

Humanitarian Protection for Prisoners of War and Refugees in the Long Aftermath of the First World War



FRANCESCA PIANA

LEIDEN
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Humanitarian Protection for Prisoners of War and Refugees
in the Long Aftermath of the First World War

Global Connections: Routes and Roots

Global Connections: Routes and Roots explores histories that challenge existing demarcations between and within local, regional, and interregional arenas. The series encompasses single-site and vernacular histories as much as studies of long-distance connection.

This series seeks to bridge early modern and modern history. By taking a wide timeframe of c. 1200 to the present, we embrace the many and shifting nodal points, key regions, modes of transportation and other forms of connectivity that together form the “routes” and “roots” of global history. This includes the making and unmaking of power in different manifestations, as well as the intellectual genealogies and trajectories of the ideas that did so.

We welcome all work that explores the global as method. We stress the need to recover local primary sources as a way of investigating both the individual and the collective agency of all those involved in the making of the global.

Series Editors

Carolien Stolte, Leiden University

Mariana de Campos Francozo, Leiden University

Editorial Board

Ananya Chakravarti, Georgetown University

Scott Levi, The Ohio State University

Su Lin Lewis, Bristol University

Gerard McCann, University of York

Prasannan Parthasarathi, Boston College

Alessandro Stanziani, École des hautes études en sciences sociales

Heidi Tworek, University of British Columbia

Other titles in this series:

Kate Imy, Teresa Segura-Garcia, Elena Valdameri and Erica Wald (eds), *Bodies beyond Binaries: In Colonial and Postcolonial Asia*, 2024

Yulianti, *The Making of Buddhism in Modern Indonesia: South and Southeast Asian Networks And Agencies, 1900-1959*, 2024

Philipp Krauer, *Swiss Mercenaries in the Dutch East Indies: A Transimperial History of Military Labour, 1848-1914*, 2024

Natalia Doan and Sho Konishi (eds), *Black Transnationalism and Japan*, 2024

Joanna Simonow, *Ending Famine in India: A Transnational History of Food Aid and Development, c. 1890-1950*, 2023

Bérénice Guyot-Réchart and Elisabeth Leake, *South Asia Unbound: New International Histories of the Subcontinent*, 2023

Carolien Stolte and Su Lin Lewis (eds), *The Lives of Cold War Afro-Asianism*, 2022

Harald Fischer-Tiné and Nico Slate (eds), *The United States and South Asia from the Age of Empire to Decolonization: A History of Entanglements*, 2022

Neilesh Bose (eds), *India after World History: Literature, Comparison, and Approaches to Globalization*, 2022

Jos Gommans and Ariel Lopez (eds), *Philippine Confluence: Iberian, Chinese and Islamic Currents, c. 1500-1800*, 2020

Michele Louro, Carolien Stolte, Heather Streets-Salter and Sana Tannoury-Karam (eds), *The League Against Imperialism: Lives and Afterlives*, 2020

HUMANITARIAN PROTECTION FOR PRISONERS OF WAR AND REFUGEES IN THE LONG AFTERMATH OF THE FIRST WORLD WAR

Francesca Piana

LEIDEN UNIVERSITY PRESS

Global Connections: Routes and Roots, volume 12

Cover design: Andre Klijsen

Cover illustration: Post World War I - Narva, Ivangorod fortress. ICRC transit point for Russian prisoners of war repatriated from Germany and German prisoners of war coming from Russia. ICRC archives (ARR). 07/1920. V-P-HIST-03050-26.

Lay-out: Crius Group

Every effort has been made to obtain permission to use all copyrighted illustrations reproduced in this book. Nonetheless, whosoever believes to have rights to this material is advised to contact the publisher.

ISBN 9789087284213

e-ISBN 9789400604629 (e-PDF)

<https://doi.org/10.24415/9789087284213>

NUR 689

© Francesca Piana / Leiden University Press, 2024

All rights reserved. Without limiting the rights under copyright reserved above, no part of this book may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the written permission of both the publisher and the editors of the book.



Creative Commons Licence CC BY-NC-ND (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/deed>)

Table of Contents

Figures and tables	7
Abbreviations	9
Acknowledgment	11
Introduction	13
Part I: The return of forgotten prisoners of war from Russia and from the Central Powers	41
Chapter 1. Humanitarian diplomacy for prisoners of war: compassion, politics, and money	43
Chapter 2. Crossing Narva: the exchange of prisoners of war at the Estonia–Russia border	75
Part II: The internationalization of the Russian refugee question	97
Chapter 3. From prisoners of war to Russian refugees: continuity of policies	99
Chapter 4. The global governance of refugee protection: obstacles and innovations	131
Chapter 5. Unsorted Constantinople: protecting white Russians from the inter-Allied occupation to modern Turkey	165
Part III: The rescue and the resettlement of Armenian refugees	201
Chapter 6. International politics for Armenians: multiple discourses, different responses	203
Chapter 7. A fragmented global exile: humanitarian protection and refugee politics for displaced Armenians	231
Conclusion	263
Bibliography	267
Index	293

Figures and tables

Fig. 1	Total number of repatriated prisoners of war	71
Fig. 2	Postcard illustrating the fortress of Ivangorod in Estonia	81
Fig. 3	Copy of the transport list of prisoners of war from Interdulgag in Estonia	87
Fig. 4	The local staff in Narva	93
Fig. 5	Example of a Nansen passport	149
Fig. 6	Example of a Nansen stamp	161
Fig. 7	Poster for the census of Russian refugees in Constantinople	175
Fig. 8	Armenian children in Aleppo	239
Fig. 9	The Armenian relief worker Vasil Sabagh	241
Fig. 10	An Armenian boy driving a tractor in Syria	245
Table 1	Total number of Russian refugees and the list of institutions assisting them by country	115
Table 2	List of the Red Cross missions, May 10-11, 1920	127
Table 3	List of private, voluntary organizations participating in the Advisory Committee for Private Organizations from 1921 to 1925	139

Abbreviations

ABCFM	American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions
ACICR	Archives of the International Committee of the Red Cross
ACPO	Advisory Committee of Private Organizations
AILO	Archives of the International Labour Organization
ALON	Archives of the League of Nations
ANB	The National Library of Norway
ARA	American Relief Administration
ARC	American Red Cross
ASC	Armenian Sub-Committee of the ACPO
BIT	International Labour Office (Bureau international du travail)
CCRAR	Central Committee for the Relief of Armenian refugees
CSAR	Commission for the Settlement of Armenian refugees
HA	Hoover archives
HCR	High Commissariat for Refugees
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
IEC	International Emigration Commission
ILO	International Labour Organization
LON	League of Nations
LRCS	League of the Red Cross Societies
NA FO	The National Archives of Great Britain, Foreign Office
NBKR	The papers of Baron Noel-Baker
NER	Near East Relief
POW	Prisoner of war
RCICR	Review of the International Committee of the Red Cross
SCF	Save the Children Fund
UISE	Union internationale de secours aux enfants
YMCA	Young Men's Christian Association
YWCA	Young Women's Christian Association

Acknowledgment

This book's history speaks to my life as well as to all the people who have supported me, intellectually, institutionally, and personally. I am deeply grateful to Davide Rodogno, who gave me the opportunity to work as a research assistant during my doctoral studies on the project that he led at the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies in Geneva, funded by the Swiss National Science Foundation.¹ The International History Department of the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies and the Pierre du Bois Foundation have also been a great support. My doctoral dissertation took the shape of a book during my postdoctoral years, supported again by two fellowships of the Swiss National Science Foundation and the fellowship of Binghamton University and the Journal of Women's History.² *Scuola Normale Superiore*,³ the University of Geneva, and the University of Trento⁴ have offered ideal spaces to complete the manuscript, for which I am grateful.

I owe a debt of gratitude to my mentors and colleagues. My supervisor, Andre Liebich, has offered knowledgeable guidance and critical reading. I have a debt of gratitude to Davide Rodogno, who shared his knowledge of internationalism and humanitarianism, and challenged me in meaningful ways. I am indebted to Peter Gatrell at Manchester University who generously engaged with my work. At Birkbeck College, Jessica Reinisch advised and supported me in many important ways. A cohort of colleagues have read, commented on, and discussed subsequent versions and parts of the manuscript. I am thankful to Ana Antić, Pamela Ballinger, Riccardo Bocco, David Brydan, Johanna Conterio, Maria Framke, Shaloma Gauthier, Rebecca Gill, Jaclyn Granick, Marcia Holmes, Jo Laycock, Sarah Marks, Erica Moretti, Jean Quataert, Iris Rachamimov, Amalia Ribi Forclaz, Timur Saitov, Pierre-Yves Saunier, Dora Vargha, and Benjamin T. White. I have presented bits and pieces

¹ Davide Rodogno, "Histoire des associations internationales et des organisations internationales non-gouvernementales humanitaires en Europe occidentale au 19ème et 20ème siècle (1800-1945)", financed by the Swiss National Science Foundation (PP0011_118875).

² Francesca Piana, "'Parallel Lives': Women, Imperialism, and Humanitarianism, ca. 1880-1950," financed by the Swiss National Science Foundation (P2GEP1_148355 and P300P1_158445).

³ "Per una storia visuale della sicurezza sociale in Italia, 1919-1978", MIUR "Dipartimenti di Eccellenza", bando 2017, Classe di lettere e filosofia, Scuola Normale Superiore, Prof. Ilaria Pavan.

⁴ "Political Repression and International Solidarity Networks (PRISON). The Transnational Mobilization on Behalf of Political Prisoners in the Interwar Period (1918-1939 ca.)", MUR - Ministero Università e Ricerca, MUR_PRIN 2022, Università degli Studi di Trento, Prof. Umberto Tulli, and Università "Ca' Foscari" Venezia.

of the book at so many international conferences and workshops that it would take too long to mention them all here. I thank all those who generously invited me as well as colleagues on the panels and audience for their remarks, criticism, and questions. The two reviewers from Leiden University Press have offered crucial reflections and useful insights. Thank you to Saskia Gieling and Lisa van Vliet at Leiden University Press, to Nick O'Dell for the copyediting, as well as to the series editors, Carolien Stolte and Mariana de Campos Francozo.

Researching this book has been a journey into many archives and libraries, which became easier to consult thanks to the help of many archivists and librarians. I am particularly grateful to Bernhardine Pejovic, Jacques Oberson, and Hermine Diebolt at the United Nations Archives in Geneva; Fabrizio Bensi and Daniel Palmieri at the archives of the International Committee of the Red Cross; Remo Becci and Jacques Rodriguez at the International Labour Organization Archives; Anne Melgård at the National Library of Norway; and Martine Basset at the library of the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies.

This book would not be the same without the affection of many people. I owe especial gratitude to Anna Aleksanyan, Patricia Arnold, William Assanvo, Souhaïl Belhadj-Klaz, Anne-Sophie Bentz, Linda Bernard, Julie Billaud, Elisa Camiscioli, Eleonora Castaldo, Aurélie Coulon, Jane Cowan, Jérôme Elie, Julieta Falcón-Salgado, Aude Gata, Jane Janz, Adil Asan Khan, Ilaria Pavan, Martine Pochon, Laura Polito, Lorenzo Rovigatti and Anita, Gabriella Tau and Jeanne, Özcan Yilmaz, and Gabriella Zalapi. Between continents and across the Alps, I know that I could count on them. My parents, Attilio Piana and Donatella Bonfiglio, have taught me to have a love of the past and have provided constant encouragement. Davide Piana, Francesca Alfieri and Niccolò have offered much needed breaks from thinking and writing about the past. Andrea Beghi has brought so much joy into my life and has been the greatest source of loving support.

This book has stayed with me for many long years. It is a testament to my perseverance and determination.

Trenno, Milano, August 9, 2024

An early version of chapter 2 was published in the following article, which I use upon the journal's permission. "L'Estonie et l'échange des prisonniers de guerre entre Allemagne et Russie, 1918-1922," *Revue d'Allemagne et des pays de langue allemande*, 52-2 | 2020, 317-340.

An early version of the material included in chapters 3 and 4 was published in the following article, which I use with the journal's permission. "Fra protezione sociale e lotta alla disoccupazione. Le negoziazioni e l'assistenza tecnica del Bureau international du travail a favore dei rifugiati russi (1919-1925)," *Studi Storici* 4 (2021), 857-887.