

Ruffert / Walter

Institutionalised International Law

C.H. Beck · Hart · Nomos

Ruffert / Walter
Institutionalised International Law

Institutionalised International Law

Dr. Matthias Ruffert

Professor of Law at Friedrich-Schiller-University, Jena

Dr. Christian Walter

Professor of Law at Ludwig-Maximilians-University, Munich

C.H. Beck · Hart · Nomos

Published by

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Waldseestraße 3-5, 76530 Baden-Baden, Germany
email: vertrieb@nomos.de

Co-published by

Verlag C.H. Beck oHG, Wilhelmstraße 9, 80801 München, Germany,
email: bestellung@beck.de

Hart Publishing, 16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW, United Kingdom,
email: orders@isbs.com

Published in North America (US and Canada) by Hart Publishing,
c/o International Specialized Book, Services,
930 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300, Portland, OR 97213-3786, USA,
email: orders@isbs.com

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in
der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische
Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

ISBN 978-3-8329-7204-2 (Nomos Verlag, Baden-Baden)
ISBN 978-3-406-63426-0 (Verlag C. H. Beck)
ISBN 978-1-84946-494-9 (Hart Publishing)

1. Edition 2015

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden 2015. Printed in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically those of translation, reprinting, re-use of illustrations, broadcasting, reproduction by photocopying machine or similar means, and storage in data banks. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to »Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort«, Munich.

Preface

This book resulted as a joint project from our teaching experience in the field of the law of International Organisations in Jena, Münster and Munich. The German version was first published in 2009, its second edition being currently in print. Our core purpose is to analyse the interactions between the development of the general law of International Organisations on the one hand and the growing institutionalisation of major substantive parts of public international law on the other. The title “Institutionalised International Law” reflects this approach. We believe that the law of International Organisations is best understood as “law in action” in specific subject areas, such as international peace and security, protection of human rights, environment as well as trade and development. The book should primarily be useful for students of international law and international relations, as well as practitioners and interested lawyers.

The publication of this book was made possible by many helping hands. Most of all, the linguistic support by *Christopher P. Hunt* (Jena) and *Stefan Schäferling* (Munich) was indispensable. We are very grateful towards them, as well as towards *Stefanie Hempel*, *Sophia Henrich*, *Tom Kuhfuß*, *Melanie Kühn*, *Susanne Prater*, *Fabian Preger*, *Chun-Kyung Paulus Suh* and *Markus Vordermayer* for their tireless research and technical assistance. Of course, all remaining mistakes are our own, and critical resonance is most welcome (cwalter@jura.uni-muenchen.de or matthias.ruffert@uni-jena.de).

Jena and Munich, August 2014

Matthias Ruffert
Christian Walter

Table of Contents

Preface	V
---------------	---

First Part: Fundamentals

§ 1 Concept and Theory of International Organisations

I. Introduction – About Working with this Book	3
II. Definition	5
1. The Concept of International Organisations	5
2. Particular Features	5
3. Similar and Differing Concepts	7
a) Regimes of Differing Organisational Density	7
b) Supranational Organisations	8
c) Public Law Categories	9
d) Non-State Organisations	10
e) Hybrid Forms of International Administration	11
III. Theories of International Organisations in International Law and International Relations	12
1. Realism and Neo-Realism	13
2. Idealistic Theories	13
3. Institutionalism	15

§ 2 History of International Organisations

I. The 19th Century: Peace Congresses and Administrative Unions as Early Forms of International Organisations	18
1. “Congresses” and “Conferences”	18
2. Administrative Unions	19
3. River Commissions	20
II. The League of Nations and the Interwar Period	20
III. The United Nations and Developments After 1945	22

§ 3 International Organisations within the Constitution of the International Community

I. How International Organisations Constitutionalise Public International Law	28
1. The Constitution of the International Community	28
2. Constitutional Elements	30
a) Functions and Institutions	30
b) Aims and Values	30
II. Elements of an International Separation of Powers	31
1. Executive Function	31
a) International Organisations as an Alternative to World Government	31
b) Political Governance	31
c) Implementation	32
d) Internal Administration	33

Table of Contents

2. Rule-Making	33
a) Rule-Making in the International Community	33
b) Typology of Rule-Making by International Organisations	34
aa) Treaties and International Organisations	34
bb) Binding Secondary Rule-Making	36
(1) Specialised Agencies of the UN	36
(2) Security Council	38
cc) Non-Binding Legal Provisions	39
dd) Techniques of Reference	40
c) Public International Law or New Legal Order?	41
d) Unanswered Questions of Legitimacy	42
3. Dispute Settlement and Adjudication	43
III. Effects of the Law of International Organisations at the Domestic Level	47
1. The Issue	47
2. Constitutional Law (particularly in Germany)	47
3. The Structure of Rule-Making and Administration of the Respective International Organisations	49

Second Part: General Principles and Rules of the Law of International Organisations

§ 4 Treaty Basis, Creation, Extinction, and Succession

I. Founding Treaty	55
1. Participants	55
2. Conclusion and Entry into Force	56
3. Modifications and Amendments	58
4. Function, Legal Nature, Interpretation	63
a) The Founding Treaty as an Organisation's Constitution	63
b) The Organisation's Constitution and Dynamics of Interpretation	63
c) From Public International Law to a Legal Order sui generis	64
d) Interpretive Power	65
II. Extinction and Succession	66
1. Extinction	66
2. Succession	67

§ 5 Legal Personality

I. Foundations and Preconditions of International Legal Personality	71
1. General Remarks	71
2. Theoretical Approaches	72
3. Criteria for International Legal Personality	74
II. Consequences of International Legal Personality	75
1. Scope	75
2. Legal Capacity under International Law	76
a) Power to Conclude Treaties	76
b) Participation in Diplomatic Relations	78
c) Liability	80
3. Relationship with Non-Member States	80
III. Capacity to Act under Domestic Law	81
IV. Privileges and Immunities	83
V. Relation to the Host State	87
1. Seat	87
2. Headquarters Agreement	88

Table of Contents

§ 6 The Doctrine of Powers

I. Concept	91
II. Basic Principles of the Attribution of Powers	92
1. The Principle of Specialty	92
a) The Principle	92
b) Doctrinal Background	93
2. Interpreting Power-Conferring Provisions	94
3. The Doctrine of Implied Powers	94
III. Consequences of Ultra Vires Acts	95
IV. Distribution of Competences between International Organisations	97
1. Institutional Differentiation within the International Community as a Problem	97
2. Coordinating Mechanisms	97
3. Further Developments of Competence Theory	98

§ 7 Responsibility and Liability

I. Responsibility in International Law, Liability and the Law of International Organisations	101
II. Responsibility and Attribution	103
1. Action by Organs and Personnel of an Organisation	103
2. State Action for International Organisations	103
3. Attribution of Private Action	105
III. Complementary Responsibility of the Member States	106
1. Member States' Responsibility under International Law	106
2. Member State Direct Responsibility for Economic Activity	107
IV. Perspectives	109

§ 8 Membership

I. Becoming a Member	111
1. Original Members	111
2. Accession	112
a) Right to Admission?	112
b) Conditions for Admission	113
aa) Formal Conditions	113
bb) Substantive Conditions	114
c) Admission Procedure	116
II. Membership Status	119
1. Rights and Obligations	119
2. Graduated Membership	120
3. Associate Membership	121
4. Observer Status	122
5. Limitation of Membership Rights as a Sanction	123
III. Termination of and Succession to Membership	124
1. Grounds for Termination	124
a) Dissolution of the Organisation	125
b) Withdrawal	126
c) Expulsion	128
d) Extinction	128
2. Membership Succession	129

§ 9 Organs and Decision Making

I. General Features	131
1. Functions and Types of Organs	131
2. Levels of Organs (Main Organs and Subsidiary Organs)	132
II. Types of Organs	135
1. Plenary Organ	135

Table of Contents

2. Executive Organs of Limited Membership and Specialised Organs	137
3. Permanent Administrative Organs	139
a) Secretary-General	139
b) Secretariat	141
4. Parliamentary Organs	142
5. Dispute Settlement Organs	145
a) PCIJ and ICJ	145
b) Other Mechanisms for the Settlement of International Disputes (notably WTO Dispute Settlement and ITLOS)	147
III. Composition of the Organs	148
IV. Decision-Making Procedures	149
1. Weighted Voting	149
a) Equality of Votes (“One State, One Vote”)	149
b) Weighted Voting on the Basis of Population	150
c) Weighted Voting on the Basis of Economic Strength	150
2. Required Majorities	151
a) Unanimity	152
b) Majority Decisions	152
c) The Specific Situation of the Veto in the Security Council	153
d) Consensus	155
V. Separation of Powers and Institutional Balance	156

§ 10 Finance and Personnel

I. Finances	160
1. The Budget and the Principle of Completeness in Earnings and Expenditures	160
2. Income	161
3. Expenditure	165
4. Budget Competence and Budget Decision Making	168
a) Budget Competence	168
b) Budget Procedure	170
5. Auditing	172
II. Personnel	172
1. The Political Importance	172
2. Statistical Information and Criteria of Selection	173
3. Law Governing the Service and Legal Position of International Civil Servants	175
4. Efforts for Reform within the UN	177

Third Part: Substantive Legal Regimes

§ 11 Peace and Security

I. The System of Collective Security of the United Nations	181
1. General Principles	181
a) Peaceful Settlement of International Disputes and the Prohibition of the Use of Force	182
b) Collective Enforcement Measures and Self-defence	183
c) Peacekeeping Forces	183
2. Competences within the United Nations	184
a) Security Council and General Assembly	184
b) The Secretary-General	186
c) Peacebuilding Commission	187
3. The Legal Structure of Chapter VII UN Charter	188
a) Threat to the Peace, Breach of the Peace and Act of Aggression	188
b) The Development of the Notion of “Peace”	188
aa) Inter-State Force as Starting Point	189

Table of Contents

bb) Civil Wars	189
cc) Massive Human Rights Violations?	190
dd) Threats to the Peace by Private Actors (International Terrorism)	191
ee) Concrete or Abstract Threats?	191
c) The Function of Art. 39 within Chapter VII UN Charter	192
d) Provisional Measures under Art. 40 UN Charter	193
e) Non-Military Measures under Chapter VII	193
f) Military Enforcement Action under Art. 42 UN	197
g) Discretion of the Security Council – Limits and Judicial Control	198
II. Maintaining Peace and Security through Regional Organisations	201
1. The Notion of Regional Organisations	202
a) Criteria for the Qualification of an International Organisation as “Regional” ..	202
b) Specific Structural Requirements	203
2. Peaceful Settlement of International Disputes by Regional Organisations	205
3. Enforcement Action by Regional Organisations	206
a) The Notion of “Enforcement Action” in Art. 53 para 1 UN	206
b) “Utilisation” by the Security Council on the Basis of Art. 53 para 1 UN	208
c) Different Forms of Authorisation	210
4. Regional Peacekeeping Forces	211
5. Specific Regional Organisations	212
a) Organization of American States (OAS)	212
b) African Union (AU)	213
c) Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE)	215
d) North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO)	217
e) Other Regional Organisations	219

§ 12 The Institutional Organisation of International Human Rights Protection

I. Human Rights Protection as Organisational Challenge	221
1. Treaty-Based and Non-Treaty/Charter-Based Surveillance Mechanisms	222
2. Universal and Regional Mechanisms	222
3. The High Commissioner for Human Rights as a Forum for Coordination of the Universal Mechanisms	223
II. The Organisation of Universal Human Rights Protection	224
1. UN General Assembly and Economic and Social Council	224
2. Commission on Human Rights and Human Rights Council	225
a) Historical Development and Organisational Issues	225
b) Establishment of the Human Rights Council	226
c) Major Differences between the Human Rights Commission and the Human Rights Council	226
d) Universal Periodic Review Mechanism – UPRM	228
e) Special Procedures	229
f) Human Rights Council Advisory Committee and Individual Complaint Procedure	230
3. Treaty Bodies and Applicable Procedures	232
a) Introductory Remarks	232
b) State Reports	232
c) Inquiries	233
d) State-to-State Complaints	234
e) Individual Complaints	235
f) Prevention	236
g) Future Perspectives for Human Rights Protection through Treaty Bodies	237
4. Security Council	239
5. Evaluation	240

Table of Contents

III. The Organisation at the Regional Level	240
1. Europe	240
a) Council of Europe	241
aa) European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) and European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR)	241
bb) Human Rights Protection in the Council of Europe outside the ECHR	242
b) OSCE	244
c) European Union	245
d) Accession of the EU to the ECHR	247
2. America	248
3. Africa	249
4. Similarities and Differences	250
IV. Independent Human Rights Institutions (Paris Principles)	251
V. The Role of International Criminal Law in Human Rights Protection	252
VI. Human Rights Protection Against Acts of International Organisations	255
1. General Principles	255
2. The Issue of Attribution	256
3. Bosphorus Test of the ECtHR	257
4. Applying the Bosphorus Test to Targeted Sanctions	259
5. Targeted UN Sanctions and the Application of EU Human Rights	260
6. Alleged Human Rights Violations Caused Directly by Acts of International Organisations (i.e. without National Implementation)	261
VII. The Outreach of Human Rights Treaty Bodies beyond their Treaty Functions	264

§ 13 Economy and Development

I. The Law of Organisation in Inter- and Transnational Economic Relationships	267
1. The World Economic Order and its Standard-Setting and Organisational Tasks ...	267
2. Plurality in Organisation	268
3. Universal and Regional Organisations	269
II. Universal Economic Organisations	270
1. Specialised Agencies of the United Nations	270
a) The Bretton Woods Organisations	270
aa) IMF	270
(1) Creation and Development of the System of Bretton Woods and of the IMF	270
(2) Legal Position and Tasks of the IMF	271
(3) Institutional Structure	272
bb) The World Bank Group	273
(1) The World Bank: Tasks and Institutional Structure	273
(2) Further Elements of the World Bank Group	274
b) International Labour Organisation (ILO)	275
aa) Aims and Tasks	275
bb) Institutional Structure	276
cc) Rule-Making and Implementation	276
c) Development Organisations	277
2. The World Trade Organisation (WTO)	278
a) On the Creation of the WTO	278
b) Structure of the WTO-Agreements and their Substantive Rules	279
c) Membership	280
d) Institutional Structure and Decision-Making	280
e) Settlement of Disputes	281
f) Criticism and Reform	281
3. Forms of Co-operation outside the UN and WTO	282
a) The Group of Eight (G8)	282
b) Paris Club	283
4. The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)	283
a) The Bank for International Settlement (BIS) and the Basel Committee on Banking Supervision	284

Table of Contents

b) The Organisation of Petroleum Exporting Countries (OPEC)	285
III. Regional Economic Integration	285
1. EU (EC), EEA and EFTA	286
2. NAFTA	286
3. MERCOSUR	287
4. ASEAN	288

§ 14 Environment

I. The Institutional Law of International Environmental Protection	291
1. Creation and Development of International Environmental Law and the Law of International Organisations	291
2. Regulatory and Organisational Tasks of International Environmental Law	293
3. Plurality of Organisations	294
4. Rule-Making and Implementation	294
II. Universal Environmental Protection Organisations	295
1. UNEP	295
a) Legal Basis, Membership and Tasks	295
b) Organ Structure and Working Methods	296
c) Reform	297
2. CSD	297
3. Special Organisations	297
a) Climate Change	297
b) Protection of Species and Biodiversity	298
c) Protection of the Oceans	299
III. Environmental Protection in Other International Organisations	299

Fourth Part: Outlook

§ 15 Perspectives

I. International Organisations as an Element of Global Governance	303
1. The Idea of Global Governance as Part of the Governance Discussion	303
2. The Role of International Organisations in the Process of Global Governance	305
II. International Organisations and the Renaissance of International Administrative Law	306
1. Terminological Remarks	306
2. International Administrative Law as Global Administrative Law – and the Role of International Organisations	308
Table of Abbreviated Citations	311
Index	313

