

Aspekt der "Bestechung" von Göttern (Martin Hensler). Jakob Hanke geht dem Brauch des Münzopfers nach. Dabei beschränkt er sich nicht nur auf den Trevi-Brunnen (1732–1762 erbaut), sondern bezieht auch andere Wasserstellen aus der Antike in seine Untersuchung des Münzwurfs "als eine Art Bezahlung der göttlichen Leistung" (57) ein. Janina von Römer untersucht den rituellen Wert und den Gebrauch von "Ahnenschätzen", sog. *pusaka* in Ostindonesien mit fremder Herkunft (wie indische Seidenstoffe, vietnamesische Bronzetrommeln).

Im Block "Momente" geht es zunächst um römische Münzen (2.–4. Jh. n. Chr.) und die Verwandlung ihres Wertes als Grabbeigabe in mittelalterlichen Gräbern (5.–15. Jh. n. Chr.; Gordana Ciric). Der Brautpreis, eine Tauschrichtung vom Bräutigam und seiner Familie zu den Eltern der Braut, kommt weltweit häufig vor. Am Beispiel dieser sozialen Praxis in Westafrika weist Kathrin Knodel die Vielfalt in der jeweiligen Ausübung und die Werte, die mit dieser Tauschpraxis verbunden werden, nach. Der Text von Anamaria Depner über den Umzug in ein Seniorenheim und die Schwierigkeiten, eine Auswahl aus den eigenen Dingen für die Lebensrestzeit auf beengtem Raum zu treffen, beschließt die Broschüre.

Die Begleitpublikation zu der Ausstellung fasst analog zur Ausstellungspräsentation alle 16 laufenden wissenschaftlichen Forschungen in kurzen, anschaulichen Kapiteln (3–6 Seiten) zusammen und beschließt damit die praxisorientierte Ausbildung im Graduiertenkolleg. Dass diese Form der interdisziplinären wissenschaftlichen Nachwuchsförderung der Deutschen Forschungsgemeinschaft unbedingt weiter fortgeführt werden sollte, wird jedem/r Leser/in nach der Lektüre des sehr informativen und in einem bewusst populärwissenschaftlichen Stil verfassten Begleitbroschüre ohne Zweifel deutlich. Wünschenswert wäre eine CD mit den Filmen aus der Ausstellung als Beilage im Begleitbuch gewesen, die den Einblick in die Arbeitsweise der Forschenden und in die komplexe Vielfalt der Perspektiven auf Wert und Äquivalenz mit visuellen Beispielen und Interviews noch weiter abgerundet hätte.

Anette Rein

**Van Klinken, Adriaan S.:** Transforming Masculinities in African Christianity. Gender Controversies in Times of AIDS. Farnham: Ashgate, 2013. 234 pp. ISBN 978-1-4094-5114-3. Price: £ 55.00

For several years, research at the intersection of the anthropology of religion and gender studies has grown increasingly popular and prolific. Within African studies, this literature is inspired by three different developments: first, the HIV/AIDS epidemic and its gender implications; second, the global human rights regime and the way it entangles gender and religion as categories of legal protection; and third, the increasing significance of religious organisations in local and transnational civil societies. Entitled "Transforming Masculinities in African Christianity," Adriaan van Klinken has written an interesting book that has grown out of these concerns and that could, therefore, hardly be more topical. Importantly, within religious studies it is to my knowledge the first monograph that fo-

cuses on masculinities as one subset of issues within the broader field of gender.

Combining research questions of gender and religion, this academic field is in an important sense interdisciplinary and involves researchers with diverging epistemological commitments. Van Klinken situates his book within the field of religious studies and mainly draws on theology and anthropology. Because of my lack in expertise in theology, I will limit my remit in this discussion to the anthropological perspective.

The central question of the book is this: What are the visions of transformed masculinity African Christians have developed in the times of AIDS and how do they resonate with people's lives in religious communities? In the author's own words, "the question is how religion is a force operating to effect certain changes in masculinities, and how these changes and their effects can be understood" (6). Van Klinken's tackles these questions from two different angles. He begins with a discussion of theological writings by African women theologians and traces the emergence of critical concepts of gender justice and the critique of patriarchy. He then goes on to check, in two separate chapters, whether and how these reflections are, or are not, in touch with the realities of masculinity and conceptions of manhood "on the ground" as they operate in a Roman Catholic parish and a big Pentecostal church in Zambia's capital city Lusaka. Following a very interesting chapter that compares the Christian gender politics in these three domains, there is a closing chapter that presents two individual biographical case studies as evidence that transformations of masculinities are really underway. It is unclear to me why the author did not integrate this material in the former chapters since it makes this final chapter appear as a strange add-on.

It is fascinating to read how van Klinken employs masculinities as a fresh angle to look at familiar religious forms and concepts, and conversely, how he analyses the way religious concepts make visible particular masculinities. In the chapter on Roman Catholicism we see how discourse on masculinity remains implicit and is mainly shaped through church hierarchies, how it resonates with popular Catholicism and its notion of community and how the very fact of being church (not "sect") conditions Catholic imaginaries of gender transformations. The central direction of change is that of promoting "responsible family fathers". I found very convincing the analysis of the role of saints, especially that of St. Joachim, as role-models.

None of all this, of course, applies to the Pentecostal community of the Assemblies of God. Here, discourse on masculinity is organised around an explicit critique of "irresponsible manhood," considered part of cultural traditions in need of Christian-inspired reformation. The focus is on the individual, on the fashioning of dramatic ruptures through conversion, and on the reorganisation of masculinity as a guiding idea of men's behaviour within the context of the nuclear family and households. Van Klinken also convincingly shows how Pentecostals employ issues of masculinity to project much broader criticisms of the immorality of politics and "society." Time and again, religion is turned into a source of transcend-

ent visions from which to project critiques of the world as it is.

Reading these chapters one gets a clear sense of how urgent and topical the talk about gender and masculinity has become in these church communities and how this urge is caught up between a sense of the deeply problematic aspects of masculinity as they appear in lived experiences, on the one hand, and “gender discourse” as a part of transnational governance, on the other. Especially in Pentecostalism, the reliance on biblical literalism engenders uneasy entanglements between calls for gender equality and legitimations of patriarchy under the banner of male headship (132) as the author clearly shows.

The book is very much centred on how masculinities are discussed in *religious* communities and does not discuss other social forces anthropologists might find important. Unfortunately, references to the long tradition of anthropological research in Zambia from the Rhodes Livingstone Institute all the way to James Ferguson are missing. However, given the book’s focus I suggest that is justifiable. Importantly, in many instances van Klinken points out how people do not spend their days in the church, how people’s absence becomes part of typical complaints and that this raises questions about possible influences of churches’ gender discourse on men’s behaviour. This is a salutary broadside against much writing in Africanist anthropology that suggests incessant commitment to churches to be an unquestioned part of African social life.

Still I find problematic the link between research question and methodology. The book is based on the interpretation of Christian writings and booklets and on sermons and interviews with pastors and congregants. Most of its documents and analyses major themes in the templates of masculinity churches promote. While with these sources we can certainly explore how masculinity is talked about, it tells us little about masculinity *in practice*. The choice of method is problematic because concerns with the effects of masculinity discourse are part of the study’s outline. Yet the data rarely permit conclusions about how masculinities are *transformed* in men’s lives in terms of everyday practices that are either oriented towards gender ideologies or justified by them after the fact. Van Klinken speaks of “male agency when men resist problematic norms of hegemonic masculinity and come to perform an alternative, more constructive type of masculinity” (190) and suggests that this “variation *is* the transformation taking place” (190, italics in original). Putting it this way, the author is forced to assume that there was or is in fact no variation prior or outside the Christian domains in the wider field of “hegemonic masculinity.” This is essentialist, difficult to prove, and empirically highly unlikely.

Van Klinken’s main intention is to criticise and move beyond a monolithic concept of patriarchy in order to expose more subtle changes in masculinities. Yet again, without observational data this task is difficult to accomplish. He, therefore, resorts to the discursive level to identify male *agency* in bringing about change, and endorses a Foucauldian perspective on power relations over and against the theory of patriarchy. In my view, van Klinken

completely misses Foucault’s insight here. A Foucauldian approach would precisely imply *not* to take at face-value the discourses of responsibility, responsible male headship, and agency, but to explore the ways these selfsame concepts are deployed to authorise masculine views of the world. While the author proposes that the concept of agency allows for critical analysis, such a critical take would mean to explore how concepts perform the opposite of what they pretend to do, as marvellously exemplified in Wendy Brown’s work on “tolerance” (*Regulating Aversion. Tolerance in the Age of Identity and Empire*. Princeton 2006).

One might also question the idea of comparing intellectualized theological discourse with church communities’ ways of addressing gender. Van Klinken criticises African women theologians’ rejection of male headship by pointing to “grassroots African women who do not share their feminist commitment and do not necessarily experience patriarchal ideas as oppressive,” and asks “on what basis then is this notion [of the positive implications of male headship] criticized ... by African women theologians?” (59). Of course, power invariably operates by obscuring its presence in people’s experiences. As especially Foucault and Bourdieu have masterfully demonstrated, people are by default complicit in their own domination, which renders the operations of power so smooth in many instances. This still leaves us with the problem of whether African women theologians can claim “to represent” African women as the author asserts they do. However, by reducing their remit to “representation” van Klinken denies them another fundamental aspect of their work which is, indeed, “critical analysis”, perhaps because he does not share their commitment to liberation theology. Although the author is at pains to avoid any arrogant tone in his criticism, it is strange that he does not problematise his own relationship towards questions of representation of “grassroots” African women, while criticising African (elite) women theologians for their failures in doing so.

Perhaps especially with a view towards these critical and complex issues, this book is worth reading for all students and scholars interested in gender and religion in Africa, but also for those concerned with the complex politics of ethical and normative engagement in public theology and its underlying epistemological commitments.

Marian Burchardt

**Villar, Diego y Combès, Isabelle** (eds.): *Las tierras bajas de Bolivia. Miradas históricas y antropológicas*. Santa Cruz de la Sierra: El País, 2012. 444 pp. ISBN 978-99954-55-89-7. (Colección Ciencias Sociales, 29) Precio: \$ 21.00

Esta compilación de estudios es una obra inédita para los estudios socio-antropológicos sobre las tierras bajas bolivianas, un área cultural históricamente marginada por las investigaciones antropológicas e históricas. En efecto, la gran cantidad de análisis etnográficos particulares sobre las poblaciones nativas de la Amazonía brasileña y peruana, así como de estudios etnohistóricos centrados mayormente en la región de la Chiquitanía, da cuenta de