

in indicators are found between the three research villages. These are explained based on local circumstances that range from accessibility of the village and village-level impact of natural resource industries such as logging and mining, to issues of ethnicity, when it turns out that a shared ethnic background with the local district head works well for one's village's development. While a considerable attention is given to schematic reproduction of wellbeing trends in the three villages, using pie charts and an analytical model showing whether various indicators have developed for better or worse, the book's main strength lies in the ethnographic data that support these schemes and give them a human face. Local livelihoods, changes in these and causes of such changes, are discussed for each of the three villages, using ten different aspects of well-being divided in a series of concentric circles – subjective well-being (centre), wealth, health, knowledge (first ring), the social, natural, political, and economic spheres (second ring), infrastructure and services (last ring) – which together make up a circular model of the “nested spheres of poverty.” A thorough discussion of each of these aspects for each village is revealing and instructive, when it comes to the importance of local circumstances as the cause of similarities and differences between the villages. At the same time, however, the usage of such models would also be a reason for my criticism as it seems to leave little space for the exploration of unusual or unpredictable elements that might play a strong role in one village but not in others. As poverty and welfare come to the fore as being largely connected to control over access to land and natural resources, these elements could have been given some more attention. Conflicts are mentioned at various points throughout the ethnographic chapters, but largely in passing. It would have been instructive to understand how such matters impacted the well-being of villagers and to recount the process of settling a conflict, even more so that the procedure of doing so is described in some detail in paragraph 3.4.4. The positions, identities, and actual authorities of the decision makers in matters of land and natural resources are mainly grouped under the political sphere, which suggests a meeting, even a clash, of traditional *adat* leaders and modern government representatives. In many areas in Indonesia such clashes, the reasonings of protagonists, the proceedings, and the outcomes are immediate results of decentralisation and of major importance to the development in the region. Arguably this is not the immediate subject of the book, but the link between power, rights, and welfare is an important one meriting attention. The sheer volume of the book's subject is probably the cause of some other matters getting perhaps less attention than they should have; for instance, the legal consequences for the village communities of the impossibility to register rights to forested land under the Basic Agrarian Law, or the actual impact of the new 2004 decentralisation laws on the regional government's control over land and resources. Arguably these can be found elsewhere, but their inclusion might have been helpful to position the (im)possibilities of the villagers' situations within the framework of the state.

Another interesting issue is the somewhat unusual set-up of the book. It appears to be a successfully defended Ph.D. thesis, to which little or no alterations were made before publishing. This results in the presence of minor spelling and grammatical errors here and there, as well as in a rather long introductory part showing the scientific validity before we get down to the actual business of dealing with the findings. The good thing about this, though, is that it is rare for readers to get so much insight into the ideas, methods, and methodological stance of the author. Whereas many authors cunningly disguise possible shortcomings in their assumptions or approach, Haug does not shy away from critically analysing her work by herself, and even refers to the “assumed strengths” of the model she applies (105) rather than stating its validity as beyond doubt.

Would I buy this book? I certainly would. Haug does a great job in analysing the effects of decentralisation on well-being and poverty in the researched villages. The ethnography is vivid and compelling, the extensive comparison of the nested spheres of poverty is thorough and convincing. It is in-depth studies such as this one that tell us what effects the decentralisation has really had on the Indonesian people. We need more of them.

Laurens Bakker

**Hermkens, Anna-Karina, Willy Jansen, and Ca-trien Notermans** (eds.): *Moved by Mary. The Power of Pilgrimage in the Modern World*. Surrey: Ashgate Publishing, 2009. 267 pp. ISBN 978-0-7546-6792-6. Price: £ 16.99

This highly readable collection brings together a set of thirteen articles, all of which approach devotion to the Virgin Mary from the perspective of “lived religion” (3). As the book's subtitle suggests, the authors are concerned with issues of power as they are played out in Marian devotion and pilgrimage. Power manifests through the Virgin herself, in the relationships between popular practices and official Church institutions, and through the “cogent connections” that pilgrims make with Mary, thereby empowering themselves (8).

The “Introduction,” by Hermkens, Jansen and Notermans, sets the theoretical agenda for the volume and effectively argues that “Marian devotion simultaneously uses modernity *and* acts against certain outcomes of modernity” (2). Paradoxically, although Marian devotion can be associated with conservative Catholic perspectives on sexuality, feminism, and secularism, it also provides a means whereby those marginalized by globalization and economic exploitation can resist oppression.

Coleman's article deals with pilgrimage to the English Marian shrine of Walsingham. Using the concept of mimesis, he shows how pilgrimage practices enable people to relive sacred presence and overcome the gap between past and present.

In one of the most interesting articles in the volume, Jansen analyzes Marian images in a Muslim-Christian community in Jordan, demonstrating that over time, a localized depiction of Mary was surpassed in popularity by

more globalized images such as those from major European pilgrimage sites like Fatima and Lourdes. Significantly, Catholics and Muslims in Jordan could potentially find common ground in their respect for Mary, since she is the only woman mentioned by name in the Quran and is “put on a par with exemplary Muslim women like Khadija, the prophet’s first wife, Fatima, his daughter, and Aisha, his most beloved wife” (39). However, Jordanian Catholics generally feel that the Mary of the Quran is “not our Mary” (39). Moreover, the depiction of Mary in statues and paintings becomes a marker of Catholic identity in opposition to the Islamic rejection of images.

Marian images are also the focus of the article by Morgan, who explores the visual piety associated with the International Pilgrim Virgin Statue of Our Lady of Fatima. Here it is the Virgin, represented by her statue, who moves, reversing the usual pattern of pilgrimage by travelling to her devotees in their home communities and churches, rather than having them travel to her shrine. The travels of the Pilgrim Virgin Statue spread the message of Fatima globally, a message which has evolved over time from the battle against Communism and atheism during the Cold War to the battle against abortion in the present.

Hermkens’ article follows the peregrinations of the International Pilgrim Virgin Statue to Bougainville, where she was carried on a journey of peace in an effort to end ten years of violent conflict on the island. Significantly, those who made the journey and carried the statue were predominantly women who, “as mothers, wives, and sisters of men who engaged in combat – were tired of warfare” (80).

Mary has a political role in Poland, too, where as Our Lady of Częstochowa, she united the nation in its struggle against Communism. The article by de Busser and Niedźwiedz explores the linkages among politics, family, and religion that Mary represented in Communist Poland through her “role as queen of the persecuted nation and as a mother suffering with her children” (93). Interestingly, the authors also point out that in the post-Communist era, the shrine of Our Lady of Częstochowa is increasingly seen by pilgrims as a symbol of European integration, “... a gift for Europe ... not only the sanctuary of the Polish people” (99).

Courtens’ article on pilgrimage to the sacred spring at Sendangsono, Indonesia, shows us that pilgrims are drawn to Mary for the same reasons in Asia as in the European Catholic heartland: desire for spiritual and physical healing, and for “help to overcome their daily troubles or more serious problems and sorrows, varying from relational tensions, financial problems, and school exams” (110). Here at the “Lourdes of Indonesia” (101), Mary unites Catholics and Muslims, unlike the case at the Jordanian shrine described by Jansen. Both Catholics and Muslims venerate Mary at Sendangsono. This lack of conflict is due in part to the fact that the shrine was an indigenous Javanese sacred site prior to becoming a place of Marian pilgrimage. The connection between indigenous and Catholic forms of spirituality was easily forged, since the Javanese supernatural beings said to frequent Sendangsono included a female spirit and her son.

The integration of Mary with indigenous supernatural figures is also documented in Derks’ article on the Virgin of Urkupiña in the Bolivian Andes. Here Mary was accepted by the local Quechua people as an avatar of Pachamama, Mother Earth (118). The principle of reciprocity that structured relationships with Pachamama was extended to the Virgin Mary as well. In this article, one of the most theoretically sophisticated in the volume, Derks argues that the economy of the sacred at Urkupiña reproduces the structural inequalities of the larger neoliberal economic system in Bolivia. Pilgrims to the shrine collect stones from the site, referred to as the Virgin’s “bank” or “mine.” Dislodging these stones is arduous work and symbolizes an offering to the Virgin, for which she will reciprocate by enabling the pilgrims to make real money. Like a loan, the stones must be returned to the Virgin within a year, with interest in the form of rituals and prayers which pilgrims pay local women ritual specialists to perform. Those who do not repay the Virgin’s loans risk experiencing the results of her vengeance.

Notermans sensitively portrays the intimate relationships between ailing Dutch pilgrims to Lourdes and Mary. Accompanying pilgrims on an organized pilgrimage to Lourdes, Notermans discovered that many people took copies of their favourite Marian images from local Dutch shrines with them to Lourdes. In this ethnographically rich article, Notermans suggests that for these elderly Dutch Catholics, many of them ailing and marginalized by transformations in the Church, frequent visits to local Marian chapels, visits to the graves of deceased family members, and pilgrimage to international Marian shrines like Lourdes constitute the core of religious experience. Marian devotion has become more important than attendance at Mass.

Notermans’ observations prompt one to raise the question of whether Mary is *de facto* assuming an equal or greater role than Christ for contemporary Catholics, in spite of orthodox theological objections to discourses representing her as co-redemptress or mediatrix. This tendency on the part of the faithful to elevate the status of Mary beyond that accorded to her by the official Church is a recurring theme in several of the articles in this volume. Margry’s chapter, for example, traces the historical development of the cult of the Lady of All Nations, which began with a series of apparitions between 1945 and 1959 to Dutch visionary Ida Peerdeman. The main image associated with this movement is a painting based on the visions which portrays Mary standing on a globe with her back against a large cross. As Margry notes, “... this configuration in itself indicates that Mary should be regarded as co-redemptress ... it creates the impression that Mary has in fact taken over the place of Christ” (185). Through the global circulation of countless reproductions of this image and networks of devotees, the movement has spread from its headquarters in Amsterdam throughout Europe and Asia, where it is especially significant in the Philippines, Japan, and South Korea. However, its promotion of a fifth and final Marian dogma that would codify Mary’s position as co-redemptress alienates the movement from the Vatican. Nonetheless, Margry points out that the el-

evaluation of Mary is attractive to Catholics seeking a more prominent role for women in the Church. Feminist sentiments also underlie another trend in contemporary Christianity to which Dubisch alludes in her summary article at the end of the volume, the rediscovery of Mary Magdalene as image of the “Divine Feminine.”

Like Notermans, Gemzöe, and Klungel explore the connections among Mary, motherhood, and caring for family members living and deceased in northern Portugal and Guadeloupe, respectively. Gemzöe refutes the notion inherited from an earlier generation of Iberian ethnographers that women in Portugal are drawn to religion through a sense of their own sinfulness and polluting nature. Rather, she argues, women construct a religious realm of their own in which they are active agents and which centers on vows made to Mary and prayers for the dead.

Klungel’s article makes excellent use of reflexivity as a tool for ethnographic insight. She describes her own experience living in a matrifocal, impoverished Guadeloupan family, where Marian pilgrimage reinforces the dominant position of the woman household head. Mary is also central for those whose families have been shattered by the death of a mother: Mary becomes “the deceased mother by proxy” (179). Klungel concludes that “Family organization in Guadeloupe could also be referred to as religious matrifocality, in the sense that Mary is at the centre of family life” (170).

The last two chapters in the book, by Edith Turner and Robert A. Orsi, complement one another nicely. Writing of the shrine of Knock in Ireland, Turner eloquently portrays the experiential side of Marian visions and the devotion they inspire. It is this immediacy of religious experience that Orsi seeks to capture in his concept of “abundant events” (220). Abundant events are those occasions, as at Knock and other Marian sites, when “the transcendent broke into time” (215). Orsi calls on historians, ethnographers, and scholars of religion to “imagine a new historiography” that will make it possible to study and write about abundant events in a nonreductionistic yet nontheological manner, a goal which requires a “vocabulary of practice, understanding and experience” (225).

The final word in the volume is given to Jill Dubisch, who has studied devotion to Mary in her Greek Orthodox form, the Panayia, for over three decades. Dubisch’s epilogue unifies the volume by drawing together a number of the common themes that recur throughout the articles, and underscores the centrality of Mary in Catholicism worldwide. “Moved by Mary” represents a major contribution to research on popular Roman Catholicism, pilgrimage, and more broadly on the anthropology of religion. The book is a valuable resource for scholars, yet accessible enough to be used by students at both undergraduate and graduate levels in the fields of anthropology, religious studies, and cultural studies.

Ellen Badone

**Holtzman, Jon:** *Uncertain Tastes. Memory, Ambivalence, and the Politics of Eating in Samburu, Northern Kenya.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009. 285 pp. ISBN 978-0-520-25737-5. Price: £ 14.95

This is a very good book. It describes and analyses the foodways of the Samburu of north central Kenya, East Africa. Holtzman provides rich ethnographic description of how Samburu think about and value food and drink. He shows both how such notions control and direct social relations and how they embody a sense of ethnicity and culture. He also shows how these have changed with the introduction of foreign food and drink and also with radical new pressures of modern political change and dire restrictions in the supply of food. These issues have played a prominent part in sociocultural change over all of Africa. It is therefore surprising that this is one of the few important, ethnographically focused studies of foodways in Africa. The other two important research projects are the early works on the Bemba by Audrey Richards, “Hunger and Work in a Savage Tribe” (1932) and “Land, Labour, and Diet in Northern Rhodesia” (1959) and more recently Elias Mandala’s study of famine among Nyanja-speaking people in southern Malawi “The End of Chidyerano” (2005).

The Samburu are an offshoot of the Maasai and have been studied by many able ethnographers and have been frequently filmed. They were traditionally patrilineal pastoralists organized into male age-sets. Strict hierarchy by these age-sets and strong segregation of the sexes were and are powerful principles of their social organization. The warrior (*murrān*) age-sets are viewed as the moral and aesthetic heart of Samburu culture. Food practices are central expressions of these division and rankings. Erosion of these practices now threatens Samburu ethnic identity and values. Yet such changes are inevitably taking place. Government policies (hostile to pastoralism), a growing money economy, and a decline in livestock-holdings due to environmental degradation and droughts have steadily weakened these practices. Holtzman describes how changes in diet (mainly a shortage of meat) have led to changes in the separation of the sexes who now often openly share food in one another’s company.

Meat is the most valued form of food among the Samburu, traditionally available only on the occasion of sacrifice at rituals. (This was also the case among the Nuer and Dinka of the Sudan and among the classical Athenians of ancient Greece, all famous cases in the ethnographic literature.) Meat is consumed by all Samburu, but it is the special food of warriors and is thought to convey courage and power. A Samburu warrior may eat meat only in the company of other age-mates and then only in the absence of married women. The staple food for all Samburu is, however, not meat but milk. This is drunk fresh or more often after it has been soured so that it may be stored for many days. With the decline in herds Samburu increasingly now face a shortage of milk as well as meat. As a result of these shortages Samburu supplement their diet with carbohydrates, mainly from maize or millet made into porridge or fermented into beer. Honey is also prized as another source of beer. Foods other than proteins or