

actions of those collecting and distributing them. It is in this respect, by providing a thought-provoking, if at times controversial, reflection on these issues and their implications, that Crapanzano makes his most significant contribution.

Claire Eldridge

**Creed, Gerald W.:** *Masquerade and Postsocialism. Ritual and Cultural Dispossession in Bulgaria*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2011. 254 pp. ISBN 978-0-253-22261-9. Price: \$ 24.95

Gerald Creed's "Masquerade and Postsocialism. Ritual and Cultural Dispossession in Bulgaria" is an empirically rich and theoretically sophisticated analysis of the postsocialist condition in rural Bulgaria. Using the Bulgarian ritual of mumming as a window onto the lived experiences of ordinary men and women as they have struggled to survive the social, political, and economic upheavals that followed the collapse of communism in 1989, Creed masterfully explores a variety of scholarly themes. Grounded in beautifully written thick descriptions of mumming rituals across Bulgaria, the text is an intellectual tour de force, challenging Western assumptions and pointing out the shortcomings of previous social scientific knowledge production about both Bulgaria and postsocialist Eastern Europe more broadly.

The book is divided up into an introduction, a brief conclusion, and five substantive chapters. The first chapter, "A Mumming Season" is a purely descriptive examination of various mumming rituals in different Bulgarian villages, giving a reader a sense of their similarities and differences across time and place. Because Creed has been conducting fieldwork in Bulgaria over the span of almost twenty-five years, his knowledge of the mumming ritual is nuanced and exquisitely detailed. In essence, mumming rituals consist of bands of men who don elaborate costumes and masks each year in the months of either January or February. In addition to ritual performances for the whole village, these mummers (or *kukeri* as they are locally called) visit individual homes to ward off evil and bring good luck for the coming year. Although these rituals are seemingly remnants of premodern paganism, Creed provocatively argues that they are instead "modernity in drag."

The subsequent chapters are almost stand-alone analyses of four themes: Gender and Sexuality, Civil Society and Democracy, Autonomy and Community, and Ethnicity and Nationalism. The second chapter on gender and sexuality wonderfully explores the definition and redefinition of appropriate masculinities in the postsocialist era and how mumming provides an important avenue for the performance of masculinity for those men who have found themselves emasculated by the collapse of the rural economies. In this chapter, Creed artfully weaves in his own participation in mumming rituals to discuss the shifting terrain upon which men must negotiate their manhoods in response to new Western discourses of gender and sexuality.

The next three chapters are specific engagements with contemporary scholarly debates. Chapter three is a

groundbreaking examination of the inherent Western biases evident in scholarly notions of what constitutes "civil society," wherein Creed argues convincingly that something important is lost, when theorists exclude informal cultural practices and performances from their definition of civic organizing. Chapter four challenges Western idealizations of notions of "community," which rely too heavily on tropes of harmony and cooperation. Creed argues that community can also be sustained by ongoing conflicts and discord, and that the presence of dis-harmony does not automatically reduce to atomization, a concept that has been used to explain the relative lack of the "right" kind of civil society in postcommunist countries. The fifth chapter is a compelling analysis of relations between ethnic Bulgarians (i.e., Slavs) and Bulgarian Roma populations through an examination of the roles that "Gypsy" figures play in various mumming rituals. This organization of the chapters makes the book particularly suitable for undergraduate teaching purposes. The first descriptive chapter can be combined with any of the four subsequent chapters to produce a rich reading unit that brings the Bulgarian case to bear on any of the aforementioned themes.

Rather than seeing the resurgence of mumming rituals in Bulgaria as a sign of neo-traditionalism or a renewed political orientation to the past, Creed chooses to read into the rituals a critique of postsocialism and the many failures of democracy and free market capitalism in the rural areas of Bulgaria. For many of Creed's informants, he writes that mumming is an: "... apt metaphor for the experience of rural postsocialism – a system where unreason reigns and every economic initiative is more of a gamble than a calculated venture. In their experience, this shift Westward made life more Byzantine, market principles produced patently irrational programs, and democracy generated rather unenlightened political stalemates. Mumming is the perfect response to this difficulty and uncertainty. It is not a return to magic but an assessment of the felicitous affinity between ineffective magical practices and postsocialism. The visceral experience of mumming as somewhat chaotic and unregulated only adds to its affective correlation with the postsocialist condition. Villagers have found new meaning in mumming not because they are backward but because they are thoughtful, expressive beings and see in mumming an image of their inexplicable and unredeemable predicament. For many, it is precisely because they have a modern secular interpretation of mumming as old-fashioned, unrestrained, and even superstitious that it resonates so beautifully with their contemporary lives! For these mummers, the appeal to tradition is not so much a rejection of modern options as an indictment of the current system's failure to deliver the modern spoils they were implicitly promised" (205).

As this extended quote beautifully demonstrates, Creed uses the ritual of mumming to uncover the complex and little discussed experience of rural communities in Bulgaria over the last two decades. As such, the book is a splendid addition to the field of postsocialist cultural studies and particularly to those anthropologists interested in ritual and ritual enactments in contemporary

Europe. The book as a whole is appropriate for both undergraduate courses and graduate seminars in the fields of anthropology, sociology, political science, Slavic studies, gender and women's studies, and for survey courses on Europe. Activists and policymakers interested in promoting democratization in post-communist countries should also pay keen attention to Creed's important critique of Western preconceived notions of what constitutes appropriate forms of civic organizing in chapter three. Overall, "Masquerade and Postsocialism" is a delightful read on a fascinating but woefully understudied country.

Kristen Ghodsee

**Donham, Donald L., and Santu Mofokeng:** Violence in a Time of Liberation. Murder and Ethnicity at a South African Gold Mine, 1994. Durham: Duke University Press, and London, 2011. 238 pp. ISBN 978-0-8223-4853-5. Price: £ 14.99

This is a beautifully produced book. The pictures alone are worth the price of admission. It is also beautifully written, thoughtful, intelligent, meticulous in making arguments, and humble in making its case and in acknowledgement of others' work. For those who are interested in debates about the often violent ambiguities of "liberation" (in South Africa and elsewhere), this is a must read. It is also a masterpiece of anthropological narrative in its own right. Like any engaging detective story, it will be widely read.

Donham focuses on a single case, the murder of two Zulu-speaking mineworkers at a mine he calls "Cinderella." The event took place on Soweto Day, about six weeks after the first free South African elections in 1994. As Donham (1) puts it, "black workers ganged up on the Zulus among them and slowly, determinedly hacked two to death." Most observers, black and white alike, interpreted the killing in ethnic terms, as an example of "Xhosas" attacking "Zulus." A few, more in the know, saw it as an attack by local members of the National Union of Mineworkers (NUM) on members of the United People's Union of South Africa (UPUSA), the Inkatha union on the mine. In the context of the "East Rand War," then winding down in the area of Cinderella mine, however, that in itself was code for "Xhosas killing Zulus," since Inkatha was a militantly anti-ANC (and COSATU) organization based in the KwaZulu homeland under Chief Mangosuthu Buthelezi, the NUM was firmly in the ANC camp, and the ANC was supposedly dominated by "Xhosa."

Very few workers from KwaZulu Natal were in fact recruited to work on the South African gold mines. After the 1987 strike, however, some mine managers deliberately sought Zulu workers because they were believed to be less militant. As a result, there came to be a small proportion of workers classified as Zulu on certain gold mines.

Some of them were Inkatha members and Buthelezi's stance was deeply conservative. This emerges, for instance, from a Gencor management report I found in Naas Steenkamp's files about a relatively minor work stoppage at Matla Colliery in 1988 where "two Zulu employees were killed and 22 injured during sporadic fighting be-

tween union [NUM] and non-union (mainly Zulu) workers following protests at the mine against the proposed Labour Relations Bill." NUM union leadership at Matla Colliery was very strong, however. Gencor talked to the NUM Head Office, local management permitted a mass meeting, and production resumed within a few days.

A delegation of Matla management and employees visited the "homeland" government in KwaZulu the day work resumed. According to the Matla report, Buthelezi insisted "that the violence at Matla was a revenge action planned by the NUM for violence that took place at Hlobane some time ago which was initiated by Inkatha/Uwusa ... Mr. Buthelezi argued that the NUM was affiliated with COSATU and COSATU with the ANC. COSATU is supporting disinvestment and sanctions whilst the KwaZulu government is opposing it. He stated that we [management] were feeding the crocodile with the hope that it would eat us last."

I mention this report at some length because I think Donham tends to play down the importance of fears of Inkatha (and police) violence on Cinderella mine. On his own account, Inkatha activists at Cinderella had direct access to the South African Police Internal Stability Unit with their armoured vehicles (99). That said, I concur with Donham's argument that most of the small minority of Zulu workers at Cinderella were not Inkatha activists. Many were innocent victims caught in the antagonism between Inkatha and the ANC. There are about a dozen accounts of "labour unrest" in the TEBA (mine recruitment agency) archives for the period from 1987 to 1996 that include reports of "Zulu problems." In all but two of these situations, the scenario depicted by Donham plays itself out. Workers in the Zulu minority are more or less summarily dismissed from the mine.

In the case of Cinderella, the murders on Soweto Day, six weeks after the election, resulted from a fight on the mine during which Zulu-speaking workers were hunted out of the compound on Easter Day, two months before the election. As a result of management's ethnic assumptions, all classificatory "Zulu" workers (including many who had not been targets of the hunt) were taken out of the compound and housed elsewhere. At that moment, the matter became "tribal" and the Zulu component of the mine work force was doomed to eventual discharge. Meanwhile, however, management sent "the Zulus" home on paid leave. It was on their return after the historic 1994 election that the Soweto Day killings occurred.

Management at Cinderella handled the return of the Zulu workers ineptly. They were brought back four days earlier than the date agreed with the NUM and mine security forces were not on the alert. Closer liaison with the NUM and better security might have avoided the Soweto Day clash or at least ensured a less deadly outcome.

Donham, however, does not think so. This is because he believes that NUM organization on the mine was more to blame for the Soweto Day killings than mine management. The NUM on Cinderella had come into being extraordinarily swiftly (within the space of less than nine months) primarily as a result of changes at the head office in Johannesburg, where a new human resources man-