

THE EU CHARTER OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

A Commentary

Edited by
Steve Peers, Tamara Hervey,
Jeff Kenner and Angela Ward



• HART •
PUBLISHING

CH BECK • HART • NOMOS

THE EU CHARTER OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union enshrines the key political, social and economic rights of EU citizens and residents in EU law. In its present form it was approved in 2000 by the European Parliament, the Council of Ministers and the European Commission. However its legal status remained uncertain until the entry into force of the Treaty of Lisbon in December 2009. The Charter obliges the EU to act and legislate consistently with the Charter, and enables the EU's courts to strike down EU legislation which contravenes it. The Charter applies to EU Member States when they are implementing EU law but does not extend the competences of the EU beyond the competences given to it in the treaties.

This Commentary on the Charter, the first in English, written by experts from several EU Member States, provides an authoritative but succinct statement of how the Charter impacts upon EU, domestic and international law. Following the conventional article-by-article approach, each Commentator offers an expert view of how each article is either already being interpreted in the courts, or is likely to be interpreted. Each commentary is referenced to the case law and is augmented with extensive references to further reading. Six cross-cutting introductory chapters explain the Charter's institutional anchorage, its relationship to the Fundamental Rights Agency, its interaction with other parts of international human rights law, the enforcement mechanisms, extraterritorial scope, and the all-important 'Explanations'.

The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights

A Commentary

Edited by

Steve Peers
Tamara Hervey
Jeff Kenner
and
Angela Ward



• HART •
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2014

Published in the United Kingdom by Hart Publishing Ltd
16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530
Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710
E-mail: mail@hartpub.co.uk
Website: <http://www.hartpub.co.uk>

Published in North America (US and Canada) by
Hart Publishing
c/o International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213-3786
USA
Tel: +1 503 287 3093 or toll-free: (1) 800 944 6190
Fax: +1 503 280 8832
E-mail: orders@isbs.com
Website: <http://www.isbs.com>

© The editors and contributors severally 2014

The editors and contributors have asserted their right under the Copyright,
Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the authors of this work.

Hart Publishing is an imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing plc.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval
system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Hart
Publishing, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate
reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be
covered by the above should be addressed to Hart Publishing Ltd at the address above.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data Available

ISBN (Hart Publishing) : 978-1-84946-308-9
ISBN (Verlag CH Beck) : 978-3-406-65499-2
ISBN (Nomos) : 978-3-8487-0472-9

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon
Printed and bound in Great Britain by
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

Foreword

by

Vassilios Skouris, President of the Court
of Justice of the European Union

The protection of fundamental rights in the European Union, as we know it today, is the result of an evolutionary process that lasted over five decades. In that respect, one cannot but emphatically point out the pioneering role of the ECJ. Early in the development of its jurisprudence, the ECJ sensed that the doctrines of supremacy and direct effect of Community law, as developed in the early landmark cases, could not hold their ground without being coupled with a system of judicial review of violations of fundamental rights. Notwithstanding the fact that the Treaties contained neither a Bill of Rights, nor even a legal basis for legislative initiatives in that field, the ECJ proceeded prudently by first asserting that fundamental human rights are enshrined in the general principles of Community law and protected by the Court and later on stating as sources of inspiration the common constitutional traditions of Member States and the international treaties to which they are signatories. Parallel to the evolution of the Court's case-law on human rights, legislative developments moved towards the same direction, albeit at a slower pace. The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union was the defining moment of this process not only because of its evident symbolic and substantial importance but also because of the unprecedented transparent political processes that led to its establishment.

As a consequence, the fundamental rights of Europeans are better guaranteed now than ever before. Through a combination of EU and Council of Europe instruments, on the one hand, and national constitutions, on the other, the harmonious coexistence of these parallel systems of protection over several decades has made Europe a world leader in the application and enforcement of fundamental rights. This is a stunning achievement, and one that is not to be overlooked in the light of fresh challenges, such as the accession of the European Union to the ECHR.

The Charter of Fundamental Rights undoubtedly brings transparency to fundamental rights protection. Prior to its promulgation, legal advisors were obliged to research the vast *corpus* of Court of Justice case law in order to determine whether a right they might be seeking to enforce existed as a fundamental principle guaranteed by the EU legal system, before they could even commence the task of assessing whether or not it might have been breached. Worse still, European citizens had no easily accessible instrument to which to turn, to inform them of the content of European Union fundamental rights, the guarantee of which they were entitled to expect. Both of these significant shortcomings have been cured by the advent of the Charter.

Foreword

This important book takes the process of bringing transparency to EU fundamental rights protection even further. As one of the first comprehensive commentaries on the Charter written in the English language, it will reach broad audiences both within and beyond the borders of Europe, and help facilitate the Charter's implementation to a degree that has perhaps, to date, not yet been achieved. Its comprehensive article by article analysis explains simply and clearly how and when the Charter applies, while at the same time preserving the depth and integrity of the principles the Charter reflects. In addition to this, a series of essays by intellectual leaders in EU fundamental right scholarship including the Vice-President and Senior members of the Court of Justice adds a further dimension to the study.

It is an invaluable resource for practitioners, academics, and indeed anyone who wishes to learn more about the enforcement and protection of fundamental rights in the European Union. I warmly recommend it.

Luxembourg, February 2014

Editors' Preface

Fundamental human rights. The phrase resonates in so many ways—historically, politically, socially, rhetorically and legally. The notion of inalienable rights, which inhere in human beings merely by reason of their humanity, and apply regardless of nationality, race, religion, sex, gender, sexual orientation, age, disability and other categories, is a crucial part of Europe's history, and its emergence from its dark past of the early twentieth century. While originally the Council of Europe was the institutional context for the development of human rights in Europe, the EU became involved in human rights from at least the 1970s onwards. This initial development, however, was in the context of the CJEU's jurisprudence, rather than in a single human rights instrument such as the Council of Europe's Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, or European Social Charter. It was not until the late 1990s that the idea of a fundamental rights instrument for the EU was realised in practice.

The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, which enshrines certain civil, political, social, economic and cultural rights in EU law, was given full legal effect by the entry into force of the Treaty of Lisbon on 1 December 2009. This brief description belies a long and convoluted journey which began with a decision of the European Council in 1999 to draw up a Charter of Fundamental Rights and resulted quite quickly in the publication of a first draft in 2000. By December 2000, the Charter had been enshrined in the Treaty of Nice. But between 2001 and 2004 the Charter became enmeshed in the ultimately unsuccessful effort to introduce an EU Constitutional Treaty, and by the end of 2004, with votes in the Netherlands and France having gone against the Constitutional Treaty, it appeared that the Charter would remain forever in legal limbo. Remarkably, it was revived by the Treaty of Lisbon, which at the same time provided for the accession of the EU to the European Convention on Human Rights.

The rhetorical power of human rights is undeniable. But in this book, our focus is on their legal status. The idea that human beings have rights that are legally enforceable against institutions of public power (typically, institutions of government in a state) is one of the most powerful aspects of human rights. Human rights thus embody important constitutional principles, including the separation of powers and the independence of the judiciary. As the EU has taken on greater public authority, particularly in areas where its actions affect matters that profoundly relate to human beings (such as their freedoms, dignity and equality), the need for subjecting the EU's decision-making to human rights review has become ever more pressing. Whatever doubts may have existed about the importance or legal status of the Charter during the early years of its gestation and infancy, there can be no doubt that it now plays this important role. Having come of age, the Charter now takes its place among the catalogue of international human rights instruments.

Each of the general editors of this volume has long been concerned with understanding the Charter and we have all written, spoken and taught about it; in Angela's case she has advised clients extensively about it and appeared as counsel in leading fundamental rights cases. In 2003, when the shape of the Charter was known but its ultimate fate remained unclear, two of us, Tammy and Jeff, writing in the Introduction to our book *Economic and Social Rights under the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights* (Oxford, Hart, 2003)

wondered whether 'the inclusion of economic and social rights in the Charter would signal a change of status of these values within the EU's legal order?' Only months later, Steve and Angela, writing in the Introduction to our book *The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights: Politics, Law and Policy* (Oxford, Hart, 2004) expressed the opinion that 'the Charter seems set to play an increasingly pivotal role in the development of the complex legal and constitutional order of the European Union'. It turns out we were both right and wrong. Right because the Charter has assumed huge significance within the EU legal order, wrong perhaps in anticipating that the status of social rights would change quite so fundamentally. But as many of the commentaries in this book demonstrate, there have been significant changes, even in the field of social rights.

What this Commentary demonstrates most emphatically, and to our great delight, is the depth of scholarship that has developed around the Charter. When we began this project we had hoped to assemble an expert team to help us; what became apparent very quickly was that we were able to attract many of the best and most interesting scholars currently at work in European law and human rights. It is with a suitable sense of awe that we now stand back and admire their craftsmanship and skill, and at the same time extend to them our sincerest and most heartfelt thanks. The Charter is a major part of the landscape of EU law, and our contributing authors have provided a sparkling examination of it.

The book has more than 50 contributing authors, which means that our list of thank yous and acknowledgements is inevitably a long one. First and foremost we thank our authors, who without exception accepted our invitation to contribute without hesitation, and who have brought an infectious enthusiasm to the project. We cannot single out authors for individual praise, but we thank Elspeth Guild for putting at our disposal her firm's office in London, where our first editorial planning meeting took place. We also thank President Skouris of the CJEU, who eagerly accepted our invitation to write the Foreword, and who has been an enthusiastic supporter of the project since its inception. We have leant heavily on our publisher, whose staff has been exemplary in their professionalism and skill; Rachel Turner, Mel Hamill, Tom Adams, Charlotte Austin and Hannah McAdams at Hart Publishing, as well as Christopher Long who copy edited the book, have all made signal and vital contributions. And without our editor Richard Hart embracing our vision for the project from the very beginning, we would never have realised it. Thank you. As this book hits the bookshelves, Richard and his partner Jane Parker will be leaving Hart Publishing; we wish them well in whatever they choose to do in future. We are very happy to have had the opportunity to work with them, and we offer this book as a farewell to two dedicated legal publishers.

Finally, and with sincere apologies to anyone whose contribution we may have inadvertently overlooked, we thank our families and colleagues for their forbearance and support during the long and occasionally stressful process of hatching this gargantuan book.

Tamara Hervey, Jeff Kenner, Steve Peers and Angela Ward

Sheffield
Nottingham
Colchester
Luxembourg

January 2014

viii

Contents

<i>Foreword by Vassilios Skouris, President of the Court of Justice of the European Union</i>	v
<i>Editors' Preface</i>	vii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xxxix

Part I – Commentary on the Articles of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights

Article 1 – Human Dignity	3
<i>Catherine Dupré</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 1	3
Select Bibliography	3
A. Article 1 and the Scope of EU Law	4
B. Interrelationship of Article 1 with Other Provisions of the Charter	6
C. Sources of Article 1	8
I. ECHR	8
II. Council of Europe Treaties	9
III. UN Treaties	10
IV. Relevant EU Law	11
V. Other Sources: National Constitutions.....	11
D. Analysis	13
I. General Remarks	13
II. Scope of Application	15
III. Specific Provisions.....	18
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	21
V. Remedies.....	23
E. Evaluation	24
Article 2 – Right to Life	25
<i>Elizabeth Wicks</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 2.....	25
Select Bibliography	25
A. Field of Application of Article 2.....	26
B. Interrelationship of Article 2 with Other Provisions of the Charter	27
C. Sources of Article 2 Rights.....	29
I. ECHR.....	29
II. UN Treaties.....	30
III. Other Sources	30

D.	Analysis	31
I.	General Remarks	31
II.	Scope of Application	31
III.	Specific Provisions.....	33
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	36
V.	Remedies.....	37
E.	Evaluation	38
 Article 3 – Right to the Integrity of the Person		39
<i>Sabine Michalowski</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 3	39
	Select Bibliography	39
A.	Field of Application of Article 3	40
B.	Interrelationship of Article 3 with Other Provisions of the Charter	42
C.	Sources of Article 3 Rights.....	43
I.	ECHR.....	43
II.	UN Treaties	43
III.	Council of Europe Treaties	43
D.	Analysis	44
I.	General Remarks	44
II.	Scope of Application	45
III.	Specific Provisions.....	46
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	57
V.	Remedies.....	58
E.	Evaluation	58
 Article 4 – Prohibition of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.....		61
<i>Manfred Nowak and Anne Charbord</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 4	61
	Select Bibliography	61
A.	Field of Application of Article 4.....	63
B.	Interrelationship of Article 4 with Other Provisions of the Charter	67
C.	Sources of Article 4 Rights.....	70
I.	ECHR.....	70
II.	UN Treaties	71
III.	Council of Europe Treaties	74
D.	Analysis	74
I.	General Remarks	74
II.	Scope of Application	76
III.	Specific Provisions.....	80
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	92
V.	Remedies.....	95
E.	Evaluation	97

Article 5 – Prohibition of Slavery and Forced Labour	101
<i>Heli Askola</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 5	101
Select Bibliography	102
A. Field of Application of Article 5	103
B. Interrelationship of Article 5 with Other Provisions of the Charter	104
C. Sources of Rights under Article 5.....	105
D. Analysis	106
I. General Remarks	106
II. Scope of Application	107
III. Specific Provisions.....	108
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	117
V. Remedies	118
Article 6 – Right to Liberty and Security.....	121
<i>Daniel Wilsher</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 6	121
Select Bibliography	122
A. Field of Application of Article 6	122
B. Interrelationship of Article 6 with Other Provisions of the Charter	125
C. Sources of Article 6 Rights.....	126
I. ECHR	126
II. UN Treaties	126
III. Council of Europe Treaties.....	127
IV. Other Sources.....	128
D. Analysis	128
I. General Remarks	128
II. Scope of Application	129
III. Specific Provisions.....	131
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	132
V. Remedies.....	150
E. Evaluation	150
Article 7 – Respect for Private and Family Life (Private Life, Home and Communications)	153
<i>Jens Vested-Hansen</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 7	153
Select Bibliography	153
A. Field of Application of Article 7 (Private Life, Home and Communications)	154
B. Interrelationship of Article 7 with Other Provisions of the Charter	154
C. Sources of Article 7 Rights.....	155

D. Analysis	155
I. General Remarks	155
II. Scope of Application	155
III. Specific Provisions.....	161
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	179
V. Remedies.....	180
E. Evaluation	181

**Article 7 – Right to Respect for Private and Family Life
(Family Life Aspects)183**
Shazia Choudhry

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 7	183
Select Bibliography	183
A. Field of Application of Article 7	183
I. Gender Equality.....	184
II. Children’s Rights	187
III. Free Movement, Immigration and Asylum	190
B. Interrelationship of Article 7 with Other Provisions of the Charter	193
C. Sources of Article 7 Rights.....	194
I. ECHR.....	194
II. Council of Europe Treaties	195
III. UN Treaties.....	198
D. Analysis	201
I. General Remarks	201
II. Scope of Application	202
III. Specific Provisions.....	207
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	216
V. Remedies.....	220
E. Evaluation	220

Article 8 – Protection of Personal Data.....223
Herke Kranenborg

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 8	223
Select Bibliography	223
A. Field of Application of Article 8.....	224
I. EU Competence on Data Protection before the Entry into Force of the Lisbon Treaty	224
II. EU Competence on Data Protection after the Entry into Force of the Lisbon Treaty	225
III. The Scope of Application of Secondary Legislation	227
B. Interrelationship of Article 8 with Other Provisions of the Charter	228
I. Article 7 (Right to Respect for Private and Family Life)	228
II. Article 11 (Freedom of Expression and Information).....	231
III. Article 17 (Right to Property) and Article 47 (Right to an Effective Remedy and to a Fair Trial)	232

IV. Article 21 (Prohibition of Discrimination)	233
V. Article 42 (Right of Access to Documents)	234
C. Sources of Article 8.....	235
I. ECHR.....	235
II. UN Treaties.....	236
III. Council of Europe Treaties	238
IV. Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development.....	238
D. Analysis	239
I. General Remarks	239
II. Scope of Application	241
III. Specific Provisions.....	247
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	259
V. Remedies.....	263
E. Evaluation	264

Article 9 – Right to Marry and Right to Found a Family.....267

Shazia Choudhry

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 9	267
Select Bibliography	267
A. Field of Application of Article 9.....	267
B. Interrelationship of Article 9 with Other Provisions of the Charter	273
C. Sources of Article 9 Rights.....	274
I. ECHR.....	274
II. Council of Europe Treaties	275
III. UN Treaties.....	277
D. Analysis	279
I. General Remarks	279
II. Scope of Application	280
III. Specific Provisions.....	280
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	287
V. Remedies.....	290
E. Evaluation	290

Article 10 – Right to Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion.....291

Ronan McCrea

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 10	291
Select Bibliography	291
A. Field of Application of Article 10.....	291
B. Interrelationship of Article 10 with Other Provisions of the Charter	293
I. Religious Freedom and Free Expression.....	293
II. Discrimination on Grounds of Religion.....	295
C. Sources of Article 10 Rights.....	298
D. Analysis	299
I. General Remarks	299
II. Scope of Application	300

III. Specific Provisions.....	301
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	301
V. Remedies.....	307
E. Evaluation	307
F. Conclusion.....	309

Article 11 – Freedom of Expression and Information311

Lorna Woods

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 11	311
Select Bibliography	311
A. Field of Application of Article 11	312
B. Interrelationship of Article 11 with Other Provisions of the Charter	314
C. Sources of Article 11 Rights.....	314
I. ECHR.....	314
II. UN Treaties.....	315
III. Council of Europe Treaties	318
IV. Other Sources	318
D. Analysis	320
I. General Remarks	320
II. Scope of Application	321
III. Specific Provisions.....	325
IV. Limits and Derogations	327
V. Remedies.....	330
E. Evaluation	331

Article 12 – Freedom of Assembly and of Association341

Article 12(1)341

Filip Dorssemont

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 12(1)	341
Select Bibliography	341
A. Field of Application of Article 12(1).....	342
B. Interrelationship of Article 12(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter	345
C. Sources of Article 12(1) Rights.....	347
I. Council of Europe Treaties	347
II. UN Treaties.....	348
III. Other Sources	349
D. Analysis	349
I. General Remarks	349
II. Scope of Application	350
III. Limitations and Derogations.....	359
IV. Remedies.....	360
E. Evaluation	364

Article 12(2)	367
<i>Jo Shaw and Lamin Khadar</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 12(2)	367
Select Bibliography	367
A. Field of Application of Article 12(2)	368
B. Interrelationship of Article 12(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter	368
C. Sources of Article 12(2) Rights	368
I. ECHR	369
II. UN Treaties	369
III. Other Sources	370
D. Analysis	370
I. General Remarks	370
II. Scope of Application	375
III. Detailed Analysis	375
IV. Limitations and Derogations	377
V. Remedies	377
E. Evaluation	377
Article 13 – Freedom of the Arts and Sciences	379
<i>Debbie Sayers</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 13	379
Select Bibliography	379
A. Field of Application of Article 13	379
B. Interrelationship of Article 13 with Other Provisions of the Charter	381
C. Sources of Article 13 Rights	382
I. ECHR	382
II. UN Treaties	383
III. Council of Europe Treaties	387
IV. Other Sources	388
D. Analysis	389
I. General Remarks	389
II. Scope of Application	390
III. Specific Provisions	391
IV. Limitations and Derogations	397
V. Remedies	398
E. Evaluation	399
Article 14 – Right to Education	401
<i>Gisella Gori</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 14	401
Select Bibliography	401
A. Field of Application of Article 14	402
B. Interrelationship of Article 14 with Other Provisions of the Charter	407

C.	Sources of Article 14 Rights.....	408
I.	ECHR.....	408
II.	UN Treaties.....	411
III.	Council of Europe Treaties.....	412
IV.	Other Sources.....	413
D.	Analysis.....	414
I.	General Remarks.....	414
II.	Scope of Application.....	416
III.	Specific Provisions.....	418
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	419
V.	Remedies.....	420
E.	Evaluation.....	421
 Article 15 – Freedom to Choose an Occupation and Right to Engage in Work.....		423
<i>Diamond Ashiagbor</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 15.....	423
	Select Bibliography.....	423
A.	Article 15 and the Scope of EU Law.....	424
B.	Interrelationship of Article 15 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	425
C.	Sources of Article 15 Rights.....	427
I.	European Social Charter.....	427
II.	UN Treaties.....	429
III.	Other Sources.....	430
D.	Analysis.....	430
I.	General Remarks.....	430
II.	Scope of Application.....	431
III.	Specific Provisions.....	432
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	433
V.	Remedies.....	434
E.	Evaluation.....	435
 Article 16 – Freedom to Conduct a Business.....		437
<i>Michele Everson and Rui Correia Gonçalves</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 16.....	437
	Select Bibliography.....	437
A.	Field of Application.....	438
I.	Freedom to Conduct a Business as a Human Right.....	440
II.	Freedom to Conduct a Business as an Element of the European Economic Constitution.....	441
B.	Relation of Article 16 to Articles 15 and 17 of the Charter.....	442
C.	Sources of Law.....	445
D.	Analysis.....	448
I.	General Remarks.....	448
II.	Scope of Application of Article 16.....	450

III. Specific Provisions.....	452
IV. Limitation to and Derogations from the Application of Article 16.....	458
V. Remedies.....	462
E. Conclusion.....	463

Article 17 – Right to Property.....465

Article 17(1)465

Ferdinand Wollenschläger

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 17(1)	465
Select Bibliography	465
A. Field of Application of Article 17(1).....	467
B. Interrelationship of Article 17(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter	467
C. Sources of Article 17(1) Rights.....	468
I. ECHR.....	468
II. UN Treaties.....	469
III. Other Sources	469
D. Analysis	470
I. General Remarks	470
II. Scope of Application	471
III. Limitations and Derogations.....	476
IV. Remedies.....	486
E. Evaluation	487

Article 17(2)489

Paul Torremans

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 17(2)	489
Select Bibliography	489
A. Field of Application of Article 17(2).....	490
B. Interrelationship of Article 17(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter	492
C. Sources of Article 17(2) Rights.....	494
I. The Human Rights Approach to Copyright in International Instruments.....	494
II. The Human Rights Approach to Other Intellectual Property Rights in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	500
III. ECHR.....	501
D. Analysis	502
I. General Remarks	502
II. Scope of Application	503
III. Specific Provisions.....	503
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	515
V. Remedies.....	516
E. Evaluation	516

Article 18 – Right to Asylum	519
<i>Maarten den Heijer</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 18	519
Select Bibliography	519
A. Field of Application of Article 18	520
B. Interrelationship of Article 18 with Other Provisions of the Charter	521
C. Sources of Article 18 Rights	523
I. ECHR	523
II. UN Treaties	523
III. Council of Europe Treaties	526
IV. Constitutional Traditions	528
V. Other Sources	529
D. Analysis	530
I. General Remarks	530
II. Scope of Application	531
III. Limitations and Derogations	537
IV. Remedies	539
E. Evaluation	539
Article 19 – Protection in the Event of Removal, Expulsion or Extradition	543
<i>Elsbeth Guild</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 19	543
Select Bibliography	543
A. Article 19 and the Scope of EU Law	544
B. Interrelationship of Article 19 with Other Provisions of the Charter	545
C. Sources of Article 19 Rights	546
I. ECHR	546
II. UN Treaties	546
III. Council of Europe Treaties	548
IV. Other Treaties	548
V. Relevant EU law	548
D. Analysis	552
I. General Remarks	552
II. Scope of Application	553
III. Specific Provisions	554
IV. Limitations and Derogations	559
V. Remedies	560
E. Evaluation	561
Article 20 – Equality before the Law	563
<i>Mark Bell</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 20	563
Select Bibliography	563
A. Field of Application of Article 20	563
B. Interrelationship of Article 20 with Other Provisions of the Charter	564

C.	Sources of Article 20 Rights.....	566
I.	ECHR.....	566
II.	UN Treaties.....	567
III.	Council of Europe Treaties.....	567
IV.	Other Sources.....	567
D.	Analysis.....	568
I.	General Remarks.....	568
II.	Scope of Application.....	569
III.	Specific Provisions.....	570
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	573
V.	Remedies.....	575
E.	Evaluation.....	576
Article 21 – Non-Discrimination.....		579
<i>Claire Kilpatrick</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 21.....	579
	Select Bibliography.....	579
A.	Field of Application of Article 21.....	580
B.	Interrelationship of Article 21 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	582
C.	Sources of Article 21 Rights.....	584
I.	ECHR.....	584
II.	UN Treaties.....	584
III.	Council of Europe Treaties.....	586
D.	Analysis.....	586
I.	General Remarks.....	586
II.	Scope of Application.....	587
III.	Specific Provisions.....	594
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	600
V.	Remedies.....	602
E.	Evaluation.....	602
Article 22 – Cultural, Religious and Linguistic Diversity.....		605
<i>Rachael Craufurd Smith</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 22.....	605
	Select Bibliography.....	605
A.	Field of Application of Article 22.....	605
B.	Interrelationship of Article 22 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	610
C.	Sources of Article 22 Rights.....	613
I.	ECHR.....	613
II.	UN Treaties.....	616
III.	Council of Europe Treaties.....	617
IV.	Other.....	618
D.	Analysis.....	618
I.	General Remarks.....	618
II.	Scope of Application.....	622
III.	Specific Provisions.....	623

IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	627
V. Remedies.....	629
E. Evaluation	630
Article 23 – Equality between Women and Men	633
<i>Dagmar Schiek</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 23	633
Select Bibliography	633
A. Field of Application of Article 23	634
B. Interrelationship of Article 23 with Other Provisions of the Charter	636
I. Article 23 and Articles 20, 21 CFREU.....	636
II. Article 23 and Other Charter Articles.....	638
C. Sources for Article 23 Rights	639
I. Council of Europe Treaties	639
II. UN Treaties	640
III. EU Law.....	641
D. Analysis	643
I. General Remarks	643
II. Paragraph 1.....	644
III. Paragraph 2.....	650
E. Evaluation	655
I. Opportunities	655
II. Shortcomings.....	659
III. Conclusion.....	660
Article 24 – The Rights of the Child	661
<i>Ruth Lamont</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 24	661
Select Bibliography	661
A. Field of Application of Article 24.....	662
B. Interrelationship of Article 24 with Other Provisions of the Charter	671
C. Sources of Article 24 Rights.....	672
I. ECHR.....	672
II. UN Treaties	674
D. Analysis	678
I. General Remarks	678
II. Scope of Application	679
III. Specific Provisions.....	680
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	686
V. Remedies.....	688
E. Evaluation	689
Article 25 – The Rights of the Elderly.....	693
<i>Colm O’Cinneide</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 25	693
Select Bibliography	693

A. Field of Application of Article 25	694
B. Interrelationship of Article 25 with Other Provisions of the Charter	695
C. Sources of Article 25 Rights	696
I. ECHR	696
II. UN Treaties	697
III. Council of Europe Treaties	698
IV. Other Sources	699
D. Analysis	701
I. General Remarks	701
II. Scope of Application	703
III. Specific Provisions	705
IV. Limitations and Derogations	706
V. Remedies	706
E. Evaluation	706

Article 26 – Integration of Persons with Disabilities **709**

Charlotte O'Brien

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 26	709
Select Bibliography	709

A. Field of Application of Article 26	710
B. Interrelationship of Article 26 with Other Provisions of the Charter	712
C. Sources of Article 26 Rights	717
I. ECHR	717
II. UN Treaties	721
III. Council of Europe Treaties	726
IV. Other Sources	728
D. Analysis	729
I. General Remarks	729
II. Scope of Application	734
III. Specific Provisions	736
IV. Limitations and Derogations	743
V. Remedies	745
E. Evaluation	747

Article 27 – Workers’ Right to Information and Consultation within the Undertaking **749**

Filip Dorsemont

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 27	749
Select Bibliography	749

A. Field of Application of Article 27	749
B. Interrelationship of Article 27 with Other Provisions of the Charter	750
C. Sources of Article 27 Rights	752
D. Analysis	755
I. General Remarks	755
II. Scope of Application	756
III. Specific Provisions	758

IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	763
V. Remedies.....	768
E. Evaluation	769
Article 28 – Right of Collective Bargaining and Action	773
<i>Catherine Barnard</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 28	773
Select Bibliography	773
A. Field of Application of Article 28 CFREU	774
B. Interrelationship of Article 28 with Other Provisions of the Charter	777
I. Other Provisions in the Charter.....	777
II. Protocol 30.....	778
C. Sources of Article 28 Rights.....	779
I. Right to Bargain Collectively.....	779
II. Right to Take Collective Action.....	781
D. Analysis	783
I. General Remarks	783
II. Scope of Application: Definition of Terms.....	784
III. Specific Provisions.....	787
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	792
V. Remedies.....	793
E. Evaluation	794
Article 29 – Right of Access to Placement Services.....	795
<i>Diamond Ashiagbor</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 29	795
Select Bibliography	795
A. Article 29 and the Scope of EU Law.....	795
B. Interrelationship of Article 29 with Other Provisions of the Charter	797
C. Sources of Article 29 Rights.....	798
I. Council of Europe: European Social Charter.....	798
II. UN Treaties.....	798
III. Other Sources	800
D. Analysis	800
I. General Remarks	800
II. Scope of Application.....	801
III. Specific Provisions.....	802
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	802
V. Remedies.....	802
E. Evaluation	803
Article 30 – Protection in the Event of Unjustified Dismissal	805
<i>Jeff Kenner</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 30	805
Select Bibliography	805
A. Article 30 and the Scope of EU Law.....	805

B. Interrelationship of Article 30 with Other Provisions of the Charter	810
C. Sources of Article 30 Rights.....	814
I. ECHR.....	814
II. UN Treaties.....	815
III. ILO	816
IV. Council of Europe Treaties	817
V. National Constitutional Laws.....	817
D. Analysis	818
I. General Remarks	818
II. Scope of Application	824
III. Specific Provisions.....	825
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	829
V. Remedies.....	831
E. Evaluation	832

Article 31 – Fair and Just Working Conditions.....833

Alan Bogg

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 31	833
Select Bibliography	833

A. Article 31 and the Scope of EU Law.....	834
B. Interrelationship of Article 31 with Other Provisions of the Charter	836
C. Sources of Article 31 Rights.....	839
I. Council of Europe Treaties	839
II. Other Sources	841
D. Analysis	845
I. General Remarks	845
II. Scope of Application	850
III. Specific Provisions.....	852
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	862
V. Remedies.....	867
E. Evaluation	868

Article 32 – Prohibition of Child Labour and Protection of Young People at Work869

Helen Stalford

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 32	869
Select Bibliography	869

A. Field of Application of Article 32	870
B. Interrelationship of Article 32 with Other Provisions of the Charter	874
C. Sources of Article 32 Rights.....	876
I. UN Treaties.....	876
II. Council of Europe Treaties	877
III. Other Sources	878
D. Analysis	879
I. General Remarks	879
II. Scope of Application	879

III. Specific Provisions.....	883
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	884
V. Remedies.....	886
E. Evaluation	888

Article 33 – Family and Professional Life.....891

Cathryn Costello

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 33	891
Select Bibliography	891
A. Field of Application of Article 33	892
B. Interrelationship of Article 33 with Other Provisions of the Charter	895
C. Sources of Article 33 Rights.....	897
I. ECHR.....	897
II. UN Treaties.....	900
III. Council of Europe Sources—The European Social Charter and Revised European Social Charter.....	905
IV. Other Sources	911
D. Analysis	917
I. General Remarks	917
II. Scope of Application	918
III. Specific Provisions and Issues	919
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	922
V. Remedies.....	923
E. Evaluation	924

Article 34 – Social Security and Social Assistance927

Robin White

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 34	927
Select Bibliography	927
A. Field of Application of Article 34.....	928
B. Interrelationship of Article 34 with Other Provisions of the Charter	930
C. Sources of Article 34 Rights.....	930
I. ECHR.....	930
II. UN Treaties.....	932
III. Council of Europe Treaties	933
IV. Other Sources	936
D. Analysis	936
I. General Remarks	936
II. Scope of Application	937
III. Specific Provisions.....	941
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	947
V. Remedies.....	948
E. Evaluation	948

Article 35 – The Right to Health Care	951
<i>Tamara Hervey and Jean McHale</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 35	951
Select Bibliography	951
A. Field of Application of Article 35	951
B. Interrelationship of Article 35 with Other Provisions of the Charter	952
C. Sources of Article 35 Rights	953
I. ECHR	953
II. UN Treaties	953
III. Council of Europe Treaties	954
IV. Other Sources	956
D. Analysis	957
I. General Remarks	957
II. Scope of Application	957
III. Specific Provisions	959
IV. Limitations and Derogations	966
V. Remedies	966
E. Evaluation	967
 Article 36 – Access to Services of General Economic Interest.....	 969
<i>Erika Szyszczak</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 36	969
Select Bibliography	969
A. Article 36 and the Scope of EU Law.....	969
B. Interrelationship of Article 36 with Other Provisions of the Charter	970
C. Sources of Article 36 ‘Rights’ and ‘Principles’	971
D. Analysis	971
I. General Remarks	971
II. Scope of Application	972
III. Specific Provisions.....	972
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	981
V. Remedies.....	981
E. Evaluation	981
 Article 37 – Environmental Protection	 983
<i>Elisa Morgera and Gracia Marín Durán</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 37	983
Select Bibliography	983
A. Field of Application of Article 37	984
B. Interrelationship of Article 37 with Other Provisions of the Charter	985
C. Sources of Article 37	987
I. EU Law.....	987
II. National Constitutional Law	989

D. Analysis	991
I. General Remarks	991
II. Specific Provisions.....	992
III. Legal Nature.....	995
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	997
V. Remedies.....	1000
E. Evaluation	1002
Article 38 – Consumer Protection	1005
<i>Steve Weatherill</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 38	1005
Select Bibliography	1005
A. Field of Application of Article 38.....	1005
B. Interrelationship of Article 38 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1006
C. Sources of Article 38 Rights.....	1006
D. Analysis	1008
I. General Remarks	1008
II. Scope of Application	1010
III. Specific Provisions.....	1010
IV. Limitations.....	1024
V. Remedies.....	1025
E. Evaluation	1025
Article 39 – Right to Vote and to Stand as a Candidate at Elections to the European Parliament.....	1027
<i>Lamin Khadar and Jo Shaw</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 39	1027
Select Bibliography	1027
A. Field of Application of Article 39.....	1028
B. Interrelationship of Article 39 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1028
C. Sources of Article 39 Rights.....	1030
I. ECHR.....	1030
II. UN Treaties	1030
III. Council of Europe Treaties	1032
IV. Other Sources	1032
D. Analysis	1033
I. General Remarks	1033
II. Scope of Application	1040
III. Specific Provisions.....	1040
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1046
V. Remedies.....	1050
E. Evaluation	1052

Article 40 – Right to Vote and to Stand as a Candidate at Municipal Elections.....	1057
<i>Kees Groenendijk</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 40	1057
Select Bibliography	1057
A. Field of Application of Article 40.....	1058
B. Interrelationship of Article 40 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1058
C. Sources of Article 40 Rights.....	1059
I. ECHR.....	1059
II. UN Treaties.....	1060
III. Council of Europe.....	1061
IV. Other Sources	1061
D. Analysis	1062
I. General Remarks	1062
II. Scope of Application	1063
III. Specific Provisions.....	1064
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1065
V. Remedies.....	1066
E. Evaluation	1066
 Article 41 – Right to Good Administration.....	 1069
<i>Paul Craig</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 41	1069
Select Bibliography	1069
A. Article 41 and the Scope of EU Law.....	1070
B. Interrelationship of Article 41 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1071
C. Sources of Article 41 Rights.....	1071
D. Analysis	1072
I. General Remarks	1072
II. Scope of Application	1072
III. Specific Provisions.....	1076
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1097
V. Remedies.....	1097
E. Evaluation	1098
 Article 42 – Right of Access to Documents	 1099
<i>Deirdre Curtin and Joana Mendes</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 42	1099
Select Bibliography	1099
A. Field of Application of Article 42.....	1100
B. Interrelationship of Article 42 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1102
C. Sources of Article 42 Rights.....	1103

D. Analysis	1104
I. General Remarks	1104
II. Scope of Application	1107
III. Specific Provisions.....	1111
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1112
V. Remedies.....	1118
E. Evaluation	1118
Article 43 – European Ombudsman.....	1121
<i>Ian Harden</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 43	1121
Select Bibliography	1121
A. Field of Application of Article 43.....	1121
B. Interrelationship of Article 43 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1124
C. Sources of Article 43 Rights.....	1124
I. UN Treaties	1125
II. Council of Europe Treaties	1125
III. Other Sources	1126
D. Analysis	1127
I. General Remarks	1127
II. Scope of Application	1129
III. Specific Provisions.....	1136
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1140
V. Remedies.....	1141
E. Evaluation	1143
I. The Ombudsman Remedy as an Alternative Route to Redress.....	1144
II. The Ombudsman Remedy as an Instrument of Public Participation	1147
III. Future Trends	1149
Article 44 – Right to Petition	1151
<i>Mats Lindfelt</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 44	1151
Selected Bibliography.....	1151
A. Field of Application of Article 44.....	1151
B. Interrelationship with Other Provisions of the Charter	1152
C. Sources of Article 44 Rights.....	1153
D. Analysis	1154
I. General Remarks	1154
II. Scope of Application	1155
III. Specific Provisions.....	1157
IV. Limitations.....	1158
V. Remedies.....	1158
E. Evaluation	1159
I. A Tool for Democratic Control.....	1159

Article 45 – Freedom of Movement and of Residence 1161

Eleanor Spaventa

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 45 1161

Select Bibliography 1161

A. Field of Application of Article 45 1161

B. Interrelationship of Article 45 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1162

C. Sources of Article 45 Rights 1163

D. Analysis 1164

I. General Remarks 1164

II. Scope of Application—Article 45(1) 1164

III. Right to Move, Right to Enter and Right to Exit 1165

IV. Right to Reside 1166

V. The Right to Move and Claims Against the Member State of Origin 1172

VI. Nature of Charter Rights—and Purely Internal Situations 1174

VII. Article 45(2) 1175

VIII. Remedies 1175

E. Evaluation 1176

Article 46 – Diplomatic and Consular Protection 1177

Eileen Denza

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 46 1177

Select Bibliography 1177

A. Field of Application of Article 46 1178

B. Interrelationship of Article 46 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1178

C. Sources of Article 46 Rights 1179

I. Commission Proposals and Research 1180

II. National Implementing Measures 1181

D. Analysis 1181

I. General Remarks 1181

II. Background—Diplomatic Protection, Protection by Diplomatic Missions and Consular Protection 1184

III. Scope of the ‘Right’ to Protection 1185

IV. Whether ‘Diplomatic Protection’ in the Formal Sense is Covered 1187

V. Specific Provisions 1188

VI. Limitations 1193

VII. Remedies 1193

E. Evaluation 1194

Article 47 – Right to an Effective Remedy and to a Fair Trial 1197

Pekka Aalto, Herwig CH Hofmann, Liisa Holopainen, Elina Paunio,

Laurent Pech, Debbie Sayers, Dinah Shelton and Angela Ward

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 47 1197

Select Bibliography 1198

A. Field of Application 1199

B. Interrelationship with Other Provisions of the Charter 1199

C.	Sources of Article 47 Rights.....	1200
I.	An ‘Effective Remedy’.....	1200
II.	A ‘Fair and Public Hearing’.....	1205
III.	‘Within a Reasonable Time’.....	1207
IV.	‘By an Independent and Impartial Tribunal Previously Established by Law’.....	1207
V.	Legal Aid for Indigents.....	1209
D.	Analysis.....	1209
I.	General Remarks.....	1209
II.	Scope of Application.....	1210
III.	Specific Provisions (Meaning).....	1211
IV.	Effective Remedies before Member State Courts and the Principle of Non-Discrimination.....	1228
V.	Damages for Breach of the Charter.....	1235
VI.	Effective Judicial Remedies before the Court of Justice.....	1241
VII.	Article 47(2): Everyone is entitled to a fair and public hearing within a reasonable time <i>by an independent and impartial tribunal previously established by law</i> . Everyone shall have the possibility of being advised, defended and represented.....	1250
VIII.	Article 47(2): Everyone is entitled to a <i>fair and public hearing within a reasonable time</i> by an independent and impartial tribunal previously established by law. Everyone shall have the possibility of being advised, defended and represented.....	1258
IX.	Article 47(3): Legal aid shall be made available to those who lack sufficient resources in so far as such aid is necessary to ensure effective access to justice.....	1269
E.	Evaluation.....	1273
	Article 48 – Presumption of Innocence and Right of Defence (Administrative Law).....	1277
	<i>Hanns Peter Nehl</i>	
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 48.....	1277
	Select Bibliography.....	1277
I.	ARTICLE 48(1)—PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE	
A.	Field of Application of Article 48(1).....	1278
B.	Interrelationship of Article 48(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	1279
C.	Sources of Rights under Article 48(1).....	1280
D.	Analysis.....	1281
I.	General Remarks.....	1281
II.	Scope of Application.....	1282
III.	Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48(1).....	1283
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	1287
V.	Remedies.....	1288
E.	Evaluation.....	1289
II.	ARTICLE 48(2)—RIGHTS OF THE DEFENCE	
A.	Field of Application of Article 48(2).....	1289
B.	Interrelationship of Article 48(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	1291

C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(2).....	1291
D. Analysis	1292
I. General Remarks.....	1292
II. Scope of Application.....	1292
III. Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48(2)	1293
IV. Limitations and Derogations	1298
V. Remedies	1298
E. Evaluation	1301

Article 48 – Presumption of Innocence and Right of Defence (Criminal Law).....1303

Debbie Sayers

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 48	1303
Select Bibliography	1303

I. ARTICLE 48(1)—PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE

A. Field of Application of Article 48(1).....	1304
B. Interrelationship of Article 48(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter	1305
C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(1).....	1306
I. ECHR.....	1306
II. UN Treaties.....	1307
III. Council of Europe Treaties	1309
IV. Other Sources	1309

II. ARTICLE 48(2)—RIGHTS OF THE DEFENCE

A. Field of Application of Article 48(2).....	1309
B. Interrelationship of Article 48(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter	1313
C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(2).....	1313
I. ECHR.....	1313
II. UN Treaties.....	1316
III. Other Sources	1319
D. Analysis	1319
I. General Remarks	1319
II. Scope of Application	1321
III. Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48.....	1322
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1344
V. Remedies	1345
E. Evaluation	1347

Article 49 – Principles of Legality and Proportionality of Criminal Offences and Penalties.....1351

Valsamis Mitsilegas

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 49	1351
Select Bibliography	1351

A. Field of Application of Article 49.....	1352
B. Interrelationship of Article 49 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1352

C.	Sources of Rights under Article 49	1353
I.	UN Sources	1353
II.	ECHR	1354
D.	Analysis	1358
I.	General Remarks	1358
II.	Legality	1359
III.	Proportionality	1365
E.	Evaluation	1371

Article 50 – Right not to be Tried or Punished Twice in Criminal Proceedings for the same Criminal Offence1373
Jonathan Tomkin

	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 50	1373
	Select Bibliography	1373

A.	Field of Application of Article 50	1374
I.	Criminal Law	1375
II.	Administrative Law Proceedings and Sanctions.....	1377
B.	Interrelationship of Article 50 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1378
C.	Sources of Rights under Article 50.....	1379
I.	ECHR	1380
II.	UN Treaties	1381
III.	Other Sources	1383
D.	Analysis	1384
I.	General Remarks	1384
II.	Scope of Application	1385
III.	Specific Provisions.....	1392
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	1407
V.	Remedies.....	1410
E.	Evaluation	1411

Article 51 – Field of Application1413
Angela Ward

	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 51	1413
	Select Bibliography	1414

A.	Field of Application of Article 51	1415
B.	Interrelationship of Article 51 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1415
I.	Article 51(1).....	1415
II.	Article 51(2).....	1421
C.	Sources of Article 51 Rules	1422
D.	Analysis	1424
I.	General Remarks	1424
II.	Specific Provisions.....	1427
E.	Evaluation	1449

Article 52 – Scope and Interpretation of Rights and Principles	1455
<i>Steve Peers and Sacha Prechal</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 52	1455
Select Bibliography	1457
A. Field of Application of Article 52	1458
B. Interrelationship of Article 52 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1458
C. Sources of Article 52 Rules	1459
D. Analysis	1459
I. General Remarks	1459
II. Specific Provisions	1461
E. Evaluation	1521
Article 53 – Level of Protection	1523
<i>Bruno de Witte</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 53	1523
Select Bibliography	1523
A. Sources of Article 53	1524
B. Analysis	1524
I. Relation with the Rest of European Union Law	1525
II. Relation with International Law	1526
III. Relation with National Constitutions	1527
IV. An Exception to the Primacy of EU Law?	1529
V. The Legal Significance of Article 53	1533
C. Conclusion	1537
Article 54 – Abuse of Rights	1539
<i>Lorna Woods</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 54	1539
Select Bibliography	1539
A. Article 54 and the Scope of EU Law	1539
B. Interrelationship of Article 54 with Other Provisions of the Charter	1540
C. Sources of Article 54 Rights	1540
I. ECHR	1540
II. UN Treaties	1541
III. Council of Europe Treaties	1543
IV. Other Sources	1544
D. Analysis	1545
I. General Remarks	1545
II. Scope of Application	1545
III. Specific Provisions	1547
IV. Limits and Derogation	1550
E. Evaluation	1550

Part II – Reflections on the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights

The Place of the Charter in the EU Constitutional Edifice1559
Koen Lenaerts and José Antonio Gutiérrez-Fons

A. The Scope of Application of the Charter1561

 I. *Wachauf* as a Token of Positive Action on the Part
of the Member States1562

 II. The Derogation Situation1568

 III. *Annibaldi* as an Example of the Situations where
the Charter does not Apply1569

B. The Charter and Primary EU Law1571

 I. The Charter and the Treaties1571

 II. The Charter and General Principles of EU Law.....1575

C. The Charter and the Common Constitutional Space1580

 I. The Charter and the ECHR.....1580

 II. The Charter and the Constitutional Traditions Common
to the Member States1586

D. Concluding Remarks.....1592

**Protocol (No 30) on the Application of the Charter of Fundamental Rights
of the European Union to Poland and the United Kingdom1595**
Anthony Arnall

Select Bibliography1596

A. Introduction1597

B. The Background to Protocol No 301599

C. The Meaning and Effect of Protocol No 30.....1603

 I. The Preamble.....1603

 II. Article 1(1) of the Protocol1604

 III. Article 1(2) of the Protocol1607

 IV. Article 2 of the Protocol.....1609

D. Evaluation1610

**The EU Fundamental Rights Agency and the Fundamental Rights Charter:
How Fundamental is the Link Between them?.....1613**
Gabriel N Toggenburg

A. Introduction1613

B. The FRA: a Glimpse at its Role in the EU’s Institutional Landscape.....1614

C. The Agency’s Founding Regulation and its Multiannual
Framework: a Case of ‘Charter-blindness?’1616

D. The Charter in the Agency’s Practice: Legal Benchmark and Tool1619

E. Instead of Conclusions: a Triptych of Proposals for Making the Link
Between the Charter, and the Agency even more Fundamental1623

**The Implementation of the Charter by the Institutions
of the European Union1627**
Olivier De Schutter

A. Introduction1627

B. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights
in the Work of the European Parliament.....1629

 I. The Parliament’s Role in Monitoring the EU Member States.....1629

 II. The Parliament as Guardian of Legality1636

 III. The Parliament as Co-legislator1641

C. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights
by the European Commission1643

 I. Assessment of Compatibility of Legislative Proposals
with the Charter1643

 II. Impact Assessments.....1645

 III. Ensuring the Implementation of the Charter of Fundamental Rights.....1648

D. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights
by the Council of the EU1650

E. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights
in Law- and Policy-making: the Next Steps.....1652

**The Extraterritorial Application of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights:
From Territoriality to Facticity, the Effectiveness Model1657**
Violeta Moreno-Lax and Cathryn Costello

Select Bibliography1657

A. Introduction1658

B. Relevant Provisions: The Treaty and the Charter.....1661

C. The Place of ‘Jurisdiction’ in the EU Legal Order1663

 I. ‘PIL Jurisdiction’ and EU Law1663

 II. ‘IHL Jurisdiction’ and EU Law.....1668

D. Analysis: The Applicability of EU Fundamental Rights,
an Autonomous Paradigm1679

E. Evaluation: The Emergence of a New Model1682

The Charter and Universal Human Rights Instruments1685
Allan Rosas

A. Introduction1685

B. The Relevance of International Human Rights Instruments
for the Development of EU Fundamental Rights1687

C. Examples from Case Law1691

D. Human Rights Instruments in EU External Relations.....1694

E. The Lisbon Treaty, the Charter and Universal Instruments1697

F. Conclusions1700

**Fundamental Social Rights in the Charter—Are They Rights?
Are They Fundamental?1703**
Niilo Jääskinen

A. Introduction	1703
B. A Short History of EU Fundamental Social Rights.....	1704
C. Nature and Effects of Fundamental Social Rights.....	1707
I. Philosophical Foundations of Fundamental Social Rights.....	1708
II. Effects of Fundamental Social Rights	1710
D. Protection of Fundamental Social Rights in a Multi-level Constitutional Structure	1710
E. From an Exception to the Fundamental.....	1712

**The Explanations Relating to the Charter of Fundamental Rights
of the European Union1715**
Jean-Paul Jacqué

A. The Origin of the Explanations.....	1715
I. The First Convention: the Explanations as an Explanatory Report.....	1716
II. The Second Convention: Moving Towards a Specific Status for the Explanations.....	1717
B. A Diversified Content	1718
C. The Use of the Explanations in Jurisdiction.....	1721
I. The Search for the Source of a Guaranteed Right	1721
II. Interpreting the Charter’s Guaranteed Rights and General Provisions.....	1722
D. Conclusion	1724

**Part III – Commentary on the Treaty of EU Accession to the European
Convention on Human Rights**

**Agreement on the Accession of the European Union to the European
Convention on Human Rights1727**
Paul Gragl

Text of the Agreement.....	1727
Select Bibliography	1733
A. Background and Overview of EU Accession to the ECHR.....	1734
I. The Long History of Accession	1734
II. The Constraints of Article 218 TFEU, Article 6(2) TEU, and Protocol No 8 to the Treaties.....	1737
III. The Relevance of Article 52(3) of the Charter of Fundamental Rights.....	1741
B. The Substantive Provisions of the Accession Agreement.....	1745
Article 1—Scope of the Accession and Amendments to Article 59 of the Convention	1745
Article 2—Reservations to the Convention and the Protocols	1758
Article 3—Co-Respondent Mechanism.....	1761
Article 4—Inter-Party Cases.....	1790

Contents

Article 5—Interpretation of Articles 35 and 55 of the Convention.....	1795
Article 6—Election of Judges	1797
Article 7—Participation of the European Union in the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe	1801
Article 8—Participation of the European Union in the Expenditure Related to the Convention.....	1812
Article 9—Relations with other Agreements.....	1815
Article 10—Signature and Entry into Force.....	1817
Article 11—Reservations	1819
Article 12—Notifications.....	1819
C. Appraisal	1820
<i>Appendix</i>	1825
<i>Index</i>	1861

List of Contributors

Pekka Aalto is a Référéndaire in the chambers of Advocate General Niilo Jääskinen at the Court of Justice of the European Union.

Anthony Arnull is Barber Professor of Jurisprudence at Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham.

Diamond Ashiagbor is Professor of Labour Law at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London.

Heli Askola is a Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Law, Monash University.

Catherine Barnard is Professor of European Law, Co-director of the Centre for European Legal Studies and Jean Monnet Chair of EU Law at Cambridge University.

Mark Bell is Professor of Law at the University of Leicester.

Alan Bogg is Professor of Labour Law at the University of Oxford with a Fellowship at Hertford College.

Anne Charbord is a Consultant on Human Rights and a Guest Lecturer at the Vienna Master of Arts in Human Rights.

Shazia Choudhry is a Reader in Law at Queen Mary, University of London.

Rui Correia Gonçalves is a Senior Teaching Assistant and PhD Student at Birkbeck School of Law, University of London.

Cathryn Costello is the Andrew W Mellon University Lecturer in International Human Rights and Refugee Law, at the Refugee Studies Centre, Oxford, and a Fellow of St Antony's College.

Paul Craig is Professor of English Law at the University of Oxford with a Fellowship at St John's College.

Rachael Craufurd Smith is Reader of European Union Law at the University of Edinburgh.

Deirdre Curtin is Professor of European Law at the University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands.

Olivier De Schutter is Professor of International Law at the Université Catholique de Louvain, Belgium.

Eileen Denza was a Legal Counsellor, Foreign and Commonwealth Office, Council to the Committee, House of Lords and a Visiting Professor at University College London.

Filip Dorssement is Professor of Labour Law at the Université Catholique de Louvain, Belgium.

Catherine Dupré is a Senior Lecturer in Law at the University of Exeter.

Michele Everson is Professor of Law at Birkbeck College, University of London.

Gisella Gori is a Senior Political Advisor for Human Rights and Multilateral Issues at the Delegation of the European Union to the United States, EU External Action Service.

Paul Gragl is a Lecturer in Law at Queen Mary, University of London.

Kees Groenendijk is Professor Emeritus of Sociology of Law at Radboud University Nijmegen, the Netherlands.

Elsbeth Guild is Jean Monnet Professor *ad personam* at Queen Mary, University of London as well as at Radboud University Nijmegen, the Netherlands.

José Antonio Gutiérrez-Fons is a *Référéndaire* in the cabinet of Vice-President Koen Lenaerts at the Court of Justice of the European Union, and a Visiting Lecturer at the Universidad Autónoma de Madrid.

Ian Harden is Secretary-General at the European Ombudsman's Office.

Maarten den Heijer is an Assistant Professor of International Law at the University of Amsterdam.

Tamara Hervey is Head of the School of Law and Jean Monnet *ad personam* Professor of European Union Law at the University of Sheffield.

Herwig CH Hofmann is Professor of European and Transnational Public Law and Jean Monnet Chair in the Centre for European Law at the Faculty of Law, Economics and Finance of the University of Luxembourg.

Liisa Holopainen is a Legal Officer at the Unit for EU Litigation, Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland.

Niilo Jääskinen is an Advocate General of the Court of Justice of the European Union.

Jean-Paul Jacqué is Emeritus Professor at the University of Strasbourg and Honorary Director-General of the Council of the European Union.

Jeff Kenner is Professor of European Law in the School of Law and the Human Rights Law Centre at the University of Nottingham.

Lamin Khadar is a Researcher at the European University Institute in Florence, Italy.

Claire Kilpatrick is Professor of International and European Labour and Social Law at the European University Institute in Florence, Italy.

Herke Kranenborg is Affiliated Senior Researcher at the Institute for European Law of the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium and a Member of the Legal Service of the European Commission.

Ruth Lamont is Lecturer in Law at the University of Liverpool.

Koen Lenaerts is Vice-President of the Court of Justice of the European Union and Professor of European Law at the University of Leuven, Belgium.

List of Contributors

Mats Lindfelt is the Director of Research and Education at Åbo Akademi University, Finland.

Gracia Marín Durán is a Lecturer in International Law at the University of Edinburgh.

Ronan McCrea is Senior Lecturer in Law at University College London and Visiting Professor at the Central European University in Budapest, Hungary.

Jean McHale is Professor of Health Care Law and Director for the Centre for Health Law, Science and Policy at Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham.

Joana Mendes is Associate Professor of European Law at the University of Amsterdam.

Sabine Michalowski is Professor of Law at the University of Essex.

Valsamis Mitsilegas is Head of the Department of Law, Professor of European Criminal Law and Director of the Criminal Justice Centre at Queen Mary, University of London.

Violeta Moreno-Lax is a Lecturer in Law at Queen Mary, University of London.

Elisa Morgera is Senior Lecturer at the University of Edinburgh.

Hanns Peter Nehl is a R  f  rendaire in the cabinet of Judge Viktor Kreuzschitz at the EU General Court, Luxembourg.

Manfred Nowak is Professor of International Law and Human Rights at the University of Vienna and Director of the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights, Vienna.

Charlotte O'Brien is a Lecturer at the University of York.

Colm O'  inneide is a Reader in Law at University College London.

Elina Paunio is a R  f  rendaire in the cabinet of Advocate General Nils Wahl at the Court of Justice of the European Union, Luxembourg.

Laurent Pech is Professor of European Law at Middlesex University London.

Steve Peers is Professor of Law at the University of Essex.

Sacha Prechal is Judge at the Court of Justice of the European Union and Professor of European Law at Utrecht University, the Netherlands.

Allan Rosas is Visiting Professor at the College of Europe in Bruges and the University of Helsinki and a Judge of the Court of Justice of the European Union.

Debbie Sayers runs the legal research consultancy Inter alia and is a member of the research panels at Interights and Matrix Chambers.

Dagmar Schiek is Professor of EU Law, Jean Monnet *ad personam* Chair of EU Law and Policy and Director of the Centre for European Law and Legal Studies at the University of Leeds.

Jo Shaw is the Salvesen Chair of European Institutions, Dean of Research and Deputy Head of the College of Humanities and Social Science, at the University of Edinburgh.

Dinah Shelton is Professor of International Law at George Washington University, Washington DC.

Eleanor Spaventa is Professor of European Union Law at Durham University.

Helen Stalford is a Professor of Law at the School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool.

Erika Szyszczak is a Barrister and Professor of Law at the University of Sussex.

Gabriel N Toggenburg is Senior Legal Advisor in the Directorate of the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights and Visiting Professor at the University of Graz.

Jonathan Tomkin is a Barrister and a Member of the Legal Service of the European Commission.

Paul Torremans is Professor of Intellectual Property Law at the School of Law, University of Nottingham.

Jens Vedsted-Hansen is a Professor of Law in the School of Law at Aarhus University, Denmark.

Angela Ward is a Legal Secretary in the chambers of Advocate General Jääskinen at the Court of Justice of the European Union, Luxembourg and a Visiting Professor at Birkbeck College, University of London.

Steve Weatherill is the Jacques Delors Professor of European Law at the University of Oxford, with a Fellowship at Somerville College.

Robin White is Emeritus Professor of Law at the University of Leicester, and a Judge in the Administrative Appeals Chamber of the Upper Tribunal.

Elizabeth Wicks is a Professor of Human Rights Law at the University of Leicester.

Daniel Wilsher is a Senior Lecturer in Law at the City Law School, City University London.

Bruno de Witte is Professor of European Union Law at Maastricht University, the Netherlands and part-time Professor at the European University Institute, Florence, Italy.

Ferdinand Wollenschläger is a Professor at the Faculty of Law, Augsburg University, where he holds a chair for Public Law, European Law and Public Economic Law.

Lorna Woods is a Professor of Law at the University of Essex.