrelationship of Article 21 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	582
C.	Sources of Article 21 Rights.....	584
I.	ECHR.....	584
II.	UN Treaties.....	584
III.	Council of Europe Treaties.....	586
D.	Analysis.....	586
I.	General Remarks.....	586
II.	Scope of Application.....	587
III.	Specific Provisions.....	594
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	600
V.	Remedies.....	602
E.	Evaluation.....	602
<b>Article 22 – Cultural, Religious and Linguistic Diversity.....</b>		<b>605</b>
<i>Rachael Craufurd Smith</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 22.....	605
	Select Bibliography.....	605
A.	Field of Application of Article 22.....	605
B.	Interrelationship of Article 22 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	610
C.	Sources of Article 22 Rights.....	613
I.	ECHR.....	613
II.	UN Treaties.....	616
III.	Council of Europe Treaties.....	617
IV.	Other.....	618
D.	Analysis.....	618
I.	General Remarks.....	618
II.	Scope of Application.....	622
III.	Specific Provisions.....	623

IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	627
V. Remedies.....	629
E. Evaluation .....	630
<b>Article 23 – Equality between Women and Men .....</b>	<b>633</b>
<i>Dagmar Schiek</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 23 .....	633
Select Bibliography .....	633
A. Field of Application of Article 23 .....	634
B. Interrelationship of Article 23 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	636
I. Article 23 and Articles 20, 21 CFREU.....	636
II. Article 23 and Other Charter Articles.....	638
C. Sources for Article 23 Rights .....	639
I. Council of Europe Treaties .....	639
II. UN Treaties .....	640
III. EU Law.....	641
D. Analysis .....	643
I. General Remarks .....	643
II. Paragraph 1.....	644
III. Paragraph 2.....	650
E. Evaluation .....	655
I. Opportunities .....	655
II. Shortcomings.....	659
III. Conclusion.....	660
<b>Article 24 – The Rights of the Child .....</b>	<b>661</b>
<i>Ruth Lamont</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 24 .....	661
Select Bibliography .....	661
A. Field of Application of Article 24.....	662
B. Interrelationship of Article 24 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	671
C. Sources of Article 24 Rights.....	672
I. ECHR.....	672
II. UN Treaties .....	674
D. Analysis .....	678
I. General Remarks .....	678
II. Scope of Application .....	679
III. Specific Provisions.....	680
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	686
V. Remedies.....	688
E. Evaluation .....	689
<b>Article 25 – The Rights of the Elderly.....</b>	<b>693</b>
<i>Colm O’Cinneide</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 25 .....	693
Select Bibliography .....	693

A. Field of Application of Article 25 .....	694
B. Interrelationship of Article 25 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	695
C. Sources of Article 25 Rights .....	696
I. ECHR .....	696
II. UN Treaties .....	697
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	698
IV. Other Sources .....	699
D. Analysis .....	701
I. General Remarks .....	701
II. Scope of Application .....	703
III. Specific Provisions .....	705
IV. Limitations and Derogations .....	706
V. Remedies .....	706
E. Evaluation .....	706

**Article 26 – Integration of Persons with Disabilities .....** **709**

*Charlotte O’Brien*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 26 .....	709
Select Bibliography .....	709

A. Field of Application of Article 26 .....	710
B. Interrelationship of Article 26 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	712
C. Sources of Article 26 Rights .....	717
I. ECHR .....	717
II. UN Treaties .....	721
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	726
IV. Other Sources .....	728
D. Analysis .....	729
I. General Remarks .....	729
II. Scope of Application .....	734
III. Specific Provisions .....	736
IV. Limitations and Derogations .....	743
V. Remedies .....	745
E. Evaluation .....	747

**Article 27 – Workers’ Right to Information and Consultation within  
the Undertaking .....** **749**

*Filip Dorsemont*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 27 .....	749
Select Bibliography .....	749

A. Field of Application of Article 27 .....	749
B. Interrelationship of Article 27 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	750
C. Sources of Article 27 Rights .....	752
D. Analysis .....	755
I. General Remarks .....	755
II. Scope of Application .....	756
III. Specific Provisions .....	758

IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	763
V. Remedies.....	768
E. Evaluation .....	769
<b>Article 28 – Right of Collective Bargaining and Action .....</b>	<b>773</b>
<i>Catherine Barnard</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 28 .....	773
Select Bibliography .....	773
A. Field of Application of Article 28 CFREU .....	774
B. Interrelationship of Article 28 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	777
I. Other Provisions in the Charter.....	777
II. Protocol 30.....	778
C. Sources of Article 28 Rights.....	779
I. Right to Bargain Collectively.....	779
II. Right to Take Collective Action.....	781
D. Analysis .....	783
I. General Remarks .....	783
II. Scope of Application: Definition of Terms.....	784
III. Specific Provisions.....	787
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	792
V. Remedies.....	793
E. Evaluation .....	794
<b>Article 29 – Right of Access to Placement Services.....</b>	<b>795</b>
<i>Diamond Ashiagbor</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 29 .....	795
Select Bibliography .....	795
A. Article 29 and the Scope of EU Law.....	795
B. Interrelationship of Article 29 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	797
C. Sources of Article 29 Rights.....	798
I. Council of Europe: European Social Charter.....	798
II. UN Treaties.....	798
III. Other Sources .....	800
D. Analysis .....	800
I. General Remarks .....	800
II. Scope of Application.....	801
III. Specific Provisions.....	802
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	802
V. Remedies.....	802
E. Evaluation .....	803
<b>Article 30 – Protection in the Event of Unjustified Dismissal .....</b>	<b>805</b>
<i>Jeff Kenner</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 30 .....	805
Select Bibliography .....	805
A. Article 30 and the Scope of EU Law.....	805

B. Interrelationship of Article 30 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	810
C. Sources of Article 30 Rights.....	814
I. ECHR.....	814
II. UN Treaties.....	815
III. ILO .....	816
IV. Council of Europe Treaties .....	817
V. National Constitutional Laws.....	817
D. Analysis .....	818
I. General Remarks .....	818
II. Scope of Application .....	824
III. Specific Provisions.....	825
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	829
V. Remedies.....	831
E. Evaluation .....	832

**Article 31 – Fair and Just Working Conditions.....833**

*Alan Bogg*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 31 .....	833
Select Bibliography .....	833

A. Article 31 and the Scope of EU Law.....	834
B. Interrelationship of Article 31 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	836
C. Sources of Article 31 Rights.....	839
I. Council of Europe Treaties .....	839
II. Other Sources .....	841
D. Analysis .....	845
I. General Remarks .....	845
II. Scope of Application .....	850
III. Specific Provisions.....	852
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	862
V. Remedies.....	867
E. Evaluation .....	868

**Article 32 – Prohibition of Child Labour and Protection of Young People at Work .....869**

*Helen Stalford*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 32 .....	869
Select Bibliography .....	869

A. Field of Application of Article 32 .....	870
B. Interrelationship of Article 32 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	874
C. Sources of Article 32 Rights.....	876
I. UN Treaties.....	876
II. Council of Europe Treaties .....	877
III. Other Sources .....	878
D. Analysis .....	879
I. General Remarks .....	879
II. Scope of Application .....	879

III. Specific Provisions.....	883
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	884
V. Remedies.....	886
E. Evaluation .....	888

**Article 33 – Family and Professional Life.....891**

*Cathryn Costello*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 33 .....	891
Select Bibliography .....	891
A. Field of Application of Article 33 .....	892
B. Interrelationship of Article 33 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	895
C. Sources of Article 33 Rights.....	897
I. ECHR.....	897
II. UN Treaties.....	900
III. Council of Europe Sources—The European Social Charter and Revised European Social Charter.....	905
IV. Other Sources .....	911
D. Analysis .....	917
I. General Remarks .....	917
II. Scope of Application .....	918
III. Specific Provisions and Issues .....	919
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	922
V. Remedies.....	923
E. Evaluation .....	924

**Article 34 – Social Security and Social Assistance .....927**

*Robin White*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 34 .....	927
Select Bibliography .....	927
A. Field of Application of Article 34.....	928
B. Interrelationship of Article 34 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	930
C. Sources of Article 34 Rights.....	930
I. ECHR.....	930
II. UN Treaties.....	932
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	933
IV. Other Sources .....	936
D. Analysis .....	936
I. General Remarks .....	936
II. Scope of Application .....	937
III. Specific Provisions.....	941
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	947
V. Remedies.....	948
E. Evaluation .....	948

<b>Article 35 – The Right to Health Care .....</b>	<b>951</b>
<i>Tamara Hervey and Jean McHale</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 35 .....	951
Select Bibliography .....	951
A. Field of Application of Article 35 .....	951
B. Interrelationship of Article 35 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	952
C. Sources of Article 35 Rights .....	953
I. ECHR .....	953
II. UN Treaties .....	953
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	954
IV. Other Sources .....	956
D. Analysis .....	957
I. General Remarks .....	957
II. Scope of Application .....	957
III. Specific Provisions .....	959
IV. Limitations and Derogations .....	966
V. Remedies .....	966
E. Evaluation .....	967
<b>Article 36 – Access to Services of General Economic Interest.....</b>	<b>969</b>
<i>Erika Szyszczak</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 36 .....	969
Select Bibliography .....	969
A. Article 36 and the Scope of EU Law.....	969
B. Interrelationship of Article 36 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	970
C. Sources of Article 36 ‘Rights’ and ‘Principles’ .....	971
D. Analysis .....	971
I. General Remarks .....	971
II. Scope of Application .....	972
III. Specific Provisions.....	972
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	981
V. Remedies.....	981
E. Evaluation .....	981
<b>Article 37 – Environmental Protection .....</b>	<b>983</b>
<i>Elisa Morgera and Gracia Marín Durán</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 37 .....	983
Select Bibliography .....	983
A. Field of Application of Article 37 .....	984
B. Interrelationship of Article 37 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	985
C. Sources of Article 37 .....	987
I. EU Law.....	987
II. National Constitutional Law .....	989

D.	Analysis .....	991
I.	General Remarks .....	991
II.	Specific Provisions.....	992
III.	Legal Nature.....	995
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	997
V.	Remedies.....	1000
E.	Evaluation .....	1002
 <b>Article 38 – Consumer Protection .....</b>		<b>1005</b>
<i>Steve Weatherill</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 38 .....	1005
	Select Bibliography .....	1005
A.	Field of Application of Article 38.....	1005
B.	Interrelationship of Article 38 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1006
C.	Sources of Article 38 Rights.....	1006
D.	Analysis .....	1008
I.	General Remarks .....	1008
II.	Scope of Application .....	1010
III.	Specific Provisions.....	1010
IV.	Limitations.....	1024
V.	Remedies.....	1025
E.	Evaluation .....	1025
 <b>Article 39 – Right to Vote and to Stand as a Candidate at Elections to the European Parliament.....</b>		<b>1027</b>
<i>Lamin Khadar and Jo Shaw</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 39 .....	1027
	Select Bibliography .....	1027
A.	Field of Application of Article 39.....	1028
B.	Interrelationship of Article 39 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1028
C.	Sources of Article 39 Rights.....	1030
I.	ECHR.....	1030
II.	UN Treaties .....	1030
III.	Council of Europe Treaties .....	1032
IV.	Other Sources .....	1032
D.	Analysis .....	1033
I.	General Remarks .....	1033
II.	Scope of Application .....	1040
III.	Specific Provisions.....	1040
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	1046
V.	Remedies.....	1050
E.	Evaluation .....	1052

<b>Article 40 – Right to Vote and to Stand as a Candidate at Municipal Elections.....</b>	<b>1057</b>
<i>Kees Groenendijk</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 40 .....	1057
Select Bibliography .....	1057
A. Field of Application of Article 40.....	1058
B. Interrelationship of Article 40 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1058
C. Sources of Article 40 Rights.....	1059
I. ECHR.....	1059
II. UN Treaties.....	1060
III. Council of Europe.....	1061
IV. Other Sources .....	1061
D. Analysis .....	1062
I. General Remarks .....	1062
II. Scope of Application .....	1063
III. Specific Provisions.....	1064
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1065
V. Remedies.....	1066
E. Evaluation .....	1066
 <b>Article 41 – Right to Good Administration.....</b>	 <b>1069</b>
<i>Paul Craig</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 41 .....	1069
Select Bibliography .....	1069
A. Article 41 and the Scope of EU Law.....	1070
B. Interrelationship of Article 41 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1071
C. Sources of Article 41 Rights.....	1071
D. Analysis .....	1072
I. General Remarks .....	1072
II. Scope of Application .....	1072
III. Specific Provisions.....	1076
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1097
V. Remedies.....	1097
E. Evaluation .....	1098
 <b>Article 42 – Right of Access to Documents .....</b>	 <b>1099</b>
<i>Deirdre Curtin and Joana Mendes</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 42 .....	1099
Select Bibliography .....	1099
A. Field of Application of Article 42.....	1100
B. Interrelationship of Article 42 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1102
C. Sources of Article 42 Rights.....	1103

D. Analysis .....	1104
I. General Remarks .....	1104
II. Scope of Application .....	1107
III. Specific Provisions.....	1111
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1112
V. Remedies.....	1118
E. Evaluation .....	1118
<b>Article 43 – European Ombudsman.....</b>	<b>1121</b>
<i>Ian Harden</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 43 .....	1121
Select Bibliography .....	1121
A. Field of Application of Article 43.....	1121
B. Interrelationship of Article 43 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1124
C. Sources of Article 43 Rights.....	1124
I. UN Treaties .....	1125
II. Council of Europe Treaties .....	1125
III. Other Sources .....	1126
D. Analysis .....	1127
I. General Remarks .....	1127
II. Scope of Application .....	1129
III. Specific Provisions.....	1136
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1140
V. Remedies.....	1141
E. Evaluation .....	1143
I. The Ombudsman Remedy as an Alternative Route to Redress.....	1144
II. The Ombudsman Remedy as an Instrument of Public Participation .....	1147
III. Future Trends .....	1149
<b>Article 44 – Right to Petition .....</b>	<b>1151</b>
<i>Mats Lindfelt</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 44 .....	1151
Selected Bibliography.....	1151
A. Field of Application of Article 44.....	1151
B. Interrelationship with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1152
C. Sources of Article 44 Rights.....	1153
D. Analysis .....	1154
I. General Remarks .....	1154
II. Scope of Application .....	1155
III. Specific Provisions.....	1157
IV. Limitations.....	1158
V. Remedies.....	1158
E. Evaluation .....	1159
I. A Tool for Democratic Control.....	1159

**Article 45 – Freedom of Movement and of Residence .....1161**

*Eleanor Spaventa*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 45 ..... 1161

Select Bibliography ..... 1161

A. Field of Application of Article 45.....1161

B. Interrelationship of Article 45 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....1162

C. Sources of Article 45 Rights.....1163

D. Analysis .....1164

I. General Remarks.....1164

II. Scope of Application—Article 45(1) .....1164

III. Right to Move, Right to Enter and Right to Exit .....1165

IV. Right to Reside.....1166

V. The Right to Move and Claims Against the Member State of Origin .....1172

VI. Nature of Charter Rights—and Purely Internal Situations .....1174

VII. Article 45(2) .....1175

VIII. Remedies .....1175

E. Evaluation .....1176

**Article 46 – Diplomatic and Consular Protection .....1177**

*Eileen Denza*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 46 .....1177

Select Bibliography .....1177

A. Field of Application of Article 46.....1178

B. Interrelationship of Article 46 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....1178

C. Sources of Article 46 Rights.....1179

I. Commission Proposals and Research.....1180

II. National Implementing Measures .....1181

D. Analysis .....1181

I. General Remarks.....1181

II. Background—Diplomatic Protection, Protection by Diplomatic Missions and Consular Protection .....1184

III. Scope of the ‘Right’ to Protection .....1185

IV. Whether ‘Diplomatic Protection’ in the Formal Sense is Covered .....1187

V. Specific Provisions .....1188

VI. Limitations .....1193

VII. Remedies .....1193

E. Evaluation .....1194

**Article 47 – Right to an Effective Remedy and to a Fair Trial .....1197**

*Pekka Aalto, Herwig CH Hofmann, Liisa Holopainen, Elina Paunio,*

*Laurent Pech, Debbie Sayers, Dinah Shelton and Angela Ward*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 47 .....1197

Select Bibliography .....1198

A. Field of Application.....1199

B. Interrelationship with Other Provisions of the Charter .....1199

C.	Sources of Article 47 Rights.....	1200
I.	An ‘Effective Remedy’.....	1200
II.	A ‘Fair and Public Hearing’.....	1205
III.	‘Within a Reasonable Time’.....	1207
IV.	‘By an Independent and Impartial Tribunal Previously Established by Law’.....	1207
V.	Legal Aid for Indigents.....	1209
D.	Analysis.....	1209
I.	General Remarks.....	1209
II.	Scope of Application.....	1210
III.	Specific Provisions (Meaning).....	1211
IV.	Effective Remedies before Member State Courts and the Principle of Non-Discrimination.....	1228
V.	Damages for Breach of the Charter.....	1235
VI.	Effective Judicial Remedies before the Court of Justice.....	1241
VII.	Article 47(2): Everyone is entitled to a fair and public hearing within a reasonable time <i>by an independent and impartial     tribunal previously established by law</i> . Everyone shall have the possibility of being advised, defended and represented.....	1250
VIII.	Article 47(2): Everyone is entitled to a <i>fair and public hearing     within a reasonable time</i> by an independent and impartial tribunal previously established by law. Everyone shall have the possibility of being advised, defended and represented.....	1258
IX.	Article 47(3): Legal aid shall be made available to those who lack sufficient resources in so far as such aid is necessary to ensure effective access to justice.....	1269
E.	Evaluation.....	1273
	<b>Article 48 – Presumption of Innocence and Right of Defence (Administrative Law).....</b>	<b>1277</b>
	<i>Hanns Peter Nehl</i>	
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 48.....	1277
	Select Bibliography.....	1277
I.	ARTICLE 48(1)—PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE	
A.	Field of Application of Article 48(1).....	1278
B.	Interrelationship of Article 48(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	1279
C.	Sources of Rights under Article 48(1).....	1280
D.	Analysis.....	1281
I.	General Remarks.....	1281
II.	Scope of Application.....	1282
III.	Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48(1).....	1283
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	1287
V.	Remedies.....	1288
E.	Evaluation.....	1289
II.	ARTICLE 48(2)—RIGHTS OF THE DEFENCE	
A.	Field of Application of Article 48(2).....	1289
B.	Interrelationship of Article 48(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	1291

C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(2).....	1291
D. Analysis .....	1292
I. General Remarks.....	1292
II. Scope of Application.....	1292
III. Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48(2) .....	1293
IV. Limitations and Derogations .....	1298
V. Remedies .....	1298
E. Evaluation .....	1301

**Article 48 – Presumption of Innocence and Right of Defence (Criminal Law).....1303**

*Debbie Sayers*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 48 .....	1303
Select Bibliography .....	1303

I. ARTICLE 48(1)—PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE

A. Field of Application of Article 48(1).....	1304
B. Interrelationship of Article 48(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1305
C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(1).....	1306
I. ECHR.....	1306
II. UN Treaties.....	1307
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	1309
IV. Other Sources .....	1309

II. ARTICLE 48(2)—RIGHTS OF THE DEFENCE

A. Field of Application of Article 48(2).....	1309
B. Interrelationship of Article 48(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1313
C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(2).....	1313
I. ECHR.....	1313
II. UN Treaties.....	1316
III. Other Sources .....	1319
D. Analysis .....	1319
I. General Remarks .....	1319
II. Scope of Application .....	1321
III. Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48.....	1322
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1344
V. Remedies .....	1345
E. Evaluation .....	1347

**Article 49 – Principles of Legality and Proportionality of Criminal Offences and Penalties.....1351**

*Valsamis Mitsilegas*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 49 .....	1351
Select Bibliography .....	1351

A. Field of Application of Article 49.....	1352
B. Interrelationship of Article 49 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1352

C.	Sources of Rights under Article 49 .....	1353
I.	UN Sources .....	1353
II.	ECHR .....	1354
D.	Analysis .....	1358
I.	General Remarks .....	1358
II.	Legality .....	1359
III.	Proportionality .....	1365
E.	Evaluation .....	1371

**Article 50 – Right not to be Tried or Punished Twice in Criminal Proceedings for the same Criminal Offence .....1373**  
*Jonathan Tomkin*

	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 50 .....	1373
	Select Bibliography .....	1373

A.	Field of Application of Article 50 .....	1374
I.	Criminal Law .....	1375
II.	Administrative Law Proceedings and Sanctions.....	1377
B.	Interrelationship of Article 50 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1378
C.	Sources of Rights under Article 50.....	1379
I.	ECHR .....	1380
II.	UN Treaties .....	1381
III.	Other Sources .....	1383
D.	Analysis .....	1384
I.	General Remarks .....	1384
II.	Scope of Application .....	1385
III.	Specific Provisions.....	1392
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	1407
V.	Remedies.....	1410
E.	Evaluation .....	1411

**Article 51 – Field of Application .....1413**  
*Angela Ward*

	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 51 .....	1413
	Select Bibliography .....	1414

A.	Field of Application of Article 51 .....	1415
B.	Interrelationship of Article 51 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1415
I.	Article 51(1).....	1415
II.	Article 51(2).....	1421
C.	Sources of Article 51 Rules .....	1422
D.	Analysis .....	1424
I.	General Remarks .....	1424
II.	Specific Provisions.....	1427
E.	Evaluation .....	1449

<b>Article 52 – Scope and Interpretation of Rights and Principles</b> .....	<b>1455</b>
<i>Steve Peers and Sacha Prechal</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 52 .....	1455
Select Bibliography .....	1457
A. Field of Application of Article 52 .....	1458
B. Interrelationship of Article 52 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1458
C. Sources of Article 52 Rules .....	1459
D. Analysis .....	1459
I. General Remarks .....	1459
II. Specific Provisions .....	1461
E. Evaluation .....	1521
<b>Article 53 – Level of Protection</b> .....	<b>1523</b>
<i>Bruno de Witte</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 53 .....	1523
Select Bibliography .....	1523
A. Sources of Article 53 .....	1524
B. Analysis .....	1524
I. Relation with the Rest of European Union Law .....	1525
II. Relation with International Law .....	1526
III. Relation with National Constitutions .....	1527
IV. An Exception to the Primacy of EU Law? .....	1529
V. The Legal Significance of Article 53 .....	1533
C. Conclusion .....	1537
<b>Article 54 – Abuse of Rights</b> .....	<b>1539</b>
<i>Lorna Woods</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 54 .....	1539
Select Bibliography .....	1539
A. Article 54 and the Scope of EU Law .....	1539
B. Interrelationship of Article 54 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1540
C. Sources of Article 54 Rights .....	1540
I. ECHR .....	1540
II. UN Treaties .....	1541
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	1543
IV. Other Sources .....	1544
D. Analysis .....	1545
I. General Remarks .....	1545
II. Scope of Application .....	1545
III. Specific Provisions .....	1547
IV. Limits and Derogation .....	1550
E. Evaluation .....	1550

**Part II – Reflections on the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights**

**The Place of the Charter in the EU Constitutional Edifice .....1559**  
*Koen Lenaerts and José Antonio Gutiérrez-Fons*

A.	The Scope of Application of the Charter.....	1561
I.	<i>Wachauf</i> as a Token of Positive Action on the Part of the Member States .....	1562
II.	The Derogation Situation .....	1568
III.	<i>Annibaldi</i> as an Example of the Situations where the Charter does not Apply .....	1569
B.	The Charter and Primary EU Law .....	1571
I.	The Charter and the Treaties.....	1571
II.	The Charter and General Principles of EU Law.....	1575
C.	The Charter and the Common Constitutional Space.....	1580
I.	The Charter and the ECHR.....	1580
II.	The Charter and the Constitutional Traditions Common to the Member States .....	1586
D.	Concluding Remarks.....	1592

**Protocol (No 30) on the Application of the Charter of Fundamental Rights  
of the European Union to Poland and the United Kingdom .....1595**  
*Anthony Arnall*

Select Bibliography .....	1596	
A.	Introduction .....	1597
B.	The Background to Protocol No 30 .....	1599
C.	The Meaning and Effect of Protocol No 30.....	1603
I.	The Preamble.....	1603
II.	Article 1(1) of the Protocol .....	1604
III.	Article 1(2) of the Protocol .....	1607
IV.	Article 2 of the Protocol.....	1609
D.	Evaluation .....	1610

**The EU Fundamental Rights Agency and the Fundamental Rights Charter:  
How Fundamental is the Link Between them?.....1613**  
*Gabriel N Toggenburg*

A.	Introduction .....	1613
B.	The FRA: a Glimpse at its Role in the EU’s Institutional Landscape.....	1614
C.	The Agency’s Founding Regulation and its Multiannual Framework: a Case of ‘Charter-blindness’ .....	1616
D.	The Charter in the Agency’s Practice: Legal Benchmark and Tool .....	1619
E.	Instead of Conclusions: a Triptych of Proposals for Making the Link Between the Charter, and the Agency even more Fundamental .....	1623

**The Implementation of the Charter by the Institutions  
of the European Union .....1627**  
*Olivier De Schutter*

A. Introduction .....	1627
B. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights in the Work of the European Parliament.....	1629
I. The Parliament’s Role in Monitoring the EU Member States.....	1629
II. The Parliament as Guardian of Legality .....	1636
III. The Parliament as Co-legislator .....	1641
C. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights by the European Commission .....	1643
I. Assessment of Compatibility of Legislative Proposals with the Charter .....	1643
II. Impact Assessments.....	1645
III. Ensuring the Implementation of the Charter of Fundamental Rights.....	1648
D. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights by the Council of the EU .....	1650
E. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights in Law- and Policy-making: the Next Steps.....	1652

**The Extraterritorial Application of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights:  
From Territoriality to Facticity, the Effectiveness Model .....1657**  
*Violeta Moreno-Lax and Cathryn Costello*

Select Bibliography .....	1657
A. Introduction .....	1658
B. Relevant Provisions: The Treaty and the Charter.....	1661
C. The Place of ‘Jurisdiction’ in the EU Legal Order .....	1663
I. ‘PIL Jurisdiction’ and EU Law .....	1663
II. ‘IHL Jurisdiction’ and EU Law.....	1668
D. Analysis: The Applicability of EU Fundamental Rights, an Autonomous Paradigm .....	1679
E. Evaluation: The Emergence of a New Model .....	1682

**The Charter and Universal Human Rights Instruments .....1685**  
*Allan Rosas*

A. Introduction .....	1685
B. The Relevance of International Human Rights Instruments for the Development of EU Fundamental Rights .....	1687
C. Examples from Case Law .....	1691
D. Human Rights Instruments in EU External Relations.....	1694
E. The Lisbon Treaty, the Charter and Universal Instruments .....	1697
F. Conclusions .....	1700

<b>Fundamental Social Rights in the Charter—Are They Rights? Are They Fundamental?</b> .....	<b>1703</b>
<i>Niilo Jääskinen</i>	
A. Introduction .....	1703
B. A Short History of EU Fundamental Social Rights.....	1704
C. Nature and Effects of Fundamental Social Rights.....	1707
I. Philosophical Foundations of Fundamental Social Rights.....	1708
II. Effects of Fundamental Social Rights .....	1710
D. Protection of Fundamental Social Rights in a Multi-level Constitutional Structure .....	1710
E. From an Exception to the Fundamental .....	1712

<b>The Explanations Relating to the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union</b> .....	<b>1715</b>
<i>Jean-Paul Jacqué</i>	

A. The Origin of the Explanations.....	1715
I. The First Convention: the Explanations as an Explanatory Report.....	1716
II. The Second Convention: Moving Towards a Specific Status for the Explanations.....	1717
B. A Diversified Content .....	1718
C. The Use of the Explanations in Jurisdiction.....	1721
I. The Search for the Source of a Guaranteed Right .....	1721
II. Interpreting the Charter’s Guaranteed Rights and General Provisions.....	1722
D. Conclusion .....	1724

### Part III – Commentary on the Treaty of EU Accession to the European Convention on Human Rights

<b>Agreement on the Accession of the European Union to the European Convention on Human Rights</b> .....	<b>1727</b>
<i>Paul Gragl</i>	

Text of the Agreement.....	1727
Select Bibliography .....	1733
A. Background and Overview of EU Accession to the ECHR.....	1734
I. The Long History of Accession .....	1734
II. The Constraints of Article 218 TFEU, Article 6(2) TEU, and Protocol No 8 to the Treaties.....	1737
III. The Relevance of Article 52(3) of the Charter of Fundamental Rights.....	1741
B. The Substantive Provisions of the Accession Agreement.....	1745
Article 1—Scope of the Accession and Amendments to Article 59 of the Convention .....	1745
Article 2—Reservations to the Convention and the Protocols .....	1758
Article 3—Co-Respondent Mechanism.....	1761
Article 4—Inter-Party Cases.....	1790

*Contents*

Article 5—Interpretation of Articles 35 and 55 of the Convention.....	1795
Article 6—Election of Judges .....	1797
Article 7—Participation of the European Union in the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe .....	1801
Article 8—Participation of the European Union in the Expenditure Related to the Convention.....	1812
Article 9—Relations with other Agreements.....	1815
Article 10—Signature and Entry into Force.....	1817
Article 11—Reservations .....	1819
Article 12—Notifications.....	1819
C. Appraisal .....	1820
<i>Appendix</i> .....	1825
<i>Index</i> .....	1861



# *List of Contributors*

**Pekka Aalto** is a Référéndaire in the chambers of Advocate General Niilo Jääskinen at the Court of Justice of the European Union.

**Anthony Arnull** is Barber Professor of Jurisprudence at Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham.

**Diamond Ashiagbor** is Professor of Labour Law at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London.

**Heli Askola** is a Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Law, Monash University.

**Catherine Barnard** is Professor of European Law, Co-director of the Centre for European Legal Studies and Jean Monnet Chair of EU Law at Cambridge University.

**Mark Bell** is Professor of Law at the University of Leicester.

**Alan Bogg** is Professor of Labour Law at the University of Oxford with a Fellowship at Hertford College.

**Anne Charbord** is a Consultant on Human Rights and a Guest Lecturer at the Vienna Master of Arts in Human Rights.

**Shazia Choudhry** is a Reader in Law at Queen Mary, University of London.

**Rui Correia Gonçalves** is a Senior Teaching Assistant and PhD Student at Birkbeck School of Law, University of London.

**Cathryn Costello** is the Andrew W Mellon University Lecturer in International Human Rights and Refugee Law, at the Refugee Studies Centre, Oxford, and a Fellow of St Antony's College.

**Paul Craig** is Professor of English Law at the University of Oxford with a Fellowship at St John's College.

**Rachael Craufurd Smith** is Reader of European Union Law at the University of Edinburgh.

**Deirdre Curtin** is Professor of European Law at the University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands.

**Olivier De Schutter** is Professor of International Law at the Université Catholique de Louvain, Belgium.

**Eileen Denza** was a Legal Counsellor, Foreign and Commonwealth Office, Council to the Committee, House of Lords and a Visiting Professor at University College London.

**Filip Dorssement** is Professor of Labour Law at the Université Catholique de Louvain, Belgium.

**Catherine Dupré** is a Senior Lecturer in Law at the University of Exeter.

**Michele Everson** is Professor of Law at Birkbeck College, University of London.

**Gisella Gori** is a Senior Political Advisor for Human Rights and Multilateral Issues at the Delegation of the European Union to the United States, EU External Action Service.

**Paul Gragl** is a Lecturer in Law at Queen Mary, University of London.

**Kees Groenendijk** is Professor Emeritus of Sociology of Law at Radboud University Nijmegen, the Netherlands.

**Elsbeth Guild** is Jean Monnet Professor *ad personam* at Queen Mary, University of London as well as at Radboud University Nijmegen, the Netherlands.

**José Antonio Gutiérrez-Fons** is a *Référéndaire* in the cabinet of Vice-President Koen Lenaerts at the Court of Justice of the European Union, and a Visiting Lecturer at the Universidad Autónoma de Madrid.

**Ian Harden** is Secretary-General at the European Ombudsman's Office.

**Maarten den Heijer** is an Assistant Professor of International Law at the University of Amsterdam.

**Tamara Hervey** is Head of the School of Law and Jean Monnet *ad personam* Professor of European Union Law at the University of Sheffield.

**Herwig CH Hofmann** is Professor of European and Transnational Public Law and Jean Monnet Chair in the Centre for European Law at the Faculty of Law, Economics and Finance of the University of Luxembourg.

**Liisa Holopainen** is a Legal Officer at the Unit for EU Litigation, Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland.

**Niilo Jääskinen** is an Advocate General of the Court of Justice of the European Union.

**Jean-Paul Jacqué** is Emeritus Professor at the University of Strasbourg and Honorary Director-General of the Council of the European Union.

**Jeff Kenner** is Professor of European Law in the School of Law and the Human Rights Law Centre at the University of Nottingham.

**Lamin Khadar** is a Researcher at the European University Institute in Florence, Italy.

**Claire Kilpatrick** is Professor of International and European Labour and Social Law at the European University Institute in Florence, Italy.

**Herke Kranenborg** is Affiliated Senior Researcher at the Institute for European Law of the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium and a Member of the Legal Service of the European Commission.

**Ruth Lamont** is Lecturer in Law at the University of Liverpool.

**Koen Lenaerts** is Vice-President of the Court of Justice of the European Union and Professor of European Law at the University of Leuven, Belgium.

*List of Contributors*

**Mats Lindfelt** is the Director of Research and Education at Åbo Akademi University, Finland.

**Gracia Marín Durán** is a Lecturer in International Law at the University of Edinburgh.

**Ronan McCrea** is Senior Lecturer in Law at University College London and Visiting Professor at the Central European University in Budapest, Hungary.

**Jean McHale** is Professor of Health Care Law and Director for the Centre for Health Law, Science and Policy at Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham.

**Joana Mendes** is Associate Professor of European Law at the University of Amsterdam.

**Sabine Michalowski** is Professor of Law at the University of Essex.

**Valsamis Mitsilegas** is Head of the Department of Law, Professor of European Criminal Law and Director of the Criminal Justice Centre at Queen Mary, University of London.

**Violeta Moreno-Lax** is a Lecturer in Law at Queen Mary, University of London.

**Elisa Morgera** is Senior Lecturer at the University of Edinburgh.

**Hanns Peter Nehl** is a Référéndaire in the cabinet of Judge Viktor Kreuzschitz at the EU General Court, Luxembourg.

**Manfred Nowak** is Professor of International Law and Human Rights at the University of Vienna and Director of the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights, Vienna.

**Charlotte O'Brien** is a Lecturer at the University of York.

**Colm O'Cinneide** is a Reader in Law at University College London.

**Elina Paunio** is a Référéndaire in the cabinet of Advocate General Nils Wahl at the Court of Justice of the European Union, Luxembourg.

**Laurent Pech** is Professor of European Law at Middlesex University London.

**Steve Peers** is Professor of Law at the University of Essex.

**Sacha Prechal** is Judge at the Court of Justice of the European Union and Professor of European Law at Utrecht University, the Netherlands.

**Allan Rosas** is Visiting Professor at the College of Europe in Bruges and the University of Helsinki and a Judge of the Court of Justice of the European Union.

**Debbie Sayers** runs the legal research consultancy Inter alia and is a member of the research panels at Interights and Matrix Chambers.

**Dagmar Schiek** is Professor of EU Law, Jean Monnet *ad personam* Chair of EU Law and Policy and Director of the Centre for European Law and Legal Studies at the University of Leeds.

**Jo Shaw** is the Salvesen Chair of European Institutions, Dean of Research and Deputy Head of the College of Humanities and Social Science, at the University of Edinburgh.

**Dinah Shelton** is Professor of International Law at George Washington University, Washington DC.

**Eleanor Spaventa** is Professor of European Union Law at Durham University.

**Helen Stalford** is a Professor of Law at the School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool.

**Erika Szyszczak** is a Barrister and Professor of Law at the University of Sussex.

**Gabriel N Toggenburg** is Senior Legal Advisor in the Directorate of the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights and Visiting Professor at the University of Graz.

**Jonathan Tomkin** is a Barrister and a Member of the Legal Service of the European Commission.

**Paul Torremans** is Professor of Intellectual Property Law at the School of Law, University of Nottingham.

**Jens Vedsted-Hansen** is a Professor of Law in the School of Law at Aarhus University, Denmark.

**Angela Ward** is a Legal Secretary in the chambers of Advocate General Jääskinen at the Court of Justice of the European Union, Luxembourg and a Visiting Professor at Birkbeck College, University of London.

**Steve Weatherill** is the Jacques Delors Professor of European Law at the University of Oxford, with a Fellowship at Somerville College.

**Robin White** is Emeritus Professor of Law at the University of Leicester, and a Judge in the Administrative Appeals Chamber of the Upper Tribunal.

**Elizabeth Wicks** is a Professor of Human Rights Law at the University of Leicester.

**Daniel Wilsher** is a Senior Lecturer in Law at the City Law School, City University London.

**Bruno de Witte** is Professor of European Union Law at Maastricht University, the Netherlands and part-time Professor at the European University Institute, Florence, Italy.

**Ferdinand Wollenschläger** is a Professor at the Faculty of Law, Augsburg University, where he holds a chair for Public Law, European Law and Public Economic Law.

**Lorna Woods** is a Professor of Law at the University of Essex.