

Lucas Sánchez de Miquel

# Legislative Remedies before Human Rights Courts

A comparative analysis



Nomos



Beiträge zum  
ausländischen öffentlichen Recht und Völkerrecht

Edited by

the Max Planck Society  
for the Advancement of Science  
represented by Prof. Dr. Armin von Bogdandy  
and Prof. Dr. Anne Peters

Volume 345

Lucas Sánchez de Miquel

# Legislative Remedies before Human Rights Courts

A comparative analysis



**Nomos**

Open Access funding provided by Max Planck Society.

**The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Berlin, FU, Diss., 2023

Source title: Legislative Remedies in Human Rights Adjudication

1st Edition 2025

© Die Autor:innen

Published by  
Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG  
Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden  
[www.nomos.de](http://www.nomos.de)

Production of the printed version:  
Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG  
Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

ISBN (Print): 978-3-7560-2322-6

ISBN (ePDF): 978-3-7489-4971-8

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748949718>



Online Version  
Nomos eLibrary



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

*A mis padres*



## Acknowledgements

The present book is based on my doctoral thesis, defended at the Faculty of Law of the Freie Universität Berlin in November 2023. I am deeply indebted to my supervisor, Prof. Dr. Anne Peters, for her invaluable support, trust and encouragement. I would also like to thank my second supervisor, Prof. Dr. Helmut Aust, for his feedback and advice.

Special thanks also to my former colleagues at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law in Heidelberg for the constructive conversations and feedback on the thesis, particularly in the context of the ‘Tuesday meetings’ of Prof. Peters’ team and the ‘Coloquio Iberoamericano’ organised by Dr. Mariela Morales. In this context, thanks also to the other doctoral candidates of the Institute for the more informal part of our time there, it was a pleasure sharing this journey with you.

This book also benefitted from research stays at the Inter-American Court of Human Rights and at the Department for the Execution of Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights, for which I also want to express my gratitude to these two institutions. At the institutional level, I also want to thank the Max Planck Society for funding my position as a Research Fellow at the Max Planck Institute and for enabling this Open Access publication. Finally, thanks to Mario Petoshati for his excellent work proof-reading and editing this book.

Para acabar, quiero dar gracias por encima de todo a mis padres, mi hermano y el resto de mi familia por su apoyo constante a lo largo de tantos años, a mis amigos por estar siempre allí a pesar de la distancia, y a Julia por acompañarme y aguantarme durante todo este trayecto.

Lucas Sánchez de Miquel

Berlin, December 2024



# Inhaltsverzeichnis

List of Abbreviations	17
Introduction	21
I. Conceptual Clarifications	25
1. “Legislative ...”	25
2. “... Remedies ...”	26
3. “...before Human Rights Courts”	28
II. Methodological Clarifications	30
1. <i>Identifying Legislative Measures: the Special Case of Legislative Remedies before the ECtHR</i>	31
2. <i>Comparing the Three Regional Human Rights Courts</i>	35
III. Structure and Overview	36
Chapter 1: The Concept of Legislative Remedies	39
I. Obligations to Legislate under Human Rights Treaties	40
1. General Obligations to Legislate	41
2. Specific Obligations to Legislate	45
a) <i>Obligations to legislate in order to protect specific rights</i>	45
b) <i>Obligations to legislate in order to protect specific groups</i>	46
c) <i>Obligations to legislate in order to prevent and punish specific acts</i>	47
d) <i>Obligations to modify or repeal domestic laws</i>	49
3. Implicit Obligations to Legislate	50
4. From Obligations to Legislate to Legislative Remedies: Is There a Victims’ Right to Legislative Reforms?	52
II. The Review of Legislation by Human Rights Courts	54
1. The Competence to Request a Review of Legislation before Human Rights Courts	56
a) <i>The ‘victim requirement’ before human rights courts</i>	57
b) <i>Exceptions to the victim requirement</i>	58
i. Potential and possible victims before the ECtHR	60
ii. Self-executing laws before the IACtHR	62

iii. The absence of a victim requirement before the ACtHPR	64
2. The Advisory Review of Legislation	69
3. From the Review of Legislation to Legislative Remedies	75
III. Legislative Remedies and the Constitutionalisation of Human Rights Law	77
1. Regional Human Rights Courts as International ‘Constitutional’ Courts?	80
a) Diverging constitutional elements of regional human rights courts	82
b) Individual vs. constitutional justice before human rights courts	85
2. Legislative Remedies as a Sign of Increased Constitutionalisation	88
3. The Differences between Legislative Remedies in Constitutional and International Settings	90
a) The effects on the domestic legal order	90
b) The predominantly positive nature of legislative remedies before human rights courts	92
c) The moment of the legislative process for issuing remedies	93
4. Legislative Remedies and the Sovereignty of States	94
a) The increased intrusiveness of legislative remedies	95
b) The legitimacy of legislative remedies	96
c) Legislative remedies and the efficiency of human rights courts	99
Interim Conclusion: Domestic Laws in Three Stages of Human Rights Adjudication	100
Chapter 2: Legislative Remedies and General International Adjudication	103
I. The Remedial Practice of the International Court of Justice	105
1. The Legal Basis for the ICJ’s Remedial Competence	107
2. The Precedent at the PCIJ: <i>Factory at Chorzów</i>	108
II. A Categorisation of Remedies in General International Law	109
1. Cessation	112
a) Cessation in the ICJ’s case law	113

b) Legislative reforms as cessation	115
2. Restitution	117
a) Restitution in the ICJ's case law	117
b) Legislative reforms as restitution	120
3. Compensation	121
a) Compensation in the ICJ's case law	122
b) Legislative reforms as compensation	124
4. Satisfaction	125
a) Satisfaction in the ICJ's case law	126
b) Legislative reforms as satisfaction	127
5. Guarantees of Non-Repetition	128
a) Guarantees of non-repetition in the ICJ's case law	128
b) Legislative reforms as guarantees of non-repetition	131
Interim Conclusion: The Particular Functions of Remedies in General International Adjudication as a Barrier for Legislative Measures	132
Chapter 3: The Special Nature of Remedies in International Human Rights Adjudication	137
I. A Remedial <i>Lex Specialis</i> in International Human Rights Law?	137
1. The ARSIWA <i>vis-à-vis</i> the UN Basic Principles	139
2. The Special Function of Remedies in International Human Rights Adjudication	143
3. The Regulation of the Human Rights Courts' Remedial Competence	146
a) The ECHR's limited remedial provision	147
b) The ACHR's expansive remedial provision	150
c) The ACHPR's concise yet wide remedial provision	152
4. The Specialty of Remedies According to Human Rights Courts	153
Interim Conclusion: The Progressive Specialisation of Remedies before Human Rights Courts	155
II. The Remedial Practice of Human Rights Courts	155
1. The Evolution of the Human Rights Courts' Remedial Practice	156
a) The evolution of the ECtHR's remedial practice	157
b) The evolution of the IACtHR's remedial practice	162

c) The evolution of the ACtHPR's remedial practice	165
2. The Current Remedial Landscape before Human Rights Courts	166
a) The remedial landscape before the European Court of Human Rights	167
b) The remedial landscape before the Inter-American Court of Human Rights	169
c) The remedial landscape before the African Court of Human and Peoples' Rights	170
3. A Classification of Remedies before Human Rights Courts	171
a) Restitution	172
b) Compensation	175
c) Satisfaction	176
d) Rehabilitation	178
e) Guarantees of Non-Repitition	178
III. Legislative Remedies in the Case Law of Human Rights Courts	180
1. The Special Case of Legislative Remedies before the ECtHR	183
2. Human Rights Courts: Positive or Negative Legislators?	190
3. Legislative Remedies as Guarantees of Non-Repitition?	192
Interim Conclusion: The Self-Understanding of International Courts in Light of their Remedial Practice	195
Chapter 4: A Categorisation of Legislative Remedies	199
I. Common Categories of Legislative Remedies	200
1. The Protection of Vulnerable Groups	201
a) Indigenous communities	205
b) Children	206
c) Prisoners	208
d) Women	211
e) Persons with disabilities	213
2. The Right to a Fair Trial	214
a) The right to an independent and impartial tribunal established by law	215
i) The independence of judges and prosecutors	216
ii) Restrictions to the military jurisdiction	218
b) The right to be judged within a reasonable time	220
c) The right to appeal before a higher court	222

d) The enforcement of domestic judgments	224
e) Other due process rights	226
3. Property Rights	227
a) Property rights in the context of transitions to democracy	229
b) Property rights in the context of state succession	231
c) Property rights in post-conflict situations	233
d) Property rights of indigenous communities	234
4. Electoral Rights	235
a) The incompatibility of electoral laws before the ACtHPR	236
b) Prisoners' voting rights before the ECtHR	238
c) Political participation and the rights of elected officials before the IACtHR	239
5. Nationality Rights	240
a) Statelessness in the context of state succession	241
b) Deprivation of citizenship in the context of migration	242
6. Freedom of Expression	243
a) The offences of libel, slander and defamation	244
b) The regulation of public access to information	245
c) Other freedom of expression-related issues	246
7. Amnesty Laws	247
8. Mandatory Death Penalty	251
9. Constitutional Issues	253
10. Codification of Criminal Offences	256
11. Others	257
II. Different Intensities in the Use of Legislative Remedies	258
Interim Conclusion: A Common Understanding with Different Priorities	262
Chapter 5: Remedial Deference and Domestic Legislatures	265
I. Deference and Human Rights Remedies	266
1. An Increased Remedial Deference for Legislators	268
a) Judicial review of legislation and parliamentary sovereignty	269
b) The additional complexity of the international judicial review of legislation	272
2. Deference and Democratic Conditions	273
3. A 'Margin of Deliberation'	276

II. The Human Rights Courts' Deference Mechanisms <i>vis-a-vis</i> the Legislatures	278
1. The ECtHR's Margin of Appreciation Doctrine <i>vis-à-vis</i> the Legislature	279
2. The IACtHR's Conventionality Control Doctrine <i>vis-à-vis</i> the Legislature	282
III. The Specificity of Legislative Remedies	285
1. The Varying Nature of Legislative Measures	288
a) Negative legislative remedies and the specification of a provision	288
b) Positive legislative remedies and the specification of an outcome	290
c) Neutral legislative remedies and the attached discretion	292
2. The Human Rights Courts' Approaches to Remedial Specificity	294
a) The European approach: prescribing the introduction of a domestic remedy	295
b) The Inter-American approach: referrals to the reasoning	298
c) The African approach: prioritising legislative incompatibilities	300
Interim Conclusion: A Margin of Deliberation for Legislative Remedies	302
Chapter 6: The Consequences of Legislative Remedies	305
I. Legislative Remedies and Backlash Against Human Rights Courts	306
1. Legislative Remedies and Individual Instances of Backlash	310
a) Resisting the ECtHR	310
b) Limiting access to the ACtHPR	313
c) Exiting the ACHR	318
2. Legislative Remedies and Collective Instances of Backlash	322
a) The 'Interlaken Process' in Europe	323
b) The 'Five Presidents Declaration' in the Americas	326
II. Legislative Remedies and Compliance	328
1. Empirical Studies on Compliance with Legislative Remedies	329

2. The Reasons for the Low Rates of Compliance with Legislative Remedies	334
3. Impact beyond Compliance	336
III. The Reaction of Human Rights Courts	345
1. Changes in the Use of Legislative Remedies	346
2. Lowering of Compliance Requirements	348
Interim Conclusion: System-Dependent Consequences of Legislative Remedies	350
Concluding Remarks	355
I. Main Findings	355
II. Normative Assessment	359
Bibliography	367
List of Sources	397



## List of Abbreviations

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACmHPR	African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACtHPR	African Court of Human and Peoples' Rights
ACDEG	African Charter on Democracy, Elections and Governance
AHRLJ	African Human Rights Law Journal
AJICL	African Journal of International and Comparative Law
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
AJJ	American Journal of Jurisprudence
App.	Application
Art.	Article
Arts.	Articles
ARSIWA	Draft Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts
AU	African Union
AUILR	American University International Law Review
CAT	UN Convention Against Torture
CDDH	Steering Committee for Human Rights
CED	UN Committee on Enforced Disappearances
CEDAW	UN Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women
CERD	UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CESCR	UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CJTL	Columbia Journal of Transnational Law
CLR	Columbia Law Review
CoE	Council of Europe
CoM	Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe
CRC	UN Convention on the Rights of the Child
CUP	Cambridge University Press

## *List of Abbreviations*

DR	Dominican Republic
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
E.g.	Exempli gratia
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECHRLR	European Convention on Human Rights Law Review
ECmHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECTHR	European Court of Human Rights
Ed.	editor
Eds.	editors
EHRLR	European Human Rights Law Review
Et al.	et alii
Et seq.	et sequens
EU	European Union
GLJ	German Law Journal
HLR	Harvard Law Review
HRCee	UN Human Rights Committee
HRLR	Human Rights Law Review
IACmHR	Inter-American Commission of Human Rights
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
I.e.	Id est
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICLQ	International and Comparative Law Quarterly
ICMW	International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families
I•CON	International Journal of Constitutional Law
ICPED	International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
ILC	International Law Commission
IJHR	International Journal of Human Rights

IJLC	International Journal of Law in Context
ISQ	International Studies Quarterly
IVF	In Vitro Fertilisation
JHRP	Journal of Human Rights Practice
JICJ	Journal of International Criminal Justice
JIDS	Journal of International Dispute Settlement
JIRD	Journal of International Relations and Development
JSAP	Journal of Small Animal Practice
JTD	Journal of Trauma and Dissociation
LCP	Law and Contemporary Problems
LGBTI	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transsexual and Intersexual
LJIL	Leiden Journal of International Law
LPICT	The Law and Practice of International Courts and Tribunals
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MPEIPro	Max Planck Encyclopedia of International Procedural Law
MPEPIL	Max Planck Encyclopedia of Public International Law
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NHRI	National Human Rights Institution
NJHR	Nordic Journal of Human Rights
NILR	Netherlands International Law Review
No.	Number
Nos.	Numbers
NQHR	Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights
OAS	Organisation of American States
OAU	Organisation of African Unity
OJLS	Oxford Journal of Legal Studies
OUP	Oxford University Press
p.	page
pp.	pages
PACE	Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe
PALU	Pan African Lawyers Union
Para.	paragraph
Paras.	paragraphs

## *List of Abbreviations*

PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
SFRY	Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
TFF	Turkish Football Federation
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
US	United States
USD	United States Dollar
VCCR	Vienna Convention on Consular Relations
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
Vol.	volume
Vs.	versus
WILJ	Wisconsin International Law Journal
YJIL	Yale Journal of International Law
YLJ	Yale Law Journal
ZaöRV	Zeitschrift für ausländisches öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht