

CHAPTER 2 – RECOLLECTIONS IN JOANA DE JESUS: MEMORY, OBSERVANCE, AND REFUGE

In order to understand anxiousness in Joana de Jesus, it is necessary to analyze how the author appropriates the mystical tradition to which she belongs: the *recollection* mysticism. Just like with anxiousness, Joana uses this notion quite often. Equivalent to the Spanish notion of ‘recogimiento’, this word derives from the Latin prefix ‘re’ (backwards) and ‘colligo’ (to collect, to move).¹ It can be translated into English as both *withdrawal* and *recollection*. Both terms are interchangeably used in the jargon of Christian mystical tradition. However, when referring to the Spanish (and Iberian) authors, most scholars and translators prefer the Latin equivalent. Together with a singular stylistic and scholarly choice, these scholars are also showing the closer connection to its etymological roots as well as preserving its popular usage in seventeenth-century English language.

In Joana’s text, the word ‘recolhimento’ appears 61 times as an abstract noun and 74 times as a verbal form: in the first person ‘recolhi-me’ (‘I recollected myself’) or in the adjective participle ‘recolhida’ (‘she is recollected’). The subject is either the ‘I’ or, less often the ‘potencies of the soul’; in either case, the verb is reflexive, indicating the movement of the subject preparing itself for an encounter with the incarnated God. The anticipation of divine encounters involves intellectual and affective activity, a true agency of loving anxiousness. Nonetheless, ‘the recollection’ or ‘the Recollect’ is also a proper noun when ascribed to a social manifestation: it is a form of religious community, usually less formal, where people lived a devotional life and showed an observance which was usually stricter than the monastic orders.² Most of these individuals were women. In the Portuguese context, the word *recollect* is mainly used when referring to the Augustinian Recollects.³

1 Ernout and Meillet, *Dictionnaire Étymologique de la Langue Latine*, s.v. “lego, -is, legi, lectum,” 622.

2 Oxford English Dictionary Online, s.v. “recollect, adj. and n.,” accessed July 1, 2013, <http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/159681>.

3 Carlos Alonso, *Dicionário de História Religiosa de Portugal*, ed. Carlos Moreira Azevedo, vol. 1, s.v. “recoletos” (Lisbon: Círculo de Leitores, 2000), 27–32.

In this chapter I will show how these modes of recollection configure the mystical, the psychological, the social, and even the (geo)political contexts of Joana's thought. Firstly, after describing recollection for Joana and her traceable spiritual masters, this notion is presented as a faculty of the soul (the memory) and its relation with knowledge and love. Secondly, recollection is shown as a social practice in the wider trend of observance devotionalism, a constitutive part of the consecutive renewals Catholicism has experienced. Here, recollection is the activity Joana has chosen to pursue with reformed Cistercians in the newly founded monastery of Lisbon. Finally, the social dimension of the mystical experience is categorized through the noun, the space of refuge that women could constitute as their own state. Different communities and networks were subsumed under the notion of recollection: the familiar, the professional, and even wider textual networks.

This approach will allow us to perceive Joana's sense of recollection and its usage in verbal ('recolher-se'/to recollect), adjectival ('recolhidas'/recollected), and nominal ('recollecta', 'recolhimento'/recollection, recollect) forms. These sections show how the ways of usage are integrated into a wider '*modus loquendi*': a way of speaking, but also a way to dwell in the language.⁴ And it is only there that recollection can be fully comprehended in its social and gendered dimension.

2.1. Recollection as Memory

2.1.1 The Spanish Mystics of Recollection

In her account, Joana mentions having read the Carmelite Teresa of Ávila and the Dominican Luis of Granada [ANTT 2, 8v]. Recollection was an important theme in both authors' works. Lorrvão's monastery library contained works of this Dominican author.⁵ However, it is impossible to ascertain whether these books were there in

4 Compare with Michel de Certeau, *The Mystic Fable*, 76.

5 Luis de Granada, *Adiciones al memorial de la vida Christiana; que compuso el Reurendo Padre Fray Luys de Granada de la Orden de Santo Domingo. En las quales se contienen dos tratados, uno de la perfeccion del amor de Dios, y otro de algunos principales misterios de la vida de nuestro Salvador* (Madrid: Thomas de Iunta, 1594). Granada, *Libro de San Ivan Climaco, llamado Escala Espiritual / agora nuevamente romançado por el Padre Fray Luyz de Granada*. – *Agora nuevamente romançado por el padre Fray Luys de Granada* (Madrid: Juan de la Cuesta, a costa de Iuan de Berrilo, 1612). Luis de Granada and Jerónimo Gomes, *Tabla muy copiosa de las obras que el muy reverendo padre Fray Luis de Granada compuso en romance, que son, Guia de pecadores, Oracion y meditacion, Memorial de la vida Christiana, y Adiciones/compuesta por el R. P. F. Hieronymo Gomez de la orden de la Merced* (Madrid: Thomas Iunti, 1594).

Joana's time at Lorvão, or whether she indeed read them. Generally, his influence is easily recognizable in Portuguese spirituality.⁶

In his *Libro de la Oracion y Meditacion* (*Book of Meditation and Prayer*), Luis de Granada mentions the word recogimiento a few times, even though he is more concerned with testing the difference between mental and vocal prayer. According to the author, prayer itself consists of six steps: preparation, reading, meditation, thanksgiving, offering, and petition.⁷ In *Memorial*, recogimiento is related to the sacraments: it is a moment and a feeling inherent to penance, after sorrow and contrition, which precedes the zeal one has to maintain in order to avoid sinning.⁸ Recollection is a mental discipline: it goes beyond the realm of external senses and imaginations (images) and is necessary both before and after the sacrament taken in Communion.⁹ To be recollected is a mark of introspection and modesty and thus the condition for mental prayer.¹⁰

In Teresa de Jesus' works, the concept of recollection was present in her three main texts: *Moradas* (*The Dwellings*), the *Camino de Perfección* (*Way of Perfection*), and in the *Vida* (*Life*). As we have seen, Joana read *The Interior Castle* when she was 15. The prayer of recollection is a solitary moment in her contact with God. Peacefulness, concentration, elevation, or consolation can be considered parallel to this stage. Recollection occurs when the potencies of the soul (understanding, will, and imagination/memory) are directed towards God, even though the nature of imagination is to be distracted and to wander. Thus recollection is not a total union but rather a momentary one. This juncture makes possible the dilation and enlargement of the soul.¹¹ It can be a rapture when it is supernatural or infused with God, but it must also be a labor that can be perfected: a habit to acquire, a method to advance, a state to be achieved and maintained while receiving the sacraments of the Eucharist/Communion and confession/penance. Furthermore, it is the possibility of a collo-

6 Carvalho "Traditions, Life Experiences," 54–68. See also the work of Maria Idalina Resina, *Fray Luis De Granada y la Literatura de Espiritualidad en Portugal (1554–1632)* (Madrid: Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca: Fundación Universitaria Española, 1988). Ana Cristina Gomes, "Frei Luís de Granada e os Círculos de Poder em Portugal: Novos Documentos," in *Revista Portuguesa de História do Livro*, Actas do Colóquio Internacional Frei Luís de Granada e o seu tempo, year 10 (2005), no. 18 (Lisbon: Távola Redonda, 2006), 41–83.

7 Luis de Granada, *Libro de la Oracion y Meditacion* (Barcelona: Imprenta y librería de D. Antonio Serra, 1846).

8 Luis of Granada, *Memorial of Christian Life: Containing all that a Soul Newly Converted to God Ought to do, that it may Attain the Perfection to which it Ought to Aspire*, revised and edited by F. J. L'Estrange (New York: The Catholic Publication Society, [187-?]), 167.

9 Granada, *Memorial*, 215

10 Granada, *Memorial*, 357

11 Teresa of Ávila, *The Interior Castle* [Moradas], trans. Kieran Kavanaugh and Otilio Rodríguez (New York: Paulist Press, 1979), 4,3.

quium or conversation. In the *Way of Perfection*, Teresa exhorts her younger sisters to

[p]ay no mind, daughters, to these humilities but rather speak with Him as with a Father, a Brother, a Lord and a Spouse – and, sometimes in one way and sometimes in another, He will teach you what you must do to please Him. Do not be foolish; ask Him to let you speak to Him, and, as He is your Spouse, to treat you as His brides. Remember how important it is for you to have understood this truth – that the Lord is within us and that we should be there with Him. [...] If one prays in this way, the prayer may be only vocal, but the mind will be recollected much sooner; and this is a prayer which brings with it many blessings. It is called recollection because the soul collects together all the faculties and enters within itself to be with its God. Its Divine Master comes more speedily to teach it, and to grant it the Prayer of Quiet, than in any other way. For there, hidden within itself, it can think about the Passion and picture the Son, and offer Him to the Father, without wearying the mind by going to seek Him on Mount Calvary, or in the Garden, or at the Column.¹²

Here one can see how recollection is connected with the treatment or the conversation between the persons in a relationship. These relationships (Father, Son, Soul) will also lead to a Trinitarian presence of God in the mystic.¹³ The collection, however, is ultimately a ‘re-’collection, a return to the primordial state of union or quietness where the soul is not split.¹⁴ With an emphasis upon the mind, Teresa insists on the mediation of images of Christ’s life, as prescribed in the monastic ‘lectio divina’.¹⁵

12 “No os curéis, hijas, de estas humildades, sino tratad con El como padre y como con hermano y como con señor y como con esposo; a veces de una manera, a veces de otra, que El os enseñará lo que habéis de hacer para contentarle. Dejaos de ser; pedidle la palabra, que vuestro Esposo es, que os trate como a tal. [...] Este modo de rezar, aunque sea vocalmente, con mucha más brevedad se recoge el entendimiento, y es oración que trae consigo muchos bienes. Llámase recogimiento, porque recoge el alma todas las potencias y se entra dentro de sí con su Dios, y viene con más brevedad a enseñarla su divino Maestro y a darla oración de quietud, que de ninguna otra manera. Porque allí metida consigo misma, puede pensar en la Pasión y representar allí al Hijo y ofrecerle al Padre y no cansar el entendimiento andándole buscando en el monte Calvario y al huerto y a la columna.” Teresa de Jesus, *Way of Perfection*, trans. E. Allison Peers, chap. 28, 3–4.

13 Anne Hunt, *Trinity: Insights of the mystics* (Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 2010), 122–143.

14 Mary Margaret Anderson, “The word in me: on the prayer of union in St. Teresa of Ávila’s Interior Castle,” in *Harvard Theological Review* 99 (July 2006): 329–354

15 Sam Anthony Morello, “Lectio Divina and the Practice of Teresian Prayer,” in *Spiritual Life* (summer 1991), accessed August 8, 2011, http://discalcedcarmelites.net/docs/Lectio_Divina_and_Praxis_of_Teresian_Prayer.pdf, See also E. Ann Matter “Lectio Divina,” in *The Cambridge Companion to Christian Mysticism*, ed. Amy Hollywood and Patricia Z. Beckman (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 147–156.

As she herself acknowledges in her *Life*, Teresa's sense of recollection derives directly from the work of Francisco Osuna (c. 1492–c. 1540).¹⁶ In the third volume of his *Tercer Abecedario espiritual* (*The Spiritual Alphabet*), Osuna enumerates several ways through which a religious life can be accomplished when guided by biblical figures: doing penitence with Paul, meditating on the afflictions of the flesh with Solomon, assisting Martha in charity, visiting the needy and doing pilgrimage with Elisha, or even fasting with Saint John.¹⁷ These could be interpreted as the way of charity or external works. Yet the Spanish mystic prefers to “advance further and imitate loftier things,” made possible through the direct imitation of Christ, which is the method of recollection. Recollection is retiring to the desert and praying “secretly and spiritually” with the Father. Though humans have a mind that strays or gets off track, which hinders full communion, it is still possible to train oneself in the exercise of prayer. Osuna points out that this is not new, having had many names throughout the history of Christianity: abstinence, drawing near, enkindling, welcome, consent, the ‘marrow and the fat’ to burn as an offering to God, attraction, adoption, arrival of the Lord to the Soul, a ‘height that rises to the soul’, spiritual ascension, captivity, and rapture. While enumerating the reasons why this prayer should be called recollection, Osuna describes the different modes of this particular exercise:

[...] the devotion is called recollection because it gathers together those who practice it and, by erasing all dissension and discord, makes them of one heart and love. Not content with just this, recollection, more than any other devotion, has the known, discernible property by which someone who follows it can be greatly moved to devotion when he sees another person also recollected. [...] The second reason why this devotion should be called recollection is that it gathers together the exterior person within himself; [...] Third, this devotion recollects sensuality [...] and places it under the jurisdiction of reason [...]. The fourth way this exercise recollects us is by inviting the one who enjoys it to go off to secret places. [...] The fifth reason this exercise should be called recollection is that it calms the senses. [...] The sixth way this holy exercise recollects us in the members of our body [...] Seventh, this exercise recollects virtues in the person who gives herself over to the devotion [...] The eighth function of this devotion is to gather together man's senses in his heart's interior where the glory of the king's daughter, meaning the Catholic soul, is found [...]. The ninth thing is to recollect i the powers of the soul's highest part where the image of God is imprinted [...]; it gathers God and the soul that has been greatly drawn into itself, into one.¹⁸

16 Teresa of Ávila, *Life*, chap. 4, 7.

17 Francisco de Osuna, *The Third Spiritual Alphabet*, [*Tercer Abecedario espiritual*] trans. and intro. Mary Giles, preface by Kieran Kavanaugh OCD (New York: Paulist Press, 1981), 158–177.

18 Osuna, *The Third Spiritual Alphabet*, 170–173.

The use of enumeration here is not random: it shows the progressive development of one's soul through the exercise and prayer toward God.¹⁹ However, enumeration was also seen as an expenditure of memory in the medieval tradition.²⁰ The storage capacity of this faculty of the soul becomes, through the succession of images, the 'new mode of prayer' for which Teresa and Joana long. As Osuna enumerates, Teresa uses metaphors for the labor of the soul's potencies. Joana chooses the 'account' of that labor, and her act of recollection is something she (as soul) suffers, *patiates* for, and 'is given' by meditating upon the mysteries and humanity of Christ, which is possible through humility and the exercise of prayer.²¹

2.1.2 Joana's Recollection

Following Teresa and Luis de Granada, Joana refers to recollection in the context of preparation for the sacrament of the Eucharist. Before her description of the soul's recollection, she describes how her circle of religious women deals with Communion and its necessity:

[ANTT 98] No que toca has cumunhois sempre entendia do Senhor que se servia muito que fosse muitas vezes e quando por alguma ocasião, as religiosas deixavam de cumunguar duas vezes cada semana, como tinham de costume entendia que o Senhor se ofendia disto e também entendia que queria este Senhor, que todas se aparelhassem com verdadeira confissão e contrição e que estivessem recolhidas com ele antes e depois de comunguarem que tudo fora disto era grande e[ro] e mostras de pouco amor. A vinte e cinco de Maio da era de 1664, me deu huma ância e desejo grande de dar a alma ao Senhor e ser com ele a mesma cousa e como este fogo fosse crescendo, se me recolherão as potências com grande paz e suavidade e parecia-me que comunguava ispiritualmente e crescendo com isto mais o amor, se me derão a entender muitas cousas entre as quais me parecia que via hum grande numero de gente separada em hum campo e entendia que esta gente se estava adereçando e preparando para cousas grandes do serviço do Senhor, por cujo mandado entendia que estavam ali entre as quais conheci só ao meu confessor e parecia-me que era entre todos o maior. [ANTT 98r]

-
- 19 Paul Whitehill, "The 42 Names of 'Recollection': Meaning and Aesthetics in the Third Spiritual Alphabet," in *Mystics Quarterly* 33, no. 3–4 (09/01, 2007): 19–43. See also his monograph, *The Origins of Spanish Golden Age Mysticism: The third Spiritual Alphabet of Francisco de Osuna* (Saarbrücken: VDM Verlag Dr. Mueller e.K., 2008).
- 20 Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A study of memory in the medieval culture* (Cambridge England; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2008).
- 21 On the question of *patiate* see the glossary and section 3.2.

[ANTT 98] Concerning the communions, I have always taken it from the Lord that it was very useful that there were many and when, on some occasions, the religious wo-men stopped taking Communion twice per week, as they used to, I took it from the Lord that he was offended thereat. I also took it that this Lord desired that every woman was to be prepared with a true confession and contrition, and that they were to be recollected with Him before and after taking Communion. Anything outside this was a great mistake and a demonstration of little love. On the twenty-fifth of May of the year of 1664, a great anxiousness, a desire of giving my soul to the Lord and to be one with Him, came upon me. And as this fire was growing, my [soul's] potencies were recollected, with great peace and suavity. It seemed to me that I was making a spiritual communion and with the love growing with this, so many things became understandable to me. Among these it seemed to me that I was seeing a great number of people separated in a field and I understood that these people were adorning and preparing themselves for great things in the service of the Lord, by whose order I understood that they were there. Among those people, I only recognized my confessor, who seemed to me he was the greatest of all. [ANTT 98r]

From this excerpt, it is possible to infer recollection as a movement of the soul. Being split into potencies or powers, this soul had to contrive itself “in great peace and suavity.” Joana does not distinguish which potencies are held by the soul. Nonetheless, by being accredited to a spiritual tradition of Neoplatonic tripartition of the soul, of which Augustine was the most influential author, the potencies alluded to could be the memory, the will, and the intellect.²² Recollection would be the path for interiorization, as seen in Augustine and in the Gregorian tradition, but also the path of purification and the ultimate union of a previous dispersion.

Following Plato's *Phaedon* and its multiple interpreters, recollection was the ‘sulegehstai’, the concentration and reunion of the dispersed elements.²³ Recollection would be that primordial reunion of body and soul, which had consequently given much “peace and suavity” to Joana. This is also the most necessary preparation for the reunion with the God-Man through the sacrament of the Eucharist: the physical partaking of divinity. Thus recollection was a movement, a reunion, and, more precisely, an exercise. This is similar to what happens in the Rhine mystics' writings.²⁴ For Eckhart, the soul unites and closes itself. For Tauler, there is a gradual recollection to the interior. And for Suso (who, as stated above, was a widely

22 S. J. L. Raypens, “Âme (Son fond, ses puissances et sa structure d'après les mystiques),” in *Dictionnaire de Spiritualité Ascétique et Mystique*, 1: 433–441.

23 Plato, “Phaedon,” in *Complete Works*, ed. John M. Cooper (Indianapolis: Hackett, 1997), 83a, 70a and 83b. On recollection, see Lydia Schumacher “Rethinking Recollection and Plato's Theory of Forms,” *Lyceum* 11:2 (Spring 2010): 1–19.

24 Herman Josef Sieben and Saturnino López Santidrian, “Recueillement,” in *Dictionnaire de Spiritualité Ascétique et Mystique*, 13:247–267.

read author in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Portugal), the recollection of the soul was the ultimate goal of prayer, in order to enjoy pure contemplation and love. Likewise, Joana says in the cited passage “with the love growing [...] so that many things were now understandable.”

2.1.2.1 Knowledge and Love

Love and knowledge are therefore the effects of recollection. But what kind of love is this? And what kind of knowledge is this? For Joana, it is knowledge of the future (as will be shown in chapter 3.3, when Joana becomes a visionary), but it is inscribed in a traditional, creative, original (directly from the sources) way: a knowledge that is beyond storage, dwelling instead in the caverns of our being, in the memory. The relationship between love and memory, or the potencies of the soul, is rooted in the Cistercian tradition.²⁵ Bernard describes three kinds of consideration: the first, practical, connected to senses; the second, scientific, related to reason; and the third, speculative, being ‘colligens in se’ (withdrawn in itself).²⁶ This third consideration approximates closely to recollection. William of Saint Thierry also regarded the act of recollection as a memory concern.²⁷

In the Latin origin, to *recollect* or to *record* something is simultaneously the act of perceiving, acknowledging, and remembering it. Recollection is a memory, an intellectual process of the soul.²⁸ But, even if mnemonic, recollection is also the testimony of love. This love cannot be seen only as in Nygren’s dualism of the Greek Eros and Christian Agape, as classic scholarship on love as shown.²⁹ Love and knowledge are the products of the medieval meeting of monastic and scholastic theology, but through different trajectories.³⁰ Yet the vernacular mysticism that

25 Jean Leclercq, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God. A study of monastic culture*, [L’amour des lettres et le désir de Dieu.] trans. Catherine Misrahi (New York: Fordham University Press, 1982), 77–74.

26 Bernard of Clairvaux, “On Consideration,” in *Selected works of Bernard of Clairvaux*, [De consideratione] trans. G.R. Evans, The classics of Western spirituality (New York: Paulist Press, 1987), 150. See Sieben and Santidrian, “Recueillement,” in *Dictionnaire de Spiritualité Ascétique et Mystique*, 7:251.

27 William of St. Thierry, *The Works of William of St. Thierry*, trans. Sister Penelope, vol. 1, *On Contemplating God: Prayer, Meditations*, [De contemplando; Meditativae orationes] Cistercian Fathers Series, no. 3 (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercians, 1977). See also Paul Verdeyen, *Willem van Saint-Thierry en Liefde. De eerste mysticus van de Lage Landen* (Leuven: Davidsfonds, 2001).

28 Aimé Solignac, “Mémoire,” in *Dictionnaire de Spiritualité Ascétique et Mystique*, 10: 991–1002.

29 Anders Nygren, *Erôs et agape: la notion chrétienne de l’amour et ses transformations*, [Eros och Agape] trans. by Pierre Jundt (Paris: Aubier, 1944).

30 For recent divergent views on the debate over love and knowledge in the mystical experience, see Andrew Louth “Apophatic and Cataphatic Mysticism,” in *The Cambridge Companion to Christian Mysticism*, ed. Amy Hollywood and Patricia Z. Beckman (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 137–146, and, in the same volume, Bernard McGinn “Unio Mystica”,

erupted among the urban, female, thirteenth-century agglomerates in Northern Europe crossed the two respective discourses around the knowledge arriving from love (the monastic theology) and that arriving from reason (the scholastic theology). The Beguine mystics, such as Beatrice of Nazareth and Hadewijch of Flanders, or Mechthild of Magdeburg in Germany, or even Margarite Porete of Cambrai, France, are considered by Kurt Ruh to be the earlier seeds of the national languages, because they wrote in their native languages (Dutch, German, and French, respectively) and wanted to approach a new female audience.³¹ Notwithstanding, there is a common theme: *minne*, a love that is mainly memory.³²

Minne as a new term for love shows a new possibility for epistemological and ontological medieval philosophy.³³ *Minne* is the extreme activity of the soul.³⁴ *Minne* has no subject, nor object, nor verb: it is a character that acts towards her, Lady Minne. It is not merely the Beloved of the exegetical monastic tradition of the Songs of Songs.³⁵ Since she is female, *Minne* is a Lady who invites the lover to win by being conquered in her.³⁶ This brings out a different feminine state to that courtly kind in which, according to Duby, the woman becomes the lady, but does not master her own body;

200–210, respectively. See also Bernard McGinn, ‘The Changing Shape of Late Medieval Mysticism,’ *Church History* 65, no. 2 (1996): 197–219.

- 31 Kurt Ruh, ‘Beginnismystik,’ in *Zeitschrift für deutsche Literatur der Altertum* CV (1977): 265–77. See also his major work *Geschichte der abendländischen Mystik. Band II Frauenmystik und Franziskanischen Mystik der Frühzeit* (München: Beck, 1993).
- 32 Etymologically, the word ‘minne’, like the Latin word ‘amor’, refers to *menimi*, ‘remember’. See E. Verwijs et al., *Middelnederlandsch Woordenboek*. ’s-Gravenhage, 1885–1952 (Published in CD-Rom: *CD-Rom Middelnederlands*. (The Hague/Antwerp: SdU/Standaraad Uitgeverij, 1998). See also the work of Norbert Paepe, *Grondige Studie van een middelnederlandse Auteur: Hadewijch, Strophische Gedichten* (Gent/Leuven: Wetenschappelijke Uitgeverij en Boekhandel, 1968).
- 33 Cfr. Joana Serrado, ‘Minnen: Varen: Verwandelen. Amar: Experienciar: Transformar. Três Verbos Místicos em Hadewijch de Antuérpia’ (master’s thesis, University of Porto, 2004), <http://repositorio-aberto.up.pt/handle/10216/53695>.
- 34 ‘What is *minne*? Or should we rather ask, Who is *minne*? Both questions are appropriate and show why it is virtually impossible to define *minne* in any clear and simple way, [...]. Rather than seeing confusion here, it may be more appropriate to realize that the puzzling ambiguity and richness of *minne* are a strong argument for the theological sophistication (...) For the human perspective, *minne* is both the experience of being subjected to this overbearing force and our response to it, the power of our own activity of loving that brings us to God.’ Bernard McGinn, ‘*Mulieres Religiosae*: Experiments in Female Mysticism,’ in *The Presence of God: A History of Western Christian Mystics*, 170 and 207.
- 35 Denys Turner, *Eros and allegory. Medieval Exegesis of the Song of Songs*. Cistercians Studies Series no, 156 (Kalamazoo: Cistercians Press, 1995).
- 36 Barbara Newman, ‘La mystique courtoise: Thirteenth-Century Beguines and the Art of Love,’ in *From Virile Woman to woman Christ: Studies in Medieval Religion and Literature*, Middle Ages Series, (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995), 137–167.

rather, it is just a promised land the Crusader must conquer.³⁷ Moreover, *Minne* is distinct from Eros, Agape, Charity or even a 'Delectatio', where there is a prevalence of images and imagination.³⁸ Its survival is a pure annihilation of the will, and that is identical to the true God and *Minne*.³⁹

Could this mnemonic *Minne* be present in Joana's notion of recollection? Could both a physical withdrawal and seclusion from the world and a psychological/philosophical experience be the inward movement of the soul's faculties to recognize (acknowledge) the (female) subject related to the Divine? Another technical term associated with recollection is 'suspension'. Following the tradition of Teresa and other Spanish mystics, Joana speaks often on how the potencies of the soul are suspended as they are recollected. Through being suspended, these potencies do not work or act individually, as they are annihilated in a wider union.

Suspension, *minne*, and recollection could be part of the same experience that we will later see belonging to the 'loving anxiousness' expressed by Joana. However, in her work the links are weak. As already stated in the introduction, there is a strong historiographic scholarship that ascertains the presence of Northern mysticism in Iberia, particularly in the recollection mystics. Yet the Northern authors were mainly Tauler, Suso, and Ruusbroec, and the books that circulated were in Latin or were Spanish translated versions inspired by these readings. These books might have indirectly brought the notion of *minne* into recollection. Nonetheless, this only illustrates the genetic transmission of knowledge during late medieval and early modern times. There are also other transmissions to be taken into consideration. One, for instance, is the development of 'mystical theology' into a 'science' of mysticism, which, according to De Certeau, occurred throughout the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. This transformation of the adjective into the substantive might also be vital in understanding Joana's notion of 'recollection' in the Christian tradition, as I will now show.

2.1.2.2 Recollection and 'Mystical Theology'

According to the historical theologian Denys Turner, the use of 'mystical' as an adjective is supported by a Neoplatonic tradition that sees a dialectic strategy to speak

37 Peter Dinzelsbacher, ed., *Minne ist ein swaerez spil: neue Untersuchungen zum Minnesang und zur Geschichte der Liebe im Mittelalter* (Göttingen: Kümmerle, 1986).

38 Charles Baladier, *Eros au Moyen Age – Amour, désir et «delectatio morosa»* (Paris: Cerf, 1999), chap. 5.

39 See Amy Hollywood, "Reading as Self-Annihilation," in *Polemic: Critical or Uncritical*, ed. Jane Gallop (New York: Routledge, 2004), 39–64, based on her earlier study *The Soul as Virgin Wife: Mechthild of Magdeburg, Marguerite Porete, and Meister Eckhart*, Studies in Spirituality and Theology, vol. 1 (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1995).

about God in the negativity discourse.⁴⁰ In Joana's texts there is no mention of it. Contrary to Osuna's or Teresa's work, in Joana's writings there is no mention of recollection as a technical discourse, or, as Teresa states, as something belonging to the realm of 'mystical theology'.⁴¹ In *The Third Spiritual Alphabet*, Osuna shows that recollection is nothing more than what Gerson understood as mystical theology – the knowledge of what is hidden, the love that must be the prayer of union.⁴²

Francisco de Osuna mentions Jean Gerson (1363–1429) forty-one times while discussing recollection. Eulogio Pacho says that this intellectual affiliation with Gerson is probably due to the time the former spent in Flanders. It may have been there that Osuna came into contact with the work of this renowned theologian. At the time, he was believed to be the author of Thomas A. Kempis' *Imitatio Christi* (*Imitation of Christ*).⁴³ Gerson's contribution to the history and historiography of mysticism is crucial to understanding a certain geographical and political movement of recollection.

Both a university theologian and a vernacular writer in mystical circles, Jean Gerson tried to define the gnoseological experience of mysticism.⁴⁴ Following the traditional scholastic attitude, he distinguished two different kinds of mysticism. The speculative (theoretical, even essential) mysticism written by trained theologians differed from an affective mysticism, which, preferred by the laity and by women, was often confused, emotional, ecstatic, and visionary. He argued that the latter kind diverted the spirit towards sensual experiences, which were considered to provide less knowledge of God. In his opusculum *De Mystica Theologia Speculativa*, Gerson confronts Ruusbroec (1293–1381), arguing against the dangerous affective and ecstatic proximity between the bride (Soul) and the groom (God).⁴⁵ A debatable and difficult separation between different modes or species of mysticism, a distinction that prevailed in the history of mystical thought, began there. The issue was not the interpretative tradition of the Song of Songs that had been present within Christian

40 Denys Turner, *The Darkness of God: Negativity in Christian Mysticism* (Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 252–273.

41 Teresa of Ávila, *Life*, 10.1.

42 Osuna, *The Third Spiritual Alphabet*, 161.

43 Pacho, "Simiente Neerlandesa", 28–30.

44 Jean Gerson, *Jean Gerson: Early Works*, trans. Brian Patrick McGuire, introd. Bernad McGinn (New York: Paulist Press, 1998); Gerson, *Selections from A Deo exivit, Contra Curiositatem Studentium and De Mystica Theologia Speculativa*, trans. Steven Ozment (Leiden: Brill, 1969). For a recent overview of scholarship on Gerson, see Brian Patrick McGuire, "Jean Gerson on lay devotion," in *A Companion to Jean Gerson*, ed. Brian Patrick McGuire (Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2006), 41–78.

45 The classic work on this polemic is Andre Combes' *Essai sur la critique de Ruysbroeck par Gerson*, 3 vols., *Etudes de theologie et d'histoire de la spiritualite 4.5* (Paris: 1945–1948). For a more up-to-date version, see Jeffrey Fischer, "Gerson's mystical theology: a new profile for its evolution," in *A companion to Jean Gerson*, 205–248.

spirituality since the Church Fathers; it was rather the visionarism and the ecstatic experience that had appeared in the vernacular literature since the thirteenth century.

Dyan Elliot, a medievalist historian, shows the difficult dual relationship Gerson had with the feminine forms of mysticism.⁴⁶ Elliot argues that Gerson's writings on discernment (proving the spirits) showed his unique position within the intellectual landscape of late medieval thought. On the one hand, he defended the study of mysticism, having even promoted it at the University of Paris. On the other hand, on different levels, he attacked experiential and unlearned mysticism (mostly performed by women), as demonstrated in his criticism of Ruusbroec. This simultaneous admiration of and resistance to mystical texts made Gerson question Bridget of Sweden's canonization, although he later defended the validity of Joan of Arc's political visions. As Elliot points out, Gerson defended the validation/verification and circulation of mystic texts. This should be done by specialists, by those Foucault would later call 'fellowships of discourse' – but not by 'experientes' or through 'mystical experimentation', according to Gerson.⁴⁷ An inquisitor (theoretically, in its less violent meaning, as in someone who asks questions) is one who would dispute the truth of certain dogmatic assumptions, even if that mystic could have, at the primordial level, a personal character (a 'self-discernment'). And self-discernment is nothing less than the activity of reason that women, due to their weaker nature, were lacking, concludes Gerson.

It is not difficult to see how discernment and self-discernment can be crucial to a notion of recollection. In his early writings, Gerson mentions recollection only a few times. In *La Montagne de contemplation* (*The Mountain of Contemplation*), a work intended for a female audience, Gerson describes the path to the practice of contemplation. Following John Chrysostom, he mentions a mental retreat from the world.⁴⁸ However, this retreat is also physical, because it is through the capacity of recollection that the person can have and can control his or her emotions or passions. Later on in the text, Gerson shows how the "recollection turn[s] to God and saints [...] against griefs, illnesses and distresses."⁴⁹ This movement of the embodied soul is, ultimately, a faculty of reason and can be a path to discernment. In another work intended for a professional (male) audience, *Briefve Maniere de confession pour jones gens*

46 Dyan Elliot, "Seeing Double: John Gerson, the Discernment of Spirits, and Joan of Arc," in *The American Historical Review* 107, no. 1 (February 2002): 26–54. See also her study, *Proving Woman: Female Spirituality and Inquisitional Culture in the Later Middle Ages* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2004).

47 Elliot, "Seeing Double," 35

48 Jean Gerson, "The Mountain of Contemplation," in *Jean Gerson: Early Works*, 97.

49 Gerson, "The Mountain of Contemplation," 118.

(*The Art of Hearing Confessions*), Gerson states that the confessor (who is the main ‘discerner’) must “recollect [the] fortress or watchtower of his reason.”⁵⁰

Even though Joana does not mention either Gerson’s work or the debate on speculative or affective mysticism, it is present in her description of recollection, including the same ecstatic and visionary effects. While the potencies of her soul mingle and are suspended in a total immersion, Joana herself receives the visionary knowledge this recollection provides. In the third chapter, I shall analyze the situations of these recollections, and, in particular, the kind of knowledge this experience provides: an anxious knowledge. If the Neoplatonic mystical tradition imbued in the negative dialectic insisted on metaphors in order to go beyond a dichotomic knowledge, as Turner asserts, the vernacular tradition to which Joana belongs sees its higher achievement in experientialism. In mystical experience there is an insistence on personal and subjective relationships with the Divine.⁵¹ The knowledge obtained from the mystical experience is practical and tangible, attributing a higher importance to the devotional and social aspects of recollection. Thus, it is understandable that the mysticism in Joana, as in other early modern Iberian mystics, contains the ascetic dimension that is indebted to the Catholic renewal movements. This was mainly known as the Observance in the religious orders.

2.2. Recollection as Observance

To recollect is much more than to be enclosed in a convent: it requires a stricter and ascetic urge to fulfill the true *imitatio Christi*. The relationship between asceticism and mysticism has been the object of many different reflections. In his book *Correntes do sentimento religioso*, Silva Dias distinguishes the mystical trend from the ascetic trend that characterized Early Modern Portugal.⁵² For this author, the movement of recollection can not only be seen as a mystical moment; it is also taken as an ascetic practice. The tendency to retreat from the world was repeatedly seen throughout Christianity: in the apostolic turns of the Mothers and Fathers of the Desert, in the Gregorian reformations in the Church, and in the preaching and mendicant

50 Gerson, “The Art of Hearing Confessions,” in *Jean Gerson: Early Works*, 365.

51 Bernard McGinn, “The Language of Inner Experience in Christian Mysticism,” in *Spiritus* 1 (2001): 156–171.

52 Dias, *Correntes Religiosas*, 1: 36.

orders.⁵³ Some of these tendencies were considered legitimate developments, but others were disregarded and even considered to be heretical.⁵⁴

For Silva Dias, the 'Devotio Moderna' was mainly an ascetic movement greatly influenced by mystical schools such as that of Ruusbroec, which marked European late medieval thought into modernity. This view, nonetheless, has been contested: the ascetic practice of retreating from the world is imbued with a mystical experience.⁵⁵ Recollection can be considered a mystical moment within a wider reformatory trend that accompanied Christianity.

Within the same framework, the Protestant Reformation can also be seen as one of several renewals that Christianity endured. Likewise, the influence of German mystics in Luther's thought has also been acknowledged.⁵⁶ However, this pietist and reformatory action of the Northern mystics was not only felt among Protestant reformers. Many of these medieval mystical texts likewise inspired renewal movements within Catholicism in the southern countries. The need to be 'reformed' was widespread among the monastic and preaching orders, appearing in houses that wanted to be stricter and more observant. Theoretically this is also seen, for instance, in the early modern return of the medieval discussion of poverty to the public sphere along with urbanization and the mendicant orders.⁵⁷ The idea of being reformed also included an urgent need to be recollected or in God's service. Teresa de Ávila's foundation of a new convent and her writing of the respective rule constituted a major incentive to women and men in their pursuit of a good life, which meant being devoted to God and leading a truly exemplary Christian life.

53 Bernard McGinn's article on "Withdrawal and Return: Reflections on Monastic Retreat from the World," in *Spiritus* 6 (2006): 149–172; Jean Leclercq and Jean Gribomont, "Monasticism and Asceticism," in Bernard McGinn, ed., *Christian Spirituality: Origins to the twelfth century* (London: Routledge, 1986), 86–131.

54 Robert E. Lerner, *The Heresy of the Free Spirit in the Later Middle Ages* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1972); Steven Ozment, *Mysticism and Dissent: Religious Ideology and Social Protest in the Sixteenth Century* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1973).

55 On 'Devotio Moderna', see John van Engen, *Sisters and brothers of the common life: the Devotio Moderna and the world of the later Middle Ages* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), 11–44.

56 Steven E. Ozment, *Homo Spiritualis. A Comparative Study of the Anthropology of Johannes Tauler, Jean Gerson and Martin Luther (1509–16) in the Context of their Theological Thought*, Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought, vol. 6 (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1969).

57 Bronislaw Geremek, *La potence ou la piété: L'Europe et les pauvres du Moyen Âge à nos jours* (Paris: Gallimard, 1987), 51–71.

2.2.1 The Cistercians and the Reformational Movements

Contrary to the monastic or preaching orders, the Cistercian Order did not incentivize many reformations.⁵⁸ The major reformation occurred in 1662, with the foundation of the Trappists, who were Cistercians of a stricter observance.⁵⁹ In Portugal, however, the situation was different. In 1459, Pius II exempted the Portuguese abbots from participating in the general chapter in France, contributing to an increasing independence of the Portuguese houses from the Cistercian mother abbey.⁶⁰ Concurrently, the number of national visitations multiplied. For instance, in the abbey of Lorvão, the visitation of 1536 reveals a set of instructions that put the power of the Eça family within the abbey's walls at stake.⁶¹ Even so, during the seventeenth century, new reformed houses were also founded.⁶² These were interchangeably called monasteries, convents, or even recollects.

Joana de Jesus bears witness to this reformational trend in her vita. After having heard that the Cistercian Order had founded a stricter house (the Recollect) in Lisbon, she immediately felt the need to participate in this movement:

[ANTT 47] Alguns meses dipois de se fundar em Lisboa a Recoleta de Nosa Senhora de Nazaré, da Ordem de Nosso patriarca e pai São Bernardo, foi o Senhor servido <de> me dar huns acesos desejos de o servir, por hum modo tão ansioso e com hum sentimento tão dilicado que me não deixava soseguar, porque era huma seta tão penetrante que me rasguava o coração, com huma dor suave que suposto me dava pena, sempre desejava de a aumentar e padecer*

-
- 58 For an overview of Cistercian history, see Rémy de Bourbon Parme, *Les Cisterciens, 1098–1998* (Bayeux: Heimdal, 1998).
- 59 Although no reference is made to the female religious houses, see the work of Polycarpe Zakar, *Histoire de la Stricte Observance de l'Ordre Cistercien depuis ses Débuts jusqu'au Généralat du Cardinal de Richelieu (1606–1635)*, Bibliotheca Cisterciensis, 3 vol. (Rome: Editiones Cistercienses, 1966). For women's reformations, see *Cîteaux et les femmes*, under the direction of B. Barrière, M.-E. Henneau, texts by A. Bonis, S. Dechevaenne and M. Wabont (Paris: Créaphis, 2001). See also Franz J. Felten, "Abwehr, Zuneigung, Pflichtgefühl. Reaktionen der frühen Zisterziensen auf der Wunsch religiöser Frauen, zisterziensisch zu leben," in *Female 'vita Religiosa' between Late Antiquity and the High Middle Ages: Structures, Developments and Spatial Contexts*, ed. by Gert Melville and Anne Müller (Münster: LIT Verlag Münster, 2012), 391–416.
- 60 Dias, *Correntes Religiosas*, 1:101–104.
- 61 Dias, *Correntes*, 51. See also Saúl António Gomes, Isabel Lage and Miguel Soromenho, *Visitações a Mosteiros Cistercienses Em Portugal: Séculos XV e XVI* (Lisbon: Instituto Português do Património Arquitectónico, 1998), 348–359.
- 62 See, in particular, the work of Maur Cocheril, *Routier des abbayes cisterciennes du Portugal*, revised ed. by Gerard Leroux (Paris: Centre Culturel Portugais, 1986), 99–103. See also *Cister. Espaço. Territórios. Paisagens. International Colloquium. 16–20 June 1998*, Mosteiro de Alcobaça (2 vols.) (Lisbon: M. Cultura/IPPAR, 2000).

pelos muitos proveitos que com ella sentia n'alma, pasando asim algum tempo com estas âncias, em que não podia admitir dúvida serem de Deos. Estando hum dia em Oração foi elle servido de me dar hum recolhimento grandisimo por larguo tempo e como as potências estavam todas unidas, obedecendo todo este mundo imtirior ao mando daquelle poderoso Deos, em cuja presença não podia duvidar que estava e como atónita e pasmada da Magestade e poder de hum Senhor, em cujo acatamento todas as cousas criadas não são nada, me vi fora de [mim mesma, desfeita* naquelle nada de minha miséria, pobre e desazida* de todas as cousas da Terra, com huma clara notícia do pouco que ellas valem e vendo como por vista de olhos o quanto vão erados aqueles que fasmem por adquirir as dignidades da Terra, me vi vestida em hum abito umilde e mui pobre de capucha e dava-se-me a entender, tomaria este abito em a Recoleta da Nazaré, em Lisboa, da Ordem de nosso patriarca e pai Sao Bernardo e tãobem entendeu a minha alma, que desta nova reformação se fazia hum dilatado número da casa, para onra e glória de Nosso Deos. [ANTT 47r]

[ANTT 47r] Some months after the foundation of Lisbon's Recollection of Our Lady of Nazareth, of the order of our Patriarch and Holy Father Bernard, the Lord saw fit to grant me some burning desires to serve Him in such an anxious way, with such a delicate feeling that it left me no rest, because it was such a penetrating arrow that cut through my heart, with a pain so soft, that even though it gave me sorrow, I always desire it would grow and I would patiate* for the many gains with it that I felt in my soul. I spent some time in this anxiousness of which I could not doubt that it came from God. One day, while praying, he saw fit to grant me a huge recollection for a longtime. As the potencies were all united, with all this inner world obeying the command of that mighty God, in whose presence I could not doubt I was; and as if astonished and overwhelmed by the Majesty and power of a Lord, in whose acceptance all the created things are nothing, I saw me outside myself, undone* in that nothingness of my misery, poor and disengaged* from all earthly things, with a clear notice of their small worth, and seeing as if with sight of my eyes, how wrong are those who strive to acquire the dignities of Earth. I saw myself dressed in a humble habit, a poor Capuchin [hooded]. It was given to my understanding that I would take this habit in Lisbon's Recollect of Nazareth, of the Order of our Patriarch Saint Bernard. My soul also understood that from this reformation a great number of houses were being created to Our Lord's honor and glory. [ANTT 47r]

The passage from the monastery in Lorrvão to the congregation in Lisbon was not without difficulty for Joana. She states that her fellow nuns at Lorrvão viewed this transition with disapproval, and her new recollected nuns at Lisbon complained about her non-obedience to the rule. This tendency to frame renewal as returning

to a primordial state is not unknown in monastic settings. Elizabeth Rapley shows a parallel situation among seventeenth-century French and English nuns who wanted to create a new congregation. “It was therefore necessary, whatever innovation was attempted, to give it legitimacy by showing that it was, in fact, a return to old tradition.”⁶³ In this excerpt, Joana sees herself with the habit of a Capuchin, but what does Capuchin mean in this context? Could this demonstrate the modeling influence that the Franciscan Observance had in Portugal during the High Middle Ages?⁶⁴ Could Joana have been thinking of her Capuchin uncle António de Mioma?⁶⁵ Silva Dias shows that between Capuchins and Recollects (as observants) there were merely tactical or political differences. The Capuchins were distinguished from the Recollected insofar as they were independent from an administrative hierarchy.⁶⁶

Despite the scholarly emphasis on movements without a rule or monastic vows, life in a proper religious community would give women more benefits, as John van Engen demonstrated in the life of the modern devout.⁶⁷ Thus, many women opted for regulated institutions and tried to improve them. As Teresa had once done, Joana also feels the need to write a new rule. This is seen in an indirect way. She sees in the movement of Discalced Bernardin women a place for her revealed ideas. Joana demonstrates the receptivity to her intentions to be a founder by including a letter in Latin that she had received from Father Alberto Amaral, from the main Cistercian House in Alcobaça. In this letter Alberto Amaral says that God has chosen her from the unhealthy and ignorant of the world to write a new Reformation (Rule) for the Cistercians houses and calls her ‘Catula leonis’, a lion’s whelp (De 33:22) [ANTT 51v-52r].

Unfortunately, the Rule Joana wrote has not been found either in the collection of Lorrvão held at the National Library in Lisbon or in the National Archives of Torre do Tombo.⁶⁸ It is also a possibility that the Rule might be her *Notebook* as well, as discussed in the previous chapter.

However, the disappearance of the Rule does not mean it did not exist. The Recollects’ need for a rule was the force that lay behind Joana’s departure to Lisbon and

63 Elizabeth Rapley, *Dévotes: Women & Church in seventeenth-century France* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 1990), 169. See also Rapley’s book, *A social history of the cloister: daily life in the teachings of the Old Regime* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2001).

64 On this movement in Portugal, see Vítor Rui Gomes Teixeira, *O movimento observante Franciscano em Portugal (1392–1517): história, cultura, e património de uma experiência de reforma religiosa* (Phd diss., Universidade do Porto, 2004).

65 See above, footnote 87.

66 Dias, *Correntes do sentimento Religioso*, 2: 144–155.

67 Engen, *Sisters and brothers of the common life*, 123.

68 Lino de Assunção also mentions not finding this Rule. See Assunção, *As freiras do Lorrvão*, 205.

her subsequent expulsion from the Lisbon Recollect. Joana states that after receiving the letter from Alberto Amaral, she showed it to Father Vivardo de Vasconcelos, who was in Lorvão at that time and who had founded the Recollect of Discalced Bernardin women, where Joana went, had inspired her to write the Rule, and had sponsored her transfer to Lorvão.

The desire to be recollected or to withdraw oneself and protect oneself from worldliness reveals a mystical and mental process (to recollect one's mind, one's soul). In addition to that, there is a social and religious practice of recollection (to be recollected, to live as a recollected nun at a Recollect). Beyond *recollecting* (the verb, action), Joana feels the need to be *recollected* (the adjective, the description), to be apart from the world. The transformation of this operation into the noun or into a substantive that illustrates the possibility of establishing a new place will be seen in the next section.

2.3. Recollection as Refuge

According to Michel de Certeau, sixteenth- and seventeenth-century mysticism (or 'mystics', as the translator suggests) constitutes a 'new' knowledge, a new methodology, a new way, which can be transformed into a science, being both a *modus loquendi* and a *modus agendi*.⁶⁹ Speech and practice, in their turn, demand the emergence of a new *space* and *apparatus*. In Joana's case, this is seen through the several layers of the concept of recollection: the verb of the love of the soul, the adjective of the Observant practice, the noun of the religious space. The transformation of verb into adjective and adjective into noun could be seen as what de Certeau calls the 'redistribution of space' and the emergence of 'refuge'.

The gesture of 'going on retreat' or of 'withdrawing' is the universal indication of the tendency that countered the necessary 'docility' or 'compliance' of State-connected religious institutions with the segregation of a place. Among the reformers, that closure was at once the consequence of the triumph of politicization from 1640 on and the condition of the possibility of an 'establishment' of the faith. It defined a 'policy' of meaning. The regular life, the religious congregations, the lay associations, the administering of the sacraments and their pastoral regulations, and the popular missions were all responses to the prime necessity of a rupture that organized (after the manner of a 'departure', a wall, a social selectivity, a secret, etc.), the circumscription of a field for specific practices. The 'mystic' groups and kinds of discourse offer a variant of these social redistributions of space and by new practices, a variant that at once calls into

69 Certeau, *The Mystic Fable*, 14.

question the autonomization of a new historical figure and the passage from one sociocultural economy to another.⁷⁰

The Recollection (or, more commonly, the Recollect⁷¹) as a place in the world of a new religious lifestyle is present in the Discalced Bernardin women of Lisbon, or in Flanders, with the Cistercian Recollect of Antwerp.⁷²

2.3.1 The Recollects and the Infamous Women

The Recollect Joana entered in 1659 had existed since before 1653, and was located in the south-eastern part of Lisbon, near the river and the port, in the Mocambo borough (nowadays called Santos-o-Velho) where many black people and former slaves lived. It was known by several names: the Recollect of Saint Magdalene, the Recollect or Convent of Saint Elizabeth of Hungary, or merely the Recollect of Mocambo.

When Joana entered the Recollect, she dealt with a difficult period in which Maria da Cruz, the founder of that retreat, was banned and was being subjected to an inquisitorial trial, which led to her arrest and degradation. Maria da Cruz, an ‘old Christian’ born in the district of Braga, was the daughter of Belchior Gomes, an ‘oficial de peneiras’ (probably a manual craftsman).⁷³ Besides leading a group of religious women in Lisbon, from a noble house, she was said to have made a pilgrimage to Rome, even having been imprisoned there and subsequently set free.⁷⁴ She was also known in the royal and noble networks. The available information about her comes from the inquisitorial process to which she was subjected.⁷⁵ When

70 Certeau, *The Mystic Fable*, 21

71 See footnote 202 above.

72 Jean Baptiste Lefèvre, “La Communauté Des Awirs-Aywières,” in *Unanimité et Diversité Cisterciennes: Filiations, Réseaux, Relectures du XIIe au XVIIe Siècle: Proceedings of the 4th International Colloquium of CERCOR, Dijon, 23–25 September 1998*, ed. Nicole Bouter (Saint-Etienne: Publications de l’Université de Saint-Etienne, 2000), 281–295.

73 *O processo de Maria da Cruz*, Tribunal do Santo Ofício, Inquisição de Lisboa, proc. 4372, Portugal, Torre do Tombo, mf. 4420. 238fl., 20/08/1659-18/07/1668.

74 Vivardo de Vasconcellos, “De hum papel de varias noticias da origem e principios do mosteiro de Nossa Senhora de Nazare que fundou em Lisboa para monjas recolletas descalcas da Ordem de Nosso Padre Sao Bernardo,” in *Collecção histórica e litúrgica que compreende várias memórias sobre o Mosteiro de Alcobaça e outros, e sobre a Ordem de S. Francisco em Portugal, sobre os Duques de Bragança e a Guerra da Restauração*, Lisbon, Biblioteca Nacional de Lisboa, Codex Alcobacensis, ms. 336, fol. 93.

75 On Maria da Cruz, the main source is the trial she underwent: *O processo de Maria da Cruz*, Tribunal do Santo Ofício, Inquisição de Lisboa, proc. 4372, Portugal, ANTT, mf. 4420. 238fl. 20/08/1659-18/07/1668. See also the work of Geraldo Pieroni, *Entre Deus e o Diabo: Santidade Reconhecida, Santidade Negada na Idade Média e Inquisição Portuguesa* (Rio de Janeiro: Bertrand Brasil, 2007), 99 and 113; Pieroni, “Heréticas da Inquisição: mulheres portuguesas degredadas para o Brasil-Colônia,” in *Saberes Brasileiros: Ensaio Sobre Identidades, Séculos XVI*

Vivardo de Vasconcellos, then abbot of Lisbon's Desterro Monastery, met her, he persuaded her to join her community to the Cistercian Order, turning it into the first branch of Discalced Bernardin women in Portugal. Vivardo gives an account of how he met beata Maria da Cruz:

Sendo eu Abbade do mosteiro de Nossa Senhora do Desterro desta corte e cidade de Lisboa me veyo a noticia que na freguesia de Santos o velho havia hum recolhimento que chamao da Magdalena no qual assistia por regent huma Maria da Cruz que tinha vindo de Roma. E dizendo-me certa pessoa que era molher de virtude me deu logo no coracao que a buscasse e no dia seguinte que foi o primeiro de Setembro de mil seiscentos cincoenta e tres a fui buscar e como esta visita era pera os fins que eu nam imaginava e o Senhor so sabia de tal modo me prendeo a conversacao daquella creatura que eu a buscasse os mais dos dias [Fol.78] para falarmos de Deos e eu lhe cobrei tanto respeito e veneracao que lhe falava de joelhos e quando a hia buscar hia rezando canticos e himnos ao Senhor porque deparara aquella sua serva. [Fol.77v-78r]

Being the Abbot of the Monastery of Our Lady of Desterro of this court and city of Lisbon, I came to know that, in the parish of Santos-o-velho, there was a recollect called Magdalena's, wherein a certain Maria da Cruz, who had come from Rome, attended as regent. And after a certain person told me that she was a woman of virtue, my heart immediately yearned to seek her. The following day, which was the first of September, sixteen hundred and fifty-three, I went to see her and, as this visit was done for purposes I could not imagine and the Lord knew, that creature's conversation was such that I went to see her most of the days [Fol. 78] to talk about God and I gained so much respect and veneration for her that I could only speak to her on my knees, and when I went to get her I was praying and chanting hymns for I had come across that servant of His. [Fol.77v-78r] [Joana Serrado's translation]

When Joana arrived in 1659, the Recollect was already in the hands of Maria Antónia do Espírito Santo and two of Vivardo's sisters, Maria de Almeida and Francisca Vasconcellos Turjeiro, previously nuns at the Benedictine monastery of S. Bento de Cas-tris at Évora.⁷⁶ The transfer of power from Maria da Cruz to Vivardo's sisters when

a XX, ed. Geraldo Pieroni and Cláudio De Nipoti (Rio de Janeiro, RJ: Bertrand Brasil, 2004) 43; Pieroni "No Purgatório mas o olhar no Paraíso: o degredo inquisitorial para o Brasil Colônia," in *Revista Textos de História*, vol. 6, no. 1 and 2 (1998), 115–141; Pieroni, *Os Excluídos do Reino: A Inquisição Portuguesa e o Degredo para o Brasil Colônia* (Brasília, DF; São Paulo, SP: Editora Universidade de Brasília; Imprensa Oficial do Estado, 2000), 90–99. Laura Mello e Souza, *Inferno Atlântico: demonologia e colonização, séculos XVI-XVIII* (São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1993).

76 Vasconcellos, "De hum papel," 81–82.

the Recollect became Cistercian was not without problems.⁷⁷ On 1 September 1653, Vivardo stated that he was talking to her “on his knees.” But soon, by Christmas of 1654, Vivardo’s sisters were arriving from Évora to take charge.⁷⁸ With Vivardo’s sisters in charge, Maria da Cruz’s leadership was contested. In August 1659, she was accused by the Holy Office of having fake visions and fake prophecies, which led to her being sentenced to a five-year exile in Brazil.⁷⁹

Maria da Cruz personifies the life at a Recollect, both through her pious lifestyle and the dreadful consequences that may have arisen from it. During her inquisitional process, Maria da Cruz was accused of 39 propositions that she might have said or was heard saying.⁸⁰ This nun was accused, for instance, of saying that, in a vision, the Virgin Mary granted Maria da Cruz whatever she would ask and that the Lord was very disappointed with the world, while Christ was interceding for the community. In addition, the world and all religions would burn by God’s hands for not having kept their rules, except for the people who were at the Recollect. According to the same propositions, God had promised her she would not lack anything: even if there was a shortage of men to work at the Recollect, he would send angels himself. God had also showed her who would be her ‘female companion’ (‘companheira’) or successor to continue her work posthumously. She is also said to have travelled in spirit to Évora’s Saint Benedict monastery, where she had seen many lights.

These were mainly accusations of ‘superbia’, pride, or lack of humility. Her obedience was also contested: she was believed not to want to accept discipline from a prelate, not to wear the habit or to sleep in a chosen place, and even not to eat (except when there were good meals) because of her claim of being only spirit. She was also said to have seen Purgatory and to have felt the same pain the Virgin felt when Christ was crucified.

Maria da Cruz is a crucial character in understanding Joana de Jesus. When Joana appeared in Lisbon in 1659, invited by Vivardo, with her own spiritual and devotional teaching on recollection based on a direct experience with God-the-Man and her derived divine authority, Vivardo himself accused her of being “another Maria da Cruz.” Joana transcribed the letter she received from her confessor Vivardo into her own writings.

Minha madre, eu não estou mal com Vossa Reverência, estou mal com o seu amor próprio, com a sua soberba, com o seu pouco sofrimento e com a sua língua, com que Vossa Reverência tem escandalizado até as paredes desta Casa Santa, e finalmente eu cuidei que tratava com huma ovelhinha de Deos e achei-

77 Vasconcellos, “De hum papel,” 77v.

78 Vasconcellos, “De hum papel,” 83v-85

79 Vasconcellos, “De hum papel,” 92–93v

80 “Proposições,” in *O processo de Maria da Cruz*, Tribunal do Santo Ofício, Inquisição de Lisboa, proc. 4372, Portugal, ANTT, mf. 4420. 238fl. 20/08/1659-18/07/1668.

me com outra Maria da Cruz, porém Vossa Reverência, não me enganou a mim, nem a Deos que a conhece, Vossa Reverência he a que fica emganada, que eu com o meu nada, entro nestas cousas e com o meu nada foi no a ficar, porque como o que amo, cuido que he Deos, tanto que conheço que me enguano, torno a ficar como estava, só o que me pasma, he o diser Vossa Reverência, a Prelada tantas veses e as religiosas, que se queria tornar para o seu mosteiro [ANTT 78r] sem ter vergonha de seus parentes e do mundo e niso conheci a violência com que Vossa Reverência vive neste paraíso e sua pouca umildade e como toda a sua doutrina he falsa, donde estes erros começarão, para Deos permitir eses emguanos, saberá Vossa Reverência ou nunqua o saberá, porque a sua cegueira e a sua soberba e prejunção não lhe dá lugar a iso. [ANTT 77v-78r]

Mother of mine, I am not on bad terms with your Reverence, I am on bad terms with your self-love, your pride, your scant suffering and with the tongue with which Your Reverence has scandalized even this holy house's walls and I thought I was finally dealing with a little sheep of God and found myself with another Maria da Cruz; however, Your Reverence has not fooled me nor God, who knows you; the one being fooled is, indeed, Your Reverence as I and what is mine have nothing to do with these things, and nothing of mine remains; because I consider what I love as God's belonging as soon as I understand that I am wrong I go back to where I was, only being staggered with the fact of Your Reverence saying so many times to the prelate and the religious women that you wanted to go back to your monastery [ANTT 78] without being ashamed before your parents and the world and in that I knew the violence with which Your Reverence lives in this paradise and your scarce humility, and how all your doctrine is false where these errors started for God to allow those mistakes, Your Reverence shall know, or never will; for your blindness and pride, and your presumption does not allow you that. [ANTT 77v-78r]

Vivardo's words make it quite clear that the spectre of Maria da Cruz was still present in the Recollect, and that her fate at the hands of the Inquisition served as a warning to more daring nuns who advocated a special teaching or presence. However, it is important to bear in mind the ambivalence of this relationship: Vivardo calls Joana 'madre' (mother) and not 'sor' or 'soror' (sister). There is a spiritual motherhood here that contains a leadership and a prophetic commitment, which is acknowledged by Phyllis Mackin in her investigation of the role of motherhood regarding seventeenth-century English Protestant visionaries. The author even suggests that the fatherly relationship served as the paradigm to the political sphere, while the motherly relationship did the same to the spiritual one.⁸¹ The Dutch scholar Mirjam de Baar

81 Phyllis Mack, "Die Prophetin als Mutter: Antoinette Bourignon," in *Im Zeichen der Krise, Religiosität im Europa des 17. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Harmut Lehmann and Anne-Charlot Trep (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 1999), 79–100.

also describes in detail how Antoinette Bourignon, a Flemish mystic and prophetess, embodied the monastic experience of spiritual motherhood in her prophetic vocabulary and went beyond it, from a monastic leadership role to physical and doctrinal action for human believers.⁸² In Joana de Jesus, her spiritual motherhood is merely recognized by her confessor and not further developed.

Vivardo, Maria da Cruz, and Joana de Jesus give testimonies to the different dimensions of what living at a recollect entailed. However, the social history of this community is difficult to trace. Only Vivardo's memories and, for comparative purposes, the Rule at the archive of the Cistercian monastery of Tabosa remain to reconstruct its history. This monastery, situated in the center of Portugal, is an important source of information on the lifestyle these religious women chose, as it was founded in 1692 to accommodate 25 nuns from the previous Lisbon Recollect.⁸³

The nuns adopted a very strict lifestyle at the Recollect.⁸⁴ They fasted all year round, which means that they did not eat meat, only fish, except when they were sick. Likewise, they were not allowed to speak to anyone else and could only see their relatives four times a year. The vow of silence was also practiced: only with the permission of the prelate could they talk together on Sundays, from twelve to three o'clock. The Divine Office was held at two o'clock in the morning (matins), mental prayer at five, primes at six. They slept on straw mattresses and wore borrel tunics and sackcloth habits. The cells only contained a crucifix and some images of saints. They drank from the same tankard (drinking vessel). They also had to discipline themselves on Wednesdays and Fridays, and more often during Advent and Holy Week.

In her narrative, Joana de Jesus expresses her admiration for this secluded life:

[C]heguamos a Lisboa a oito dias de Outubro e loguo entrei na Recoleta, que me pareceu hum Ceo abitado de anjos, que assim me parição cada huma daquelas servas do Senhor, em o qual as amava avia muito tempo. Todas me festejarão muito e me fizerão grandes caridades e descansei do caminho treze dias, e em dia das Onze Mil Virgens, tomei o abito da Recoleta, o qual me lançou o Padre Reverendíssimo com grande <de>voção e lágrimas, [ANTT 58r] com que se solinizou esta acção, em a qual o meu Senhor <se> mostrou comiguo muito liberal de suas miziricórdias, paricia-me que sempre o tinha presente e não podia duvidar de aquela obra ser sua e se por alguma via me atemorizava o rigoor e asperesa daquela vida, loguo este piadoso Senhor me consolava, pondo-me naqueles amargu[r]as tanta suavidade e duçura que muitas veses

82 Mirjam de Baar, "Geestelijke moederschap," in *"Ik moet spreken. Het spiritueel leiderschap van Antoinette Bourignon"* (PhD diss., University of Groningen, 2004), 437–460.

83 Maria Luísa Gil dos Santos, *O Ciclo Vivencial do Mosteiro de Nossa Senhora da Assunção de Tabosa* (master's thesis, Universidade do Porto, 2000), 62.

84 Vasconcellos, "De hum papel," 86r-v.

me suspendia todos os sentidos e não podia duvidar daquele socorro me ser imviado de Sua poderosa mão. Todas as cousas me agradavão muito e as apertadas celas e casas daquela Santa Recoleta, que ainda neste tempo ho erão muito, me parição melhor e mais agradáveis que os sumtuosos edifícios que tinha deixado em Lorvão. As religiosas me edificavão muito pelas muitas virtudes e mortificação que via em cada huma dellas. [ANTT 57v-58r]

We arrived at Lisbon on the eighth of October and I immediately entered the Recollect, which seemed to me a Heaven inhabited by angels, for so each one of those servants of the Lord within whom I already loved for a long time seemed to me. Everyone greeted me and did great charities to me. I rested from my travelling for thirteen days and on the day of the eleven thousand virgins, I took the habit of the Recollect which was thrust upon me by the Most Reverend Father with great devotion and tears, [ANTT 58r] that made this act solemn in which my Lord has shown himself most liberal with His mercies towards me. It seemed to me that I always had Him present and could not doubt that that work was His and if the rigor and harshness of that life scared me in any way, soon the pious Lord would console me, putting so much suavity and sweetness into that bitterness that oftentimes He would suspend all my senses and I could not doubt that that aid was sent by His powerful hand; all things pleased me much and the narrow cells and houses of that saint Recollect, which at that time were still very small, seemed to me much better and more pleasant than the sumptuous edifices I had left at Lorvão. The religious women edified me much through the many virtues and the mortification I saw in each one of them. [ANTT 57v-58r]

Maria da Cruz and other religious women were subject to inquisitorial trials and subsequent deportation based on their practices of holiness during the seventeenth century.⁸⁵ Joana de Jesus, however, escapes this fate mainly due to the fact that she moved around and was part of several communities and networks. Her refuges were the physical Recollect at Lisbon and also the deviances that emerged from that.

These communities served as shelters but also held some kind of social control in which her thought could be tested. This was the case with the recognition and success of Joana's texts, both *Notebook* (original) and *Copy*, as we have already seen. The manuscripts moved from Lisbon to Lorvão and were controlled by the confessors and the readers. In the case of England, for instance, Jason Scott-Warren speaks of the existence of true textual communities, where the manuscripts circulated along-

85 Women within cloisters were not exempt from that. Cf. Adelaide Filomena Amaro Lopes Cardoso, "As religiosas e a Inquisição. Quadros de vida e espiritualidade" (Master's thesis, University of Oporto, 2003).

side printed books.⁸⁶ In Joana's case, as we shall see, the need for publication is concomitant with the survival of the manuscript, and the communities read, shared, and probably also wrote following the example of Joana. Whether or not this happened at Lorvão we do not know, but in a book on early modern Spanish mysticism, Isabelle Poutrin shows how crucial these multiple networks were to the appraisal of someone's work, even constituting real "workshops of autobiographical writing," where they could develop their own writing skills and share ideas related to visions.⁸⁷

We can think of two locally based social and intellectual networks that received and disseminated Joana's writings. Her extended, mainly female family network, dispersed through several branches of the Cistercian (and wider Benedictine) houses, provided her with a 'safety net' that allowed her to jump forward intellectually – to manifest herself – but also to attenuate the possibly dangerous consequences of her speaking out. In both cases, the 'honor' and the weight of the 'family name' served as a shield that protected her but also had to be preserved. The second, more professional network, ranging from Lorvão to Lisbon's reformed Recollect, simultaneously both female and male, formed her 'reputation' or 'opinion', which might have equally led to either the subsequent recognition of her saintliness or her intellectual neglect as well as, to some extent, her social and physical punishment (public beatings and deportation to Brazil), as happened in the case of Maria da Cruz.

2.3.2 The Family Network

Throughout her life, Joana showed the permanence and importance of her family ties. She claimed to have received her domestic education from her father. This section's main focus will be on the influence of her siblings and relatives during her adult life.

As her aunts held high positions within the Benedictine and Cistercian hierarchy, Joana had a privileged entrée to several monasteries (Mioma, Ferreira das Aves, and Lorvão). While at Lorvão, she also mentions how her relatives used their influence in her religious circle (ANTT 4r,5v,48v,57r-60r). After coming to Lisbon, she loses this support and 'comfort' (ANTT 79v).

Lorvão was to be a 'second home' for the Albuquerque sisters (at least for Inês, the future abbess, and Sebastiana), often hosting their younger brother António when

86 Jason Scott-Warren, "Reconstructing Manuscript Networks: The Textual Transactions of Sir Stephan Powle," in *Communities in Early Modern England. Network, Place, Rhetoric*, eds. Alexandra Shepard and Phil Withington (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2000), 18–37.

87 Poutrin, *Le Voile Et La Plume*, 131.

he traveled from Tarouca (his own monastery, in Northern Portugal) to Alcobaça (the order's main house, to the south-east of Lôrvão, in the Coimbra district). In Lisbon, in proximity to Friar Vivardo de Vasconcellos, the head of the Cistercian Order, Joana directly encouraged (through visions) her brother's religious fellowship and put in a 'good word' with her confessor, Vivardo de Vasconcellos.

The Albuquerquees never interrupted their contact with each other. Joana continued exchanging letters with her family and acted as confidante and social and spiritual intercessor to her siblings. She promoted the religious (monastic) life in the Cistercian Order by disapproving of the marriages of her brother António and her sister Catarina.

Minha irmã e todo o meu bem, o gosto com que recebo vosas novas, me obrigua a molestar-vos com estas letras e nelas grangiar o logro de mas concederes, boas de vosa saúde assim como este irmão vos deseija eu com ela fiquo ainda neste vale de Lôrvão, assistindo com estas irmasinhas no que tenho grande alívio de alguns cuidados que me têm penalizado por muitas veses e afirmo-vos minha irmã que particularmente me recreo em as ver, tão bem acomodadas e livres dos contrastes do mundo que estão oje pesimo. De huma carta que escrevestes a Mariana, me constou leres huma que vos escrevi. Nela vos dizia algumas cousas a respeito de huma causa em que ando decaído a alguns anos a esta parte e como esta demanda hé de crimes e ofensas que tenho cometido contra Deos Noso Senhor, me <quero> pôr em livramento, apresentando-me preso diante de sua devina misericórdia para que com ela ponha os seus olhos em este pobre pecador e assim que minha irmã, tratai loguo de em meu nome faseres huma petição com algumas religiosas desa santa casa, apresentando-a a este Senhor para que <me> conceda perdão e despacho nesta preposta que vos quero perguntar. Como tenho visto <o> que sempre desejei com grande ância que he ver minhas irmãs religiosas. Catherina já a considero por esa, que fio da sua capacidade que nao trocará ela este estado por nenhum do mundo e como só eu me veijo no labarinto dele, tendo-me mostrado ter nele poucos descansos e acho-me homem sem tomar estado e por ver niso dilaçois que me têm ocasionado alguns cuidados que aqui não manifesto. Me tenho resuluto em seguir destes 2 caminhos hum de casado ou de religioso, o que for mais conviniente para o serviço de Deos e meu [ANTT 100v] crédito, assim que vos peço parecer nisto e o que me mandares diser e ei-de seguir que fiquo resoluto niso e sendo o de riligioso peço-vos que trateis loguo diso com a brevidade posivel com o Noso Padre Frei Vivardo de Vasconcelos, que como he Pai de nós todos, será servido de querer emparar este seu filho e pedi-lhe que tome este neguócio por sua conta, para me pedir patente para converso ou de misa que para iso me parece a mim, que tenho ainda conhecimento bastante de latim e isto vos relato debaixo de confissão, que trateis isto com todo o segredo de modo que o não chegue a saber nunca pesoa alguma, nem chegue ha notícia de nosa Mai e irmãos, exceto Dona Mariana Freire, que lhe descubri

o coração a respeito de me avisar do que se pasa a respeito desta matéria, porque vindo a patente que ao Reverendissimo Padre Frei Vivardo peço por amor de Deos, há-de agenciar com o segredo que diguo para o Mosteiro que a ele lhe parecer hia eu escondido da nosa gente e da de fora tomar o abito e nesta resolução não tendes que duvidar e disto me avisai loguo, mandandome a carta com a de Nosa Irmã, Dona Mariana Freire a quem avisai em papel apartado para loguo se rasguar tanto que for visto. Com isto o Ceo vos guarde, oije, 31 de Maio, 1664= Voso Irmão António Freire de Albuquerque. [ANTT 100r-v]

My sister and all my good: the pleasure with which I receive your news obliges me to bother you with these letters and in them I reach the aim of you granting me good news about your health just as this brother wishes you: I stay healthy, still in this Lorrão valley, abetting these little sisters, which gives me great relief of some cares that have often weighed upon me, and I state to you, my sister, that I have a particular pleasure in seeing them so well installed and free from the adversities of the world, which is dreadful nowadays. From a letter that you have written to Mariana, I came to know that you read the one I have written you. I told you therein something regarding a cause in which I have been involved for some years, and as this process is about crimes and offenses that I have committed against God, our Lord, I want to get acquitted, presenting myself as imprisoned before His Divine mercy so that he may put his eyes upon this poor sinner. And thus, my sister, take immediate care to make a petition with some religious women of that Holy House in my name, presenting it to this Lord for him to grant me forgiveness and dispatch this proposal I want to ask you about. As I have been seeing what I have always desired with great anxiousness, which is to see my sisters being religious women, [as] I already consider Catharina thus for I trust her capability to keep this state not exchanging it for any other in the world and as only I see myself in his labyrinth, having been shown to have scarce rest in it, finding myself without having taken the state and as I see in this a lateness that has caused me some cares that I will not clarify here, I remain resolute in following these two paths: that of a married man or a religious man, the one more convenient to God's service and my [ANTT 100v] credit. So I ask for your opinion about this and what you will tell me I will resolutely follow. And if [your opinion] is the religious path, I beg you to handle that as soon as possible with our Father Friar Vivardo de Vasconcelos, who, as the Father of us all, will deign himself to support this son of his and I asked him to take care of this matter personally, by asking a permit for a convent or one for mass as it seems to me that I still have enough knowledge of Latin, and I tell you this as a confession. Handle this wholly secretly so nobody ever gets to know it, nor arrives to be known by our Mother and brothers, except Dona Mariana Freire, to whom I have uncovered my heart about her having to warn me about what is happening regarding this matter because when it comes to light that I ask the Most Reverend Father Friar Vivardo by the love of God to act with the secrecy I describe, so I go to the

Monastery that seems fit to him, hiding from our own people and outsiders, to take the habit: of this resolution you do not have to doubt and you must warn me immediately, sending me the letter, together with that of our sister Dona Mariana Freire, whom you must warn in a different paper to be torn up as soon as it is seen. With this, may Heaven keep you, today, the thirty-first of May, 1664, your brother, Antonio Freire de Albuquerque. [ANTT 100r-v]

Joana would subsequently explain that António was successful in becoming a religious man, thanks to her spiritual and temporal intercession with God. Despite the role she purported to have kept within her family, Joana lost power in Lisbon. As we have seen in Vivardo's letter, when Joana was accused of being too proud and vain by her confessor and her fellow religious women of the Recollect, she was also charged with having 'dishonored' her relatives [ANTT 78r].

Nonetheless, Joana's return to her original religious home may have been due to her sisters' efforts, with those of Inês de Albuquerque, who became the abbess of Lorvão's Monastery in 1668, being the most relevant.⁸⁸ The last words she wrote in Lisbon, in 1663, may be an indication of this protection. Joana describes how pleased the Lord was with the advancement of virtues by the religious women of Lorvão [ANTT 98v]. Later, one unnamed sister wrote to her, describing the election for the abbess in which the continuation of the titular head is predicted. Joana never mentions names, but if this was indeed written in or after 1663, the abbess in question was either Maria de Carvalho or Madalena de Castro.⁸⁹ Nevertheless, Joana is told by divine revelation that this would not come to pass, for the nun in question would die soon and, due to Joana's intervention, Maria de Carvalho's or Madalena de Castro's soul would be saved from Purgatory.

There was a continuous presence of the family and the 'business affairs' of family members – regarding the achievement of a (new) state either in temporal life or the afterlife – and Joana was asked to intervene in those same affairs and was also held to account for their results. This situation of interference (in and after life) was typical as a means to access early modern female agency in spiritual endeavors, which Isabelle Poutrin also describes as being common in the Spanish setting.⁹⁰

Eight years after her return to Lorvão, Joana was spurred to continue to write about her life, in a new *Notebook*, with the support of a new confessor, António de Conceição. At the end of her narrative Joana states her decision "to be subjected to the obedience of two sisters of a lower grade and age" [ANTT 157], one of whom she is, however, able to cure through her intercession with John the Baptist and Saint Blaise [ANTT 157v]. Thanks to her family network, Joana regained her intellectual,

88 Borges, *Arte Monástica*, 966.

89 Borges, *Arte Monástica*, 966.

90 Poutrin, *Voile et Plume*, 47.

spiritual, and healing roles in the Lorvão community, turning the monastery into a sort of sheltered community.

2.3.3 The ‘Professional’ Network

As previously seen, when dealing with the mysticism of recollection, the discernment of spirits is at issue within the mystical experience. Dyan Elliot’s reading of Jean Gerson states that he promoted an epistemological certification of visionary thought when he proposed the existence of an “assessor for mystical phenomena” who should “have the advantage of both practical experience and theological training.”⁹¹ This would constitute a validation network that would normalize and further some mystical writings to the detriment of others. This would also constitute a place of refuge *per se*. This will be illustrated by some examples from Joana’s life-writing.

In the first instance, there are the confessors. Vivardo de Vasconcellos sponsored her writing and her travel to Lisbon. Alberto do Amaral, also a confessor in Lisbon, maintained a correspondence with Joana and inspired her to write a new Rule – also called ‘Reformação’ (Reformation) – while she was at Lorvão, but he also suspected of her visions and ailments during her stay at the Recollect of Lisbon. There may have been some more spiritual directors, such as those in the Cistercian Chapter in 1661: elderly priests trained only to assist Cistercian women.⁹² However, in her account, Joana mentions Cristóvão Freire de Andrade, who was an inquisitor at Lisbon and gave the initial approval for her departure to Lisbon:

Pasado já hum ano e três meses do trianio deste nosso Reverendíssimo Padre, sem eu para isso dar ocasião, se disse em Lorvão que eu avia de ir para a Recoleta de Lisboa e como eu alli tinha muitas parentas e irmãs, começarão a se levantar alguns ditos que ião causando perturbação em algumas pessoas, e como em esta ocasião estivesse nequella santa casa, Cristovão de Andrada, Freire Imquisidor, que era naquelle tempo em Coimbra, ao qual eu tinha por vezes comunicado algumas cousas de minha alma, mandou-me chamar e pediu-me lhe disese o fundamento que avia para se dizerem aquelas cousas, ao que lhe respondi as razois, que me pareceu convinhão e juntamente lhe disse em confissão o que em oração me avia sucedido. Respondeu-me que achava naquillo muito em que reparar e que tinha grande mistério, que nada era impossivel a Deos. Com isto fiquei quieta e sosseguada e as mais pessoas tãobem se quietarão com o silêncio do tempo, mas o meu coração não podia ter descanso, porque sempre

91 Elliot, “Seeing double”, 32. See also Jean Gerson, “De theologia Mystica lectio sex” in McGuire, *Jean Gerson*, 270–271.

92 Jo Ann McNamara, *Sisters in Arms: Catholic nuns through two millennia* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996), 497–498.

andava ancioso, com hum fervor que me cricia tanto em alguns dias, que parece se me acabava a vida. [ANTT 48v]

Already after one year and three months of the three-year mandate of this Very Reverend Father of ours, without any pretext of mine for that, it was said at Lorvão that I would be going to the Recollect of Lisbon. As I had many relatives and sisters there, some rumors were raised, causing some disturbance to some and as Christovão de Andrade Freire, then Inquisitor in Coimbra and to whom I had sometimes communicated some affairs of my soul, was in this Holy House at the time, he sent to call for me, and asked me to tell him the basis for those things being said, which I answered with the reasons that seemed to be convenient and also told him in the confession what happened to me while in prayer. He answered me he found it much worthy of notice and to contain a great mystery, as nothing was impossible for God. With this I came to rest and also the other persons calmed themselves with the silence of time; but my heart could not rest as it was always anxious with a fervor that someday grew so much in me that it seemed that my life was about to end. [ANTT 48v]

The rumors ('ditos') Joana complains of illustrate the reciprocal clash of her family networks and her more religiously confessional, even 'professional' networks. Why did Joana want to leave a familiar environment to which she had generational ties and where she could easily intervene and acquire a key position? Taking the wealth enjoyed by the Lorvão monastery into account, the change to a new, urban, 'reformed' setting must have been regarded with suspicion by Joana's influential relatives. Thus, the coming of the inquisitor to Lorvão would serve to legitimize Joana's somewhat strange desire to change religious home. Despite their similar family name, there is no mention in the life-writing that this inquisitor belonged to the maternal side of Joana's family.

In her account Joana mentions Gabriel de Avé-Maria (1637–1677). A theologian born in Óbidos, a small town near Lisbon, he taught at the University of Coimbra and authored one book on the *Mary officium* and two on *Cistercian dispositions*.⁹³ Gabriel de Avé-Maria was known for dealing with 'spiritual affairs'. Due to this expertise, he was asked to check Joana's visionary accounts, having stated that those did not feature any theological divergences [ANTT 84r].

93 In his bibliographical dictionary, Diogo Barbosa Machado gives the references for Gabriel de Avé-Maria's works: *Officium B. Mariae Virginis secundum morem Monachorum*. Ullisipone apud Dominicum Carneiro, 1665.8, *Breviario dos Conversos Segundo o uzo da Ordem de Cister e Congregação dae Santa Maria de Alcobaça*. Lisbon by Domingos Carneiro, 1669.8. and *Formulario de todo o genero de Provisoens que se custumaõ passar na Secretaria dos Geraes da Ordem de Christo*, fol. M.S. Diogo Barbosa Machado, *Biblioteca Lusitana*, 3:310.

On the third occasion, Joana was less lucky with the external opinions about her work. Later on, already back in Lorvão, she would recall the official invitation to leave Lisbon which she received:

estando eu em o relo da Recoleta, despedindo-me de meu irmão que estava para se partir, chegou huma provisão do nosso padre geral, que era em este tempo Frei Francisco Brandão, em que mandava em virtude da santa obediência e excomunhão ipso facto, à Prelada da Recoleta me largase e ha de Lorvão, donde era filha, me recolhese e a mim que visto não se affectuar a fundação de Santarém, para donde avia de ir por fundadora e os meus achaques e doenças serem tão grandes, obedecese logo debaixo das mesmas cemsuras e me pusee a caminho em companhia de meu irmão, que não ficou pouco assustado, asim por ver aquela repentina detriminação, como pelo grande sentimento com que me via, sem poder admitir consolação alguma. [ANTT 152r]

Whilst by the Recollect's grille, saying farewell to my brother who was about to depart, a provision arrived, sent by our general father, who, at the time, was Friar Francisco Brandão. By virtue of the holy obedience and ex communitio ipso facto, he ordered the Recollect's Prelate to release me and that of Lorvão, of whose house I was daughter, to recollect me. As the foundation of Santarém (where I should have gone as a founder) would not come to pass, together with my ailments and illnesses being so great, I should obey immediately, under those same reprieves. I had to depart, accompanied by my brother who was thus quite scared by such sudden determination as well as the heavy feeling which he saw me experiencing without admitting any consolation. [ANTT 152r]

The person Joana mentions, Francisco de Brandão (1601–1680) was also a 'lente' (lecturer) in theology at Coimbra's Saint Bernard's College. In 1668, he became the Chief Abbot of the Cistercians for a period that lasted less than a year.⁹⁴ Throughout his life, he held several important religious and political functions, such as being the kingdom's chief chronicler ('cronista-mor') and inquisitor of the Holy Office. He was a fervent supporter of the Portuguese Restoration and continued the historiographical work of his uncle, Friar António Brandão. Despite his short time as Chief Abbot, he vetoed Joana's extension of her writings.⁹⁵

Below are the words that interrupt Joana's *Livro de Apontamentos* (Notebook):

94 Diogo Barbosa Machado, *Biblioteca Lusitana*, vol. 2 (Lisbon: Lisboa Occidental, na Officina de Antonio Isidoro da Fonseca, 1741), 122–124.

95 This might be associated with the later accusation of alumbadism that Vivardo had received. See Pedro de Azevedo, "A Inquisição e alguns setecentistas," in *Arquivo Histórico Português*, vol. 3 (1905), 460–465. See also Tavares, *Beatas, inquisidores e teólogos*, 1.

“Este tratado que me parece se não deve fiar de todos e menos de pessoas que não tiverem letras; nem o leiam enquanto não está approved por varões doutos. Não é útil para quem segue a vida espiritual por muitos fundamentos e perigos que se expõem, e menos entre pessoas do sexo feminino: me não parece conveniente ande de mão em mão porque ainda que a doutrina seja muito util e muito clara, trata nela alguns pontos que teem maior dificuldade, e sem aprovação de maior exame não devem decorrer, ainda que bem vejo que se sabe que a nada d’isto se ha de assentir em fé divina, no que toca a revelações, senão com fé humana.” [ANTT 134r]

“This treatise does not seem to be trustworthy for anyone, at least not for non-learned persons. They should not read it until it is approved by learned men. It is not useful to those who follow the spiritual life due to many dangers and fundaments that therein are exposed, even less among persons of the feminine sex. It does not seem convenient that it be circulated because, although the doctrine may be very useful and very clear in it there are treated some points of major difficulty, and without the approval of greater examination, they should not be pursued. Still I see very well that one knows that nothing of this one must assent in divine faith, which regards revelations, but with human faith.” [ANTT 134r]

This excerpt was omitted in the eighteenth-century *Copy* of Joana de Jesus. Her writing continues with another section, the second book, written on Holy Spirit Day, seventeen years after she began writing her life story. As stated above, she first began writing in 1661, which dates the second book to at least c. 1678 [ANTT 152r]. However, the preface dates the second book to four years before her death (1676–1677) [BNL 5v].

As she herself stated, Joana wrote because she was ordered to do so by “the same obedience.” According to the author of the preface, António da Conceição, Joana’s second confessor, was “well known in Coimbra for his letters and talents.”⁹⁶ In the city’s university register of lecturers there is no mention of his name.⁹⁷ Diogo de

96 ‘Fr. Antonio da Conceição bem conhecido na Universidade de Coimbra pelas suas letras e talento’ [BNL. 5r].

97 F. T. Fonseca, “A Teologia na Universidade de Coimbra,” in *História da Universidade em Portugal*, vol. 1.2, 1537–1771 (Coimbra, Lisbon: Universidade de Coimbra – Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, 1997), 782–783, 788.

Barbosa Machado mentions two anonymous writers who might have been Joana's second confessor, but this cannot be conclusively established.⁹⁸

By sponsoring her writing, the second confessor was also acting as a counter-peer-review to the statement (presumably) proffered by Francisco de Brandão, and, to some extent, also to Vivardo de Vasconcellos, who had given official support to the Cistercian nuns. Again, the influence of the Albuquerque's network in the Cloister and the Coimbra region is not to be underestimated when considering their elder sister's evaluation.

2.4. Final Remarks on the Recollections of Joana de Jesus

In this chapter, I have contextualized Joana de Jesus' intellectual history from the angle of 'recollection'. Through its inscription in recollection mysticism mainly acquired through the work of Teresa of Ávila, Joana's text acquires a psychological and gnoseological dimension that is not immediately evident. Her gendered soul 'knows' when her potencies are being recollected. This experience of love and nuptial mysticism could be traced to a wider tradition to which Joana, as well as other Spanish mystics, is indebted. However, Joana's use of recollection is not confined to a merely mystical moment or a verb, *to recollect*. Recollection also means a social and observant state. *To be recollected* is to participate in the Catholic renewal movement, which she conveys through her desire to move from a Cistercian house to a discalced branch in Lisbon. Moreover, and again like Teresa of Ávila, Joana wants to write a new reformation (rule) for a new house, in a stricter environment.

Recollection becomes a noun – the *Recollect* – when it stops being a characteristic and evolves into a wider social phenomenon. It becomes a state but also a refuge, a 'non-place' utopia that aggregates visionary women under the same roof and shelter. Sponsor-ship, censorship, and protection can be seen as the common traits within the different networks that made it possible for Joana de Jesus' writings and influence to be known.

Nonetheless, for Joana, this Recollect (as a refuge) is not only the Recollect of Lisbon that she enters, but also the way in which she is protected and sponsored. Likewise, there are several networks in which Joana further develops her intellectual and spiritual refuge, despite her changing from being a Strict to a Reformed Cistercian. By moving from Lorvão to Lisbon and subsequently returning to her original

98 Father Antonio da Conceição (1658–1698) professed in Tibeans (Benedictine Cloister) and was 'jubilated master' in theology as a preacher. He was an abbot at the Convent of Santarém and Lisbon and rector at the Colegio da Estrela (Lisbon). His homonym (1653–1713) was Franciscan and 'lente' (lecturer) at the University of Coimbra. Cf. Machado, *Bibliotheca Lusitana*, 1: 246.

monastery, Joana consolidates her family honor and acquires status, fame, and a reputation. Joana's name must be read on a par with other women introduced in her narrative: Teresa de Ávila and Maria da Cruz.

The notion of recollection in all these variants provides a fertile ground for understanding the rise of the crucial concept that is anxiousness.