

Frobenius Institute's expeditions to southern Ethiopia is only mentioned in a few lines as material that "still awaits further research" (77). No examples are given about the content of these films, or techniques used by the Frobenius researchers to make their films, as one might expect (though Thubauville does fill in some of these gaps in her chapter). Moreover, any potential connection with the author's own research interest in the different audio-visual techniques with which film scholars have approached their research subjects in Ethiopia are only alluded to in the conclusion, but never discussed in any detail.

One obvious strength of the volume is its detailed and systematic presentation of the long, dynamic and, at times, turbulent history of anthropological research in Ethiopia, hinting at some of the anxieties that anthropologists continue to face today under the current EPRDF (see Braukämper: 66f.). Although some anthropologists continue to be viewed with suspicion today, especially since the late Prime Minister, Meles Zenawi, labelled them as "friends of backwardness," the current volume substantiates the important place of anthropology in Ethiopian Studies. As the contributors implicitly and explicitly show, anthropological research has contributed – and continues to contribute – to an understanding of the historical and contemporary issues of the diverse peoples of Ethiopia. Anthropologists can only do this, of course, if they learn the language, conduct long-term field research, and identify and explore the beliefs and accounts of men and women from a variety of social, political, and economic backgrounds, and not only those of male elders, "chiefs," or administrators. That multiple views can initiate new discourses and offer comparative views and fresh debates is at the heart of the anthropological endeavor, as many of the author's show. For example, Braukämper's reflections on the outcome of his long-term ethnographic research among the Hadiyya and his refusal to alter his findings – or, as he puts it, "to act as a bard for particular interests and options" (70) – only restores the ethical mission of anthropology: to ensure the integrity of our research and to safeguard our informants from being negatively impacted by our work. Other chapters, (see especially those by Lewis, Abbink, Epple, Glück, Barata, Ambaye, and Getachew) provide further proof of how far anthropology has come since its beginnings during the first expeditions of the Frobenius Institute to Ethiopia, not only in terms of understanding past and current issues but concerning the principled and ethical ways in which anthropologists are expected to approach their research.

One of the understated strengths of the volume is its balanced appraisal of the achievements of members of the Frobenius Institute during their expeditions to southern Ethiopia, and how such archival materials can be "used and re-evaluated to stimulate further research" (Abbink: 172). Glück's chapter is an especially timely one, as it could contribute to recent debates that have emerged (after the volume was published) about the repatriation of Ethiopian treasures. For example, one of the hotly debated collections found at the U.K.'s Victoria and Albert Museum, recently "offered to return on loan treasures to Ethiopia seized by British troops 150 years ago"

(V&A's Ethiopian Treasures. A Crown, a Wedding Dress, and Other Loot. BBC April 4, 2018, <<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-43642265>> [13.04.2018]). After reading Glück's chapter, it is not difficult to imagine that certain objects housed in museums in Germany, like the wooden steles of the Gato, could spur similar debates in the future, if they have not already.

Overall, Dinslage and Thubauville's edited volume is a useful summary of influential perspectives on the history of the Frobenius Institute's expeditions to Ethiopia, the political contexts in which anthropologists worked – and continue to work – and the different kinds of written and audiovisual material that were produced and continue to be integrated into current research and made available to wider audiences. Indeed, to many critics today their work would seem rather unethical, unprincipled, and perhaps even atheoretical, however, thanks to such an in-depth appraisal of the archival material, a better understanding emerges of the context in which it was collected. If anything, the volume serves as a kind of proclamation of the emancipation of anthropology from outmoded assumptions underlying anthropology at that time (see Kohl's foreword), but also a declaration of all that can still be harvested from this rich archive. Dinslage and Thubauville's volume should be recommended as an important text for anyone interested in anthropology and Ethiopian Studies.

Shauna LaTosky

Draycott, Jane, and Emma-Jayne Graham (eds.): *Bodies of Evidence. Ancient Anatomical Votives Past, Present, and Future.* New York: Routledge, 2017. 271 pp. ISBN 978-1-4724-5080-7. Price: £ 110.00

The book under review is published in the new interdisciplinary series "Medicine and the Body in Antiquity," and the core of the volume results from the conference, "Bodies of Evidence. Re-defining Approaches to the Anatomical Votive," organized by the editors and held at the British School at Rome in June 2012. According to the editors "the category of 'anatomical offering' remains ... ill defined." Furthermore, questions raised "at the conference included what anatomical votives were for, what they represented to those who dedicated, encountered or made them, and what factors influenced the selection of a particular item." Papers at the conference "were concerned with what these ... offerings can reveal, ... about past religious and medical contexts and practices, [as well as] about identity, society, politics and concepts or constructions of the human body, both past and present" (xiii).

The book includes a list of figures, notes on contributors, preface, list of abbreviations, a bibliography, and index. The bulk of the book features an "Introduction: Debating the Anatomical Votive," by the editors and 12 chapters. "Corpora in Connection: Anatomical Votives and the Confession Stelai of Lydia and Phrygia," by Justine Potts; "Partible Humans and Permeable Gods: Anatomical Votives and Personhood in the Sanctuaries of Central Italy," by Emma-Jane Graham; "Anatomical Votives (and Swaddled Babies): From Republican Italy

to Roman Gaul,” by Olivier de Cazanove; “Hair Today, Gone Tomorrow: The Use of Real, False and Artificial Hair as Votive Offerings,” by Jane Draycott; “Demeter as an Ophthalmologist? Eye Votives and the Cult of Demeter and Kore,” by Georgia Petridou; “Wombs for the Gods,” by Rebecca Flemming; “Ritual and Meaning: Contextualising Votive Terracotta Infants in Hellenistic Italy,” by Fay Glinister; “The Foot as *gnōrisma*,” by Sara Chiarini; “The Open Man: Anatomical Votive Busts between the History of Medicine and Archaeology,” by Laurent Haumesser; “Fragmentation and the Body’s Boundaries: Reassessing the Body in Parts,” by Ellen Adams; “Votive Genitalia in the Wellcome Collection: Modern Receptions of Ancient Sexual Anatomy,” by Jen Grove, and “Votive Futures: An Afterword,” by Jessica Hughes.

Given the limited space in a review, the following will present a selection of the contributions.

The first chapter, by J. Potts, sets out to transgress boundaries and thereby reassess the modern scholars’ limited definition of the anatomical votives and distinction between these and the confession stelai dedicated by people punished with illness for various wrongdoings in Asia Minor. She demonstrates how a comparison of the similarities between the confession stelai and the votives based, *inter alia*, on the correspondences between the images carved on the stelai (see, e.g., Figure 1.1) and the votives, will help understand them better and the logic of the religious thinking of the ancients, since the two corpora express a common religious mentality (42).

R. Flemming examines the many votive wombs found from Hellenistic central Italy in chap. 6, aiming to “advance the broader discussion about how these artefacts should be read in this particular case” (113). The author refrains from discussing gender or status of suppliants as well as what gods are involved. Although she uses the term gods throughout, goddesses are not excluded, and these deities might certainly have been important recipients of the votives, as illustrated by the silver uteri dedicated to Delian Artemis (123). Moreover some words on women as possible dedicators of the items, from a gyno-inclusive perspective, could give an interesting supplementing dimension to these material sources in conjunction with all the male-produced written ones on the topics of wombs, such as in Aristotle, “Generation of Animals.” This would certainly apply since the author draws on medical, especially Hippocratic (written) sources from the Greek context, in order to discuss these Italian votives within the wider framework. In so doing, she rightly states the importance of folk tradition in Hippocratic medicine. One may add that this is certainly a topic which needs more research, also by including data from the archives of various folkloric centres around the Mediterranean. The author rightly mentions the “star role” of the women’s wombs in the classical medical discourse (128), but instead of including a gyno-inclusive perspective in order to search out female identity in reading these artefacts, it seems that the wombs are rather used to confirm the male perspective encountered in the written sources. One may envisage that a future publication will seek to broaden the gendered dimension, since the author stresses

that further work is needed and also mentions the contradictory information in the male-produced texts (critiquing popular beliefs and simultaneously sharing them).

In the following chapter, F. Glinister, discusses, *inter alia*, swaddled infants in Italy, paralleling the contribution of de Cazanove from Gaul, although with a different aim (the latter being concerned with diffusion of religious practices). Based on written and visual sources, we learn how the swaddled infant *ex-voto* found in a diversity of locales, including remote rural sacred sites on hills or in caves, near rivers or springs, represents one of the life stages through which the child passed on the way to citizenship. It is especially represented by the item called the *bullā*, a bubble-shaped apotropaic amulet which is found around the neck of many swaddled infant votives (see, e.g., Figure 7.1), and also is mentioned in literary sources, although with one exception, at least in Rome, in connection with freeborn boys (141 f.), who were those who acquired citizen status. Thus, “the *bullā* on a swaddled infant *ex-voto* was emblematic of both the gender and the social status of the child it represented” (144). Here it might also have been interesting to have some words on the female dimension of the *bullā*, the *lunula* (cf. 141 f.).

J. Grove discusses votive genitalia in the Wellcome collection in chap. 11, under the subheading “Modern Receptions of Ancient Sexual Anatomy.” Items from this rich collection are employed as illustrations in several of the articles in the present book. Sir Henry Wellcome was a pharmaceutical millionaire who put together a vast collection and opened an “Historical Medical Museum” in 1913 in London, *inter alia*, including a collection of female and male genitalia. Grove shows how Wellcome challenged the prevailing historiographies focusing on censorship and suppression, since he used these artefacts in conjunction with other, similar objects from cultures worldwide in order to understand ancient medical and anatomical knowledge and also cultural practices, including the link between religion and sex. Her article in many ways put the female and male votives where they really belong: back to people who used them in practical life. Anatomical votives are still used in several places in the world, *inter alia*, in the Mediterranean region where also these votives were originally found. Here also belong the ancient myths, providing the mythical background of the importance of the phallus both in the Rural Dionysia and in the City Dionysia in the Greek context. In the latter, according to the legend, the reason was because, when the Athenians initially rejected Dionysos, the male part of the population was punished with a disease of the genitals. The oracle at Delphi advised them to worship Dionysos and perform a phallic procession in his honour. When they did this, their illness was cured. An interesting later parallel, to this reader, is the story about Italian women offering votives to the local doctor saints by the end of the 1800s (231), but also the punishments encountered in the confession stelai discussed by Potts (chap. 1) dedicated by people punished with illness and pain. This also means that modern scholarship could learn a lot by doing comparisons between ancient votives and modern ones to obtain a better understanding of the former. Although some

scholars do that kind of comparative work based on their personal fieldwork today, this is not a distinct topic in the present book nor modern material in the Mediterranean region, apart from some remarks such as a footnote on the healing saint, Agia (Saint) Paraskevē in Georgia Petridou's contribution (106), but could have given a more dynamic dimension to a generally very fascinating and rich collection of articles. This is, for instance, illustrated by the very interesting picture from the contemporary Brazilian context (cf. Figure 1.3). Including an article on this present-day topic would certainly had been welcome.

Earlier books published by Routledge had endnotes, in the present book we meet footnotes, which is much more reader friendly. However, they are mixed with in-text references which sometimes are several lines long (e.g., 68), and this is a drawback. Evy Johanne Håland

Drew, Georgina: *River Dialogues. Hindu Faith and the Political Ecology of Dams on the Sacred Ganga.* Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 2017. 258 pp. ISBN 978-0-8165-3510-1. Price: \$ 60.00

In her "Prelude" (xiii–xxii) Georgina Drew invites the readers to follow her reflections and journeys (2004–2016) along the Ganges on the Himalayan stretch in the Uttarakhand State of India. She begins fieldwork as a young naive student, impressed by the River Ganges, and later on journeys as an experienced observer and critical scholar of anthropology, development, and conservation of the Ganges through Uttarakhand. She pays special attention to people who are directly affected by the River Projects on the one hand and people who have the scientific and/or political responsibility for them on the other. Her analysis of the environmental and social impact of the projects concentrates on men's and especially women's dam concerns: Hindu worship of Ganges, pilgrimage economy, integrity of maintaining the landscape, aesthetic and psychological values, promotion of industrial growth, activist networks, and policy debates. Drew narrates her experiences and discussions with people and analyzes pro and contra of the developing politics of hydroelectricity while emphasizing the various regional and national interests from an ecological perspective.

In order to understand the development debates along the Ganges, Drew explicitly stresses that cultural politics and political ecology must take into serious consideration the influence of religion and be open towards everyday religious practice, i.e., infusing political ecology with religiously attuned cultural politics. The study shows "the contingency, ambiguity, and positive political potential inherent in lived experiences of devotion to sacred entities that are also natural resources" (19).

Chap. 1 provides an overview of the different personal and communal values that people attribute to Ganges and the impact of their debates on how to use these most renowned water resources. Drew reports about the complex framework of the Ganges as the source of living water and hydroelectric power, while taking into account its enormous importance for people's future economic, social, and religious life. The viewpoints of river devotees,

"secular" critiques, dam proponents, and environmentalists are well explained.

In chap. 2 "Loving the Ganga," Drew shows how rural and semi-urban women intend to forge some special relationships with the Ganga to explore the nuances of human and nonhuman affect. Some life histories of illiterate women active in the river cleaning and dam oppositions illustrate their situation on the ground. How and why is the Ganges significant to the cultural practices of the mountain women and to their regional enactments of Hindu faith? Drew emphasizes: "In contemporary practice, women frequently use songs in their repertoires of daily work, worship, and protest" (80). "[D]evotional song as a cultural form with sociohistorical links to bhakti tradition ... is a key communication resource employed by women to position the Ganga as an entity of paramount importance whose flow is the product of an ancestor's penance and a treasure to defend for current and future generations" (88).

Chap. 3 informs about the engagements and motivations of campaign participants and leaders contesting the construction of dams on the Ganges in Uttarkashi. Drew narrates social movement processes and the reasons why women choose either to defend the Ganges or to abstain from doing so. "The combined attention to both resource needs and religious reverence for water bodies means that there is a role for political ecology analyses attuned to the insights of feminism and to the religious affect expressed for socially revered resources" (123).

Chap. 4 "Saving the Ganga" shows Drew's concerned and critical look at insiders, outsiders, and activist politics. What is at stake in damming the Ganges? This becomes particularly evident from her account of how activists' ideas and actions clashed during the intense debate and controversy concerning the various water projects. Drew pays due attention to the outstanding engagement of Honorary Prof. G. D. Agarwal – PhD UC Berkeley, doyen of environmental engineers in India, scientist-turned-sanyasi notable for his successful fasts-unto-death in 2009 to stop the damming of Bhagirathi River – and those who critiqued Agarwal's Hindu-based opposition to dams on the Ganges. "Agarwal's fasts were another example of the deep disconnect between the desires of plain residents and the needs of the mountain residents" (135). "[M]any erstwhile opponents of dams revised their opinions" (147). In 2009, the National Ganga River Basin Authority (NGRBA) was created as an "empowered planning, financing, monitoring, and coordinating authority for the Ganga river" (147) which was not able to "put an end to the conflict over the use of the river or the struggle over development in the region" (151 f.), since regional, national, and international efforts of the Ganges' management were not always compatible.

In chap. 5 "Eco-Zones on the Ganga. The Politics of Exceptionalism," Drew expresses once again her concern about local and national interests, when in 2012 "the government of India declared 4,180 square kilometers of the Bhagirathi Ganga's flow an Ecologically Sensitive Zone or Eco-Zone under the Environmental Protection Act of 1986" (159). The Act contains among others the follow-