

**Forgó / Kollek / Arning / Kruegel / Petersen**

**Ethical and Legal  
Requirements  
for Transnational Genetic  
Research**

**C. H. Beck · Hart · Nomos**

Forgó/Kollek/Arning/Kruegel/Petersen  
Ethical and Legal Requirements for Transnational Genetic Research



# Ethical and Legal Requirements for Transnational Genetic Research

by

Dr Nikolaus Forgó, Professor of Law,  
University of Hanover

Dr Regine Kollek, Professor for Technology Assessment,  
University of Hamburg

Dr Marian Arning, Senior Research Fellow,  
University of Hanover

Dr Tina Kruegel, Senior Research Fellow,  
University of Hanover

Dr Imme Petersen, Senior Research Fellow,  
University of Hamburg



Verlag C. H. Beck München 2010

*Published by*

Verlag C. H. Beck oHG, Wilhelmstraße 9, 80801 München, Germany,  
eMail: [bestellung@beck.de](mailto:bestellung@beck.de)

*Co-published by*

Hart Publishing, 16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OXI 2JW, United Kingdom,  
online at: [www.hartpub.co.uk](http://www.hartpub.co.uk)

Published in North America (US and Canada) by Hart Publishing, c/o International  
Specialized Book Services, 930 NE 58<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Suite 300, Portland, OR 97213-3786,  
USA, eMail: [orders@isbs.com](mailto:orders@isbs.com)

ISBN 978-3-406-61011-0 (Beck)  
ISBN 978-1-84946-128-3 (Hart Publishing)

© 2010 Verlag C. H. Beck oHG  
Wilhelmstr. 9, 80801 München

Printed in Germany by  
fgb · freiburger graphische betriebe  
Bebelstr. 11, 79108 Freiburg

Typeset by Reemers Publishing Services GmbH, Krefeld

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Verlag C. H. Beck, or as expressly permitted by law under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation.

Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to  
C. H. Beck at the address above.

# Contents

List of abbreviations .....	IX
<b>1. Introduction .....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. From clinical to clinico-genomic research: New ethical and legal challenges .....	1
1.2. The ACGT project: Developing an ICT infrastructure .....	3
1.3. Aim and structure of the book .....	4
<b>2. Ethical requirements .....</b>	<b>7</b>
2.1. Introduction .....	7
2.2. Informed consent .....	8
2.2.1. Ethical foundations of the doctrine of informed consent .....	8
2.2.1.1. Historical background .....	9
2.2.1.2. General aspects .....	10
2.2.1.3. Informed consent in tissue-based research .....	10
2.2.2. The scope of consent .....	12
2.2.2.1. Models of consent .....	12
2.2.2.1.1. Specified consent .....	13
2.2.2.1.2. Broad or blanket consent for future research .....	14
2.2.2.1.3. Tiered consent models .....	17
2.2.2.1.4. Patients' and donors' perspectives .....	18
2.2.2.1.5. Particularities of consent to research involving children .....	21
2.2.2.2. Informed consent and communication .....	25
2.2.2.2.1. The character of information .....	27
2.2.2.3. Issues to be consented to .....	29
2.2.2.3.1. General requirements .....	30
2.2.2.3.2. Sharing data and information .....	30
2.2.2.3.3. Re-contact .....	31
2.2.2.3.4. Commercial interests .....	31
2.2.2.3.5. The timeframe of consent .....	32
2.2.2.4. The right to withdraw consent .....	32
2.3. The right to know, the duty to inform, and the quality of feedback .....	33
2.3.1. Access to personal information: a donor driven inquiry process .....	34
2.3.2. Feedback of research results: an investigator driven disclosure process .....	35
2.3.2.1. Informing about general research results .....	36
2.3.2.1.1. Ethical foundations .....	36
2.3.2.1.2. Practical challenges of feedback processes regarding general research results .....	37
2.3.2.2. Information about individually relevant research results .....	38
2.3.2.2.1. Ethical foundations .....	39
2.3.2.2.2. What to feed back? .....	40
2.3.2.2.3. Characteristics of genetic research results in the context of cancer trials .....	44
2.3.2.2.4. To whom to feed back? .....	47
2.3.2.2.5. Practical challenges of feedback processes regarding individual research results .....	50
2.4. Summary of consolidated ethical requirements .....	55
2.4.1. Ethical requirements .....	56
2.4.1.1. Summary: The informed consent process .....	56

## Contents

2.4.1.2. Conclusions: How to design the informed consent process .....	58
2.4.1.3. Summary: Donor driven inquiry processes and investigator driven individual feedback processes .....	60
2.4.1.4. Conclusion: How to organize donor driven inquiry processes and investigator driven individual feedback processes .....	63
2.5. Outlook: Ethical challenges in the european context .....	64
2.5.1.1. Revision of data protection and information flows .....	64
2.5.1.2. Community interests .....	65
<b>3. Legal requirements .....</b>	<b>67</b>
3.1. Introduction .....	67
3.2. Theoretical analysis .....	67
3.2.1. European Data Protection Directive 95/46/EC .....	67
3.2.1.1. Genesis .....	67
3.2.1.2. Scope of the Directive .....	68
3.2.1.2.1. Personal data .....	68
3.2.1.2.1.1. Anonymous data .....	69
3.2.1.2.1.2. Pseudonymous data .....	70
3.2.1.2.2. Territorial application .....	70
3.2.1.3. Fair and lawful data processing .....	70
3.2.1.3.1. General .....	70
3.2.1.3.1.1. Requirement of a legal basis .....	70
3.2.1.3.1.2. Technical and organisational measures .....	71
3.2.1.3.2. Sensitive data .....	72
3.2.1.3.2.1. Definition .....	72
3.2.1.3.2.2. Prohibition of data processing .....	73
3.2.1.3.2.3. Exceptions .....	73
3.2.1.4. Duties of the data controller .....	74
3.2.1.5. Rights of the data subject .....	75
3.2.1.5.1. Information duties regarding data collection from the data subject .	75
3.2.1.5.2. Information duties regarding data which has not been obtained from the data subject .....	76
3.2.1.5.3. Right of access .....	77
3.2.1.5.4. Right to rectification, erasure or blocking .....	78
3.2.1.5.5. Exemptions and restrictions .....	79
3.2.1.5.6. Right to object .....	79
3.2.1.6. Transfer of personal data to third countries .....	80
3.3. Data protection within a trans-european research project – using the example of ACGT ...	82
3.3.1. Data flows .....	82
3.3.2. Legitimate processing of genetic data (Directive 95/46 EC) .....	84
3.3.2.1. Genetic data .....	84
3.3.2.1.1. Special characteristics of genetic data with regard to data protection	85
3.3.2.1.2. Anonymisation of genetic data .....	90
3.3.2.2. Relevance of the character of data processing for the distinction between personal data and anonymous data .....	95
3.4. Data protection framework within genetic research networks .....	101
3.4.1. Anonymisation of genetic data within research networks .....	102
3.4.2. Necessary legal agreements, contracts and informed consents .....	103
3.4.2.1. Contract between the Data Protection Authority and the data exporter (e.g. a hospital) .....	105
3.4.2.1.1. Guarantee of a “state-of- the-art” pseudonymisation .....	105
3.4.2.1.2. Technically and organisationally separated project database .....	105
3.4.2.2. Contract between Data Protection Authority and end users .....	106
3.4.2.2.1. Data controllers within genetic research networks .....	106

## Contents

3.4.2.2.2. Data Protection Authority as central Data Protection Authority within the research network .....	108
3.4.2.2.3. Ensuring the context of anonymity .....	110
3.4.2.2.4. Separated database .....	111
3.4.2.2.5. No matching .....	111
3.4.2.3. Second pillar and first fallback scenario: Informed Consent .....	112
3.4.2.3.1. Regulatory framework .....	113
3.4.2.3.1.1. Definition .....	113
3.4.2.3.1.2. Declaration of intention .....	113
3.4.2.3.1.3. Freely given .....	113
3.4.2.3.1.4. For a specific case .....	113
3.4.2.3.1.5. Informed indication .....	114
3.4.2.3.2. Scope of the consent .....	114
3.4.2.3.2.1. Object of the consent/purpose specification/future research .....	114
3.4.2.3.2.2. Expected period of usage/temporal scope of the consent .....	115
3.4.2.3.2.3. Death of the patient .....	116
3.4.2.3.2.4. Data transfer to third parties/third countries .....	117
3.4.2.3.3. Consent of relatives needed? .....	117
3.4.2.3.3.1. Additional information of relatives is collected .....	117
3.4.2.3.3.2. No additional information of relatives is collected .....	118
3.4.2.3.4. Consent of the minor data subject or person with intellectual disabilities needed? .....	118
3.4.2.3.5. The right to withdraw and right to erasure .....	119
3.4.2.4. The right to know and the duty of notification .....	120
3.4.2.5. Third Pillar and second fallback scenario: Exceptions for genetic research in national legislations .....	122
4. Legal conclusion .....	125
5. References .....	127
6. Appendix 1– legal terminology .....	137
7. Appendix 2 – relevant regulation .....	141



## List of abbreviations

AAP .....	American Academy of Paediatrics (USA)
ACGT .....	Advancing Clinico-Genomic Trials on Cancer
Art .....	Article
ASCO .....	American Society of Clinical Oncology (USA)
AuthN .....	Authentication
AuthZ .....	Authorization
BDSG .....	(Deutsches) Bundesdatenschutzgesetz (Federal Data Protection Act of Germany)
BMB .....	(Deutsches) Bundesministerium für Bildung (German Ministry for Education)
BRCA1/BRCA2 .....	Breast Cancer 1/Breast Cancer 2
BVerfG .....	(Deutsches) Bundesverfassungsgericht (German Federal Constitutional Court)
CAT .....	De facto anonymisation tool
CDP .....	Centre for Data Protection
cf. ....	confer/compare
CIOMS .....	Council for International Organisations of Medical Sciences (international)
CoE .....	Council of Europe
CR .....	Computer und Recht (German Law Journal: Computer and Law)
DHHS .....	Department of Health and Human Services (USA)
Dir .....	Directive
DNA .....	Deoxyribonucleic Acid
DPA .....	Data Protection Authority
DSG .....	(Österreichisches) Datenschutzgesetz (Austrian Federal Act Concerning the Protection of Personal Data)
DuD .....	Datenschutz und Datensicherheit (German Law Journal: Data Protection and Data Security)
EC .....	European Community
ECJ .....	European Court of Justice
ed(s) .....	editor(s)
EEA .....	European Economic Area
e.g. ....	exempli gratia/for example
EPOF .....	European Privacy Officers Forum
EU .....	European Union
ff. ....	following pages
GCCR .....	German Childhood Cancer Registry
GEMSS .....	Grid-Enabled Medical Simulation Services
GMC .....	General Medical Council (UK)
HIV .....	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
HUGO .....	Human Genome Organization (international)
ibid. ....	ibidem
IC .....	Informed Consent

## *List of abbreviations*

ICT .....	Information and Communication Technology
IT .....	Information Technology
lit. ....	litera/letter
MMR .....	Multimedia und Recht (German Law Journal: Multimedia and Law)
MPG .....	(Österreichisches) Medizinproduktegesetz (Austrian Medical Drugs Act)
MRC .....	Medical Research Council (UK)
MRI .....	Magnetic Resonance Tomography
MS .....	Member States of the European Union
NBAC .....	National Bioethics Advisory Commission (USA)
no. ....	number
OECD .....	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
p./pp. ....	page/pages
para. ....	paragraph
PET .....	Positron Emission Tomography
RdM .....	Recht der Medizin (Austrian Law Journal: Medical Law)
SOA .....	Service Oriented Architecture
StGB .....	(Deutsches) Strafgesetzbuch (German Criminal Code)
TTP .....	Trusted Third Party
UNESCO .....	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (international)
WHO .....	World Health Organization (international)
WMA .....	World Medical Association (international)
WS .....	Web Services