

Andreas E. Buss

The Economic Ethics of World Religions and their Laws

An Introduction to Max Weber's Comparative Sociology

Nomos

Andreas E. Buss

The Economic Ethics of World Religions and their Laws

An Introduction to Max Weber's Comparative Sociology



Nomos

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

ISBN 978-3-8487-2424-6 (Print)
978-3-8452-6583-4 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-2424-6 (Print)
978-3-8452-6583-4 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Buss, Andreas

The Economic Ethics of World Religions and their Laws
An Introduction to Max Weber's Comparative Sociology
Andreas Buss

219 p.

Includes bibliographic references and index.

ISBN 978-3-8487-2424-6 (Print)
978-3-8452-6583-4 (ePDF)

1. Edition 2015

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2015. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

To my grandsons Jona and Mika

PREFACE

Max Weber is today perhaps the classic author in the cultural and social sciences, recognized by scientists in many subject areas and on all continents. But his widely felt intellectual presence has not eliminated wide-ranging discussions about his intentions and the foundations of his work. Many use his œuvre only as a quarry for concepts and ideas, unaware that only a coherent and systematic reading will penetrate to the foundations of his thought, open up its possibilities, but also its inner tensions.

This is particularly true with regard to his essays on «The Economic Ethics of World Religions» and to his much shorter writings on the laws of these religions, for they appear to be based on an inner contradiction. On the one hand, Weber insisted that only by specialization, by putting on blinders, so to speak, the scientist can achieve something that will endure. But, on the other hand, he wrote about religions and cultures and their legal systems – in India, China, Buddhism, ancient Judaism –, and he commented on other cultures - Islam, Orthodox Christianity, and occidental Christianity - about which he certainly could not claim much specialized knowledge. What characterizes his œuvre, however, is his approach: he proposed a refined and coherent method of comparative social study with a largely historical dimension which was intended to contribute to the understanding of the characteristics of Western culture even when he wrote about Asian cultures. At the same time he asked which attitude towards the world remains for Western man, and what kind of conduct and which price and sacrifices it requires.

Weber's questions are not self-evident for sinologists, indologists, semi-tists or historians of Christianity, and they are also new for scholars and students of comparative religions and of the comparative history of law. For Westerners they provide a wider than usual perspective. At the same time, Weber did not want to teach the people of Asia anything about how their cultures should develop. His approach allows people of all cultures to turn the mirror around and, while adapting Weber's approach to their perspective, to look at their own roots. May this book contribute to the dissemination of Weber's comparative macrosociological analysis and of his understanding of the peculiarities of Occidental rationalism.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS	13
CHAPTER I INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	15
<i>The Texts (15); What were Weber's intentions? (18); The Critiques (21); Scientific Concepts and Points of View (25); Rationality and Rationalisation (27); The Method of Analysis (29); A Short Outline of the Material (31)</i>	
CHAPTER II THE PROTESTANT ETHIC STUDIES	34
1. <i>The Protestant Ethic and the «Spirit» of Capitalism of 1904/05</i>	34
2. <i>The Protestant Sects and the Spirit of Capitalism</i>	40
3. <i>The Anti-Critiques</i>	42
4. <i>The 1920 Version of the «Protestant Ethic»</i>	44
CHAPTER III THE WORLD RELIGIONS AND THEIR ETHICS	48
1. <i>Max Weber's Introduction</i>	48
2. <i>Confucianism and Taoism</i>	57
<i>The Patrimonial Domination (58); The Spirit of Confucianism (60); Heterodoxies (61); Conclusion (63); The Result: Puritanism versus Confucianism (65)</i>	
3. <i>Intermediate Reflection: Religious Rejections of the World and their Levels and Directions</i>	67

4. <i>Hinduism and Buddhism</i>	75
<i>The Hindu Social System (76); The Hindu Spirit (78); Orthodox and Heterodox Salvation Teachings (79); Ancient Buddhism (82); Buddhism elsewhere in Asia (85); Excursus: Japan (87); Later Indian Developments (88); A Retrospective View on the Asian Cultural World (90)</i>	
5. <i>Ancient Judaism</i>	92
<i>The Transcendent God, the berith, and the Prophets (93); Pariah People, Pariah Ethics, and Pariah Capitalism (95); Supplement: The Pharisees (98)</i>	
6. <i>Islam</i>	101
<i>Islamic Patrimonial Domination (102); The «Spirit» of Islam (106); Sufism and Conclusion (108)</i>	
7. <i>Christianity</i>	110
a. <i>Ancient Christianity</i>	110
<i>The Roman Monarchic-Bureaucratic Empire (110); The Spirit of Ancient Christianity (111)</i>	
b. <i>Eastern Orthodox Christianity</i>	115
<i>The Patrimonial State (116); The Orthodox Church (118); The «Spirit» of the Orthodox Church (119); Russian Old Believers (121); The Russian Sects (124); Result (126)</i>	
c. <i>Occidental Christianity</i>	127
<i>The Institutional and Legal Transformations (127); The «Spirit» of Traditionalism and the Puritan Sects (133); The Characteristics of Modern Western Capitalism (136)</i>	
CHAPTER IV THE WORLD RELIGIONS IN CONTROL TESTS	137
1. <i>Elective Affinity and Causal Adequacy</i>	137
2. <i>Adequate Causation according to v. Kries</i>	141
3. <i>Weber's Use of the Concept of Adequate Causation</i>	146
4. <i>Adequate Causation and «The Economic Ethics of World Religions»</i>	147

CHAPTER V THE WORLD RELIGIONS AND THE LAW	152
SECTION 1: MAX WEBER'S SOCIOLOGY OF LAW	152
<i>Jurisprudence and the Sociology of Law (153); The Rationalisation of the Societal Spheres (155); Excursus on Eigengesetzlichkeit (159); The Rationalisation of the Law (160); The Carriers of the Rationalization of Law (166); The «England Problem» (168); Retrospective Considerations (171)</i>	
SECTION 2: LAW IN THE WORLD RELIGIONS	172
1. The Laws in Non-Occidental Cultures	174
<i>China (174); India (176); Buddhist Countries and Japan (177); Islam (179); Jewish Law (181); The Law within Russian Orthodoxy (183)</i>	
2. Canon Law	185
3. European Secular Law	187
<i>Roman Law (187); Natural Law (188); Continental European Law (190); English Common Law (193); A Retrospective View of European Secular Law (194); 4. Coda on Modern Comparative Law (195)</i>	
CONCLUSION	197
1. The «Author's Introduction» as a Conclusion	197
2. Commentary	200
<i>Science (201); Architecture, Art, and Music (202); Formally Rational Law and the Puritan Conduct of Life (204); The Contemporary Relevance of Weber's Comparative Sociology (206)</i>	
APPENDIX	208
BIBLIOGRAPHY	209
INDEX OF AUTHORS	216
INDEX OF SUBJECTS	218

ABBREVIATIONS

AC	<i>The Protestant Ethic Debate. Max Weber's Replies to his Critics 1907-1910.</i> Edited and translated by D. Chalcraft, A. Harrington & M. Shields. Liverpool University Press 2001
AJ	Max Weber <i>Ancient Judaism</i> New York : The Free Press 1967
ASS	Max Weber <i>Gesammelte Aufsätze zur Soziologie und Sozialpolitik</i> Tübingen: Mohr (Siebeck) 1924 (1988)
ASW	Max Weber <i>Gesammelte Aufsätze zur Sozial- und Wirtschaftsgeschichte</i> Tübingen: Mohr (Siebeck) 1924 (1988)
CMW	<i>Max Weber. Collected Methodological Writings.</i> Edited by H. H. Bruun & S. Whimster, translated by H. H. Bruun, London : Routledge 2012
ES	Max Weber <i>Economy and Society</i> New York : Bedminster Press 1968
FMW	<i>From Max Weber : Essays in Sociology</i> Translated and edited by H.H. Gerth & C. Wright Mills New York : Oxford University Press 1958
GARS	Max Weber <i>Gesammelte Aufsätze zur Religionssoziologie</i> vol. 1 (1920); vol. 2 (Hinduismus und Buddhismus) 1921; vol. 3 (Das antike Judentum) 1920 Tübingen: Mohr (Siebeck)
GEH	Max Weber <i>General Economic History</i> New Brunswick : Transaction 1981
HCP	Max Weber <i>The History of Commercial Partnerships in the Middle Ages</i> Lanham : Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc. 2003
MWG	<i>Max Weber Gesamtausgabe</i> Tübingen: Mohr (Siebeck) since 1984
PE	Max Weber <i>The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism.</i> Translated by T. Parsons; London & New York : Routledge 2001
PE 1	Max Weber <i>The Protestant Ethic and the «Spirit» of Capitalism and Other Writings.</i> Edited and translated by P. Baehr & G. Wells. London : Penguin 2002
PE 2	Max Weber <i>Kritiken und Antikritiken. Die protestantische Ethik II</i> Gütersloh: Mohn 1978
PW	Max Weber <i>Political Writings</i> (ed. By P. Lassman & R. Speirs) Cambridge U. Press 1994
RC	Max Weber <i>The Religion of China</i> New York/London : MacMillan 1951
RI	Max Weber <i>The Religion of India</i> New York : The Free Press 1958
RSM	Max Weber <i>The Rational and Social Foundations of Music</i> , Southern Illinois U. Press 1958
SAC	Max Weber <i>The Agrarian Sociology of Ancient Civilizations</i> (transl. by R. I. Frank) London : New Left Books 1976
WG	Max Weber <i>Wirtschaft und Gesellschaft</i> Tübingen: Mohr (Siebeck) 1972

