

Thomas Burri

# The Greatest Possible Freedom

Interpretive formulas and their spin in  
free movement case law



Nomos



Nomos

*Thomas Burri*

# The Greatest Possible Freedom

*Interpretive formulas and their spin in  
free movement case law*

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft

*Thomas Burri* is an assistant professor of international and European law at the University of St. Gallen (HSG) in Switzerland. He received his education as a lawyer at the Universities of Basel and Zurich, as well as at the College of Europe in Bruges. This book was written while on research stays at Harvard University and the Ludwig-Maximilians-University in Munich. Thomas Burri previously published a book on the rights of minorities ('Models of Autonomy? Case-Studies of Minority Regimes in Hungary and French Polynesia') as well as articles in various international and European law journals and books. Webpage: [www.thomas-burri.com](http://www.thomas-burri.com).

**Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: St. Gallen, Univ., Habil., 2015

ISBN 978-3-8487-2391-1 (Print)  
978-3-8452-6549-0 (ePDF)

#### **British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-2391-1 (Print)  
978-3-8452-6549-0 (ePDF)

#### **Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Burri, Thomas

The Greatest Possible Freedom

Interpretive formulas and their spin in free movement case law

Thomas Burri

606 p.

Includes bibliographic references and index.

ISBN 978-3-8487-2391-1 (Print)  
978-3-8452-6549-0 (ePDF)

1. Edition 2015

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2015. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

*Für Lotti und Kaspar*



# Table of Contents

A	Introduction: The way to the greatest possible freedom .....	17
	I Free movement of persons and services: 1400 decisions .....	17
	II The structure of the book .....	19
	III Why is the first part on ‘the case-law’ necessary? Why not cover more interpretive formulas? .....	20
	IV A text-based approach .....	21
	V Why is this book useful and novel? .....	22
	VI An illustration of how this book is different from other works .....	25
	VII What this book is not .....	27
B	The case-law .....	29
	I The 1960s .....	29
	II The 1970s .....	34
	1 Workers .....	34
	A first wave of cases: 34 – The year 1975: 36 – The remain- ing years of the decade: 36	
	2 Establishment .....	38
	3 Social security .....	39
	Aggregation and apportionment: 39 – Niemann and Petroni: 41 – Other aggregation: 43 – Aggregation and third states: 43 – Social security v. social assistance: 44 – Definitions and scope: 45 – Personal scope: 45 – Family: 46 – Unemploy- ment: 47 – Sickness: 49 – Non-discrimination and resi- dence: 49 – One legislation: 50 – Transition and technicali- ties: 51	
	4 Services .....	52
	III The 1980s .....	53
	1 Workers .....	53
	Advantages: 55 – Educational advantages: 55 – Mainte- nance grants: 56 – Family members: 57 – Derogations: 58 – No violation of non-discrimination: 60 – Diploma recognition: 61 – The Ankara Agreement: 61 – Enlarge- ment: 61 – Technicalities, purely internal situations: 62	
	2 Establishment .....	63
	1985: 64 – 1986: 64 – 1987: 65 – 1988 and 1989: 65 – Purely internal situations and remainders: 66 – Companies: 67 – Diploma: 67	

3	Social security .....	68
	Definitions and scope: 68 – Social security v. social assistance: 69 – Further issues of definition: 70 – Aggregation and apportionment: 71 – Benefits of the same kind and rules against overlapping: 72 – Further aggregation: 74 – Aggregation and third states: 75 – Short periods of insurance and other intricacies: 76 – Recalculation: 77 – Aggregation and conditions of affiliation: 77 – Overlapping benefits, supplements: 79 – Adding to the disparities: 81 – More supplements: 82 – Unemployed frontier workers: 83 – Atypical frontier workers: 84 – Exporting unemployment benefits: 85 – A Kafka novel: 86 – Sicknes: 86 – Applicable legislation: 87 – Non-discrimination and residence: 88 – The Dutch transition: 89 – Further non-discrimination: 90 – Technicalities: 91	
4	Services .....	93
	Broadcasting: 93 – Posted workers: 94 – Variety: 95 – Infringement in the insurance sector: 96 – Public works: 96 – Lawyers: 96 – Broadcasting again: 97 – Remuneration: 98 – Transport services: 98 – Tourists: 98	
IV	The 1990s .....	98
1	Workers and citizens .....	99
	Worker: 99 – Advantages: 100 – Education: 102 – Taxes: 103 – Derogations: 105 – Non-discrimination: 106 – Union citizenship: 107 – Ankara: 108 – Technicalities: 110 – Purely internal situations: 112 – Transition and remainders: 113	
2	Establishment .....	114
	Ships and aircrafts: 114 – Doctors: 116 – Purely internal situations: 116 – Taxation: 118 – Official authority: 119 – Names: 119 – Gebhard: 119 – Driving licences: 120 – Sunday trading: 120 – Non-profit: 121 – Austria: 121 – Non-discrimination: 122 – Legal persons: 122 – Technicalities: 124 – Secondary law as to companies and further technicalities: 125 – Diploma: 126	
3	Social Security .....	129
	Scope and definitions: 129 – Social security v. assistance: 129 – Conventions with third states: 130 – Further scope: 130 – Scope and applicable legislation: 131 – Ceasing occupation: 132 – Derived rights: 133 – Special non-contributory benefits, social assistance: 135 – Farming: 135 – (Not) purely internal situations: 135 – Monopoly, periods of insurance: 136 – Applicable legislation: 136 – Aggregation: 138 – Previous conventions: 141 – Changing circumstances: 142 – Benefits of the same kind, overlapping: 145 – Aggregation in Spain:	



146 – Aggregation and special non-contributory benefits:	
147 – Differing retirement ages: 147 – Aggregation and civil servants: 147 – Broader aggregation: 148 – Family benefits: 150 – After Pinna: 151 – More family benefits: 152 – Post Rossi: 154 – Unemployment: 156 – Sickness and invalidity: 159 – Non-discrimination and residence: 161 – Third states: 164 – Ankara: 166 – Technicalities: 167 – Subrogation: 167 – Social security more broadly: 168	
4 Services .....	169
Posted workers: 169 – Tourist guides: 170 – Lawyers: 171 – Säger: 172 – Broadcasting: 172 – No connection to services, purely internal: 175 – Public works: 176 – Various services: 177 – Games of chance: 178 – Maritime transport: 179 – Again various services: 180 – Medical services: 182 – Taxation: 183 – Public procurement: 185 – Further services cases: 186	
V The 2000s .....	188
1 Workers and citizens .....	188
Worker: 188 – Advantages: 189 – Family members: 190 – Family members and Union citizenship: 191 – Union citizenship, minimex, and students: 192 – Education without Union citizenship: 194 – Tideover allowance and Union citizenship: 194 – Job seekers and Union citizenship: 195 – Genuine link again: 195 – War victims and Union citizenship: 195 – Union citizenship and expulsion: 196 – Names and Union citizenship: 196 – Union citizenship and institutional issues: 197 – Union citizenship and other policies: 197 – Taxation: 198 – Taxes and houses: 199 – Cohesion of the tax system: 200 – Taxation of employees of the Communities: 201 – Taxes and Union citizenship: 201 – Taxes on cars: 202 – Taxes and real estate: 202 – Interim assistance and taxation: 203 – Derogations: 203 – Sufficient resources: 205 – Non-discrimination: 205 – Car registration: 207 – Further non-discrimination: 207 – Ankara: 208 – Ankara more favourable than the internal market: 211 – Agreements with other third states: 212 – Technicalities: 214 – Driving licences: 214 – Purely internal situations: 216	
2 Establishment .....	217
Dentists: 217 – Opticians: 218 – Psychotherapists: 219 – Pharmacies: 219 – Lawyers: 220 – Pay slips for workers: 222 – Games of chance: 222 – Taxation: 223 – Car registration: 226 – Diploma: 226 – Private security: 227 – Bovine semen: 227 – Family members: 228 – Cars: 228 – Ankara: 229 – Europe Agreements: 229 – Switzerland: 231 – Purely in-	

	ternal situations: 231 – Secondary law: 231 – Open skies: 232 – Legal persons and taxation: 232 – Dividends: 233 – Incorporation: 233 – Taxation of capital gains and profits: 234 – Sight account with banks: 235 – Ship registration: 235 – Taxation of groups: 236 – Cross-border merger: 236 – Further companies, taxation (2006): 237 – More dividends case-law: 238 – Companies and third countries: 239 – Further group cases: 240 – Inheritance tax: 241 – Taxation of limited partnerships: 241 – More dividends: 241 – Currency loss: 241 – Expenses for research and development: 242 – Further group taxation: 242 – Moving the seat: 245 – Secondary law re companies: 246 – Diploma recognition in 2000-2002: 246 – Diploma recognition in 2003-2004: 249 – Diploma recognition in 2005-2006: 251 – Diploma recognition in 2007-2009: 252	
3	Social security .....	255
	Scope and definitions: 255 – Special non-contributory benefits: 256 – Annex issues: 259 – Further scope and definitions: 260 – Applicable legislation: posted workers: 261 – One legislation: 262 – Ceasing occupation: 264 – Two legislations: 265 – Aggregation: 265 – Aggregation and child-rearing in Austria: 267 – Aggregation and employment with the Community: 268 – Further aggregation: 268 – Sickness benefits, medical services: 269 – Pensioners and sickness benefits: 272 – Unemployment benefits: 273 – Exporting unemployment benefits: 275 – Unemployed frontier workers: 275 – Family benefits: 276 – Family benefits and pensioners: 278 – Non-discrimination: 278 – Agreements with third countries, Ankara: 281 – Technicalities: 283 – Further social security cases: 284	
4	Services .....	285
	Posted workers: 285 – Construction business: 286 – More posted workers: 286 – Medical services: 291 – Games of chance: 295 – Taxes: 296 – Private security firms: 306 – Leased cars: 308 – Maritime transport: 309 – Broadcasting: 312 – Public procurement: 316 – Ankara: 322 – Further services cases: 323 – Services more broadly: 335	
VI	The 2010s .....	337
1	Workers and citizens .....	337
	Advantages: 337 – Residence: 339 – Taxation: 340 – Family members: 344 – Collective agreement: 344 – Non-discrimination: 345 – Driving licences: 347 – Ankara: 348 – Bulgaria: 352 – Union citizenship: 352 – Union citizenship and students: 353 – Permanent residence: 354 – Union citizenship and expulsion: 356 – Union citizenship and names: 356 – (Not) purely	

internal situations, family reunification of Union citizens: 358 – Union citizens and prohibition to leave: 361 – Union citizenship and the broader family: 362 – The Union citizenship of a president: 362 – Issues left open re Union citizenship: 363 – Further cases: 363	
2 Establishment .....	364
Taxes: 364 – Pharmacies: 364 – Laboratories: 365 – Games of chance: 366 – Car insurance: 367 – Lawyers, notaries, and courts: 368 – Non-discrimination: 369 – Ankara and other Agreements with third states: 371 – Technicalities: 372 – Legal persons and taxation: 372 – Further company cases: 378 – Companies and third states: 379 – Diploma: 381	
3 Social security .....	382
Scope and definitions: 382 – Special non-contributory benefits: 384 – Discrimination: 385 – Applicable legislation: 385 – Sickness: 387 – Aggregation: 389 – Unemployment: 389 – Family benefits: 390 – Aggregation more broadly: 392 – Ankara: 392	
4 Services .....	393
Posted workers: 393 – Games of chance: 395 – Medical services: 399 – Taxes: 401 – Telecommunication and broadcasting: 404 – Public service concession: 407 – Non-discrimination: 409 – Maritime transport: 413 – Air transport: 413 – The Services Directive: 414 – Switzerland: 414 – Secondary law: 415 – Purely internal situations: 415 – Further cases: 416	
C The evolution of interpretive formulas .....	417
I ‘Broad’ .....	417
1 In the early days: until the mid-1970s .....	418
Three branches of broad interpretation: 418 – First branch: broad interpretation of notions: 419 – Second branch: narrow exceptions from rules: 420 – Third branch: the greatest possible freedom: 421 – The spin exerted by interpretive formulas: 423	
2 From the mid-1970s until the ‘Maastricht moment’ .....	423
a) First branch: broad notions .....	423
The first and the second branch connecting: 426 – The first and the third branch connecting: 426 – Lebon expanding Kempf: 427 – Further broad interpretation: 428	
b) Second branch: narrow exceptions from rules .....	428
The second branch in establishment and services: 429 – Weakness of the second branch in social security: 430	

c)	The third branch: the greatest possible freedom .....	431
	The third branch's outburst in the mid-1980s: 431 – The third branch's outburst at the beginning of the 1990s: 432 – 'Conditions most favourable': 433	
d)	Spin – in the second branch .....	434
	Spin in the third branch – evolving into empty spin: 434 – Why empty spin?: 435 – Spin in the first branch: 436	
e)	Some conclusions from the period .....	436
3	During the age of Maastricht .....	438
a)	First branch: broad notions – 'worker' .....	438
	Broad free movement of workers: 440 – Broad interpretation in services: 441 – Further broad interpretation: 441 – Connection of the first and third branch: 442 – More broad interpretation: 442 – 'Aim and broad logic': 443 – The concept of establishment is 'a very broad one': 444	
b)	Second branch: narrow exceptions from rules – second branch connecting with third .....	445
	Second branch and recognition: 446 – Derogations: 446 – Second branch in social security: 446 – Second branch in services: 447 – Further derogations: 448 – Second branch connecting with the third in social security, sometimes: 448 – Second branch and recognition again: 449 – More derogations: 449 – Second branch and secondary law: 450 – Union citizenship implying a particularly restrictive interpretation of derogations: 450 – Narrow exception from recognition of driving licences: 451 – Narrow derogation from freedom of maritime services: 452 – Restrictive interpretation of the in-house exception: 452 – Derogations again: 452	
c)	Third branch: the greatest possible freedom .....	453
	Two branches connecting: 453 – 'The most favourable conditions': 454 – The greatest possible freedom again: 454	
d)	Spin – and advance statement of case-law .....	455
	Spin in the first branch: 'worker': 455 – Spin in other parts of the first branch: 456 – Spin in the second branch: 456 – Spin in third branch-combinations: 458 – Spin in the third branch: 458 – Spin at its clearest in third branch: 458 – Empty spin: 459	
e)	Some conclusions from the period .....	460
4	The present .....	463
a)	First branch: broad notions – 'worker' .....	463
	Other broad notions: 464 – Very broad establishment: 466	

b) Second branch: narrow exceptions from rules .....	467
Derogations, connecting with first branch: 467 – Second branch and posted workers: 468 – Further narrow derogations: 468 – Strict interpretation of non-exportability: 469 – Narrow derogations again: 469 – Narrow exceptions from recognition of driving licences: 470 – Exception from the free choice of one's lawyer: 471 – Derogations, again: 471 – Further second branch interpretation: 472 – Back to derogations: 472 – Second branch in universal service: 473 – Further derogations: 473 – Second branch in secondary law: 475 – More second branch and driving licences: 475 – Narrow student loans: 476	
c) Third branch: the greatest possible freedom – moving beyond social security .....	476
Revival of third branch: 477	
d) Spin – in the first branch .....	478
Spin by very broad establishment: 479 – Spin in the second branch: 480 – Spin and driving licences: 481 – Further spin in the second branch: 481 – Spin in the third branch: 483	
e) Some conclusions from the present .....	484
II 'Coordinated' .....	489
1 In the early days: until the mid-1970s .....	489
The origin of 'simply coordinated': 489 – From justifying advantages to distributing powers ...: 490 – ... and back to justifying advantages: 491 – The complexity of coordination: 491 – The shift of Regulation 1408/71: 492 – Spin: 492 – Some conclusions from the period: 493	
2 From the mid-1970s until the 'Maastricht moment' .....	494
a) Occurrence of 'coordinated' – 'simple coordination' under Regulation 1408/71 .....	494
Coordination to the disadvantage of migrant workers: 495 – 'Separate claims': 495 – Inversing simple coordination: 495 – Simple coordination, in effect a (dis)advantage for migrant workers: 496 – Obfuscation of the origins of 'simple coordination': 498 – Further simple coordination cases: 498 – 'Coordination' and the 'stability of the system': 499 – For and against migrant workers: 499	
b) Spin .....	499
Negative spin: 500 – Empty spin: 501 – More 'un-empty' spin: 501	
c) Some conclusions from the period .....	501
3 During the age of Maastricht .....	503

a)	Occurrence of ‘coordinated’ – the beginning of the age .....	503
	Coordination and derived rights: 505 – Six decisions in 1997: 505 – Come-back in 2000: 507 – Two judgments in 2001: 508 – Inverse ‘mere coordination’: 508 – The ‘return’ of ‘complexity’: 509 – Advance statement of case-law: 510	
b)	Spin – and advance statement of case-law .....	511
	The return of empty spin: 512 – Regular spin: 512	
c)	Some conclusions from the period .....	513
4	The present .....	514
a)	Occurrence of ‘coordinated’ – frequent use .....	514
	Absence of harmonisation as a proxy: 515 – ‘Coordination’ v. free movement: 515 – No guarantee of neutrality: 516 – ‘Coordination’ under medical services: 516 – Advance statement: 517 – ‘No neutrality’ and ‘coordination’, again: 518 – The latest cases: 519	
b)	Spin .....	520
	Empty spin: 521 – Advance statement cancelling out spin: 522 – Compliance with the Treaty freedoms obscuring spin: 522	
c)	Some conclusions from the period .....	522
III	‘Fundamental’ .....	524
1	Previously existing ‘fundamental’ notions .....	524
	The ‘fundamental’ freedoms and non-discrimination: 524 – ‘Fundamental’ rights: 527 – ‘Fundamental interests of society’ and other ‘fundamental’ notions: 528 – Conclusions: 530	
2	The ‘status’, linking to Union citizenship .....	530
	The origins: the ‘Community national’ ...: 530 – ... And the ‘Community citizen’: 531 – The parties/national courts driving the ‘Community national’: 531 – The ‘Community national’ becoming current: 533 – Three decades of ‘Community nationality’ – and more: 534 – The end of the ‘Community national’: 535 – Conclusions: 535	
3	The evolution of the ‘fundamental status’ .....	536
a)	Occurrence – in the 2000s .....	536
	Occurrence in the early 2010s: 538 – The blessings of the ‘fundamental status’: 539	
b)	Spin .....	540
	Empty spin: 542 – No spin, advance statement: 542 – Spin uncertain: 543	
c)	Conclusions .....	544
4	Counterfactual evidence .....	544
	Before Grzelczyk: 544 – After Grzelczyk, non-occurrence in the 2000s: 545 – Non-occurrence in the early 2010s: 547 – No non-spin, the blessings of the absence of ‘fundamental sta-	

tus’: 548 – The curse of the absence of ‘fundamental status’:  
549 – Conclusions: 550

D Conclusion ..... 551

    I Spin and emptiness ..... 551

    II Breadth ..... 553

    III Coordination ..... 554

    IV Fundamentality ..... 555

E Table of Cases ..... 557

F Bibliography ..... 601

G Acknowledgments ..... 605

