

Philipp Sauter

Fusion Energy in Nuclear Weapons Law

Tackling the Climate Crisis while Addressing
the Risk of Further Proliferation



Nomos

Beiträge zum
ausländischen öffentlichen Recht und Völkerrecht

Edited by

the Max Planck Society
for the Advancement of Science
represented by Prof. Dr. Armin von Bogdandy
and Prof. Dr. Anne Peters

Volume 348

Philipp Sauter

Fusion Energy in Nuclear Weapons Law

Tackling the Climate Crisis while Addressing
the Risk of Further Proliferation



Nomos

Open Access funding provided by Max Planck Society.

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Frankfurt am Main, Univ., Diss., 2025

1st Edition 2026

© Philipp Sauter

Published by

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG
Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden
www.nomos.de

Production of the printed version:

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG
Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

ISBN (Print): 978-3-7560-3561-8

ISBN (ePDF): 978-3-7489-6621-0

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748966210>

D30



Onlineversion
InLibra



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

In loving memory of my Father

Acknowledgments

This book is based on my PhD thesis which has been accepted as doctoral dissertation by the Faculty of Law of the Goethe University Frankfurt during the summer semester of 2025.

I am indebted to many people who have accompanied me on this journey. *Marcel Dommer* first introduced me to the topic of fusion in 2015. *Thomas Eich* enabled me to do research in plasma physics between 2020 and 2022. *Karoly Olajos Tamas* integrated me into the legal fusion community. *Dieter Fleck* sparked my particular interest in nuclear weapons law. *Rob Goldston* and *Hartmut Zohm* offered valuable help with physics questions. I am also grateful to the two anonymous reviewers whose comments on a draft paper significantly improved my analysis.

Furthermore, I also wish to thank the Max Planck Society, the German Academic Scholarship Foundation (Studienstiftung des deutschen Volkes) as well as the German Federal Ministry of Research, Technology and Space (Funding Program Fusion 2040 – Research on the way to a fusion power plant, contract number 13F1002D) for their financial support, which made my research and extensive travels to conferences possible.

Moreover, I want to express my deepest gratitude to my colleagues at the Max-Planck-Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law for their invaluable feedback on draft chapters and for contributing to the inspiring intellectual atmosphere at the institute. I am especially grateful to my supervisor, *Armin von Bogdandy*, for his support, guidance, and patience. I would like to also thank *Caroline Sommerfeld* for helping me with proofreading. I further thank *Stefan Kadelbach* for his prompt grading of my thesis and for his valuable feedback.

Finally, I am also deeply indebted to my friends and family, who, even if they did not always understand what I was doing, constantly supported me in my endeavours.

Heidelberg, September 2025

Philipp Sauter

Table of Contents

Table of Abbreviations	17
Introduction: Sustainable Development and Securing Peace	19
1 Fusion in International Law	21
2 Fusion in International Nuclear Law	24
3 Fusion in Nuclear Weapons Law	27
3.1 The Interest to Study Nuclear Weapons Law	28
3.2 The Interest to Study Nuclear Proliferation	33
3.3 The Interest and Scope of This Study	36
4 Outline of the Book	37
Chapter 1: Technological Background	39
1 Fundamentals of Nuclear Physics	39
1.1 Atom and its Nucleus	39
1.2 Isotopes	40
1.3 Radioactivity	40
1.4 Neutron Capture	41
2 Nuclear Fusion	42
2.1 Basics of Nuclear Fusion	43
2.2 Confinement Technologies	44
2.3 Fusionable Materials	47
2.4 Fusion in a Power Plant	48
2.5 The Road to Commercial Fusion Energy	50
3 Nuclear Fission	52
4 Nuclear Weapons	55
4.1 Tactical and Strategic Nuclear Weapons	55
4.2 Nuclear Weapons Delivery Systems	56
4.3 Fission and Fusion Bombs	57
4.3.1 Pure Fission Bombs	57
4.3.2 Thermonuclear Weapons	58

5	Fusion and the Risk of Nuclear Proliferation	59
5.1	Transmutation – Fusion to Produce Nuclear Weapons Material	59
5.1.1	Transmutation of Uranium and Thorium	60
5.1.2	From Fertile to Fissile Material with Fission	61
5.1.3	From Fertile to Fissile Material with Fusion	62
5.1.4	Advantages of Fusion for Plutonium Breeding	65
5.1.5	Limitations of Fusion as a Plutonium Provider	66
5.1.6	Safeguarding ITER	68
5.1.7	Fusion without Transmutation Potential?	69
5.2	Tritium and the Hydrogen Bomb	71
5.2.1	Tritium Boosting of Fission Weapon	71
5.2.2	Tritium in Multi-Stage Devices	72
5.2.3	Tritium in Military Programmes and Civilian Nuclear Fuel Cycle	73
5.2.4	Tritium and Fusion Energy	74
5.3	Inertial Confinement Fusion	76
5.4	Fusion-Fission-Hybrid Systems	79
5.5	Fundamental Differences Between Fusion and Fission	80
5.6	Summary	81
	Chapter 2: The Legal Framework of Nuclear Weapons	83
1	Political Logic of Nuclear Weapons Law	83
1.1	Nuclear Weapons as a Tool for Deterrence and Coercion	84
1.2	Conflict between Security and Economy	89
2	The Law of Nuclear Non-Proliferation	92
2.1	Non-Proliferation Predating the IAEA	93
2.2	The IAEA Statute	94
2.2.1	The IAEA's Authority as Nuclear Watchdog	94
2.2.2	The IAEA's Powers in Nuclear Non-Proliferation	96
2.3	The Non-Proliferation Treaty	97
2.3.1	The Cornerstone of Nuclear Non-Proliferation	97
2.3.2	Legal Framework of the NPT	100
2.4	Safeguards Agreements	102
2.4.1	Structure of Safeguards Agreements	103
2.4.2	Safeguards Predating the NPT	104
2.4.3	Comprehensive Safeguards Agreements and the Additional Protocol	105

2.4.4	Voluntary Offer Agreements	107
2.5	Euratom Safeguards	108
2.5.1	The European Route	109
2.5.2	Safeguards in Europe	111
2.6	Export Controls	112
2.6.1	Zangger Committee	113
2.6.2	Nuclear Suppliers Group	115
2.7	The Limited Success Story of the Non-Proliferation Regime	119
2.7.1	Achievements	119
2.7.1.1	Setting an International Norm	119
2.7.1.2	Stopping Nuclear Weapons Programmes	121
2.7.2	Shortcomings	122
2.7.2.1	Lack of Universality	123
2.7.2.2	Reactivity Instead of Proactivity	124
2.7.2.3	Lack of Consensus on Fundamental Questions	125
2.7.2.3.1	Implementation of Article VI	125
2.7.2.3.2	Legality of Nuclear Sharing	126
2.7.2.3.3	Legality of Nuclear Cooperation	128
2.7.2.3.4	Implementation of 1995 Extension Deal	129
2.7.2.3.5	Review of the NPT	132
2.7.3	Summary	133
3	The Law of Nuclear Disarmament	133
3.1	Nuclear Disarmament and the United Nations	133
3.2	Disarmament within the NPT	134
3.3	Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons	136
3.4	NWFZ Treaties	138
4	The Limits of International Law in Preventing Nuclear Proliferation	140
4.1	Limitations of Safeguards	140
4.2	Heterogenous Set of Interests	142
4.2.1	Nuclear Weapon States Recognised by the NPT	142
4.2.1.1	United States	143
4.2.1.2	Russia	145
4.2.1.3	United Kingdom	145
4.2.1.4	France	146
4.2.1.5	China	147
4.2.1.6	Summary	147
4.2.2	Nuclear Weapon States Outside the NPT	148

4.2.3 Non-Nuclear NATO States	149
4.2.4 Non-NATO States from the Global North	151
4.2.5 States from the Global South	151
4.2.6 Other States with Particular Interests	152
4.2.7 European Union and Euratom	154
4.2.8 IAEA	154
4.2.9 Summary	155
5 Summary	156
Chapter 3: Fusion in the Existing Legal Framework	159
1 Fusion in the IAEA's Safeguards Regime	159
1.1 IAEA and Fusion	160
1.1.1 Fusion and Atoms for Peace and Development	160
1.1.2 Fusion and the Peaceful Use of the Atom	162
1.1.2.1 Article III.A.5 of the IAEA Statute	162
1.1.2.2 Article XII of the IAEA Statute	164
1.1.2.3 Article XX of the IAEA Statute	165
1.1.3 Summary	167
1.2 Fusion and the NPT	167
1.2.1 Article I NPT	168
1.2.2 Article II NPT	168
1.2.3 Safeguards: Article III.1 NPT	169
1.2.3.1 Objective of Article III.1 NPT	169
1.2.3.2 Source or Special Fissionable Material	170
1.2.3.3 Principal Nuclear Facility	172
1.2.3.4 Summary	175
1.2.4 Export Controls: Article III.2 NPT	175
1.2.5 Summary	176
1.3 Fusion and Safeguards Agreements	176
1.3.1 Comprehensive Safeguards Agreements	176
1.3.1.1 Nuclear Material	177
1.3.1.2 Facility	177
1.3.2 Additional Protocol to the CSA	181
1.3.3 Item-Specific Safeguards Agreements	185
1.3.3.1 Nuclear Material	185
1.3.3.2 Principal Nuclear Facility	186
1.3.4 Voluntary Offer Agreements	187
1.3.5 Summary	187

1.4 Summary	188
2 Export Control Regimes	188
2.1 Scope of Export Control Groups	189
2.2 Material Application of the Guidelines	190
2.3 Procedural Application of the Guidelines	192
2.4 Summary	194
3 Further Regimes	194
3.1 ITER Agreement	195
3.2 Fusion in the Euratom Treaty	196
3.3 Fusion and the TPNW	198
3.4 Fusion in Nuclear Weapon Free Zone Treaties	200
3.4.1 Treaty of Tlatelolco	200
3.4.2 Treaty of Rarotonga	201
3.4.3 Treaty of Bangkok	202
3.4.4 Treaty of Pelindaba	203
3.4.5 Treaty of Semipalatinsk	203
3.4.6 Summary	204
3.5 Summary	204
4 Evaluation of the Applicability of the Framework on Fusion	204
4.1 A Sprit but not an Obligation to Strengthen the Safeguards Regime	205
4.2 Summary of the Findings	207
Chapter 4: Adapting the Legal Framework	209
1 Constraints to Adapt the Framework	209
1.1 Financial and Commercial Interests	210
1.2 Political Interests	211
1.2.1 NWS recognised the NPT	211
1.2.2 NWS outside the NPT	212
1.2.3 NNWS from the Global North	213
1.2.4 States from the Global South	213
1.2.5 European Union and Euratom	214
1.2.6 IAEA	215
1.2.7 Summary	215
2 Evolutionary Interpretation	216
2.1 Doctrinal Background	216

Table of Contents

2.2	The IAEA's Safeguards System	219
2.2.1	Source and Special Fissionable Material	219
2.2.2	Nuclear Facility	221
2.3	Implications to NWFZ and the TPNW	223
2.4	Euratom Treaty	224
2.5	Stocktaking and Limitations of Evolutionary Interpretation	225
3	Acting under the Existing Regime	226
3.1	Decisions by the Board of Governors	227
3.1.1	Authority of the Board of Governors	227
3.1.2	Designate Materials	229
3.1.3	Designate Facilities	231
3.1.4	Establishing Committees and Advisory Groups	232
3.1.5	Call for Voluntary State Action	233
3.2	Practice by the IAEA Secretariat	234
3.2.1	Authority of the IAEA Secretariat	234
3.2.2	Advisory Groups	235
3.2.3	Special Inspections	237
3.2.4	Interpreting the Safeguards Instruments	238
3.2.5	Evaluation of the Authorities of IAEA Bodies	239
3.3	Nuclear Suppliers Group	239
3.3.1	Modifying Export Control Procedures	240
3.3.2	Safeguarding Inertial Confinement Fusion	241
3.3.3	Evaluation of the NSG's Authority	242
3.4	NPT Review Conferences	242
3.5	TPNW Meeting of State Parties and Review Conferences	244
3.6	United Nations	245
3.7	Evaluation and Summary	247
4	Treaty Changes	249
4.1	General Considerations on Safeguarding Tritium	250
4.2	Changing the IAEA Safeguards System	251
4.2.1	Amending the NPT and IAEA Statute	251
4.2.2	Second Additional Protocol to the CSA	253
4.3	International Tritium Control System	255
4.4	NWFZ Treaties	256
4.5	Euratom Treaty	257
4.6	Summary	257
5	Conclusion	258

Chapter 5: Outlook – The Adoption of a Fusion Treaty	261
1 Regulating Fusion Outside the NPT System	261
1.1 Fusion is not Fission	262
1.2 The NPT as Pandora’s Box	262
1.3 Vertical Proliferation	263
1.4 Precedents	264
2 Structure of a Fusion Treaty	266
2.1 Politics of a Fusion Treaty	266
2.2 Incentivising Scope and Content	267
2.2.1 International Nuclear Law	268
2.2.2 Technical Assistance	269
2.2.3 Vertical Proliferation and Disarmament	270
2.2.4 Further Regulatory Aspects	272
2.2.5 Summary	273
2.3 Forum for Negotiation	274
2.4 Institutional Framework	275
2.5 Summary	277
3 Safeguards Under a Fusion Treaty	277
3.1 The Question of Nuclear Weapon States	278
3.2 Legal Architecture of Fusion Safeguards	278
3.3 Addressing the Risk of Fissile Material Production	280
3.3.1 Gamma Radiation Detectors	280
3.3.2 Design Review and Monitoring of Energy Output	281
3.3.3 Physical Access to Fusion Facilities and Environmental Sampling	282
3.3.4 Satellite Imagery	283
3.4 Addressing the Risk of Tritium	283
3.5 Addressing the Risk of Knowledge Transfer in ICF	285
3.6 Relevance of Export Control Regimes	286
3.7 Summary	287
4 Conclusion	287
Chapter 6: Conclusion	289
Bibliography	295
1 Treaties	295

Table of Contents

2	Cases	296
2.1	Permanent Court of International Justice	296
2.2	International Court of Justice	296
2.3	International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea	297
2.4	Arbitral Awards	297
2.5	Court of Justice of the European Union	297
3	Resolutions	297
4	International Documents	298
4.1	International Atomic Energy Agency	298
4.1.1	Information Circular	298
4.1.2	Board of Governors	298
4.1.3	General Conference	298
4.2	United Nations	299
4.3	NPT	299
5	Figures	299
6	Literature	300

Table of Abbreviations

Abbreviation	Explanation
AP	Additional Protocol, based on INFCIRC/540(Corrected)
COP	Conference of Parties
CSA	Comprehensive Safeguards Agreements, based on INF-CIRC/153(Corrected)
CTBT	Comprehensive Test-Ban Treaty
CTBTO	Comprehensive Test-Ban Treaty Organization
D	Deuterium
ENDC	Eighteen Nations Committee on Disarmament
Euratom	European Atomic Energy Community
EU	European Union
H	Hydrogen
He	Helium
ICF	Inertial Confinement Fusion
INFCIRC	Information Circulars (IAEA series to communicate on matters of general interest to all IAEA Member States)
IAEA	International Atomic Energy Agency
ICJ	International Court of Justice
IFEA	International Fusion Energy Agency
ILC	International Law Commission
Li	Lithium
NNWS	Non-Nuclear Weapons State
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NPT	Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty
NSG	Nuclear Suppliers Group
NWFZ	Nuclear Weapon Free Zone
NWS	Nuclear Weapons State
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
Pu	Plutonium

Table of Abbreviations

SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
TPNW	Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons
T	Tritium
UN	United Nations
UNSCR	United Nations Security Council Resolution
U	Uranium
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties