

Patrick Abel

International Investor Obligations

Towards Individual International Responsibility for the
Public Interest in International Investment Law



Nomos

Beiträge zum
ausländischen öffentlichen Recht und Völkerrecht

Edited by

the Max Planck Society
for the Advancement of Science
represented by Prof. Dr. Armin von Bogdandy
and Prof. Dr. Anne Peters

Volume 315

Patrick Abel

International Investor Obligations

Towards Individual International Responsibility for the
Public Interest in International Investment Law



Nomos

The **Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Göttingen, Georg-August-Universität, Diss., 2021

ISBN 978-3-8487-8981-8 (Print)
978-3-7489-3317-5 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8981-8 (Print)
978-3-7489-3317-5 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Abel, Patrick

International Investor Obligations

Towards Individual International Responsibility for the Public Interest
in International Investment Law

Patrick Abel

373 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8981-8 (Print)
978-3-7489-3317-5 (ePDF)

1st Edition 2022

© Patrick Abel

Published by

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG

Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

www.nomos.de

Production of the printed version:

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG

Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

ISBN 978-3-8487-8981-8 (Print)

ISBN 978-3-7489-3317-5 (ePDF)

DOI <https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748933175>



Onlineversion
Nomos eLibrary



This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Preface and Acknowledgments

International investment law represents one of the branches of international law in which individuals – natural persons and companies – play a key role both in substantive law and in dispute settlement. Many observers criticise the field to be overly investor-friendly. Do investors enjoy international rights without corresponding obligations? As I started to research the interplay of investment law and human rights in 2015, I came to realise that there is a pattern in investment law theory and practice which answers this question to the negative. In a diffuse, decentral development, investor rights and obligations increasingly go hand in hand. This book aims at comprehensively analysing how international investor obligations have incrementally begun to develop in investment law and how we may situate this finding in the broader debate about the status of individuals in international law. It is a revised version of my doctoral dissertation which I submitted to the Faculty of Law of the University of Göttingen in 2018 and which I defended in 2021. The book takes into account scholarly writing and arbitral jurisprudence until the end of 2021.

Above all, I would like to express my gratitude to *Professor Dr. Peter-Tobias Stoll* who supervised my dissertation. His support and guidance have made this book possible. I am particularly grateful for three fascinating, challenging and inspiring years of working for him as a PhD research fellow at the Institute of International and European Law between 2015 and 2018. I would also like to thank *Judge Professor Dr. Andreas Paulus* for many valuable discussions in Göttingen and Karlsruhe and for his critical and helpful comments as second examiner of my dissertation.

Professor Dr. Armin von Bogdandy and *Professor Dr. Anne Peters* accepted this book into the series of *Beiträge zum ausländischen öffentlichen Recht und Völkerrecht* of the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law in Heidelberg for which I am much obliged.

Furthermore, my thanks are due to a large group of people who contributed to my dissertation in various ways and in different places. These include firstly, *Professor Dr. Andreas von Arnould*, *Professor Dr. Christian Walter* and *Professor Dr. Fabian Wittreck* who sparked my interest in academia and especially in national and international human rights law during my studies at the University of Münster. I would also like to thank *Professor Dr. Dapo Akande*, *Professor Dr. Gregory Messenger*, *Professor Dr. Catherine*

Preface and Acknowledgments

Redgwell, Professor Dr. Dan Sarooshi and Professor Dr. Antonios Tzanakopoulos for the intriguing lectures and discussions during my studies at the University of Oxford which led me to the topic of my dissertation. Furthermore, I am much obliged to *Professor Dr. Nehal Bhuta, Professor Dr. Ernst-Ulrich Petersmann, Professor Dr. Martin Scheinin and Professor Dr. Joanne Scott* for an inspiring time as a visiting PhD researcher at the European University Institute and for taking the time for making valuable remarks on my PhD project.

Among the many colleagues, *Dr. Henner Gött* and *PD Dr. Till Patrik Holterhus* deserve particular mentioning for many discussions and the fruitful collaboration in Göttingen and plenty of other places, as well as for reading and critically commenting drafts. I would also like to thank *Dr. Carsten Bormann* and *Dr. Laura Jung* for their continuous support and *Agata Daszko* for her great help in revising the manuscript.

Moreover, my sincere gratitude is due to the German National Academic Foundation (Studienstiftung des deutschen Volkes) which awarded me a PhD scholarship for this project and to *Professor Dr. Christoph Herrmann* for generously supporting the publication of this book.

Passau, May 2022

Patrick Abel

Table of contents

List of Abbreviations	15
Chapter 1. Introduction: The Need for International Investor Obligations	17
I. Interactions between foreign investment and the public interest	17
II. The regulatory setting: Investment agreements and the right to regulate	21
1. Regulating as a function of the state	21
2. Foundations of international investment law	21
3. The right to regulate debate	24
III. The need for international investor obligations?	26
1. The discussion on the international responsibility of corporations	26
2. International investor rights without obligations?	32
3. A practical example	33
IV. Exploring investor obligations in investment law	34
Part I Direct Obligations	36
Chapter 2. Preconditions of Direct Obligations	37
I. Direct applicability	37
II. International subjectivity	39
III. Non-application of the pacta tertiis principle	42
IV. Direct obligations as the exception in international law	44
V. Investment law's asymmetry	48
1. The traditional focus on investor rights	48
2. Recent integration of CSR norms	49
VI. Interim conclusion: Few preconditions, few role-models	51

Chapter 3. Direct Obligations in Investment Law Practice	53
I. Integrating external obligations directly applicable to private actors	56
1. Concept	56
2. The Urbaser v Argentina award	58
a) Direct obligations in human rights law	59
b) Mechanics of integrating external obligations	63
c) A desire for direct obligations	65
3. The Aven v Costa Rica award	66
4. Critique	69
II. Diverting international obligations of states	70
1. Concept	71
2. IIAs and reform suggestions	71
3. Critique	75
III. Converting legally non-binding standards	77
1. Concept	77
2. IIAs and reform suggestions	78
3. Critique	81
IV. Elevating domestic investor obligations to international investor obligations	82
1. Concept	82
2. The Al-Warraq v Indonesia award	84
3. IIAs and reform suggestions	87
4. Critique	90
V. Creating direct obligations de novo	92
1. Concept	92
2. The Al-Warraq v Indonesia award	92
3. IIAs and reform suggestions	93
4. Critique	95
VI. Applying domestic obligations in investment arbitration	96
1. Concept	96
2. The Perenco v Ecuador and Burlington v Ecuador awards	98
3. Investment arbitration's internationalising effect	101
a) Joint application with international law	102
b) Interpretation by an investment tribunal	103
c) International enforcement	106
4. Critique	107
VII. A nascent doctrine of direct obligations	108
1. Emerging direct obligations from plural sources	108

2. Construction as directly applicable norms	110
a) Limitations of investor rights' scope?	110
b) Inter-state obligations?	111
(1) Obligations of the host state	111
(2) Obligations of the home state	111
3. Direct obligations owed to whom?	113
4. Investor rights as challenges for direct obligations	114
a) Human rights of the investor	115
b) MFN- and national treatment rights of the investor	116
Chapter 4. International Enforcement Through Counterclaims	119
I. The discovery of counterclaims for a new purpose	119
II. Lenient jurisdiction and admissibility requirements	122
1. Consent by the disputing parties	123
2. Jurisdiction <i>ratione personae</i>	126
a) Approaches which focus on the wording	127
b) Jurisdiction for counterclaims 'ipso-facto'	129
c) A holistic interpretive approach	130
3. Jurisdiction <i>ratione materiae</i> for public interest-related matters	133
4. Jurisdiction <i>ratione materiae</i> for domestic public law	134
5. Direct relation to the primary claim's subject matter	136
III. Counterclaims' relevance for extraterritorial enforcement	138
IV. Obstacles to primary claims by host states against foreign investors	139
1. Lacking investor consent	140
2. Indirect ways of acquiring investors' consent	141
3. Legal fictions of investor consent	141
4. Primary claims before international investment courts?	145
Chapter 5. Interim Conclusion: The Dawn of Direct Obligations	148
Part II Indirect Obligations	150
Chapter 6. Indirect Obligations as a Concept	151
I. Definition	151
II. Partially compulsory norms	152
III. Turning the public interest into a self-interest	154
IV. International character	155

Table of contents

V. Loss of procedural or substantive rights	155
VI. Norms with dual character	156
VII. Analytical potential	156
VIII. Lacking tradition	159
IX. A new doctrinal category in a developing field	162
Chapter 7. Indirect Obligations in Investment Law Practice	164
I. Arbitration's jurisdiction and admissibility requirements	164
1. Contribution to the host state's development	165
a) The Salini jurisprudence	165
b) Contribution to development as an indirect obligation	168
c) Vague content of the obligation	168
(1) The economy as a public good	169
(2) Other forms of the public interest	170
2. Compliance with host state's domestic law before admission	172
a) Compliance as a jurisdiction requirement	172
b) Compliance as an established indirect obligation	174
c) Content of the obligation	177
3. Compliance with international law	181
a) New IIA clauses with indirect obligations	181
b) Ordre public international as an indirect obligation	183
c) Fundamental rules of human rights protection as indirect obligations	187
4. Interim conclusion	189
II. Substantive requirements of investor rights	190
1. Investors' legitimate expectations	191
a) Relevant requirements of investor rights	192
b) Consideration of investor misconduct	193
c) A lacking character as an indirect obligation	195
2. Proportionality	198
a) The proportionality principle in investment law	198
b) Consideration of investor misconduct	200
c) A lacking character as an indirect obligation	201
3. Interpreting rights in the light of soft law	202
a) Soft law as interpretive standards	203
b) Consideration of investor misconduct	204
c) Soft law as a potential indirect obligation	205

4. Interpreting rights in the light of other host state obligations	207
a) Art 31 (1) and (3) (c) VCLT	207
b) Consideration of investor misconduct	210
c) Specific state obligations as indirect obligations	215
5. Compliance with host state's domestic law after admission	217
a) Compliance as a substantive requirement	218
b) Compliance as an established indirect obligation	219
c) Content of the obligation	219
6. Interim conclusion	221
III. Rules on compensation	221
1. Qualitative methodology of calculating compensation	223
a) Rules on calculation	223
b) Indirect obligations in new IIA clauses	224
c) Consideration of investor misconduct in arbitral awards	228
2. Contributory negligence	232
a) Foundations of contributory negligence	232
b) MTD v Chile and the environment	233
c) Yukos v Russia and the rule of law	236
d) Copper Mesa v Ecuador and human rights	237
e) Bear Creek v Peru and indigenous peoples	239
(1) The Tribunal's award	240
(2) Sands' Partial Dissenting Opinion	241
3. Interim conclusion	243
IV. The clean hands doctrine	244
1. The clean hands doctrine as a general principle of law	244
2. Clean hands as a suggested indirect obligation	246
3. Redundancy of the clean hands doctrine	249
Chapter 8. Interim Conclusion: Established Indirect Obligations	254
Part III Common Implications	257
Chapter 9. The Internal Perspective: Rebalancing Investment Law	258
I. One common development towards symmetry	258
II. Rebalancing investment law from within	261
1. Strengthening the public interest	262
2. Reinterpretation and new treaty designs	264
3. A changing role of investors	265

Table of contents

III. Sustainable investment law	266
1. The concept of sustainable development	267
2. The original purpose to increase investment volume	269
3. Towards attracting sustainable investment	270
IV. Interactions with host states' right to regulate	271
1. Complementary reform options	271
2. Strengthening the right to regulate	272
3. Limiting the right to regulate	274
Chapter 10. The Regulatory Perspective: Steering Investors	276
I. Considering international regulation of foreign investment	276
II. Relevant regulatory strategies	277
1. Command-and-control	278
2. Incentives	279
III. IIAs as limited command-and-control regulation	281
1. Binding international public interest standards	281
2. Reactive enforcement	282
IV. IIAs as promising incentive-based regulation	284
1. Investment protection's economic value	284
2. Investment protection as obligations' leverage	286
3. Steering investors' behaviour	287
4. Compensating for the unwilling or unable host state	288
5. Limits and potentials	289
Chapter 11. The Theoretical Perspective: Individuals in International Law	292
I. Construing international responsibility of foreign investors	292
1. The concept of international responsibility	293
2. Individual investor responsibility	295
3. Shared responsibility between states and investors	298
II. Responsibility as an aspect of Global Administrative Law	300
1. The idea of Global Administrative Law	300
2. Investor obligations as part of global administrative space	303
3. Following administrative law functions and principles	305
III. Individual responsibility as a fundamental value?	306
1. The idea of individual international law	306
2. Investor obligations as individual international law	309
3. More pragmatic, less value-oriented	310

Chapter 12. Conclusion: Towards an International Responsibility of Investors	313
I. The dawn of direct obligations (Part I)	314
II. The presence of indirect obligations (Part II)	316
III. Common implications (Part III)	318
1. Rebalancing investment law	318
2. Regulating investment based on incentives	319
3. A case study for the individual's role in international law	320
IV. Outlook	322
Table of International Treaties	325
Table of Declarations and Documents of International Organisations	331
Table of Cases	335
Bibliography	347

List of Abbreviations

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
AfrCHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
AU	African Union
BIT	Bilateral Investment Treaty
COMESA	Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa
CPTPP	Comprehensive and Progressive Agreement for Trans-Pacific Partnership
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EU	European Union
FET	Fair and Equitable Treatment
FTA	Free Trade Agreement
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICSID	International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes
IFC	International Finance Corporation
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
IIA	International Investment Agreement
IISD	International Institute for Sustainable Development
ILC	International Law Commission
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IMT	International Military Tribunal
ISDS	Investor-State Dispute Settlement
MFN	Most-Favoured-Nation

List of Abbreviations

MIGA	Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
PCA	Permanent Court of Arbitration
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
SADC	Southern African Development Community
TPP	Trans-Pacific Partnership
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNCITRAL	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
UNCommHR	United Nations Commission on Human Rights
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WTO	World Trade Organisation