

1. Entanglements in/of the Maghreb

Julius Dihstelhoff & Charlotte Pardey

1.2 The Volume and its Approach

What can Saint Augustin tell us about modern day Algerian identity? What does a Jewish Tunisian novelist suggest about language and multilingualism in Tunisia? To what extent can the politicization of the Europe-based activists of the Moroccan *hirāk* movement around 2017 be understood as transnational practices in the Maghreb? How does each of the Maghrebi countries – Algeria, Libya, Mauretania, Morocco, and Tunisia – perceive its identity as both related to and distinct from its neighbors? How can a region at the crossroads of Africa, Europe, and the Middle East be considered peripheral nevertheless – by both politicians and researchers, in both Europe and the MENA region (Middle East and North Africa)?¹ How can a region that forms an important cultural and geopolitical fulcrum – after all, the uprisings of 2010-11 started there – be neglected by interdisciplinary comparative research, research that considers cultural production as well as the political system and ideally places culture and politics into mutual dialogue?

The volume *Entanglements of the Maghreb* aims to answer these questions and to collect cutting-edge research on a region that has been ‘in motion’ for many years, not only since the uprisings of 2010-11. ‘In motion’ here characterizes the Maghreb as dynamic. A century ago, it was already restless with revolutionary tendencies and anticolonial insurgencies. The Algerian struggle for independence in the 1950s and 1960s brought this restlessness to a head and, in 2010-11, the revolutionary spirit returned via the streets of Tunisia. ‘In motion’ also describes the Maghreb as mobile across the borders of nation-states, across language divides and local identities.

The Maghreb is a region at the intersection of various geographic, religious, cultural, political, and economic spaces (Bargaoui and Remaoun; Ben-nison, Buskens and Touati; De Toro and Bonn). As a center of geopolitical con-

nectivity, it is claimed as a sphere of influence by outside powers (Galissot). As a space of cultural exchanges and hybridities (Grangaud, Messaoudi, and Oualdi; Le Gall and Perkins; Tamalet-Talbayev; Vermeren), the Maghreb connects three world regions: Africa, Europe, and the Middle East. The Maghreb itself is connected under one name with a shared history, a common cultural heritage and similar language situation, and yet it is subdivided into distinct nation-states with their own histories, cultural productions, and language policies.

Despite this central capacity to serve as a geopolitical and cultural fulcrum, the Maghreb, with its transregional dynamics, has rarely been a focus of scholarly attention, as will be seen later in this anthology (e.g. Dirèche and Ouaisa's chapter in section II of this volume). Not least for this reason, the anthology will explicitly explore the region's manifold cultural and political 'entanglements' and their transregional dynamics from a position of prominence. Those entanglements are an exposure of the Maghreb's entangled interdependencies. Here, special attention will be paid to predominant dialectics in the Maghreb region, which are always characterized by the relationships between periphery and center, between reception and production of ideas, and between change and constancy. In the Hegelian sense, dialectics is understood here as the doctrine of contradictory processes between opposites (e.g. concepts) as well as the discovery and dissolution of these opposites (De Vos 183).

To highlight the contents covered in this anthology, the editors will discuss the book's structure below. Its scope is to address the interdependent peculiarities in/of the Maghreb from an interdisciplinary perspective. As noted, such a perspective remains lacking from Maghrebi studies to date, although research on the region has been on the rise in recent years since the uprisings of 2010-11 began in Tunisia. To capture the particularities of the Maghreb's heterogeneity, this volume focuses on entanglements as a transdisciplinary and translanguing concept to approach the Maghreb's interdependencies. Within the dimensions of culture, politics, economic and social affairs, entanglements are conceptualized by describing various interdependent thematic fields and actors in motion. This allows scholars to reflect upon the fact that the impulse behind some of the most central transformations in the Arab world in recent years came from the Maghreb. It also provides a lens for addressing the questions about the region outlined above.

The volume locates entanglements, firstly, on the spectrum of the history of transcultural relations. Other concepts on this same spectrum include *histoire croisée* (e.g. Werner and Zimmermann, *Comparaison*; “Penser l’histoire”; “Vergleich”), “transfer history” (e.g. Espagne and Werner; Espagne, *Les Transferts*; “Sur les limites”) and “entangled history” (e.g. Conrad and Randeria; Mintz; Sobe). All these concepts share their rejection of the idea that history is straightforwardly comparable and insist instead on the hybrid character of units of comparison, questioning the habit of considering national cases in isolation. Secondly, these approaches’ primarily historical orientation is complemented by other social science and humanities perspectives to create the truly interdisciplinary perspective that this volume intends to present. For the editors of this anthology, the notion of ‘entanglements’ also signifies that the ideas presented always reflect multiple perspectives, that they are multilingual, international, intergenerational, and generally highlight plurality. This approach will be elaborated in the following pages.

1.2 About the Anthology

The aim of *Entanglements of the Maghreb* is to elaborate the specific logic of internal interdependency within the Maghreb as well as its co-dependencies with surrounding geographic areas: the Maghreb’s entanglements. It does so by drawing on historical as well as current aspects in the fields of culture, politics, economics, and social affairs. The subjects of analysis include affiliations, connections, and transfers that shape the nations of the Maghreb and their relations amongst themselves and to Europe, the rest of Africa, and the larger MENA region. The beginning of the volume will explore the very concept of the Maghreb. In this context, the volume enables an enriching exchange between the disciplines because it believes that the various facets of the region can best be understood in light of such an exchange. The anthology consequently offers readers an interdisciplinary collection of new approaches to the Maghreb from an intellectual and academic point of view.

The idea for this volume arose at a conference entitled *Re-Centering a Region: The Maghreb in Motion*,² which the editors organized in February 2018 within the framework of the research group *Figures of Thought | Turning Points* (funded by the German Research Foundation, or DFG)³ at Philipps-Universität Marburg. The conference’s objective was to foster interdisciplinary exchanges around a transforming Maghreb among some of the most experienced in-

ternational researchers in the field as well as emerging researchers. Within this context, it became clear that an anthology along the lines of the present volume would be crucial for future research on the Maghreb. Firstly, there is a striking absence of research publications in Maghrebi studies that combine international, interdisciplinary approaches with chapters from the social sciences and humanities. This lacuna is not justified: we believe that the benefits of combining research lie in the creation of an innovative dialogue on the Maghreb between systematic disciplines (Arabic studies, Romance studies, Media studies, sociology, political science etc.). Since its establishment in 2006, Marburg's Center for Near and Middle Eastern Studies has always lived by the idea of interdisciplinary research. This has become particularly evident in recent years through the research groups *Figures of Thought | Turning Points* (led by Friederike Pannewick, DFG) and *Re-Configurations* (led by Rachid Ouaisa, funded by the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research, or BMBF).⁴ Most recently it is reflected in the newly established *Merian Centre for Advanced Studies in the Maghreb* (MECAM, funded by BMBF), which began work in April 2020, and in which all the editors of this volume are actively involved.⁵ MECAM is based in Tunis, Tunisia and aims to construct and strengthen scholarly networks between Tunisia and Germany and across the Maghreb, the Middle East, and Europe. From a Maghrebi vantage point, MECAM's guiding theme, "Imagining Futures: Dealing with Disparity," addresses the complex processes of (re-)negotiating societal experiences into ideas for the future ('imagining futures') within the context of different forms and unequal conditions ('disparities'). MECAM focuses on complex social and political processes and issues of common interest that divide and connect the Maghreb, the Middle East, and Europe both historically and in our time, for example, beliefs, distribution of resources, migration, rule of law, socio-economic conflicts, and (transitional) justice.

Secondly, research on the Maghreb is generally limited by university politics and linguistic abilities. For example, research projects commonly investigate literary production either in French, Arabic, or Tamazight. Cultural products are also classified according to the languages in which they are produced – in other words, multilingual research is only conducted in exceptional cases. In general, Arabic Studies and Area Studies departments devote the vast majority of their attention to the Mashreq, that is, the Arab East (Lebanon, Syria etc.), whereas the Maghreb is discussed in French or Romance Studies departments, if at all. This means that in each case, one half of literary production is left by the wayside. Karima Laachir has proposed an initiative to counter this:

a “reading together” of Moroccan literary works in both Arabic and French (Laachir; see also her chapter in this volume). This certainly can be extended to Tamazight languages and to all the countries of the Maghreb that share similar multilingualism. Since the research is thus divided, the public does not receive a unified picture of the region; this in turn inhibits further public interest in such research. The present anthology attempts to correct this deficit.

Thirdly, by focusing on “entanglements” and by choosing the term for its title, the editors of this volume hope to highlight the project’s commitment to overcoming the ideological assumption that treats the Maghreb as the periphery of Africa, the Middle East, and Europe. This approach questions the concepts of region or territory as clearly delimited and homogeneous entities. Instead, entanglements can be seen between regions. Furthermore, the specific locale of the Maghreb is characterized – and thereby re-centered – via case studies, examples, and observations.

One result of the ‘formal’ entanglements to which the volume attempts to do justice is that the volume itself is bilingual, with some of the chapters written in English and others in French. The anthology thereby addresses not only a French-speaking audience, but also English-speaking readers and reflects two important languages that are currently central (alongside Arabic, of course) to research on the Maghreb. Another example is the collective final chapter, which is described below.

Our book joins the short list of works on the Maghreb. In relative terms, only a few monographs and anthologies approach the Maghreb across disciplines and linguistic spheres. This volume offers an innovative approach by uniting the contributions of scholars from Germany, France, the United Kingdom, and the Maghreb from various social sciences and humanities disciplines who all share expertise on North Africa. The result is a multifaceted glance at the Maghreb that complements the state of the art of scientific discourse. Our anthology brings into interdisciplinary dialogue the themes discussed in previous works that can be grouped into five areas. There are works that:

- Deal with the Maghreb, focusing on a particular Maghrebi identity (e.g. Fatih; Laroussi; Richet; Lazhar)
- Discuss the significance of the region from the perspective of international and regional politics (e.g. Coustillière and Vallaud; Frosini and Biagi; Hill; Willis; Mouqadim)

- Analyze artistic and cultural production in the context of the mobility and transformation of the Maghreb (e.g. Abderrezak; Armes; Bienbeck et al.; Brahim; Tamalet-Talbayev; Vogel; Woodhull)
- Take a historical approach to analyzing constructs of the Maghreb (e.g. Bargaoui and Remaoun; Bennison, Buskens, and Touati; Corriou and Oualdi; Grangaud, Messaoudi, and Oualdi; Le Gall and Perkins; Vermeren)
- Relate to entanglements conceptually (e.g. Beetz and Schwab; Espagne and Werner; Espagne, *Les transferts*, “Sur les limites”; Frankham; Hesse; Hönke and Müller; Kautz and Blegind Jensen; Mintz; Pearlman and Allen; Pernau; Pries; Salter; Sobe; Werner and Zimmermann, *Comparaison*, “Penser l’histoire”, “Vergleich”; Wong et al.)

However, our collective volume stands apart in that none of the works referenced comes close to its scope. Through its interdisciplinary approach, it is particularly well suited as material for lecturers teaching classes on the Maghreb at universities worldwide. At the same time, it advances Maghrebi studies. Therefore, it can be read and used both by established researchers specializing in the Maghreb or related topics and by students interested in the region. By providing an overview of the current state of research, this volume, and especially the final collective chapter, allows for both an inventory and a glance into the future. This book thus offers an itinerary for future generations of researchers.

1.3 The Concept of Entanglements

Established approaches to the history of transcultural relations, such as ‘histoire croisée,’⁶ and ‘transfer history,’⁷ are influential in social science debates in Franco-German research but remain marginal in Anglophone research contexts (e.g. Iriye and Saunier). The opposite is true of the concept of entanglements: it has not been operationalized in Germany or France, but it has a presence in Anglophone research (e.g. Allen; Beetz and Schwab; Frankham; Hesse; Hönke and Müller; Kautz, Blegind and Orlikowski; Salter; Wong et al.). In Anglophone research, the term is mainly employed in postcolonial studies, especially under the rubric of ‘entangled history’.⁸

The Cameroonian historian and political scientist Achille Mbembe describes entanglements as a characteristic of the postcolonial age:

By age is meant not a simple category of time but a number of relationships and a configuration of events – often visible and perceptible, sometimes diffuse, "hydra-headed," but to which contemporaries could testify since very aware of them. As an age, the postcolony encloses multiple *durées* made up of discontinuities, reversals, inertias, and swings that overlay one another, interpenetrate one another, and envelope one another: an entanglement. (14, emphasis in original)

Entanglement is defined here as the combination of discontinuities, reversals, and overlays; the interpenetration and envelopment of various aspects.

In the English language, the word entanglement carries negative connotations that need to be addressed here. *Cambridge Dictionary* describes it as follows, including enlightening usage examples:

- a situation or relationship that you are involved in and that is difficult to escape from:
- The book describes the complex emotional and sexual entanglements between the members of the group.
- a fence made of wire with sharp points on it, intended to make it difficult for enemy soldiers to go across an area of land
- the condition of being wrapped and twisted together in a mass:
- entanglements of cables and wires.⁹

In addition to these, other connotations of the word entanglement include the state of being deeply involved or of being enmeshed (like a fish in a net).

In the present volume, the term 'entanglements' is used as an equivalent to the German and French words *Verflechtungen/enchevêtrements* and *Verschränkungen/intrication*.

The German *Verflechtung* does not immediately contain the same negative meanings that the English term carries. While it refers to all sorts of relations, interweavings, close combinations, and crossings, these can be problematic but do not need to be: For example, *politische Verflechtungen* (political entanglements) could be used to describe a difficult or conflicting position of one state in relation to others. It might also neutrally refer to the relations between actors without hinting at a conflict.¹⁰ *Verschränkung* describes the mixing of elements (in linguistics, for example, it refers to the mixing of different grammatical layers of a sentence) or the intertwinement of elements or systems.¹¹

The French word *enchevêtrement*, a close equivalent to ‘entanglement,’ carries both neutral and negative meanings, as it highlights both the network and the confusing or difficult situation. According to *Le Robert Dico en Ligne*, it describes a :

- disposition ou amas de choses enchevêtrées
- extrême complication, désordre¹²

The listed synonyms for the first definition are “reseau, entrelacement, imbrication, interpénétration” and for the second “mélange, confusion, dédale, désordre” (ibid.).

Another word very close to *enchevêtrement* is *intrication*, which is defined as the state of something that is “entremêlé; enchevêtrement.”¹³

In Arabic, the word *tashābuk* is used, which translates to interlacing, interweaving, confusion, intricacy, obscurity, or abstruseness.¹⁴ Its basic meaning *shabaka* means “to entwine,” “to entangle,” “to join,” “to fasten,” or “to attach.” It suggests a net: strings can be described as such (*tashābakat al-khuyūt*, the strings are tangled), a person can be entangled in his problems (*tashābakat mashākiluhu*), thoughts can be confused (*tashābakat al-’afkār*), and fates can be tied together (*tashābakat al-maṣāliḥ*).¹⁵ These examples show that in Arabic, as in German and French, the terms do not necessarily carry negative connotations. An alternative Arabic rendition is *taḍāfar* which is closer to ‘entwine-ment.’ Its basic root *ḍafara* means “to braid,” “plait,” “interweave,” “interlace,” “intertwine,” or “twine.”

This volume now aims to contribute to operationalizing the concept of entanglements for interdisciplinary multifaceted research fields such as Maghrebi studies. Insights from perspectives that are prevalent in the Franco-German research field, such as *histoire croisée* and ‘transfer history,’ will be combined with the Anglophone usage of entanglements, especially in its application in post-colonial studies (e.g. Adesanmi; Brower Stahl; Burton; Chatterjee, 1999; Conrad and Sachsenmaier; Cooper and Stoler; Hall; Le Cour Grandmaison; Mbembe; Nuttall; Paddison et al.; Pernau; Thomas; Wilson). The existing usages of entanglements will be expanded and elaborated.

Entanglements should serve as an analytical starting point that integrates many connotations. In the individual articles it is used to various extents, both with direct mention and without. As the etymological overview showed, the terms *entanglement*, *enchevêtrement*, etc., allow for a certain openness in their employment. As a concept, ‘entanglement’ therefore should be specified

as needed. It is perfectly suited to explore the development of transnational areas of action, its problematic aspects, and actors in the post-Arab Spring Maghreb. After all, the Maghreb does not form a homogenous totality, as the very first section of this introduction highlighted. Instead, it forms a construct of entanglements. This anthology aims to embark on a transnational analysis of this construct from multiple perspectives by bringing together an interdisciplinary group of authors and editors.

The editors particularly valued contributions that reflected a) an awareness of the relationship between researcher/research object, b) the safeguarding of interdisciplinary research perspectives, c) multilingual sources, and d) special attention to the interdependences within/of the Maghreb. However, perspectives from individual countries are included as examples of broader patterns. Some interdependencies are particularly relevant:

- **Time:** Since our premise is a ‘Maghreb in motion,’ a region that undergoes constant changes, we are interested in a temporal classification of events. We deal with a specific, multiple *durée* consisting of discontinuities, reversals, dynamics, and periods of inaction or standstill. In the sense of entanglements, we analyze temporal overlaps and mutual conditions in the period under investigation.
- **Space:** The entanglements explored by this anthology are trans-local and go beyond geographical considerations. They are culturally, socially, linguistically, and artistically determined, or imagined.
- **Actors:** We are interested in the groups and individuals that are perceived as motors of change in the Maghreb. What defines them? To what extent are they subjects of entanglements in the region? And to what extent are they a product of their experience and influence?

These aspects frequently recur across our volume, as will be apparent in the following section of this introduction, which presents the chapters individually.

1.4 Overview of the Anthology

This book contains four sections with a total of 11 chapters in addition to the introduction and conclusion, all of which deal with entanglements of the Maghreb. The chapters are written by scholars from Europe, the Maghreb,

and North America who hail from research fields such as literature, political science, and the other social sciences, working in English or French.

The first section, “Conceptions of the Maghreb,” develops global perspectives on the interdependent character of the Maghreb to round out the introductory remarks outlined here. This section examines different ideas and conceptions of the Maghreb, its borders, and its identities. In concrete terms, Karima Dirèche and Rachid Ouaisa discuss various conceptions of the Maghreb from historical and interdisciplinary perspectives. The authors of “Le Maghreb en mouvement” argue that the origins of the Maghreb’s remarkable dynamism can only be conceived beyond geographical considerations in terms of spatialization. These dynamics lie above all in a profound tension between the economic, ethnic, cultural, linguistic, political, religious, and social disparities and the region’s far-reaching interdependencies with Africa, the Middle East, and Europe: factors that have shaped the Maghreb throughout its history.

The second section of the volume is titled “Entanglements of Mobility and Society”. In this, mobility and society are both understood as dimensions of entanglements. The section looks more closely at dynamics of motion and socio-political processes of change within and without Maghrebi societies. It does so through issues such as intranational mobility, mobility in the arts, social mobility as well as shaping processes of social and state models. Simultaneously, the Maghreb is seen as both an origin and destination of migration (e.g. from sub-Saharan Africa).

First, Hakim Abderrezak’s article “The Maghreb Entangled and Ensnared in European Webs: Nets, Knots, Spiders, and Sirens as Symbols of Clandestine Sea-Crossings” analyzes entanglements in literature and film from and about the Maghreb using the example of clandestine migration, which the author deems essential to understanding today’s Maghreb and its entanglements. Literature and film have explored the desire to leave and the actual journeys undertaken. They make use of images such as spiders, nets, knots, and sirens to allegorize the push and pull factors of migration, which the author attempts to disentangle.

As the second chapter of this section, Lahouari Addi’s article examines cultural and political interweaving processes, which are already evident in its title “Anthropologie de la conscience nationale au Maghreb.” The author reflects on national consciousness in the Maghreb and explains the differences between the nation-states of Algeria, Morocco, and Tunisia despite their sim-

ilar cultural parameters, such as their shared religion, rite (Sunni-Malekite), and language, through various political factors.

Third, Christoph Schwarz's chapter, "Le *ḥirāk du Rif* et la diaspora en Europe : espaces mentaux enchevêtrés," discusses Europe-based activists of the Moroccan *ḥirāk* movement around 2017. The author addresses the entangled stances of European activists in between Europe and their country of origin, Morocco (specifically the Rif area). He argues the politization and mobilization of a Rif diaspora has produced an identification not only with the Rif but also with Europe. These are transnational practices, an example of entangled mobilities in the Maghreb.

The final chapter in this section, "L'instruction des filles dans le Maghreb colonial" by Fadma Aït Mous, analyzes social entanglements using the example of girls' education in the Maghreb, which evolved in the aftermath of the independence of the Maghreb and has preoccupied colonial authorities and Maghrebi elites alike. The chapter attempts to explain the persistence of the instrumentalization of the 'question' of women both by state feminisms and by social movements.

The third section, entitled "Entanglements of Identities and Multilingualism," discusses the Maghreb with regard to culture. The chapters focus on language and the simultaneity and interactions of multilingual identities within this heterogeneous cultural space. The section examines the role of identity, minority culture, and language politics through history in the media, arts, and literature.

The first chapter, "Entangled memory: Saint Augustine in Colonial and Postcolonial Texts" by Claudia Gronemann, considers Saint Augustine as a symbolic figure in Maghrebi cultural discourses. Approaching the subject with reference to Memory Studies, the author examines the saint's changing significance within the Maghreb's cultural tradition. She discusses the extent to which Saint Augustine has become a significant reference point for the production of memory and collective identity. The role of Saint Augustine as a 'figure of memory' exemplifies cultural entanglements of the Maghreb.

In the section's second article, entitled "La question du multilinguisme au Maghreb: représentations de la langue et postures d'appropriation," Samia Kassab-Charfi examines multilingualism in the Maghreb using the example of the empirical study of Francophone literature – mostly from Tunisia – during the twentieth century. Her focus is on cultural entanglements in the form of interlingual dynamics, such as linguistic representations, relationships be-

tween languages, attitudes towards appropriation, and their respective imprints on identity.

In the third chapter of this section, “Defying Language Ideologies: A View from Morocco” Karima Laachir addresses the multilingual literary traditions of the Maghreb with a specific focus on the Moroccan context. The author highlights the problematic nature of monolingual readings of a multilingual body of literature. Instead, Laachir proposes a multilingual ‘reading together’ of literary works in different languages, which facilitates accessing their shared themes and techniques.

The last section of the anthology, “Entanglements of Politics and Economics,” considers the composition of the Maghreb in terms of political systems, economic structures, and cultural identity. Topics such as the entangled identity politics in/of the Maghreb are relevant here, e.g. national consciousness and Berberism. This section also assesses the status of the economy in the Maghreb with specific reference to globalization.

In the first article of this section, “Les Printemps berbères. Pour en finir avec un Maghreb arabe?,” Karima Dirèche focuses on the Berber uprisings of 2011 and investigates the role of historically considered marginalized Berberism in collective protest. Referring back to the 1960s and 1970s, Dirèche examines the increasing politicization and resistance of the Berbers as an expression of sociocultural and political entanglements in the Maghreb, which have particularly reflected Maghrebi societies’ ethnic and linguistic plurality since 2011.

In the second chapter, “Socioeconomic Factors and Political Mobilization in the Maghreb: Lessons from the Arab Spring,” Janicke Stramer-Smith explores the entanglement of sociopolitical mobility and existing power structures. The author compares the cases of Algeria, Libya, Morocco, and Tunisia, especially with regard to the perceived success or failure of the respective popular movements. The differences in outcomes are attributed to variances in governance and power structures shaped by colonial experiences and post-independence politics.

The third and last article of this section, Hartmut Elsenhans’s “Rent, Globalization, Dependency, and Impediments to Growth in the Maghreb,” explores why globalization has not produced dynamic capitalist economies with self-sustaining growth in the Maghreb. As one explanation, Elsenhans points to their inability to compete with successful export-oriented industrializers such as Vietnam. The author argues that to overcome this impasse, the Maghrebi countries would need to solve their dependency on food imports.

After these interdisciplinary perspectives on entanglements of the Maghreb, the anthology ends with a collective chapter comprised of statements by the contributors in place of a typical conclusion. Introduced and arranged by the editors Julius Dihstelhoff, Rachid Ouaisa, Friederike Pannewick, and Charlotte Pardey, these statements reflect the overall themes of this volume under the title *Perspectives off/for the Maghreb*. This concluding chapter addresses the current state of research in Maghrebi studies, while also attempting to glance at the future and the possibilities of interdisciplinary work in our field. The aim of the collective effort is both to reflect the idea of entanglements and to do justice to interdisciplinary research in Maghrebi studies. Like the countries in question, these perspectives are interconnected and separate at once: they do not form a coherent narrative. This brings us back to the very first observations this introduction made about the Maghreb, posing the question of both connectedness (shared history, common cultural heritage, and similar language situation) and separateness (distinct nation-states, unique cultural productions, and divergent language policies). This volume offers a multilayered, interdisciplinary response to that open-ended question.

Bibliography

- Abderrezak, Hakim. *Ex-Centric Migrations. Europe and the Maghreb in Mediterranean Cinema, Literature, and Music*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2016.
- Adesanmi, Pius. "Of Postcolonial Entanglement and *Durée*. Reflections on the Francophone African Novel." *Comparative Literature* 56.3 (2004): 227-242.
- Armes, Roy. *Postcolonial Images. Studies in North African Film*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2005.
- Bargaoui, Sami, and Hassan Remaoun. *Savoirs historiques au Maghreb. Constructions et usages*. Oran: Edition CRASC, 2006.
- Bennison, Amira, Léon Buskens, and Houari Touati, eds. *Studies in the History and Society of the Maghrib*. 12 vols. Leiden: Brill, 2012-2020.
- Beetz, Johannes, and Veit Schwab. *Material Discourse – Materialist Analysis: Approaches in Discourse Studies*. Lanham: Lexington Books, 2017.
- Bienbeck, Ricarda, Maroua El Naggare, Ute Fendler, and Mechthild Gilzmer, eds. *Transformations. Changements et nouveaux dans la littérature et le cinéma au Maghreb depuis 1990*. München: AVM.edition, 2016.

- Brahimi, Denise. *Regards sur les cinémas du Maghreb*. Paris: Éditions Petra, 2016.
- Brower Stahl, Ann. "Colonial Entanglements and the Practices of Taste. An Alternative to Logocentric Approaches." *American Anthropologist* 104.3 (2002): 827-845.
- Burton, Antoinette. "Who Needs the Nation? Interrogating 'British' History." *Journal of Historical Sociology* 10.3 (1997): 227-248.
- Chatterjee, Patha. *Nationalist Thought and the Colonial World. A Derivative Discourse*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1993.
- Conrad, Sebastian, and Dominic Sachsenmaier, eds. *Competing Visions of World Order. Global Moments and Movements, 1880s-1930s*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.
- Conrad, Sebastian, and Shalini Randeria, eds. *Jenseits des Eurozentrismus. Postkoloniale Perspektiven in den Geschichts- und Kulturwissenschaften*. Frankfurt am Main: Campus, 2002.
- Cooper, Frederick, and Ann Laura Stoler, eds. *Tensions of Empire. Colonial Cultures in a Bourgeois World*. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1997.
- Corriou, Morgan, and M'hamed Oualdi, eds. *Une histoire sociale et culturelle du politique en Algérie et au Maghreb. Études Offertes à Omar Carlier*. Paris: Éditions la Sorbonne, 2018.
- Coustillière, Jean François, and Pierre Vallaud. *Géopolitique et Méditerranée. Volume 1. La Méditerranée: un espace imaginaire et fracturé*. Paris: L'Harmattan, 2014.
- De Vos, Lu. "Dialektik." *Hegel-Lexikon*. Eds. Paul Cobben, Paul Cruysberghs, Lu de Vos and Peter Jonkers. Darmstadt: WBG, 2006. 183.
- De Toro, Alfonso, and Charles Bonn, eds. *Le Maghreb writes back. Figures de l'hybridité dans la culture et littérature maghrébines*. Hildesheim: Georg Olms Verlag, 2009.
- Dihstelhoff, Julius, and Charlotte Pardey. "Re-Centering a Region. The Maghreb in Motion", Proceedings of the conference Re-Centering a Region. The Maghreb in Motion, Center for Near and Middle Eastern Studies, Philipps-Universität Marburg, Germany, 15-17 February 2018. H-Soz-Kult, 13 July 2018. Web. <https://www.hsozkult.de/conferencereport/id/tagungsberichte-7791>.
- Espagne, Michel. *Les transferts culturels franco-allemands*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1999.
- . "Sur les limites du comparatisme en histoire culturelle." *Genèses. Sciences sociales et histoire* 17 (1994): 112-121.

- Espagne, Michel, and Michael Werner, eds. *Transferts. Les relations interculturelles dans l'espace franco-allemand (XVIIIe et XIXe siècle)*. Paris: Éditions Recherche sur les Civilisations, 1988.
- Fatih, Zakaria. *Le Maghreb à la croisée des chemins. L'enjeu de la tradition et le défi de la modernité*. Paris: L'Harmattan, 2016.
- Frankham, Jo. "Network utopias and alternative entanglements for educational research and practice." *Journal of Education Policy* 21:6 (2006): 661-677.
- Frosini, Justin O., and Francesco Biagi, eds. *Political and Constitutional Transitions in North Africa. Actors and Factors*. Oxford et al.: Routledge, 2014.
- Gallissot, René. *Le Maghreb de traverse*. Saint-Denis: Bouchène, 2000.
- Grangaud, Isabelle, Alain Messaoudi, and M'hamed Oualdi, eds. *Besoins d'histoire. Historiographies et régimes d'historicité au Maghreb à l'aune des révolutions arabes*. Special issue of *L'année du Maghreb* 10 (2014).
- Hall, Catherine. *Civilising Subjects. Metropole and Colony in the English Imagination 1830-1867*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002.
- Hesse, Barnor, ed. *Un/settled Multiculturalisms. Diasporas, Entanglements, Transruptions*. London: Zed Books, 2000.
- Hill, Jonathan N. C. *Democratisation in the Maghreb*. Edinburgh and New York: Edinburgh University Press, 2016.
- Hönke, Jana, and Markus-Michael Müller. "Governing (In)Security in a Postcolonial World. Transnational Entanglements and the Worldliness of 'Local' Practice." *Security Dialogue* 43.5 (2012): 383-401.
- Iriye, Akira, and Pierre-Yves Saunier, eds. *The Palgrave Dictionary of Transnational History. From the Mid-19th Century to the Present Day*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Kautz, Karlheinz, and Tina Blegind Jensen. "Debating Sociomateriality: Entanglements, imbrications, disentangling, and agential cuts." *Scandinavian Journal of Information Systems* 24.2 (2012): 89-96.
- Laachir, Karima. "The Aesthetics and Politics of 'Reading Together' Moroccan Novels in Arabic and French." *The Journal of North African Studies* 22.1 (2016): 22-36.
- Laroussi, Farid. *Postcolonial Counterpoint. Orientalism, France, and the Maghreb*. Toronto: Toronto University Press, 2016.
- Lazhar, Mohamed. *Traces et identité au Maghreb*. Unpublished PhD dissertation. Universität Stuttgart, 2015.
- Le Cour Grandmaison, Olivier. *La République impériale. Politique et racisme d'État*. Paris: Fayard, 2009.

- Le Gall, Michel, and Kenneth Perkins. *The Maghrib in Question. Essays in History and Historiography*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1997.
- Mbembe, Achille. *On the Postcolony*. Trans. A. M. Berrett, Janet Roitman, Murray Last and Steven Rendall. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.
- Mintz, Sidney Wilfred. *Sweetness and Power. The Place of Sugar in Modern History*. New York: Penguin Books, 1986.
- Mouqadim, Hassan. *Die geopolitische Bedeutung des Maghreb im Spannungsfeld der Interessen Europas und der USA*. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 2011.
- Nuttall, Sarah. *Entanglement. Literary and Cultural Reflections on Post-Apartheid*. Johannesburg: Wits University Press, 2009.
- Paddison, Ronan, Chris Philo, Paul Routledge, and Joanne Sharp, eds. *Entanglements of Power. Geographies of Domination/Resistance*. Abingdon: Routledge, 2000.
- Pearlman, Karen and Richard James Allen. "Entanglement Theory. Playing with mixed realities." *Performance and Temporalisation. Time Happens*. Eds. Stuart Grant, Jodie McNeilly, and Maeva Veerapen. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015. 168-179.
- Pernau, Margit. "Whither Conceptual History? From National to Entangled Histories." *Contributions to the History of Concepts* 7.1 (2012): 1-11.
- Pries, Ludger. *Die Transnationalisierung der sozialen Welt. Sozialräume jenseits von Nationalgesellschaften*. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 2008.
- Richet, Xavier, and Nadji Safir. *Le Maghreb à l'épreuve de la mondialisation*. Paris: L'Harmattan, 2016.
- Salter, Chris. *Entangled: Technology and the Transformation of Performance*. Cambridge: The MIT Press, 2010.
- Sobe, Noah W. "Entanglement and Transnationalism in the History of American Education." *Rethinking the History of Education. Transnational Perspectives on Its Questions, Methods, and Knowledge*. Ed. Thomas S. Popkewitz. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013. 93-107.
- Tamalet-Talbayer, Edwige. *The Transcontinental Maghreb. Francophone Literature Across the Mediterranean*. New York: Fordham University Press, 2017.
- Thomas, Nicholas. *Entangled Objects. Exchange, Material Culture, and Colonialism in the Pacific*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1991.
- Tuvi, Pierre. *Le Maghreb dans son contexte international. Les affaires, les usages et les mentalités au Maroc, en Algérie, en Lybie*. Paris: Éditions du Dauphin, 2015.
- Vermeren, Pierre. *Misère de l'histoire du 'Maghreb' postcolonial (1962-2012)*. Paris: Éditions de la Sorbonne, 2012.

- Vogl, Mary B. *Picturing the Maghreb. Literature, Photography, (Re)presentation*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2003.
- Werner, Michael, and Bénédicte Zimmermann. "Penser l'histoire croisée. Entre empirie et réflexivité." *Annales. Histoire, Sciences Sociales* 58.1 (2003): 7-36.
- . "Vergleich, Transfer, Verflechtung. Der Ansatz der *Histoire croisée* und die Herausforderung des Transnationalen." *Geschichte und Gesellschaft* 28.4 (2002): 607-636.
- Werner, Michael, and Bénédicte Zimmermann, eds. *De la comparaison à l'histoire croisée*. Paris: Éditions du Seuil 2004.
- Willis, Michael J. *Politics and Power in the Maghreb. Algeria, Tunisia and Morocco from Independence to the Arab Spring*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Wilson, Kathleen, ed. *A New Imperial History. Culture, Identity and Modernity in Britain and the Empire, 1660-1840*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Wong-Campos, Jamie David, Steven A. Moses, Kale Gifford Johnson, and Christopher Monroe. "Demonstration of Two-Atom Entanglement with Ultrafast Optical Pulses." *Physical Review Letters* 119.23 (2017).
- Woodhull, Winifred. *Transfigurations of the Maghreb. Feminism, Decolonization, and Literatures*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1993.

Notes

- 1 The term 'MENA region', acronym for 'Middle East and North Africa', is used in this paper for the entirety of the states of the Near and Middle East. Borrowed from the English tradition, it includes North Africa and the 'Middle East', which is commonly referred to as the 'Naher Osten' in German.
- 2 Find the conference report here: Dihstelhoff and Pardey or the conference website via: <https://www.uni-marburg.de/de/cnms/forschung/maghreb/tagungen-und-konferenzen/internationale-konferenz>.
- 3 For more information, see: <https://www.uni-marburg.de/en/cnms/arabic-studies/figures-of-thought-turning-points>.
- 4 For more information, see: <https://www.uni-marburg.de/en/cnms/research/re-configurations>.
- 5 MECAM is a joint endeavor of a consortium of renowned Tunisian and German research institutions: It is coordinated by the Philipps-Universität Marburg and the Université de Tunis and supported by the Universität Leipzig, the German Institute for Global and Area Studies (GIGA) in Hamburg/Germany, the Forum Transregionale Studien in Berlin/Germany, the Institut Tunisien des Études Stratégiques (ITES) in Tunis/Tunisia, and the University of Sfax/Tunisia. For more information, visit MECAM's provisional website: www.uni-marburg.de/en/cnms/mecam.
- 6 *Histoire Croisée* is an expression of reorientations in German and French historiography since the beginning of the 2000s. It attempts to construct a specific connection between observation posts, points of view and objects (e.g. Werner and Zimmermann, *Comparaison*, "Penser l'histoire", "Vergleich"). "Croiser" is understood to mean crossing (over) or interweaving.
- 7 Research on cultural transfer is a relatively young cultural studies approach that was developed from the mid-1980s onwards, using the example of cultural relations between France and Germany. The cultural transfer refers to the process of the adoption of cultural phenomena between different cultures, for example between different countries or between different social groups (e.g. Espagne, *Les transferts*, "Sur les limites"; Espagne and Werner, *Transferts*).
- 8 The analytical scope of Entangled History is broader than that of *Histoire Croisée* and transfer processes took place not only from colonizing to

- colonized countries, but also from the colonies to the mother countries (e.g. Conrad and Randeria; Mintz; Sobe).
- 9 “Entanglement.” Cambridge Dictionary Online, <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/entanglement>, examples are highlighted in the original.
 - 10 “Verflechtung.” Duden, <https://www.duden.de/rechtschreibung/Verflechtung>.
 - 11 “Verschränkung.” Duden, <https://www.duden.de/rechtschreibung/Verschränkung>.
 - 12 “Enchevêtrement.” Le Robert Dico en Ligne, <https://dictionnaire.lerobert.com/definition/enchevetrement>.
 - 13 “Intrication.” Le Robert Dico en Ligne, “intrication”, <https://dictionnaire.lerobert.com/definition/intrication>.
 - 14 “Tashābuk”. The Hans Wehr Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic, 4th ed. 1979. 528-529.
 - 15 “Tashābuk”. Almaany. <https://www.almaany.com/ar/dict/ar-ar/>.

