

# Knowledge Organization

## International Journal

Devoted to Concept Theory, Classification, Indexing, and Knowledge Representation

Archiv  
Vol. 31, issue 3, 2004

ERGON-VERLAG  
ISSN 0943-7444 Knowl.Org.

# KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION

KO

Official Quarterly Journal of the International Society for Knowledge Organization

ISSN 0943 – 7444

International Journal devoted to Concept Theory, Classification, Indexing and Knowledge Representation

## Contents

Editor's Message ..... 133

Obituary: Dr. Arthur Steven Pollitt ..... 134

### Articles

López-Huertas, María José, and Evaristo Jiménez Contreras. Spanish Research in Knowledge Organization (1992-2001) ..... 136

Gnoli, Claudio, and Roberto Poli. Levels of Reality and Levels of Representation ..... 151

Coleman, Anita S.. A Code for Classifiers: Whatever Happened to Merrill's *Code*? ..... 161

Thellefsen, Torkild L., and Martin M. Thellefsen. Pragmatic Semiotics and Knowledge Organization ..... 177

### Report

Williamson, Nancy J. Eighth International ISKO Conference, London UK, 13-16 July, 2004 ..... 188

### Book Review

SATIJA, M.P. *A Dictionary of Knowledge Organization*. Amritsar, India: Guru Nanak Dev University, 2004. (248 p.) ISBN 81-7770-101-0 ..... 196

### Letter to the Editor

Nicolaisen, Jeppe, and Birger Hjørland. A Rejoinder to Beghtol (2004) ..... 199

### Knowledge Organization Literature

31 (2004) No.3 ..... 202

### Personal Author Index

31 (2004) No.3 ..... 210

## Contents page

López-Huertas, María and Evaristo Jiménez Contreras. (2004). **Spanish Research in Knowledge Organization (1992-2001).** *Knowledge Organization*, 31(3). 136-150. 15 refs.

**ABSTRACT:** This study gives an initial appraisal of research activity in Spain surrounding “knowledge organization.” The sample comprises articles, monographs and PhD. dissertations identified in the following data bases: ISI, LISA, ISOC, REBIUN, RUECA and TESEO. In Spain, “knowledge organization” is a consolidated subject area that shows increasing productivity, although it cannot be considered well developed by any means. A small number of highly productive authors are responsible for the bulk of output. Most research activity stems from university departments and schools of library science, in particular the Universities of Madrid and Zaragoza. A general interest in the theoretical aspects of classification systems, documentary languages and thesauri can be seen.

Gnoli, Claudio and Roberto Poli. (2004). **Levels of Reality and Levels of Representation.** *Knowledge Organization*, 31(3). 151-160. 45 refs.

**ABSTRACT:** Ontology, in its philosophical meaning, is the discipline investigating the structure of reality. Its findings can be relevant to knowledge organization, and models of knowledge can, in turn, offer relevant ontological suggestions. Several philosophers in time have pointed out that reality is structured into a series of integrative levels, like the physical, the biological, the mental, and the cultural, and that each level plays as a base for the emergence of more complex levels. More detailed theories of levels have been developed by Nicolai Hartmann and James K. Feibleman, and these have been considered as a source for structuring principles in bibliographic classification by both the Classification Research Group (CRG) and Ingetraut Dahlberg. CRG's analysis of levels and of their possible application to a new general classification scheme based on phenomena instead of disciplines, as it was formulated by Derek Austin in 1969, is examined in detail. Both benefits and open problems in applying integrative levels to bibliographic classification are pointed out.

Coleman, Anita S.. (2004). **A Code for Classifiers: Whatever Happened to Merrill's Code?** *Knowledge Organization*, 31(3). 161-176. 32 refs.

**ABSTRACT:** The work titled *Code for Classifiers* by William Stetson Merrill is examined. The development of Merrill's *Code* over a period of 27 years, 1912-1939 is traced by examining bibliographic, attribution, conceptual and contextual differences. The general principles advocated, the differences between variants, and three controversial features of the *Code*: 1) the distinction between classifying vs. classification, 2) borrowing of the bibliographic principle of authorial intention, and 3) use of Dewey Decimal class numbers for classified sequence of topics, are also discussed. The paper reveals the importance of the *Code* in its own time, the complexities of its presentation and assessment by its contemporaries, and its status today.

Thellefsen, Martin and Torkild Thellefsen. (2004). **Pragmatic Semiotics and Knowledge Organization.** *Knowledge Organization*, 31(3). 177-187. 18 refs.

**ABSTRACT:** The present paper presents a philosophical approach to knowledge organization, proposing the pragmatic doctrine of C.S. Peirce as basic analytical framework for knowledge domains. The theoretical framework discussed is related to the qualitative branch of knowledge organization theory i.e. within scope of Hjørland's domain analytical view (Hjørland and Albrechtsen 1995; Hjørland 2002; Hjørland 2004), and promote a general framework for analyzing domain knowledge and concepts. However, the concept of knowledge organization can be viewed in at least two perspectives, one that defines knowledge organization as an activity performed by a human actor e.g. an information specialist, and secondly a view that has the perspective of the inherent self-organizing structure of a knowledge domain the latter being investigated in the paper.

# KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION

KO

Official Quarterly Journal of the International Society for Knowledge Organization

ISSN 0943 – 7444

International Journal devoted to Concept Theory, Classification, Indexing and Knowledge Representation

## KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION

This journal is the organ of the INTERNATIONAL SOCIETY FOR KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION (General Secretariat: Dr. Gerhard RIESTHUIS (Literature Editor), Liendenhof 60, NL-1108 HB Amsterdam, Netherlands).

## Editors

Dr. Richard P. SMIRAGLIA (Editor-in-Chief), Palmer School of Library and Information Science, Long Island University, 720 Northern Blvd., Brookville NY 11548 USA.  
Email: Richard.Smiraglia@liu.edu

Dr. Clément ARSENAULT (Book Review Editor), École de bibliothéconomie et des sciences de l'information, Université de Montréal, C.P. 6128, succ. Centre-ville, Montréal (QC) H3C 3J7, Canada. Email: clement.arsenault@umontreal.ca

Dr. Gerhard RIESTHUIS (Literature Editor), Liendenhof 60, NL-1108 HB Amsterdam, Netherlands.  
Email: gerhard.riesthuis@hum.uva.nl

Dr. Nancy WILLIAMSON (Classification Research News Editor), Faculty of Information Studies, University of Toronto, 140 St. George Street, Toronto, Ontario M5S 3G6 Canada.  
Email: william@fis.utoronto.ca

Hanne ALBRECHTSEN (Communications Editor), Risø National Laboratory, Roskilde, Denmark.  
E-mail: hanne.albrechtsen@risoe.dk

Matthew F. AINSWORTH (Editorial Assistant), Palmer School of Library and Information Science, Long Island University.

## Consulting Editors

Prof. Dr. Ulf G. BARANOW, Rua Ubaldino do Amaral 580, Apto. 51, BR-80060-190, Curitiba - PR, Brazil

Prof. Clare BEGHTOL, Faculty of Information Studies, University of Toronto, 140 St. George Street, Toronto, Ontario M5S 3G6, Canada. Email: clare.beghtol@utoronto.ca

Dr. Gerhard BUDIN, Dept. of Philosophy of Science, University of Vienna, Sensengasse 8, A-1090 Wien, Austria.  
Email: gerhard.budin@univie.ac.at

Mr. Christian GALINSKI, Director: Infoterm, Simmeringer Hauptstr. 24, A-1110 Wien, Austria

Dr. Francisco Javier GARCÍA MARCO, Área de Biblioteconomía y Documentación, Facultad de Filosofía y Letras, Universidad de Zaragoza, E-50.009 Zaragoza, Spain. Email: jgarcia@unizar.es

Dr. M.A. GOPINATH, 7604 Sandy Lake Ct., Raleigh, NC-27613, USA, (919) 788-9099 voice. Email: yadugirig@yahoo.com

Dr. Rebecca GREEN, College of Information Studies, Hornbake Bldg. (So. Wing), Room 4105, University of Maryland, College Park, MD 20742-4345 USA. Email: rgreen@umd.edu

Dr. Norbert HENRICHES, Im Luftfeld 80, D-40489 Düsseldorf, Germany

Dr. Roland HJERPPE, Dept. of Computer and Information Science, Linköping University, S-58183 Linköping, Sweden

Dr. Barbara H. KWASNICK, Professor, School of Information Studies, Syracuse University, Syracuse, NY 13244 USA, (315) 443-4547 voice, (315) 443-4506 fax. Email: bkwasnik@syr.edu

Dr. Ia MCILWAIN, Director, School of Library, Archive & Information Studies, University College London, Gower Street, London WC1E 6BT U.K. Email: i.mcilwaine@ucl.ac.uk

Prof. Dr. Francis MIKSA, Graduate School of Library and Information Science, University of Texas at Austin, SZB 564, Austin, TX 78712-1276

Ms. Joan S. MITCHELL, Editor in Chief, Dewey Decimal Classification, OCLC Online Computer Library Center, Inc., 6565 Frantz Road, Dublin, OH 43017-3395 USA.  
Email: joan\_mitchell@oclc.org

Dr. Widad MUSTAFA el HADI, URF IDIST, Université Charles de Gaulle Lille 3, BP 149, 59653 Villeneuve D'Ascq, France

Dr. Giliola NEGRINI, Consiglio Nazionale della Ricerca, Ist. di Studi sulla Ricerca e Doc. Scientifica, Via Cesare De Lollis, 12, I-00185 Rome, Italy

Dr. Hope A. OLSON, School of Information Studies, 522 Bolton Hall, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, Milwaukee, WI 53201 USA. Email: holson@uwm.edu

Ms. Annelise Mark PEJTERSEN, Systems Analysis Dept., Risø National Laboratory, P.O. Box 49, DK-4000 Roskilde, Denmark

Dr. M. P. SATIJA, Guru Nanak Dev University, School of Library and Information Science, Amritsar-143 005, India

Dr. J.F. (Jos) SCHREINEMAKERS, Section Business Informatics, School of Computer Science, Faculty of Sciences, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, The Netherlands. Email: jos@cs.vu.nl

Dr. Otto SECHSER, In der Ey 37, CH-8047 Zürich, Switzerland

Dr. Winfried SCHMITZ-ESSER, Rothenbaumchaussee 3, D – 20148 Hamburg, Germany

Dr. Dagobert SOERGEL, College of Information Studies, Hornbake Bldg. (So. Wing), Room 4105, University of Maryland, College Park, MD 20742

Dr. Eduard R. SUKIASYAN, Editor-in-chief, Library Bibliographical Classification (LBC), National Classification System of Russia, Russian State Library. Email: sukias@rsl.ru

Dr. Martin van der WALT, Department of Information Science, University of Stellenbosch, Private Bag X1, Stellenbosch 7602, South Africa. Email: msvdw@sun.ac.za

Prof. Dr. Harald ZIMMERMANN, Softex, Schmollerstrasse 31, D-66111 Saarbrücken, Germany

Official Quarterly Journal of the International Society for Knowledge Organization

ISSN 0943 – 7444

International Journal devoted to Concept Theory, Classification, Indexing and Knowledge Representation

**Publisher**

ERGON-Verlag, Grombühlstr. 7, GER-97080 Würzburg  
Phone: +49 (931) 280084; FAX +49 (931) 282872  
E-mail: service@ergon-verlag.de; http://www.ergon-verlag.de

**Editor-in-chief (Editorial office)**

Dr. Richard P. SMIRAGLIA (Editor-in-Chief), Palmer School of Library and Information Science, Long Island University, 720 Northern Blvd., Brookville NY 11548 USA.  
Email: Richard.Smiraglia@liu.edu

**Instructions for Authors**

*Manuscripts* should be submitted electronically (in Word, Wordperfect, or RTF format) in English only to the editor-in-chief and should be accompanied by an indicative abstract of 100 or 200 words. Submissions via email are preferred; submissions will also be accepted via post provided that submissions are accompanied by a 3.5" diskette encoded in Word, Wordperfect, or RTF format.

A separate title page should include the article title and the author's name, postal address, and E-mail address, if available. Only the title of the article should appear on the first page of the text. To protect anonymity, the author's name *should not* appear on the manuscript, and all references in the body of the text and in footnotes that might identify the author to the reviewer should be removed and cited on a separate page. Articles that do not conform to these specifications will be returned to authors.

*Criteria for acceptance* will be appropriateness to the field of the journal (see Scope and Aims), taking into account the merit of the contents and presentation. The manuscript should be concise and should conform as much as possible to professional standards of English usage and grammar. Manuscripts are received with the understanding that they have not been previously published, are not being submitted for publication elsewhere, and that if the work received official sponsorship, it has been duly released for publication. Submissions are refereed, and authors will usually be notified within 6 to 10 weeks. Unless specifically requested, manuscripts and illustrations will not be returned.

The text should be structured by numbered subheadings. It should contain an *Introduction*, giving an overview and stating the purpose, a *main body*, describing in sufficient detail the materials or methods used and the results or systems developed, and a *conclusion or summary*.

*Reference citations within the text* should have the following form: (author, year). For example, (Jones, 1990). Specific page numbers are optional, but preferred when applicable, e.g. (Jones, 1990, p.100). A citation with two authors would read (Jones & Smith, 1990); three or more authors would be: (Jones et al., 1990). When the author is mentioned in the text, only the date and optional page number should appear in parenthesis – e.g. According to Jones (1990), ...

*References* should be listed alphabetically by author at the end of the article. Journal names should not be abbreviated. Multiple citations by the same author should be listed chronologically and should each spell out the author's name. Articles appearing in the same year should have the following format: Jones, T. (1990a) ... , Jones, T. (1990b) ...

**Examples:**

Dahlberg, I. (1978). A referent-oriented, analytical concept theory for INTERCONCEPT. *International Classification*, 5(3). 142-151.

Graesser, A., Person, N. & Huber, J. (1992). Mechanisms that generate questions. In T. W. Lauer, E. Peacock, & A. C. Graesser (Eds.). *Questions and Information Systems*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates. 167-187.

Sager, J.C. (1990). *A Practical Course in Terminology Processing*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Sukiasyan, E. R. (1996). Change as a problem of classification system development. In R. Green (Ed.). *Knowledge Organization and Change: Proceedings of the 4<sup>th</sup> International ISKO Conference*. Frankfurt: Indeks Verlag. 119-122.

*Footnotes* should be kept to a minimum. They should be indicated in the text with numbered superscripts, and the corresponding notes should be collected at the end of the article, before the *references*, under the heading *Notes*.

*Illustrations* should be kept to a necessary minimum and should be submitted electronically when possible. Photographs (including color and half-tone) should be scanned with a minimum resolution of 600 dpi and saved as tif files (Tagged Image File Format preferred). Tables and figures should be embedded within the document or, alternatively, saved as separate files with clear instructions indicating their placement in the text. Tables should contain a number and title at the top, and all columns and rows should have headings. All illustrations should be cited in the text as Figure 1, Figure 2, etc. or Table 1, Table 2, etc. Illustrations submitted in hard copy only should be marked to indicate their placement in the text.

Upon acceptance of a manuscript for publication, authors must provide a wallet-size photo and a one-paragraph biographical sketch. The photograph should be scanned with a minimum resolution of 600 dpi and saved as a tif file (Tagged Image File Format).

**Advertising**

Responsible for advertising: Dr. H.-J. Dietrich, ERGON-Verlag, Grombühlstr. 7, 97080 Würzburg (Germany).

©2004 by ERGON-Verlag Dr. H.-J. Dietrich.

All Rights reserved.

Printed in the Federal Republic of Germany  
by Offizin Hildburghausen GmbH Druckhaus.

KO is published quarterly by ERGON-Verlag.  
The price is € 103,00/ann. including airmail delivery.

# KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION

KO

Official Quarterly Journal of the International Society for Knowledge Organization

ISSN 0943 – 7444

International Journal devoted to Concept Theory, Classification, Indexing and Knowledge Representation

## Scope

The more scientific data is generated in the impetuous present times, the more ordering energy needs to be expended to control these data in a retrievable fashion. With the abundance of knowledge now available the questions of new solutions to the ordering problem and thus of improved classification systems, methods and procedures have acquired unforeseen significance. For many years now they have been the focus of interest of information scientists the world over.

Until recently, the special literature relevant to classification was published in piecemeal fashion, scattered over the numerous technical journals serving the experts of the various fields such as

philosophy and science of science  
 science policy and science organization  
 mathematics, statistics and computer science  
 library and information science  
 archivistics and museology  
 journalism and communication science  
 industrial products and commodity science  
 terminology, lexicography and linguistics

Beginning in 1974, KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION (formerly INTERNATIONAL CLASSIFICATION) has been serving as a common platform for the discussion of both theoretical background questions and practical application problems in many areas of concern. In each issue experts from many countries comment on questions of an adequate structuring and construction of ordering systems and on the problems of their use in opening the information contents of new literature, of data collections and survey, of tabular works and of other objects of scientific interest. Their contributions have been concerned with

- (1) clarifying the theoretical foundations (general ordering theory/science, theoretical bases of classification, data analysis and reduction)
- (2) describing practical operations connected with indexing/classification, as well as applications of classification systems and thesauri, manual and machine indexing
- (3) tracing the history of classification knowledge and methodology
- (4) discussing questions of education and training in classification
- (5) concerning themselves with the problems of terminology in general and with respect to special fields.

## Aims

Thus, KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION is a forum for all those interested in the organization of knowledge on a universal or a domain-specific scale, using concept-analytical or concept-synthetic approaches, as well as quantitative and qualitative methodologies. KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION also addresses the intellectual and automatic compilation and use of classification systems and thesauri in all fields of knowledge, with special attention being given to the problems of terminology.

KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION publishes original articles, reports on conferences and similar communications, the Newsletters of the International Society for Knowledge Organization (ISKO News) and the Committee on Classification Research of the International Federation for Information and Documentation (FID/CR News) as well as book reviews, letters to the editor, and an extensive annotated bibliography of recent classification and indexing literature, covering some 500 items in each issue.

KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION should therefore be available at every university and research library of every country, at every information center, at colleges and schools of library and information science, in the hands of everybody interested in the fields mentioned above and thus also at every office for updating information on any topic related to the problems of order in our information-flooded times.

KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION was founded in 1973 by an international group of scholars with a consulting board of editors representing the world's regions, the special classification fields, and the subject areas involved. From 1974-1980 it was published by K.G. Saur Verlag, München. Back issues of 1978-1992 are available from ERGON-Verlag, too.

As of 1989, KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION has become the official organ of the INTERNATIONAL SOCIETY FOR KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION (ISKO) and is included for every ISKO-member, personal or institutional in the membership fee (US \$ 55/US \$ 110).

*Rates:* From 2004 on for 4 issues/ann. (including indexes) € 103,00 (forwarding costs included). Membership rates see above.

ERGON-Verlag, Grombühlstr. 7, GER-97080 Würzburg;  
 Phone: +49 (931) 280084; FAX +49 (931) 282872; E-mail: [service@ergon-verlag.de](mailto:service@ergon-verlag.de); <http://www.ergon-verlag.de>

The contents of this journal are indexed and abstracted in *Referativnyi Zhurnal Informatika* and in the following online databases: *Information Science Abstracts*, *INSPEC*, *Library and Information Science Abstracts (LISA)*, *Library Literature*, *PASCAL*, *Sociological Abstracts*, and *Web Science & Social Sciences Citation Index*.