

Forgó / Kollek / Arning / Kruegel / Petersen

**Ethical and Legal
Requirements
for Transnational Genetic
Research**

C. H. Beck · Hart · Nomos

Forgó/Kollek/Arning/Kruegel/Petersen
Ethical and Legal Requirements for Transnational Genetic Research

Ethical and Legal Requirements for Transnational Genetic Research

by

**Dr Nikolaus Forgó, Professor of Law,
University of Hanover**

**Dr Regine Kollek, Professor for Technology Assessment,
University of Hamburg**

**Dr Marian Arning, Senior Research Fellow,
University of Hanover**

**Dr Tina Kruegel, Senior Research Fellow,
University of Hanover**

**Dr Imme Petersen, Senior Research Fellow,
University of Hamburg**



Verlag C. H. Beck München 2010

Published by

Verlag C. H. Beck oHG, Wilhelmstraße 9, 80801 München, Germany,
eMail: bestellung@beck.de

Co-published by

Hart Publishing, 16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW, United Kingdom,
online at: www.hartpub.co.uk

Published in North America (US and Canada) by Hart Publishing, c/o International
Specialized Book Services, 930 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300, Portland, OR 97213-3786,
USA, eMail: orders@isbs.com

ISBN 978-3-406-61011-0 (Beck)
ISBN 978-1-84946-128-3 (Hart Publishing)

© 2010 Verlag C. H. Beck oHG
Wilhelmstr. 9, 80801 München

Printed in Germany by
fgb · freiburger graphische betriebe
Bebelstr. 11, 79108 Freiburg

Typeset by Reemers Publishing Services GmbH, Krefeld

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Verlag C. H. Beck, or as expressly permitted by law under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation.

Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to
C. H. Beck at the address above.

Contents

List of abbreviations	IX
1. Introduction	1
1.1. From clinical to clinico-genomic research: New ethical and legal challenges	1
1.2. The ACGT project: Developing an ICT infrastructure	3
1.3. Aim and structure of the book	4
2. Ethical requirements	7
2.1. Introduction	7
2.2. Informed consent	8
2.2.1. Ethical foundations of the doctrine of informed consent	8
2.2.1.1. Historical background	9
2.2.1.2. General aspects	10
2.2.1.3. Informed consent in tissue-based research	10
2.2.2. The scope of consent	12
2.2.2.1. Models of consent	12
2.2.2.1.1. Specified consent	13
2.2.2.1.2. Broad or blanket consent for future research	14
2.2.2.1.3. Tiered consent models	17
2.2.2.1.4. Patients' and donors' perspectives	18
2.2.2.1.5. Particularities of consent to research involving children	21
2.2.2.2. Informed consent and communication	25
2.2.2.2.1. The character of information	27
2.2.2.3. Issues to be consented to	29
2.2.2.3.1. General requirements	30
2.2.2.3.2. Sharing data and information	30
2.2.2.3.3. Re-contact	31
2.2.2.3.4. Commercial interests	31
2.2.2.3.5. The timeframe of consent	32
2.2.2.4. The right to withdraw consent	32
2.3. The right to know, the duty to inform, and the quality of feedback	33
2.3.1. Access to personal information: a donor driven inquiry process	34
2.3.2. Feedback of research results: an investigator driven disclosure process	35
2.3.2.1. Informing about general research results	36
2.3.2.1.1. Ethical foundations	36
2.3.2.1.2. Practical challenges of feedback processes regarding general research results	37
2.3.2.2. Information about individually relevant research results	38
2.3.2.2.1. Ethical foundations	39
2.3.2.2.2. What to feed back?	40
2.3.2.2.3. Characteristics of genetic research results in the context of cancer trials	44
2.3.2.2.4. To whom to feed back?	47
2.3.2.2.5. Practical challenges of feedback processes regarding individual research results	50
2.4. Summary of consolidated ethical requirements	55
2.4.1. Ethical requirements	56
2.4.1.1. Summary: The informed consent process	56

Contents

2.4.1.2. Conclusions: How to design the informed consent process	58
2.4.1.3. Summary: Donor driven inquiry processes and investigator driven individual feedback processes	60
2.4.1.4. Conclusion: How to organize donor driven inquiry processes and investigator driven individual feedback processes	63
2.5. Outlook: Ethical challenges in the european context	64
2.5.1.1. Revision of data protection and information flows	64
2.5.1.2. Community interests	65
3. Legal requirements	67
3.1. Introduction	67
3.2. Theoretical analysis	67
3.2.1. European Data Protection Directive 95/46/EC	67
3.2.1.1. Genesis	67
3.2.1.2. Scope of the Directive	68
3.2.1.2.1. Personal data	68
3.2.1.2.1.1. Anonymous data	69
3.2.1.2.1.2. Pseudonymous data	70
3.2.1.2.2. Territorial application	70
3.2.1.3. Fair and lawful data processing	70
3.2.1.3.1. General	70
3.2.1.3.1.1. Requirement of a legal basis	70
3.2.1.3.1.2. Technical and organisational measures	71
3.2.1.3.2. Sensitive data	72
3.2.1.3.2.1. Definition	72
3.2.1.3.2.2. Prohibition of data processing	73
3.2.1.3.2.3. Exceptions	73
3.2.1.4. Duties of the data controller	74
3.2.1.5. Rights of the data subject	75
3.2.1.5.1. Information duties regarding data collection from the data subject .	75
3.2.1.5.2. Information duties regarding data which has not been obtained from the data subject	76
3.2.1.5.3. Right of access	77
3.2.1.5.4. Right to rectification, erasure or blocking	78
3.2.1.5.5. Exemptions and restrictions	79
3.2.1.5.6. Right to object	79
3.2.1.6. Transfer of personal data to third countries	80
3.3. Data protection within a trans-european research project – using the example of ACGT ...	82
3.3.1. Data flows	82
3.3.2. Legitimate processing of genetic data (Directive 95/46 EC)	84
3.3.2.1. Genetic data	84
3.3.2.1.1. Special characteristics of genetic data with regard to data protection	85
3.3.2.1.2. Anonymisation of genetic data	90
3.3.2.2. Relevance of the character of data processing for the distinction between personal data and anonymous data	95
3.4. Data protection framework within genetic research networks	101
3.4.1. Anonymisation of genetic data within research networks	102
3.4.2. Necessary legal agreements, contracts and informed consents	103
3.4.2.1. Contract between the Data Protection Authority and the data exporter (e.g. a hospital)	105
3.4.2.1.1. Guarantee of a “state-of- the-art” pseudonymisation	105
3.4.2.1.2. Technically and organisationally separated project database	105
3.4.2.2. Contract between Data Protection Authority and end users	106
3.4.2.2.1. Data controllers within genetic research networks	106

Contents

3.4.2.2.2. Data Protection Authority as central Data Protection Authority within the research network	108
3.4.2.2.3. Ensuring the context of anonymity	110
3.4.2.2.4. Separated database	111
3.4.2.2.5. No matching	111
3.4.2.3. Second pillar and first fallback scenario: Informed Consent	112
3.4.2.3.1. Regulatory framework	113
3.4.2.3.1.1. Definition	113
3.4.2.3.1.2. Declaration of intention	113
3.4.2.3.1.3. Freely given	113
3.4.2.3.1.4. For a specific case	113
3.4.2.3.1.5. Informed indication	114
3.4.2.3.2. Scope of the consent	114
3.4.2.3.2.1. Object of the consent/purpose specification/future research	114
3.4.2.3.2.2. Expected period of usage/temporal scope of the consent	115
3.4.2.3.2.3. Death of the patient	116
3.4.2.3.2.4. Data transfer to third parties/third countries	117
3.4.2.3.3. Consent of relatives needed?	117
3.4.2.3.3.1. Additional information of relatives is collected	117
3.4.2.3.3.2. No additional information of relatives is collected	118
3.4.2.3.4. Consent of the minor data subject or person with intellectual disabilities needed?	118
3.4.2.3.5. The right to withdraw and right to erasure	119
3.4.2.4. The right to know and the duty of notification	120
3.4.2.5. Third Pillar and second fallback scenario: Exceptions for genetic research in national legislations	122
 4. Legal conclusion	 125
5. References	127
6. Appendix 1– legal terminology	137
7. Appendix 2 – relevant regulation	141

List of abbreviations

AAP	American Academy of Paediatrics (USA)
ACGT	Advancing Clinico-Genomic Trials on Cancer
Art	Article
ASCO	American Society of Clinical Oncology (USA)
AuthN	Authentication
AuthZ	Authorization
BDSG	(Deutsches) Bundesdatenschutzgesetz (Federal Data Protection Act of Germany)
BMB	(Deutsches) Bundesministerium für Bildung (German Ministry for Education)
BRCA1/BRCA2	Breast Cancer 1/Breast Cancer 2
BVerfG	(Deutsches) Bundesverfassungsgericht (German Federal Constitutional Court)
CAT	De facto anonymisation tool
CDP	Centre for Data Protection
cf.	confer/compare
CIOMS	Council for International Organisations of Medical Sciences (international)
CoE	Council of Europe
CR	Computer und Recht (German Law Journal: Computer and Law)
DHHS	Department of Health and Human Services (USA)
Dir	Directive
DNA	Deoxyribonucleic Acid
DPA	Data Protection Authority
DSG	(Österreichisches) Datenschutzgesetz (Austrian Federal Act Concerning the Protection of Personal Data)
DuD	Datenschutz und Datensicherheit (German Law Journal: Data Protection and Data Security)
EC	European Community
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ed(s)	editor(s)
EEA	European Economic Area
e.g.	exempli gratia/for example
EPOF	European Privacy Officers Forum
EU	European Union
ff.	following pages
GCCR	German Childhood Cancer Registry
GEMSS	Grid-Enabled Medical Simulation Services
GMC	General Medical Council (UK)
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
HUGO	Human Genome Organization (international)
ibid.	ibidem
IC	Informed Consent

List of abbreviations

ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IT	Information Technology
lit.	litera/letter
MMR	Multimedia und Recht (German Law Journal: Multimedia and Law)
MPG	(Österreichisches) Medizinproduktegesetz (Austrian Medical Drugs Act)
MRC	Medical Research Council (UK)
MRI	Magnetic Resonance Tomography
MS	Member States of the European Union
NBAC	National Bioethics Advisory Commission (USA)
no.	number
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
p./pp.	page/pages
para.	paragraph
PET	Positron Emission Tomography
RdM	Recht der Medizin (Austrian Law Journal: Medical Law)
SOA	Service Oriented Architecture
StGB	(Deutsches) Strafgesetzbuch (German Criminal Code)
TTP	Trusted Third Party
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (international)
WHO	World Health Organization (international)
WMA	World Medical Association (international)
WS	Web Services