Aude Aylin de Tapia

University of Freiburg, Germany
Aylin.de.tapia@orient.uni-freiburg.de

Cappadocia as a Field for Expertise: Paths of Three Rum 'Experts' of Cappadocia in Search of a Historical Identity

Abstract

In the last decades of the Ottoman Empire, literature in the Greek alphabet, namely in Greek and in Karamanli-Turkish, experienced an important increase in terms of the number of publications as well as the proliferation of published topics and the diffusion of these publications to wherever readers were present throughout the Empire, especially in Cappadocia, but also abroad. Cappadocia – as a region inhabited by Rums for centuries – became itself a subject for expertise for those who aimed to look into the past of local Rum communities, which, for the most part, were Turkish-speaking, while a minority of Greek-speakers were observed as the heirs of Ancient Greece. While Western travellers were interested in this topic and proposed (hypothetical) theories about the origins of these communities, a series of Rum authors became central experts about Cappadocia's history, geography and even ethnography and published several books and articles in Greek and in Karamanli-Turkish about Cappadocia. In this paper, we will follow the path of three of them: Nikolaos S. Rizos (1838–1895), Anastasios Levidis (1834–1918), and Ioannis Kalfoglou (1871–1931). Through the analysis of their biographies and writings, I will try to understand what the main motivations of these authors were to write about Cappadocia, why and how they became experts in this topic, what kinds of interactions they had with other authors writing about Cappadocia, and to what extent Cappadocia became a field of expertise and these authors experts in this field.

Keywords: Cappadocia, Greek-Orthodox Christians, intellectual history, Karamanlidika, literature in Greek; nineteenth century

1. Introduction

In the last decades of the Ottoman Empire, literature written in the Greek alphabet, namely in Greek and in Karamanli-Turkish (Turkish written in Greek script), experienced a significant increase in terms of number of publications as well as of topics, while the spreading of these publications throughout the Empire and abroad intensified too. In this context, Cappadocia – as a region inhabited by Rums, including Greek- and Turkish-speaking communities living in towns as well as in rural areas – became one of the places of diffusion but also a subject of expertise for this literature. In the same period, among Western intellectuals and travellers who visited Anatolia and Greek/Rum intellectual circles of urban centres of the Ottoman Empire and Greece, such as Istanbul, Izmir, and Athens, Cappadocian Rum communities began to be observed as the heirs of Ancient Greeks. While Western travellers were more interested in ancient times and theories about the origins of local Christian communities, a series of Rum

authors became central experts on Cappadocia's history, geography and even ethnography. They published numerous books and articles in Greek and in Karamanli-Turkish about Cappadocia and its Christian populations.

In this paper, we will follow the path of three of these authors: Nikolaos S. Rizos (1838–1895), Anastasios Levidis (1834–1918), and, to a lesser extent, Ioannis Kalfoglou (1871–1931). Through the analysis of their biographies and writings, we will investigate what the main motivations on these authors were to write about Cappadocia, why and how they became experts in this topic, and to what extent their expertise was recognized and considered in the Rum and *a fortiori* Ottoman, Greek and European intellectual circles. For that purpose, this article scrutinizes works of these three authors by integrating them in a larger network of writings published in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries about Cappadocia and including different kinds of works written in Western languages (mainly English, French, and German), in Greek and in Karamanli-Turkish: travelogues, missionary reports, articles of journals, newspapers and yearbooks (*salname* in Turkish ; *imerologion* in Greek).

Concerning the three authors, who are the focus of this article, and more generally when it comes to Greek Orthodox writers of the late Ottoman period, valuable biographic and bibliographic works, often based on the archives of the Center of Asia Minor Studies have been produced, especially in the first volume of the online *Encyclopaedia of the Hellenic World* focusing on Asia Minor[1] A worthwhile secondary literature exists on intellectual circles including producers (authors and publishers) and audience of late Ottoman Greek literature and Karamanlidika, but it mostly concentrates on the largest urban communities, such as Istanbul or Izmir.[2] To propose a far-reaching intellectual history of the Christian communities of the Ottoman Empire, which transcends the borders of these main urban centers, it is now necessary to investigate the life and works of these personalities from the perspective of the provinces and through a comparative perspective, this article being a first attempt.[3]

For that purpose, I will consider main works of Rizos, Levidis and Kalfoglou and analyse them in terms of expertise on Cappadocia. Concerning Nikolaos S. Rizos, his book published in 1856, *Καππαδοκικα, ήτοι δοκίμιον ίστορικῆς περιγραφῆς τῆς Ἀρχαίας Καππαδοκίας, καὶ ἰδίως τῶν ἐπαρχιών Καισαρείας καὶ Ἰκονίου* [*Cappadocia, that is, an*

1 The project of the online *Encyclopaedia of the Hellenic World* is described together with the main team and methodology used in its preparation on URL: http://asiaminor.ehw.gr/forms/fmain.aspx. The Encyclopaedia incues three volumes

2 See among others: Anastassiadou 2012; 2004; Anastassiadou-Dumont 1997; Anastassiadou-Dumont and Heyberger 1999; Balta 2011 and 2010; Balta and Kappler 2008; Benlisoy 2014; Benlisoy and Benlisoy 2010; Kechriotis 2016; Smyrnelis 2005 and 1997; Yılmaz 2012). A part of these references integrates the case of provincial migrants who integrated intellectual circles of Istanbul or Izmir. A few works have also been published on smaller provincial towns such as Kayseri or Mersin. See Balta 2002; Benlisoy 2021.

3 Comparative perspective has begun to be implemented in the study of newspapers published in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries by the Rums of the empire, including Greek and Karamanli-Turkish newspapers. See for instance Balta 2010a and 2010b; Baydar 2014; Benlisoy 2014; Benlisoy and Benlisoy 2010.

essay of historical description of Ancient Cappadocia, and especially of the provinces of Caesarea and Ikonio] is the only source written by his hand, and information about his life and work are rather available in the work of his contemporary, Anastasios Levidis, as well as in a series of publications about the town of Sinasos, especially the monographs written by his own son, Serafeim N. Rizos, *Η Σινασός (Sinasos)* and by the historian Christos Hadziossif, *Σινασός, ιστορία ενός τόπου χωρίς ιστορία* (*Sinasos. History of a place without history*), respectively written in 1952 and published in 2005. The work of Anastasios Levidis is much more substantial, including books, articles and manuscripts detailed in the bibliography. Data he collected during his field research throughout Cappadocia have also been used by other scholars, especially the British archaeologist Richard Dawkins (1871–1955). As for Ioannis Kalfoglou, his two main works, the monograph of the Monastery of Ioannis Prodromos of Zincidere (*Ζιντζίντερε καργεσινδέ πουλουνάν Ιωάννης Πρόδρομος Μοναστηρή γιαχόδ Μονή Φλαβιανών*, 1898) written in Karamanli-Turkish and his *Historical Geography of the Asia Minor Continent* (*Μικρα Ασια Κητασηνην Ταριχιε Δζαγραφιαση*, 1899) also written and published in Karamanli-Turkish (and its translation into Greek by Stavros Anestidis with a preface of Ioanna Petropoulou published in 2002), are the main sources used in this article.

2. Cappadocia and the Cappadocians as a Subject of Expertise in the Nineteenth Century

Depending on the period, the toponym Cappadocia was given to a territory with changing boundaries that was sometimes a kingdom, a military, administrative, and/or a religious province or series of provinces, while in some periods, it disappeared entirely from official territorial nomenclatures.[4] In the nineteenth century, it reappeared as a cultural space after centuries of oblivion in the writings of Western travellers and in those of scholars who were seen as experts in various domains, especially geology, topography, history, art history, linguistics, and ethnography. It was also during the nineteenth century that Western authors began to make the connection between the history and geography of the region of Aksaray-Niğde-Nevşehir-Kayseri and that of the mythic, mystic Cappadocia mentioned by ancient authors such as Strabo. The reappearance of Cappadocia can be credited to multiple contextual factors. First, the interest of Westerners in Asia Minor increased because Cappadocia became an important step along the 'Voyage to the Orient,' in vogue at the time. Simultaneously, Protestant and Catholic missionary activities based in Cappadocia developed largely because of the significant presence of Christians (Orthodox Rums but Also Armenians) in this rural area, but also because of its very distinctive Christian landscape, which attracted

4 The first record of the term 'Cappadocia,' dating to the late sixth century BC, was found in a trilingual inscription in the Persian, Elamite, and Akkadian languages in the form 'Katpatuka,' which designated the name of one of the satrapies of the Persian Empire. Regarding the Ancient and Medieval history of Cappadicia, see Hild and Restle 1981; Lamesa 2015; Room 1997; Thierry 2002; Vryonis 1971.

the attention of missionaries. Secondly, an important migration flow of Cappadocian Rums, including educated people, to Istanbul and other intellectual centres of the Empire and abroad attracted the attention of intellectual circles to this region and its population, in the context of the rise of the Hellenization movement led, from different standpoints and with different objectives, from Athens and Istanbul, respectively.

As a trigger of the Western interest, in the 1810s, John MacDonald Kinneir, a British traveller passing through the region, was the first author to clearly identify the area between Aksaray and Kayseri as the ancient Kingdom of Cappadocia described by Strabo.[5] After he did so, many travellers visited Cappadocia, most of them being mainly interested in finding the ruins of ancient and Byzantine civilizations in the Cappadocian landscape. Local geology and troglodytism were also regional points of interest that fascinated Europeans.[6] Most Western travellers thought that Cappadocians' rupestrian living resulted from the preservation of a local, ancestral way of life, made possible by the remoteness of the area. Local Christians were thus observed as the heirs of an ancient tradition, testifying to their capacity to adapt to the local environment and guard against external influences. In the eyes of Western travellers, the endurance of Christian communities, which had practiced their faith openly in the midst of territories conquered by Muslims centuries earlier, demonstrated the fervent religiosity of these Christians.

Among local Christians, Rums drew the attention of archaeologists, epigraphers, and geographers in search of the vestiges of Hellenism. As a result, just as the term 'Cappadocia' became a generic word used to define the area, it also emerged in several narratives as an adjective used to describe Rums specifically (and not local Armenians or Muslims).[7] Ainsworth, in 1839, described Cappadocian Greeks as 'a tribe [. . .] excelling in having become less changed, and less humbled and prostrated than other Greek communities are by four centuries of Osmanli tyranny.'[8] Moreover, on the one hand, the Cappadocian Greek dialects also attracted the interest of Western travelling experts who considered that Cappadocians spoke an intact antique, or at least non-inflected language.[9] On the other hand, Turkish-speaking Rums surprised European travellers, not because they spoke Turkish, but because they did not know a word of Greek. A widespread story taken up in several travel accounts suggests that the latter had lost their original language because Turks used to cut out the tongues of Greek children 'to exterminate that speech.'[10] Finally, the archaeologist William Ramsay is the only author to have meticulously described the coexistence of both Turkish- and Greek-speaking groups, as well as the large proportion of bilingual individuals among them.[11]

5 Kinneir 1818, 96–100.
6 See for instance Hamilton 1842, II:254; Sterrett 1900, 677; Texier and Pullan 1864, 38.
7 This expression, referring to the contemporary population, was first used by Ainsworth before spreading to other travelogues (Ainsworth 1839, 1:312; Perrot 1864; Ramsay 1897; Wilson 1884).
8 Ainsworth 1839, 1:214.
9 Perrot 1864, 382–3.
10 Knüppel 1997.
11 Ramsay 1897, 240.

Descriptions of Cappadocia in European travelogues offer a wide range of details on a variety of topics at a time when Greek and some Rum elites were establishing the basis for the creation of an encompassing Greek nation. The creation of the Kingdom of Greece (1832) provided a spark for the development of Greek nationalism. However, when it came to Greeks (or Rums) living outside of the kingdom, it would be misleading to think that Athens had become the only heart of Greek nationalism. In Ottoman territories, the main concern was to unify all of the Rums under the same identity, based, first, on Orthodox faith and the Greek language. In this context, Turkish-speaking Orthodox Christians, who were for the most part not able to understand Greek, appeared to present a thorny issue. As a rule, the Hellenization movement which took place from the late nineteenth century was double-headed from Athens and Istanbul. However, concerning Cappadocia and Cappadocian Rums, the movement was more specifically led from Istanbul under the leadership of Constantinopolitan Rum elites and under the auspices of the Patriarchate,[12] while representatives of Athens, namely Greek diplomats, penetrated inner Anatolia – especially Cappadocia – late, compared to the efforts done for the Aegean coasts of Asia Minor. The Greek Consul General of Smyrna, Stamatis Antonopoulos, visited the area of Konya for the first time in 1901, and it is only in 1908 that a Greek consulate was established in Konya, its first consul arriving a few years later, in 1912.[13]

The Hellenization efforts carried out by ruling elites of Istanbul about Anatolian Rums was also assisted by Turkish-speaking Cappadocian immigrants living in the capital, at least by those who were especially motivated to resolve their linguistic contradiction. But the movement's final purpose was far broader than a linguistic issue. Nevertheless, next to faith, the Greek language was the main symbolic incarnation of the unity of Greek culture and civilization. In this context, Karamanlı-Turkish became a tool leading toward Hellenization and Cappadocia one of the main targets since Turkish-speaking Rums were settled there in especially high numbers.[14] Against this backdrop, it was important to understand the population of Cappadocia, its history, language, and culture, and for that purpose Rum intellectuals and scholars began to write extensively on Cappadocia, the region becoming a new area for expertise.

3. Rum Experts of Cappadocia: Being a Cappadocian to be an Expert of Cappadocia?

Western narratives were important resources for Rum scholars. They led to the rise of a network of exchange for ideas among Western and Rum scholars. For instance, the French archaeologist Charles Texier used the work of Father Kyrillos (Metropolite of Ikonium who became Kyrillos VI, Patriarch of Constantinople between 1813 and

12 Anagnostopoulou 2010.
13 *ibid*., 63.
14 Tapia 2023, 19–23, 32–42.

1818) to write his major book on Minor Asia.[15] The Rum elites of the Ottoman capital became interested in foreign narratives about this part of Anatolia, their interest being triggered in part but not solely by the interest of Westerners. For instance, an article by Andreas Mordtmann on the troglodyte people of Cappadocia ('Die Troglodyten von Kappadokien'[16]) was debated during several sessions of the Greek Philological Syllogos of Istanbul in 1863, members of the Syllogos discussing Mordtmann's theory concerning the language of Cappadocian Rums. Paranikas, who had translated the article into Greek, opened a passionate debate on two principal issues: Mordtmann's use of the term 'troglodyte' and his point of view concerning local languages. Mordtmann claimed that Cappadocian Rums had directly switched from a Cappadocian language to Turkish, without ever using Greek as a mother tongue. He asserted that the Greek language was used only as the language of the Church and not as a native tongue.[17]

Avid supporters of the Hellenization movement rapidly understood that there was something to be done with these Cappadocians. The curiosity of urban Rum elites was also piqued by the massive migration of Cappadocian Rums towards the largest Ottoman cities, primarily Istanbul. Among these migrants, some well-educated individuals integrated themselves into the intellectual environment of the capital and attracted interest in their native land through their writings, becoming themselves experts about Cappadocia. Such was the case for the two following individuals: Nikolaos S. Rizos and Anastasios Levidis, who were born in Cappadocia, received part of their education in Istanbul before returning to their native land.

3.1 Nikolaos S. Rizos (1838–1895): the Precursor

Nikolaos S. Rizos was probably the most important author and source of inspiration for the other Rum experts on Cappadocia. Little is known about him; the only information about his biography comes from Anastasios Levidis.[18]

Nikolaos Rizos was born in 1838 in Sinasos (today Mustafapaşa), the main centre for Hellenism in Cappadocia.[19] He was the son of Serafeim Rizos, a trader who benefitted from and furthered the economic prosperity of Sinasos. Nikolaos went to the primary school in Sinasos[20] and then completed his studies in Istanbul, at the *Megali tou Genous Scholi* (Great School of the Nation). He graduated in 1856 and in the

15 Kyrillos 1815; Texier 1863, 559.
16 Mordtmann 1861.
17 'Συνεδριακες ΞΒ΄ τη 15 Ιουνιου 1863' 1863; 'Συνεδριακες ΞΒ΄ τη 27 Ιουλιου 1863' 1863; Mordtmann 1861, 11–28; Tapia 2023, 39–40. On the Syllogos of Constantinople, see Vassiadis 2007.
18 A. M. Levidis 1899b, 376–78; Sapkidi 2002c.
19 Hadziiossif 2010.
20 The school of Sinasos is the first primary school founded by a Rum community in Cappadocia in 1821, thanks to the financial support of several local traders, especially members of the Caviar Trade Union, including the father of Nikolaos Rizos (Balta 2009, 99; Benlisoy 2010; Rizos 2007, 11; Stamatopoulos 1986, 46; Tapia 2023, 141).

same year published his seminal and only book *Kappadokika*, presenting the history of Cappadocia and of its Rum population from the ancient to the Ottoman times.[21] Largely inspired by a previous work published in 1815 by Kyrillos, Metropolite of Ikonium,[22] he portrayed in a very detailed way the towns and villages of the region, giving demographic information, descriptions of main buildings, schools, and local administrative systems, among other things. An important aspect of his account concerned linguistics as he described the dialects spoken by Greek-speaking communities while abstaining from dealing with Turkish-speaking communities since the aim of his book was to correct 'the wrong ideas of the ignorant' who imagined that Cappadocian Rums were only Turkish-speaking Karamanlis.[23] This book was his response to the Rum elites who laughed at and disregarded the Cappadocians, describing them as uncouth people unable to speak the language of their Church and nation.[24] His impressive work, written in Greek, was published by Evangelinos Misailidis at the printing office of the Karamanli newspaper 'Anatoli' of Istanbul in 1856. In a short time, *Kappadokika* became one of the main references on Cappadocia for those who, in the next decades, would aim to collect material on Cappadocia and Cappadocians but also diffuse Hellenism and/or 're-hellenize' Karamanli people.

Rizos' work initiated of a new era of interest in the 'living monuments' and local culture of Cappadocia among Christian elites, not only those of Istanbul, but also those of other centres of Hellenism, such as Athens and Izmir.[25] Urban Rum elites discovered the Greek-speaking communities living in Cappadocia thanks to it. *Kappadokika* especially contributed to the Rum elites' awareness of these Cappadocian communities, which began to be observed as the proof of a direct link between ancient Hellenes and contemporary Greeks/Rums. In that context, research on local Greek dialects through the collection of living monuments (records of speakers, transcription of songs, etc.) began to be funded and supported by urban intellectual elites.[26] Rizos' book also became a tool to counter theories questioning the Hellenic origins of Cappadocian Orthodox Christians, such as, for instance, the theories elaborated by Mordtamnn and published a few years later (in 1861).

Kappadokika, probably because it was written by a local notable who knew his native land well, incited Rum intellectuals and scholars to consider it a relevant area of expertise, and Rizos appeared to be a trusted expert on Cappadocia and Cappadocians. Surprisingly, after that book, Rizos did not publish any other work and became quite an influential notable in the Sinasiote community until his death in 1895.[27] As a result, in terms of expertise, one can wonder if Rizos can really be considered an expert, since his production is limited to a single publication. He was perhaps not an expert in the

21 Sapkidi 2002c.
22 Kyrillos 1815.
23 N.S. Rizos 1856, θ'.
24 Anestidis 2014.
25 N.S. Rizos 1856. See also Anagnostakis and Balta 1990, 21–3.
26 Anastassiadou 2012.
27 Sapkidi 2002c.

scholarly sense of the word, but his only book became one of the main references for subsequent scholars and authors writing on Cappadocia – some of them even just copying or translating it in their own publications. As such, it was obviously regarded as the product of expertise by his contemporaries.

3.2 Anastasios Levidis (1834–1918): The Local Expert par excellence – A Life of Work on and for Cappadocians

Unlike Rizos, the second individual, Anastasios Levidis, published several books and articles on Cappadocia. He is the Cappadocian expert of Cappadocia *par excellence*, since he was born in 1834 in Everek, a small town close to Kayseri in a family of Karamanli local notables, the Kazantzoglous. Contrary to Rizos, Levidis belonged to a Turkish-speaking community and learnt Greek at school, first at the primary school of Everek for three years, and then at home thanks to one of his uncles who was head of the local parish and became his personal teacher. At the age of 20, he moved to Istanbul, where his father was already settled, and he enrolled, like Rizos, at the Great School of the Nation. There, the headmaster grecisized his family name and renamed him Levidis.[28]

Levidis dedicated his life to Cappadocia and became one of the most prolific authors and scholars writing about Cappadocia. In 1861, after his graduation from the Great School of the Nation, he returned to his birthplace and was appointed by Paisios II, the metropolite of Kayseri, as a teacher in the Religious School of the Monastery of Zincidere where he worked for three years. He became an administrator in the late 1860s and remained at the head of the Theological School until 1871, when the school began to decline due to a lack of funds and internal difficulties. After two years, in 1873, he returned at the direction of the school, which, in the meantime, had turned into a more secular high school. Internal difficulties, however, especially fights between religious and secular staff, incited him to quickly resign. In 1874, he was appointed director of the schools of Andronikí (Endürlük), where he taught for eight years. During the following years, he also ran various schools around Yozgat and in Talas (near Kayseri), and after his official retirement in 1889, he continued to be an advisor or board member for different schools throughout Cappadocia.[29]

During the three decades he spent in Cappadocia as a schoolteacher and director, Levidis travelled a lot throughout the region. He took notes on local history and geography, collected historical and linguistic material, especially song lyrics and local stories and traditions, and wrote books, while teaching and preaching the word of God. His fight against Protestantism was probably one of the main reasons for his wish to develop expertise about Cappadocia and Cappadocians. Levidis was indeed a fierce enemy of Protestantism and fought the missionaries who were penetrating Cappadocia

28 Levidis 1935; Sapkidi 2002b.
29 Levidis 1935.

in those years.[30] His goal was thus to develop his own expertise to be able to help his Cappadocian fellows and to use this expertise against Protestant proselytism. For these purposes, he wrote various works in Greek, but also in Karamanli-Turkish to more broadly diffuse his great knowledge among local communities, which were mainly Turkophone. For instance, he published two books in Karamanli-Turkish, one entitled *Mirati fezail ve meagip* (*Μιράτη φεζαΐλ βε μεαγίπ*, Mirror of virtues and vices, 1875), and the other *Giani Rouhani* (*Γιανί Ρουχανί*, Spiritual armor, 1880) to help local priests and populations who did not know Greek to adequately understand sermons and to give them ammunition against missionaries.[31] He also published a series of texts in the journal *Xenofanis*, especially on the history of proselytism in Asia Minor,[32] as well as two dictionaries: *Onomastikon*, a Turkish-Greek dictionary published in 1887 aiming to teach Greek to Turkish-speaking Rums in order to help them to recover their ancestral language, and its Greek-Turkish counterpart, *Lexikon Ellino-Tourkikon*, in 1888, to teach Turkish to Greek-speakers who needed to use the Turkish language as a tool for communication in their everyday and professional lives.[33]

After his retirement in 1889, Levidis dedicated the rest of his life until his death in 1918 to writing books, using the material that he had collected in the previous years. On the one hand, he continued the preparation of his monumental work *Istorikon Dokimion tis Kappadokia* (entire title: *Ιστορικόν δοκίμιον διηρημένον εις τόμους τέσσαρας και περιέχον την θρησκευτικήν και πολιτικήν ιστορίαν την χωρογραφίαν και αρχαιολογίαν της Καππαδοκίας*), an essay divided into four volumes and containing the religious and political history, geography, and archaeology of Cappadocia).[34] The first volume on Ecclesiastical history had already been published in 1885 in Athens. Levidis wrote the following three volumes later but never published them in his lifetime: the second volume focused on archaeology, the third one on political history and the fourth on languages previously spoken in Cappadocia. On the other hand, in 1899, he published two other books : one is an archaeological and historical work about the monasteries of Cappadocia (*Αἱ ἐν Μονολίθοις Μοναί τῆς Καππαδοκίας καί Λυκαονίας / The Monolithic Monasteries of Cappadocia and Lycaonia*) published in 1899;[35] the other is an unpublished (typewritten) treatise on major Cappadocian intellectuals from the Ancient Times to the present day (*Πραγματεία περί πολιτισμού και διανοητικής αναπτύξεως των Καππαδόκων και των εκ Καππαδοκίας διαλαμψάντων επισήμων ανδρών από των αρχαιοτάτων χρόνων μέχρι της σήμερον/Treatise on the culture and intellectual development of the Cappadocians and the brilliant official men from Cappadocia from ancient times to the present day*).[36] He also published an article on the town of Kayseri in the yearbook of

30 About the reaction of the Orthodox church and intellectuals against Protestant proselytism, see Anestidis 2011, 277.
31 Levidis 1875 and 1880.
32 Levidis 1905b.
33 Levidis 1875, 1880 and 1905b; Petropoulou 2001, 292; Renieri 1993, 55.
34 Levidis 1885.
35 Levidis 1899a.
36 Levidis 1899b.

the National charity shops in Constantinople (*Ημερολόγιον Εθνικών Φιλανθρωπικών Καταστημάτων εν Κωνσταντινουπόλει*).[37]

Levidis obviously used Western references, including Greek texts and the works of Europeans–such as the book of Charles Texier on Asia Minor–in his own writings, and his work dialogued with the research of European intellectuals of his time. The work of Levidis was for instance used by Frederick Hasluck in his seminal book *Christianity and Islam under the Sultans*.[38] Levidis also met and exchanged with Richard Dawkins, another British scholar who, in the 1910s, prepared a dissertation on Cappadocian dialects and visited Zincidere in 1911.[39] Dawkins benefitted from the very rich collection of linguistic and ethnographical data collected by Levidis, who dealt with the Turkish- as much as Greek-speaking communities of Cappadocia at a time when the promotion of the Hellenic character of Cappadocian Rums and thus the silencing of any element that could be considered opposed to this view was the rule among most Rum and Greek scholars. On the other hand, he ignored Ottoman sources and focused neither on the Ottoman history of Cappadocia nor on the exchange of influences between the Ottomans and the Orthodox-Christians of the region, passing over the Ottoman centuries to go back to the glorious and prestigious Greek antiquity.[40]

3.3 Ioannis Kalfoglou (1871–1931): A Cappadocian Expert 'by Adoption'

The third individual, Ioannis Kalfoglou, is also central among Rum experts on Cappadocia, even though his expertise transcended the borders of Cappadocia and extended to Anatolia/Asia minor[41] as a whole. While the two previously named experts were Cappadocian natives who developed expertise on their homeland, Kalfoglou was rather a Cappadocian 'by adoption' since he himself was not a native of the region and his parents had no Cappadocian origin. He was born in 1871 in Üsküdar (on the Asian shore of Istanbul) to a family hailing from Bafra (in the Pontic area). Kalfoglou was consequently not a Cappadocian by birth. However, he spent several years in the region as a student of the Theological Seminary of Zincidere during the years when Levidis was the director.[42]

In the early 1900s, Kalfoglou became a fervent supporter of the Hellenization movement and of the emancipation of the Greeks of Asia Minor. From 1901 onward, he participated in the liberation movement of the Pontic region while living in Batumi. However, contrary to other supporters of the Hellenization movement, who wrote exclusively in Greek, Kalfoglou – whose native tongue was Turkish, like Levidis – wrote in Greek as well as in Karamanli-Turkish because he considered it important to reach

37 Levidis 1905a.
38 Hasluck 1929, II:759–60.
39 Dawkins 1916 and 1930, 135.
40 Petropoulou 2001, 292–3.
41 About the distinction between Anatolia and Asia Minor, see (Bruneau 2015, 40).
42 About the life of Kalfoglou, see the preface of Ioanna Petropoulou in Kalfoglou 2002.

Turkish-speaking compatriots and make them aware of their Greek identity by using Karamanli-Turkish. For instance, in 1898, he published a book in Karamanli-Turkish about the monastery of Ioannis Prodromos in Zincidere (*Ζιντζίντερε καργεσινδέ πουλουνάν Ιωάννης Πρόδρομος Μοναστηρή γιαχόδ Μονή Φλαβιανών*) and in 1899 another book on the history and geography of Asia Minor (*Μικρα Ασια Κητασηνην Ταριχιε Δζαγραφιαση /* Historical Geography of the Asia Minor Continent). [43] Cappadocia was not the central focus of Kalfoglou's work. He rather worked on Asia Minor as a whole, including the Black Sea area, the Aegean and Mediterranean shores. As a strong supporter of Hellenism who, however, felt himself to be Rum and Anatolian and distinguished this identity from being Greek (*Yunan*), he was driven by the desire to address misconceptions and ignorance about the geography of Asia Minor among his contemporaries.[44] However, with his book on the monastery of Zincidere, he also cultivated expertise on Cappadocia, since like Rizos and Levidis, he was one of the frequently quoted references in many articles and books of the twentieth century. In terms of historiographical expertise, Kalfoglou had a more encompassing way of writing history than Rizos and Levidis. Like that of Levidis, his work dialogued with Greek and Byzantine but also with Western sources and references. Yet, contrary to Levidis, he also used Ottoman primary sources such as firmans and wrote about the Ottoman period and administration in his *Historical Geography of Asia Minor*.[45]

In the early twentieth century, Kalfoglou settled in Batumi, where he published in 1908 a new essay on Caucasian Greeks, in which his ideology obviously changed since he aimed to prove the belonging of Caucasian Greeks to a purely Greek race encompassing all the Hellenes, including those living outside Greece, while, in 1899, he still distinguished between the Rums and the Greeks of Greece.[46]

4. Conclusion

The nineteenth century was a period of resurgence and revival for the Rum communities of the Ottoman Empire, a period during which political, socio-economic, cultural, educational, artistic, and philanthropic dynamics were revitalized thanks to a favourable context that included the independence of Greece (1830), reforms inside the Ottoman empire, and the rise of a class of new – often non-Muslim – entrepreneurs who benefitted from new technologies and opportunities brought by integration into the world economy. This renaissance was not only visible among Rums; similar dynamics were experienced by members of other *millet*s and a fortiori among Muslims.[47] In Cappadocia, this renaissance had various consequences. The massive rural exodus from the middle of the century within Christian communities caused a demographic

43 Kalfoglou 1898 and 1899.
44 Kalfoglou 2002, 11 (Petropoulou's preface).
45 Petropoulou 2001, 290.
46 Kalfoglou 2002, 32 (Petropoulou's preface).
47 Strauss 1995 and 1998.

decline, but it also provided rural communities with new opportunities for economic, social, and cultural development.[48]

In the urban environments that received these migrants, Cappadocians and Cappadocia became a subject of interest at the heart of a broader quest for identity. Both Rum and Western intellectuals observed and debated the case of these Orthodox Christians – many of them being Turkish speakers and some Greek speakers with 'archaic' dialects. These debates were also joined by intellectuals from Cappadocia, who sought to make known their region, its history, and its geography, but also local communities, language, and culture, often to correct a negative and often false image that had spread in the educated urban environments of the empire and in Greece.[49]

In this context, several personalities became – voluntarily or involuntarily – experts on Cappadocia, and their writings became references on the history of the region and its Christian communities. The three personalities studied in this article are obviously not the only ones. The historian Pavlos Karolidis, for example, can be mentioned here, since he was also born in Cappadocia (in the Turkish-speaking Rum community of the village of Endürlük near Kayseri). Educated in Istanbul and then trained at the universities of Athens, Munich, Strasbourg and Tübingen, Karolidis also began his career by developing expertise on Cappadocia as he defended a doctoral thesis in 1872 on Cappadocian archaeology (published in Greek in 1874[50]) and then published a work on the city of Comana in 1882 and a linguistic study on Cappadocian Greek in 1885.[51] However, subsequently, he moved away from this area of local expertise to focus on the history of the Greek nation and world history, incidentally becoming deputy of the Ottoman assembly between 1908 and 1912. One should also mention Ioakeim Valavanis, born in Aravani in 1858, doctor of philosophy from the University of Athens (1889), and his work on the traditions, language, and anthropology of the Orthodox Christians of his native land.[52] We can also mention lesser-known Cappadocian authors such as Simeon Farasopoulos (and his book on the village of Sylata) or Archelaos I. Sarantidis (and his book on the village of Sinasos), for whom biographical information is limited.[53]

Unlike Karolidis and Valavanis, the three personalities studied in this article did not have a university education. While Nikolaos Rizos and Anastasios Levidis were both born in Cappadocia, the former in a Greek-speaking community and the latter in a Turkish-speaking community, Ioannis Kalfoglou spent the key years of his education in the region. The three men have been able to claim – or have received – the

48 Tapia 2023, 128–44.
49 Anagnostakis and Balta 1990.
50 Karolidis 1874.
51 Kechriotis 2016; Petropoulou 2001, 284; Strauss 1995.
52 Valavanis published especially articles in magazines of the Athenian Literary Society *Parnassos*. His articles on everyday life, traditions, and beliefs in Cappadocian villages, as well as on the life of migrants, were later collected and published in a compilation in 1891. He also prepared a dictionary on the Greek dialect of his native village, Aravani, that he never published. About the life and work of Valavanis, see Fosteris 1955, 377; Sapkidi 2002a.
53 Sarantidis 1899; Farasopoulos 1895.

identity of expert in the fields of history, geography, linguistics and ethnography of Cappadocia thanks to their written production and despite a methodology that is often questionable from a scientific point of view, relying on few primary sources, sometimes based on approximate knowledge and having a biased approach shaped by the context of the rise of nationalist ideologies, especially the *Megali Idea* and the Hellenization movement in which they participated directly or indirectly. Their expertise was not founded on a disciplinary dichotomy but on a geography and on their belonging to it. It is indeed above all their indigenous identity – or at least, in the case of Kalfoglou, his presence on the field – that guaranteed their work the status of suitable expertise.

By scrutinizing the ways these authors are cited and mentioned in several Greek and Karamanlidika works (which often do not provide clear references to their sources), I observed that, in a few cases, in Karamanlidika, the word '*μεχαρετλού*' ('*meharetlü*,' variant of '*maharetli*' meaning 'skilful, proficient') was used, generally combined with the word '*efendi*' (which was more often used alone).[54] Most of the time, however, in Greek as much as in Karamanlidika publications, there was no specific term used to define them as 'expert.' Instead, their local origin was often emphasized with terms such as the Greek adjective '*ήμέτερος*' ('*imeteros*,' meaning 'our') or the Turkish equivalent suffix '*-miz*' in Karamanli-Turkish, or adjectives specifying their belonging to a local settlement (for instance '*Ανδρονικειὺς*'/'from Androniki' in Greek or '*Αραβὰνλη*'/'from Aravani' in Karamanli-Turkish).[55] This confirms that the status of expert was mainly validated by their presence on the ground and, above all, by their autochthony (for Kalfoglou, 'by adoption') that gave them legitimacy with external audiences (the urban Rum intellectual circles) but also internal readership (the Rums of Cappadocia themselves). In that sense, their expertise had a double audience, but also a dual purpose on multiple levels: as they themselves often emphasized, their main motivation was to correct the false image of their region and their compatriots, but also to prove to Cappadocian Orthodox Christians their rightful belonging to the Rum *millet*, to the community of the faithful of the Greek Orthodox Church, and even to the Hellenic identity, despite the Turcophony of many of them and despite their geographical location on the margins of the Hellenic world.

Bibliography

Ainsworth, William Francis. 1839. *Travels and Researches in Asia Minor, Mesopotamia, Chaldea and Armenia*. 2 vols., vol. 1. London: John W. Parker.

Anagnostakis, Ilias and Balta, E. 1990. *Η Καππαδοκία Των "Ζώντων Μνημείων": η Ανακάλυψη "Της Πρώτης Πατρίδος Της Ελληνικής Φυλής" (19ος Αι.)*. Athens: Πορεία.

Anagnostopoulou, Sia. 2010. 'Greek Diplomatic Authorities in Anatolia'. In Kappler, M. and Balta, E. (eds.). *Cries and Whispers in Karamanlidika Books: Proceedings of the First International*

54 For instance, Kalfoglou mentions Anastasios Levidis as 'meharetlü Anastasios Levidis Efendi' (Kalfoglou 1898, η).

55 See, for instance, Ioannidis 1896; Kalfoglou 1898, η; Levidis 1885, 8; Levidis 1899a.

Conference on Karamanlidika Studies (Nicosia, 11th–13th September 2008. Turcologica, 83. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag. 63–78.

Anastassiadou-Dumont, Méropi. 1997. *Salonique, 1830–1912. Une ville ottomane à l'heure des réformes*. Leiden: Brill.

Anastassiadou, Méropi. 2004. 'De la paroisse à la communauté. Les Grecs orthodoxes de Stavodromi (Beyoğlu-Istanbul)'. *Anatolia Moderna - Yeni Anadolu* X. 149–66.

– 2012. *Les Grecs d'Istanbul au XIXe siècle. Histoire socioculturelle de la communauté de Péra*. Leiden: Brill.

Anastassiadou-Dumont, Méropi, and Bernard Heyberger. 1999. *Figures anonymes, figures d'élites : pour une anatomie de l'Homo ottomanicus*. Istanbul: Isis.

Anestidis, Stavros Th. 2011. 'Saint Augustin visite la Cappadoce des Pères orthodoxes'. In *Between Religion and Language: Turkish-Speaking Christians, Jews and Greek-Speaking Muslims and Catholics in the Ottoman Empire*, edited by E. Balta. Istanbul: Eren. 277–90.

– 2014. 'Yunan ve Türk Edebiyatında Erken Karamanlı Tiplemeleri'. In Balta, E. (ed.). *Cultural Encounters in the Turkish-Speaking Communities of the Late Ottoman Empire*. Istanbul: Isis. 29–40.

Balta, Evangelia, and Matthias Kappler. 2008. *Cries and Whispers in Karamanlidika Books: Proceedings of the First International Conference on Karamanlidika Studies (Nicosia, 11th–13th September 2008)*. Turcologica. Vol. 83. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag.

Balta, E. 2002. 'The Greek Orthodox Community of Mersina (Mid-19th Century to 1921)'. In Akdeniz Kent Araştırmaları Merkezi (ed.). *Mersin, the Mediterranean and Modernity - Heritage of the Long Nineteenth Century*. Mersin: Mersin Üniversitesi Yayınları. 39–43.

– 2009. *Sinasos. Mübadeleden Önce Bir Kapadokya Kasabası*. Istanbul: Bir Zamanlar.

– 2010a. 'Catalogue of the Karamanlidika Press'. In *Beyond the Language Frontier. Studies on the Karamanli and the Karamanlidikas Printing*. Istanbul: Isis. 123–133.

– 2010b. 'Karamanlidika Press (Smyrna 1845 – Athens 1926)'. In *Beyond the Language Frontier. Studies on the Karamanlis and the Karamanlidika Printing*. Istanbul: Isis. 107–121.

– 2010c. *Beyond the Language Frontier. Studies on the Karamanli and the Karamanlidikas Printing*. Istanbul: Isis.

– 2011. *Between Religion and Language : Turkish-Speaking Christians, Jews and Greek-Speaking Muslims and Catholics in the Ottoman Empire*. Istanbul: Eren.

Baydar, Ayça. 2014. 'Anadolu'da Ortodoksluk Sadası'. In Balta, E. and Ölmez, M. (eds.). *Cultural Encounters in the Turkish-Speaking Communities of the Late Ottoman Empire*. Istanbul: Isis. 335–358.

Benlisoy, Foti, and Stefo Benlisoy. 2010. 'Reading the Identity of "Karamanli" Through the Pages of Anatol'. In Kappler, M. and Balta, E. (eds.). *Cries and Whispers in Karamanlidika Books: Proceedings of the First International Conference on Karamanlidika Studies (Nicosia, 11th–13th September 2008*. Turcologica 83. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag. 93–108.

Benlisoy, Stefo. 2010. 'Education in the Orthodox Community of Nevsehir during the Nineteenth Century'. Unpublished PhD Dissertation, Boğaziçi University, Istanbul.

– 2014. 'Another Newspaper in Our Language!' In Balta, E. (ed.). *Cultural Encounters in the Turkish-Speaking Communities of the Late Ottoman Empire*. Istanbul: Isis. 359–392.

– 2021. '"Aghios Kaisareias Meselesi": Dissent and Factionalism in the Late 19th Century Orthodox Community of Kayseri'. In Balta, E. (ed.). *Following the Traces of Turkish-Speaking Christians of Anatolia*. Cambridge: The Department of Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations of Harvard University. 417–448.

Bruneau, Michel. 2015. *De l'Asie Mineure à la Turquie. Minorités, homogénéisation ethno-nationale, diasporas*. Paris: CNRS.

Dawkins, Richard M. 1916. *Modern Greek in Asia Minor; a Study of the Dialects of Sílli, Cappadocia and Phárasa, with Grammar, Texts, Translations and Glossary*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.
– 1930. 'The Recent Study of Folklore in Greece'. *Papers and Transactions of the Jubilee Congress of the Folklore Society*.
Farasopoulos, Simeon. 1895. *Τα Σύλατα: Μελέτη του νομού Ικονίου υπό γεωγραφικήν, φιλολογικήν και εθνολογικήν έποψιν*. Athens: Φιλολογικην και Εθωολογικων Εποψιν.
Fosteris, D.P. 1955. 'Ιωακείμ Βαλαβάνης'. *Μικρασιατικά Χρονικά* 6. 377–380.
Hadziiossif, Christos. 2005. *Σινασός, ιστορία ενός τόπου χωρίς ιστορία*. Heraklion: Presses universitaires de Crète.
Hadziiossif, Christos. 2010. 'The Ambivalence of Turkish in a Greek-Speaking Community of Central Anatolia'. In Kappler, M. and Balta, E. (eds.). *Cries and Whispers in Karamanlidika Books: Proceedings of the First International Conference on Karamanlidika Studies (Nicosia, 11th–13th September 2008.* Turcologica, 83. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag. 23–31.
Hamilton, William J. 1842. *Researches in Asia Minor, Pontus and Armernia; with Some Account of Their Antiquities and Geology*. 2 vols., vol. 2. London: John Murray.
Hasluck, Frederick William. 1929. *Christianity and Islam under the Sultans*. 2 vols., vol. II. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
Hild, Friedrich, and Marcell Restle. 1981. *Tabula Imperii Byzantini*. Vol. 2. Kappadokien (Kappadokia, Charsianon, Sebesteia und Lykandos). Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.
Ioannidis, Ioannis. 1896. *Καισαρεία Μητροπολιτλερί βε Μααλουμάτη Μουτενεββιά*. Dersaadet: Αλέξανδρος Νομισματίδης ματπαασή.
Kalfoglou, Ioannis. 1898. *Ζιντζίντερε καργεσινδέ πουλουνάν Ιωάννης Πρόδρομος Μοναστηρή γιαχόδ Μονή Φλαβιανών*. Dersaadet: Αλέξανδρος Νομισματίδης ματπαασή.
– 1899. *Μικρα Ασια Κητασηνην Ταριχιε Δζαγραφιαση*. Deri Saadet: Αδελφοι Μισαηλιδαι Ματπαση.
– 2002. *Ιστορική Γεωγραφία Της Μικρασιατικής Χερσονήσου*. Edited and translated by Stavros Anestidis. Athens: CAMS.
Karolidis, Pavlos K. 1874. *Καππαδοκικά : Ήτοι πραγματεία ιστορική και αρχαιολογική περί Καππαδοκίας*. Constantinople: Τύποις Ευαγγελινού Μισαηλίδου.
Kechriotis, Vangelis. 2016. 'A Cappadocian in Athens, an Athenian in Smyrna, and a Parliamentarian in Istanbul: The Multiple Personae and Loyalties of Pavlos Carolidis'. In Isom-Verhaaren, Christine and Schull, Kent F. (eds.). *Living in the Ottoman Realm: Empire and Identity, 13th to 20th Centuries*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. 297–309.
Kinneir, John MacDonald. 1818. *Journey through Asia Minor, Armenia, and Koordistan in the Years 1813 and 1814*. London: Murray.
Knüppel, Michael. 1997. 'Die Karamanen Im Spiegel Europäischer Reisebeschreibungen Des 15.–19. Jahrhunderts'. *Materialia Turcica* 18. 81–132.
Kyrillos, Patriarch of Constantinople. 1815. *Ιστορική περιγραφή του εν Βιέννη προεκδοθέντος χωρογραφικού πίνακος της μεγάλης αρχισατραπίας Ικονίου*. Constantinople: Πατριαρχικό Τυπογραφείο.
Lamesa, Anaïs. 2015. 'D'une Cappadoce à l'autre (Ve av. - Xe ap.). Problèmes historiques, géographiques et archéologiques'. Unpublished PhD Dissertation, Université Paris-Sorbonne, Paris.
Levidis, Anastasios M. 1875. *Μιράτη Φεζαΐλ Βε Μεαγίπ: Γιάνι Φαζιλέτ Βε Κεμλικλερίν Αϊνεσί*. Smyrna: Proodos.
– 1880. *Γιανί Ρουχανί*. Smyrna.

– 1885. *Ιστορικόν δοκίμιον διηρημένον εις τόμους τέσσαρας και περιέχον την θρησκευτικήν και πολιτικήν ιστορίαν την χωρογραφίαν και αρχαιολογίαν της Καππαδοκίας*. Vol. Α΄ Εκκλησιαστική Ιστορία. Athens: Εκ του τυπογραφείου της μυθιστορικής βιβλιοθήκης Δ. Φέξη.
– 1899a. *Αἱ Ἐν Μονολίθοις Μοναί Τῆς Καππαδοκίας Καί Λυκαονίας*. Constantinople.
– 1899b. *Πραγματεία περί πολιτισμού και διανοητικής αναπτύξεως των Καππαδόκων και των εκ Καππαδοκίας διαλαμψάντων επισήμων ανδρών από των αρχαιοτάτων χρόνων μέχρι της σήμερον*.
– 1905a. 'Η Μητρόπολις Καισαρείας Καππαδοκίας'. *Ημερολόγιον Εθνικών Φιλανθρωπικών Καταστημάτων Εν Κωνσταντινουπόλει*. 126–55.
– 1905b. 'Συμβολαί είς την ίστορίαν του Προσηλυτισμού εν Μικρά Ασία. Περί των εν Καππαδοκία ενεργειών των προσηλυτιστικών εταιρειών'. *Ξενοφάνης: σύγγραμμα περιοδικόν του Συλλόγου των Μικρασιατών 'Ανατολής'* 3: 82–85, 114–119, 145–150, 248–255, 343–351, 403–410.

Levidis, Platon. 1935. 'Βιογραφία Αναστασίου Μ. Λεβίδου'. Athens: Center of Asia Minor Studies.

Mordtmann, Andreas David. 1861. 'Die Troglodyten von Kappadokien'. *Abhandlungen Der Bayerischen Akademie Der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-Philologische Und Historische Klasse* 2. 11–28.

Perrot, Georges. 1864. *Souvenirs d'un voyage en Asie Mineure*. Paris: M. Lévy Frères.

Petropoulou, Ioanna. 2001. 'Ιστοριογραφικές Προσεγγίσεις Του Οθωμανικού Παρελθόντος Στη Χριστιανική Ανατολή – 19ος Αιώνας. Μια Δειγματοληψία'. *Mnimon* 23. 269–95.

Ramsay, William Mitchell. 1897. *Impressions of Turkey during Twelve Years Wanderings*. London: Hodder & Stoughton.

Renieri, Irini. 1993. 'Ανδρονίκιο: Ένα Καππαδοκικό Χωριό Κατά Τον 19ο Αιώνα'. *Mnimon* 15. 9–67.

Rizos, Nikolaos Serafeim. 1856. *Καππαδοκικα, ήτοι δοκίμιον ἱστορικῆς περιγραφῆς τῆς Ἀρχαίας Καππαδοκίας, καὶ ἰδίως τῶν ἐπαρχιών Καισαρείας καὶ Ἰκονίου*. Constantinople: Εκ του τυπογραφείου Η ΑΝΑΤΟΛΗ Ευαγγελινός Μισαηλίδης.

– 2007. *Η Σινασός (1952)*. Edited by S. Anestidis. 2 vols. Athens: Center of Asia Minor Studies.

Room, Adam. 1997. *Place Names of the World*. London: MacFarland and Company.

Sapkidi, Olga. 2002a. 'Βαλαβάνης Ιωάννης'. In *Encyclopaedia of the Hellenic World*. Vol. I, Asia Minor. Athens: Foundation of the Hellenic World. URL: http://www.ehw.gr/l.aspx?id=7352 (last accessed 6 January 2025):

Sapkidi, Olga. 2002b. 'Λεβίδης Αναστάσιος'. In *Encyclopaedia of the Hellenic World*. Vol. I, Asia Minor. Athens: Foundation of the Hellenic World. URL: http://www.ehw.gr/l.aspx?id=10002 (last accessed 6 January 2025).

Sapkidi, Olga. 2002c. 'Ρίζος Νικόλαος'. In *Encyclopaedia of the Hellenic World*. Vol. I, Asia minor. Athens: Foundation of the Hellenic World. URL: http://www.ehw.gr/l.aspx?id=12541 (last accessed 6 January 2025).

Sarantidis, Archelaos, I.. 1899. *Η Σινασός ήτοι θέσις, ιστορία, ηθική και διανοητική κατάστασις, ήθη, έθιμα και γλώσσα της εν Καππαδοκία κωμοπόλεως Σινασού*. Athens.

Smyrnelis, Marie-Carmen. 1997. 'Colonies européennes et communautés ethnico-confessionnelles à Smyrne de la fin du XVIIe au milieu du XIXe siècle. Coexistence et réseaux de sociabilité'. In Georgeon, F. and Dumont, P. (eds.). *Vivre dans l'Empire ottoman. Sociabilités et relations intercommunautaires (XVIII–XXe siècles*. Paris: Harmattan. 173–94.

– 2005. *Une société hors de soi: identités et relations sociales à Smyrne au XVIIIe et XIXe siècles*. Turcica. Paris: Peeters.

Stamatopoulos, Kostas M. 1986. 'Η Καθημερινή Ζωή Στη Σινασό Της Καππαδοκίας'. In *Η Σινασός Της Καππαδοκίας*. Edited by Φ. Ποιμενίδη. Translated by E. Malçok. Athens: Άγρα. 39–91.

Sterrett, J.R. Sitlington. 1900. 'Troglodyte Dwellings in Cappadocia'. *The Century*. 677–687.

Strauss, Johann. 1995. 'The Millets and the Ottoman Language. The Contribution of Ottoman Greeks to Ottoman Letters (19th–20th Centuries)'. *Die Welt des Islams* 35.2. 189–249.

– 1998. 'Les voies de la transmission du savoir dans un milieu cosmopolite. Lettrés et savants à Istanbul au XIXe siècle'. In Sanagustin, F. (ed.). *Les Intellectuels en Orient musulman, statut et fonction*. Le Caire: IFAO. 109–119.

'Συνεδριακες ΞΒ΄ τη 15 Ιουνιου 1863'. 1863. Ο εν Κωνσταντινουπόλει Ελληνικός Φιλολογικός Σύλλογος.

'Συνεδριακες ΞΒ΄ τη 27 Ιουλιου 1863'. 1863. Ο εν Κωνσταντινουπόλει Ελληνικός Φιλολογικός Σύλλογος.

de Tapia, Aude Aylin. 2023. *Orthodox Christians and Muslims in Cappadocia: Local Interactions in an Ottoman Countryside (1839–1923)*. Leiden: Brill.

Texier, Charles. 1863. *Asie mineure: description géographique historique et archéologique des provinces et des villes de la Chersonnèse d'Asie*. Paris: Firmin Didot.

Texier, Charles and Popplewell Pullan, E. 1864. *Byzantine Architecture*. London: Day.

Thierry, Nicole. 2002. *La Cappadoce de l'Antiquité au Moyen Âge*. Turnhout: Brepols.

Valavanis, Ioakeim. 1891. *Μικρασιατικά*. Athens.

Vassiadis, George A. 2007. *The Syllogos Movement of Constantinople and Ottoman Greek Education 1861–1923*. Athens: Center of Asia Minor Studies.

Vryonis, Speros. 1971. *The Decline of Medieval Hellenism in Asia Minor and the Process of Islamization from the Eleventh Through the Fifteenth Century*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Wilson, Charles W. 1884. 'Notes on the Physical and Historical Geography of Asia Minor, Made during Journeys in 1879–1882'. *Proceedings of the Royals Geographical Society and Monthly Record of Geography* 6.6. 305–25.

Yılmaz, Simeon. 2012. 'Antakyalı Rum Ortodoksların İstanbul'daki Bugünğ ve Yarın'. In Benlisoy, F., Aslanoğlu, Anna Maria and Rigas, Raris (eds.). *İstanbul Rumları Bugün ve Yarın*. Istanbul: Istos. 223–232.