

highlight the principles that should underlie any search for acceptability both in word and image.

Chapter 8 – Computer applications for terminology – occupies over 70 percent of this 2<sup>nd</sup> volume with 15 contributions, which virtually all document a reversed relation, namely terminology in a computer environment. Both terminology and computers are ancillary to knowledge organisation and management, so that databases, data categories, entry structures, data extraction & retrieval, interchange, compilation, and information handling & structuring, which all are competently and informatively discussed here, clearly bear out what they actually sub-serve, and that terminology is part & parcel of a bigger deal, that of knowledge engineering. The technicalities presented highlight particular concerns of terminologists, localizers, and information specialists working in the language industry, while the last contribution on TM in artificial intelligence and knowledge acquisition (Khurshid Ahmad) strides a wider area and fills the register.

### 3. Conclusion

It is always hard to assess the merits of information. Bias is a feature which, in scientific publications, cannot afford to come out as clearly as in publicity, but it is well known that, like in journalism, selection, rejection, and presentation of data forms opinion and creates followers. When confronted with a fuller picture including further information or with information based on a different arrangement of facts or terms, the first impression will have to be revised. This is what is bound to happen after reading this outstanding second volume, and hopefully, the opinion gained from using this manual will brave it out. The reader has plenty of nodes of hypertext to joggle off on. It is up to him to enjoy the game or disagree with ontology as pictured naively on p.888. Since hypertext allows no conclusion, no exit, he should bridle his curiosity and look out for the first stop to take a return ticket, as Alice was advised.

### H. Eisele

Herbert Eisele, Terminologist, Research director for translation and terminology, ISIT, Paris.  
E-mail: [herbert.eisele@free.fr](mailto:herbert.eisele@free.fr).

SMIRAGLIA, Richard P. **The nature of “a work”: Implications for the organization of knowledge.** Lanham, MD : Scarecrow Press, 2001. ISBN 0-8103-4037-5.

As any cataloguer knows, the concept of “the work,” which is central to bibliographic description, receives almost no overt treatment in our cataloguing codes. Richard Smiraglia has therefore produced a timely contribution: the first book-length exploration of the concept of the work in bibliographic description. Smiraglia poses three questions: What is the nature of a work? What is a work? And who is concerned about the nature of works? The author attempts to provide preliminary answers to these questions by summarizing previous research, by embedding the work concept in a theoretical context, and by providing empirical evidence of the presence of works and of bibliographic relationships in catalogues.

Smiraglia begins with an analysis of the work as it figures in the primary writings on Anglo-American cataloguing. Using an effective conceptual frame that originates in Patrick Wilson's concept of the bibliographic universe, he surveys the chief writings on bibliographic description in a comprehensive and methodical fashion, beginning with Hyde and following through such important names as Panizzi, Jewett, Cutter, Pettee, and Lubetzky. He covers the Paris Principles, and moves on to the work of Domanovsky, Tanselle, Wilson, Carpenter, and the IFLA Report on the Functional Requirements of Bibliographic Records. He then goes on to survey the work of Tillet, Smiraglia, Leazer, Yee, Velluci and Carlyle on bibliographic relationships.

From these scholars, Smiraglia extracts some general points of consensus on the work: primarily that it is an abstract concept that can sustain a variety of physical manifestations. He separates intellectual content into “ideational” and “semantic” content, and argues that a significant change in ideational content, semantic content or both, results in the creation of a new work. A taxonomy of bibliographic relationships can be created to chart the growth of new works from a progenitor work.

Smiraglia then moves on to a series of reflections on the social and cultural importance of works, which produces what can only be described as a whirlwind tour of structuralist and post-structuralist theory. He grounds the work concept in linguistics and semiotics, drawing on Saussure, Yngve, and Peirce. He also draws on Barthes and Mark Poster, as well as music theorists Jean-Jacques Nattiez and Lydia Goehr, and uses Fou-

cult to emphasize the theoretical tangles we encounter when dealing with problems of authorship, ownership and attribution in works. On the basis of this survey, Smiraglia draws two chief conclusions: first, that the work is a social and cultural phenomenon, and second, that the work concept rests on a tension between immutability, which enables multiple physical manifestations to be linked with the same work, and mutability, which causes works to mutate over time.

This mutability becomes the focus of the third part of the book, in which Smiraglia presents recent empirical research on derivative bibliographic relationships, much of it his own. He summarizes a series of studies that quantitatively measure the existence of works and of bibliographic relationships in a variety of catalogues. These studies examine the impact of various features on bibliographic families: the age of the progenitor work, the work's form and genre, the language and place of origin, and the discipline and subdiscipline. He follows this with a qualitative investigation of various bibliographic families, complete with diagrams and models. The author comes to the conclusion that bibliographic relationships are indeed complex, that the age of the progenitor work is a factor in the number of works it spawns, and that a work's popularity may be factor in degree of derivation. He concludes the book with an outline of a potential theory of the work. A work, he claims, is the intellectual content of a bibliographic entity, which functions in society as a sign functions in language, and possesses the qualities of the Peircean symbol.

This book has a number of significant strengths. For one thing, it is badly needed, particularly at a time when the Joint Steering Committee for AACR2R is working to incorporate a more articulate theoretical base for the Anglo American Cataloguing Rules. Smiraglia grounds his discussion in both a theoretical and an empirical context, which should appeal to researchers of various methodological inclinations. He provides a conscientious and detailed outline of his methodology in the various studies that form the heart of the later chapters, and while much of his research on derivative bibliographic relationships has already appeared elsewhere, it certainly benefits from being assembled and integrated into a broader discussion. Above all, he provides a superb summary of the various writings on the work, drawing together disparate voices into a concise, effective narrative on the growth of this concept over the last two hundred years. This alone will make the book required reading for many cataloguing courses.

The weaknesses of the book are largely mitigated by Smiraglia's own admission that this constitutes only a

preliminary exploration of a concept that needs much more attention. Some of them, however, do deserve mentioning, if only to stimulate debate. First, Smiraglia's questions are at odds with his method, to some degree. The book claims to be working towards a definition of the work, and that this working definition, however tentative, will be the "product" of the book's content. But because much of the discussion is based on an empirical analysis of the presence of works in catalogues, he needs to have a working definition before he begins. As a result, the empirical chapters assume that the primary questions of the book have already been answered, and the framework he produces at the end of the book is not significantly different from the definition he produced at the end of the literature survey. Furthermore, the third question ("Who is concerned about the nature of works?") is answered, but the answer reads like a justification of the importance of the research, and does not really derive from the research itself.

Certain concepts could use more clarification, particularly the division of content into ideational content, which he defines as the propositions expressed in a work, and semantic content, which is the expression of those propositions in a particular set of linguistic strings. The division itself causes no particular difficulties, and has precedents in the work of Wilson and others. But Smiraglia needs to explain how these two facets of content can be operationally separated, and to show, perhaps through examples, how ideational content can change without the semantic content changing as well.

Smiraglia's use of the term "triad" when discussing Peirce, although not incorrect, may lead to some confusion. I would advise using Peirce's term "trichotomy" to express the relationship between icon, index, and symbol. It would prevent readers from confusing it with the "triadic sign" of sign-object-interpretant, which is often used in information retrieval, particularly to distinguish the trinary Peircian model of the sign from the binary Saussurean model.

Smiraglia began the book by asking, "what is a work?" His book leaves me with another nagging question. Is there a work at all? Smiraglia is convinced that there is, and he uses semiotics and post-structuralism as a source of theory to be empirically tested. But the implications of the theoretical discussion work against the premise that these things are empirically testable, at least in the way that Smiraglia has tested them. If, as Smiraglia argues, the work is a product of social and cultural forces, what is there beyond what members of a culture see by mutual consensus? And if "the work" is a cultural construction, then I would argue that we

need to pay greater attention to the social processes that fabricate our conception of the "work." These social processes will be reflected in catalogues, but not articulated there. The articulations may, however, be found in, or derived from, closer and more comprehensive readings of social and cultural theory, and the operationalization of a fresh set of variables for empirical analysis. Smiraglia has made a good beginning, but, as he would be the first to admit, the task is far from over.

Grant Campbell

Dr. Grant Campbell, Faculty of Information and Media Studies, University of Western Ontario, London, Ontario, N6A 5B7, Canada.  
E-mail: gcampbel@uwo.ca.

**TAYLOR, Arlene G. Wynar's Introduction to Cataloging and Classification.** 9th ed. Assisted by David P. Miller. Englewood, CO : Libraries Unlimited, 2000. xx, 552 p. ISBN 1-56308-857-6(pbk).

First published in 1964, and at the time solely authored by Bohdan S. Wynar, this textbook has kept constant pace with the rapidly changing scene of bibliographic and information organization. Its nine editions chart the course this field has treaded over the last four decades, and the regular editions speak of its popularity. It has deservedly grown into a textbook which has shaped the curricula of many library schools around the world. Associated with it since the sixth edition (1980), Professor Taylor is a teacher of repute and a prolific writer in the area of knowledge organization. A recipient of the coveted Margaret Mann Citation and member of the Decimal Classification Editorial Policy Committee, she is an authority in the field. Professor Taylor has enlisted the help of many colleagues and experts to keep the text up to date and authentic, maintaining a policy of inviting widely based suggestions. After a nine year period, *Wynar's Introduction to Cataloging and Classification* needed drastic revisions.

The 20 chapters that make up the text have been organised into six parts. Part I (the first two chapters) explains the meaning, purpose and history of cataloguing and cataloguing codes. Part II (chapter 3) describes the MARC format, more specifically the MARC 21 version, as well as SGML, HTML and other formats for

encoding information. Part III (Chapters 4 to 7) discuss descriptive cataloguing and choice of access points according to the latest versions of the AACR and ISBDs for different types of information packages. Rules have been illustrated with judiciously chosen examples.

Part IV (Chapters 8 to 17) deals with the theory of classification, shelf classification and subject indexing. Major classifications discussed in adequate details are DDC and LCC. Unused classification systems, such as those of Brown and Cutter, are presented briefly. Regrettably, there is no description of Ranganathan's CC, though its method is discussed cursorily in a section on faceted classification. This part has detailed chapters, each on the *Library of Congress Subject Headings* and the *Sears List of Subject Headings*. Some space is also given to the presentation of a few of the best known thesauri, such as the *Art and Architecture Thesaurus*.

Part V (Chapter 18) deals with authority control and work for consistency of headings to identify and collate materials. Part VI (Chapters 19-20) deals with administrative issues relating to centralised and cooperative cataloguing, and describes the functions of bibliographic utilities such as OCLC. The last chapter has been rewritten to be on the cutting edge and develops the theme with a focus on the internal administration of a cataloguing department.

The 1980 ALA filing rules are printed in an appendix. A glossary provides definitions of varying length for some 325 select basic terms and abbreviations. A current bibliography of about 300 books, journal papers and standards, available either both in print or on Web, will be useful for advanced researchers in the field. The detailed index is exemplary, as is the analytical table of contents. Figures and illustrations enhance the lucidity of the book. Each chapter has been divided into sections with headings, is fully referenced, and is followed by suggested readings.

*Wynar's Introduction to Cataloging and Classification* deals with a large number of topics both current and classic. Yet its growing obesity has been skilfully checked. The book reflects the current state of the art in the turbulently changing field of information and document organization, and so is indispensable for students, teachers and working cataloguers.

M.P. Satija

Dr. M.P. Satija, Guru Nanak Dev (GND) University, Amritsar, 143 005, India.  
E-mail: satija\_mp@yahoo.com.