

Gina Glock

Algorithmic Decision-Making in Service Work

An Analysis of Changing Job Autonomy



Nomos

Arbeit, Digitalisierung und Organisation

Edited by

Prof. Dr. Maximilian Heimstädt

Prof. Dr. Markus Hertwig

Prof. Dr. Elke Schüßler

Prof. Dr. Caroline Ruiner

Prof. Dr. Carsten Wirth

Volume 3

Gina Glock

Algorithmic Decision-Making in Service Work

An Analysis of Changing Job Autonomy



Nomos

This publication originated from a doctoral scholarship at the Schaufler Lab@TU Dresden, a joint project of THE SCHAUFLER FOUNDATION and the Dresden University of Technology.

Diese Publikation entstand in Rahmen eines Promotionsstipendiums am Schaufler Lab@TU Dresden, ein gemeinsames Projekt von THE SCHAUFLER FOUNDATION und der Technischen Universität Dresden.

**SCHAUFLER LAB
TU DRESDEN**

A joint project by: | Ein Projekt von:



**TECHNISCHE
UNIVERSITÄT
DRESDEN**



**THE SCHAUFLER
FOUNDATION**

Diese Open Access Publikation wurde vom Open Access Publikationsfonds der Sächsischen Landesbibliothek, Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek gefördert.

We acknowledge support for the open access publication by the Open Access Publication Fund of Saxon State and University Library Dresden (SLUB).

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Dresden, Univ., Diss., 2024

1st Edition 2024

© Gina Glock

Published by

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG
Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden
www.nomos.de

Production of the printed version:

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG
Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

ISBN 978-3-7560-1013-4 (Print)

ISBN 978-3-7489-4666-3 (ePDF)

DOI <https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748946663>



Online Version
Nomos eLibrary



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution – ShareAlike 4.0 International License.

Acknowledgements

As a member of the Schaufler Lab@TU Dresden, I would like to thank all the people behind the organization who have accompanied and supported me since 2020 and who have kept my back free both organizationally and financially.

My sincere thanks go to Prof. Dr. Antonia Kupfer, who not only guided me on my path to my doctorate but, above all, gave me the chance and the confidence to start this project in the first place.

My thanks go to Prof. Dr. Sabine Pfeiffer, who always managed to provide motivating and instructive advice at the right moments.

Without the support and time commitment of my interview partners, this thesis would not have been possible. I would like to thank the employees of the outpatient care provider in the first case study, who participated in this project with great engagement despite the large volume of work. I would also like to thank the employees of the second case study company in banking services, who gave me a deep insight into their daily work despite the ongoing economic pressure. I would like to thank the experts who gave me valuable information in our discussions that extended well beyond my empirical analyses.

I must thank my parents, who made my path into education and science possible in the first place. I do not think any of us would have guessed that I would go on to do a doctorate.

I would like to thank my dear friends who never doubted that I could complete this project. I have never lacked support or motivating words.

Finally, my thanks go to my partner, who has experienced, supported, and endured the daily highs and lows of this project like no other.

I am beyond happy and proud to have completed this project.
I am looking forward to what's ahead.

“My work comes to me in a completely automatic way, in the gestures of an automation. [...] But underneath this my mind never stops working. It lives by itself. Some call it dreaming, and if so, I am dreaming all day long, five days a week. [...] The whole bench dreams like this. It is a gallery of automations locked in dreams.”

From Bryan Slater's *On the line*
in Ronald Fraser's *Work: Twenty personal accounts* (1968, pp. 97–98).
Found in Amelia Horgan's *Lost in work. Escaping capitalism* (2021, p. 49).

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	5
List of figures	11
List of tables	13
List of abbreviations	15
1. Introduction	17
1.1. The necessity of a sociological lens on AI	22
1.2. Avoiding confusion: workers' autonomy and machine automation	27
1.3. Framing job autonomy in the organization of work	30
1.4. Relevance and extent of job autonomy	33
1.5. Excursus: How are you, service workers?	38
2. Research objective and structure	48
PART I Linking ADM, job autonomy & service work: an attempt at conceptual embedding	
3. AI in the work process	55
3.1. From AI to algorithmic decision-making	55
3.2. Differentiating affected tasks	61
3.3. Towards a categorization of ADM systems	65
3.4. Excursus: Digitalization, ADM, and AI in figures	70
4. Facets of job autonomy in service work	74
4.1. Call for conceptual renewal	74
4.2. Seven dimensions of job autonomy	77
4.2.1. Task Autonomy	80
4.2.2. Method Autonomy	82
4.2.3. Criteria Autonomy	85
4.2.4. Scheduling Autonomy	87
4.2.5. Working Time Autonomy	90
4.2.6. Locational Autonomy	93
4.2.7. Interactional Autonomy	96

5.	Job autonomy as ambivalent element of control	100
5.1.	Rationalization at its core: minimizing job autonomy and direct control	102
5.2.	Exploiting the subject: granting job autonomy and indirect control	106
5.3.	Digital Taylorism: Just old wine in new bottles?	110
5.4.	Corporate strategies as drivers between technology and job autonomy	114
5.5.	Expectations of ADM in service work and missing pieces	118

PART II Who catches the eye?

Quantifying job autonomy in service work

6.	Objective	129
7.	Method: constructing the Autonomy Index	131
7.1.	A question of operationalization	132
7.2.	Item selection	137
7.3.	Calculation, sample, and variable description	142
8.	Results: Autonomy Index	148
8.1.	By service branch and task type	150
8.2.	By selected socio-economic aspects	158
8.3.	By selected ADM aspects	163
8.4.	Changes between 2012 and 2018	168
9.	Limitations	176
10.	Summary: solidified polarizations, less intensity for some	178

PART III Case study insights: glances into changing job autonomy of service workers

11.	Objective	183
12.	Method: understanding and conduct of case studies	186
12.1.	What is a case?	187
12.2.	Data collection	188
12.3.	Interview initiation and conduction	192
12.4.	Data preparation and analysis	194

13. Company Case I: good practice in outpatient care	196
13.1. Branch profile: outpatient care	196
13.2.1. Retrospective: What do we know so far?	196
13.2.2. Employment, content & work demands	198
13.2.3. Job autonomy in (outpatient) care & technology use	201
13.2. Case summary	206
13.3. On company and employees	208
13.4. ADM usage in the work process	211
13.4.1. Basic functional spectrum	212
13.4.2. Elements of learning ADM	215
13.5. Influence on job autonomy	217
13.5.1. Overall evaluation	217
13.5.2. Job autonomy dimensions	219
13.6. Technical barriers, misuse, and areas of improvement	233
13.7. Impact and conditions of changed job autonomy	237
14. Company Case II: universal bank in change mode	241
14.1. Branch profile: banking services	241
14.2.1. Retrospective: What do we know so far?	241
14.2.2. Employment, work organization & perpetual structural change	243
14.2.3. Job autonomy in banking services & technology use	248
14.2. Case summary	253
14.3. On company and employees	254
14.4. ADM usage in the work process	260
14.4.1. Basic functional spectrum	261
14.4.2. Elements of learning ADM	264
14.5. Influence on job autonomy	266
14.5.1. Overall evaluation	266
14.5.2. Job autonomy dimensions	268
14.6. Technical barriers, misuse, and areas of improvement	290
14.7. Impact and conditions of changed job autonomy	293
15. Experts' views: pending issues and power imbalance	298
16. Limitations	302
17. Summary: increasing job autonomy, interaction work at risk?	304

PART IV Conclusions and implications: job autonomy torn back and forth	
18. Job autonomy as descriptor of change	315
18.1. Less and highly autonomous services: distinct yet converging	316
18.2. Assisting, augmenting, automating ... liberating?	318
18.3. The distinctive features of learning ADM	322
19. Corporate strategies becoming tangible	327
20. Outlook and reflections	331
Appendix Introduction Part I	335
Appendix Part II	343
Appendix Part III	359
References	369

List of figures

Figure 1: Dominating research attempts regarding AI and work	23
Figure 2: Distinction between ADM systems and AI based on ML	60
Figure 3: Dimensions of job autonomy	79
Figure 4: Autonomy Index (Total, service sector), 2018	149
Figure 5: Autonomy Index by service branch (1/2), 2018	151
Figure 5 (continuing)	152
Figure 6: Autonomy Index by service branch (2/2), 2018	153
Figure 6 (continuing)	154
Figure 7: Autonomy Index by task type, 2018	156
Figure 8: Autonomy Index by selected socio-economic aspects, 2018	159
Figure 8 (continuing)	160
Figure 8 (continuing)	161
Figure 9: Autonomy Index by ADM aspects, 2018	164
Figure 9 (continuing)	165
Figure 9 (continuing)	166
Figure 10: Autonomy Index w/o Loc (Total, service sector), 2018 and 2012	169
Figure 11: Home screen on tablet for employees, Case I	213
Figure 12: Classification in ADM categorization, Case I	214
Figure 13: Weighting for client-oriented preference in tour planning, Case I	216
Figure 14: Cutouts of sales front page and exemplary list of ADM events, Case II	261
Figure 15: Classification in ADM categorization, Case II	263
Figure 16: Exemplary ADM event with approach details, Case II	265
Figure 17: ADM categorization by company case studies	319
Figure 18: Employment shares by branch, sex, working time, 2022	339
Figure 19: Employment shares by branch, qualification, 2022	339
Figure 20: Translated interview guideline for context interviews	360
Figure 21: Translated interview guideline for employee interviews	362
Figure 22: Translated interview guideline for expert interviews	365

List of tables

Table 1:	Selected job quality measures, 2019–2022	46
Table 2:	Levels of automation in Sheridan (1991)	67
Table 3:	Levels of automation in decision-making in Bitkom (2017)	68
Table 4:	Overview on theoretical embedding of job autonomy and ADM systems	119
Table 5:	Recent operationalization attempts of job autonomy using BIBB/BAuA-ETB	136
Table 6:	Construction of Autonomy Index with selected BIBB/BAuA-ETB 2018 items	139
Table 7:	Changes in Autonomy Index by branch, task type, 2012–2018	170
Table 8:	Changes in Autonomy Index by socio-economic, ADM aspects, 2012–2018	173
Table 9:	Effects of the ADM system on employees and care manager, Case I	218
Table 10:	Impact of technical barriers on employees and care manager, Case I	234
Table 11:	Effects of the ADM system on employees, Case II	267
Table 12:	Impact of technical barriers on employees, Case II	290
Table 13:	Effects of rule-based and learning ADM on job autonomy dimensions	323
Table 14:	Service branches according to WZ 2008	336
Table 15:	Employment by branch, employment status, sex, working time, 2022	338
Table 16:	Employment growth by branch, working time, qualification, 2018–2022	340
Table 17:	Influence of digitalization on selected job characteristics by branch, 2022	341
Table 18:	Decomposition of job autonomy dimensions with recoding in 2018	344
Table 19:	Decomposition of job autonomy dimensions with recoding in 2012	347
Table 20:	Observations and shares by branch, 2018 and 2012	350
Table 21:	Source variables, observations, shares of secondary variables, 2018 and 2012	351
Table 22:	Decomposition of variable task type	353

Table 23: Decomposition of variable ADM knowledge	354
Table 24: Decomposition of variable changes in work environment	355
Table 25: Detailed summary statistics of Autonomy Index, 2018	356
Table 26: Detailed summary statistics of Autonomy Index (w/o Loc), 2018 and 2012	358
Table 27: Specification of interviews conducted	367

List of abbreviations

ADM	Algorithmic Decision-Making
AI	Artificial Intelligence
ANN	Artificial Neural Networks
BAuA	Federal Institute for Occupational Safety and Health
BIBB	Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training
DA	Data analytics
DL	Deep learning
ETB	Employment Survey
GDPR	General Data Protection Regulation
HAS	Highly autonomous service
ICT	Information and Communications Technologies
JCI	Job Characteristic Inventory
JDC	Job Demand-Control Model
JD-R	Job Demands-Resources Model
JDS	Job Diagnostic Survey
KIS	Knowledge-intensive services
LAS	Less autonomous service
LEEP	Linked-Employer-Employee-Panel
LKIS	Less knowledge-intensive services
M	Mean
ML	Machine learning
NLP	Natural language processing
PEP	Personnel resource planning
PoC	Point of Care
pp	Percentage points
SD	Standard deviation
SOEP-IS	Socio-Economic Panel Innovation Sample
TBA	Task-based Approach
w/o	Without

This thesis follows the citation style of the 7th edition of the American Psychological Association (APA).

